DAVID H. STAUFFER

THE ORIGIN AND ESTABLISHMENT

OF BRAZIL'S INDIAN SERVICE

1889 - 1910

(DISSertation PREsented to the FacultY of the Graduate School

of the University of Texas iN pARtial fUrillement of the

requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy )

AUSTIN, TEXAS

( August, 1955 )
VITA

David Halff Stauffer was born in Shanghai, China, on November 3, 1921, the son of Marjorie Nol and Milton T. Stauffer. His early years were spent in New Jersey where he graduated from Blair Academy in 1940. His further study at Amherst College, Massachusetts, was interrupted in early 1943 by thirty-three months of Army service which included the command of a Flying Fortress on twenty-two combat missions over Germany.

Following his graduation from Amherst College in September, 1946, he began a study of the Chinese language at Yale University and continued it from March to November, 1947, at the Yale-sponsored "College of Chinese Studies" in Peiping, China. During the following twelve months until his evacuation from China in December, 1948, he served in various parts of interior China and Manchuria as operations officer and field manager with Claire Chennault's "Civil Air Transport."

Returning to the United States in early 1949, he taught two years in the Kiskiminetas Springs School for Boys, Saltsburg, Pennsylvania, while completing an M. A. degree at Columbia University. He enrolled in the graduate school of the University of Texas in June, 1951, and specialized in the history of Latin America with a minor emphasis on the history of Europe and the Far East. The subject of this dissertation has required, since 1953, long periods of research in the major libraries of the Northeast, together with a seven-month examination of the archives.
of Rio de Janeiro and São Paulo, Brazil.

Permanent address: Box 192
Bedford, N. Y.

This dissertation was typed by Margaret McGrade and Dorothy Vartia.
DAVID H. STAUFFER

THE ORIGIN AND ESTABLISHMENT
OF BRAZIL'S INDIAN SERVICE

(1889-1910)

Atenção: Faltam as 10 primeiras páginas do original em inglês. Nesta reprodução do texto original, as páginas que faltam foram substituídas pelo trecho correspondente da tradução brasileira de J. Philipson (Revista de História, USP, vol. XVIII nº 37, janeiro-março 1959, pp.73-85).
ORIGEM E FUNDAÇÃO DO SERVIÇO DE PROTEÇÃO AOS ÍNDIOS (*)

PREFÁCIO

Em 7 de setembro de 1910, um serviço nacional de proteção indígena, comumente conhecido como o S.P.I., ou Serviço de Proteção aos Índios, foi inaugurado no Brasil. Sendo um departamento dentro do Ministério da Agricultura, seus poderes de supervisão, em âmbito nacional, dos assuntos indígenas e o fato de ter responsabilidade apenas perante o Governo Federal, acreditaram a soberania dos Estados e provocaram a oposição daqueles que temiam a tendência do século XX em direção a um governo mais forte e mais centralizado.

Aquêles que se opuseram à fundação do Serviço por razões puramente políticas foram apoiados em sua atitude por indivíduos e organizações comerciais, que viam no S.P.I. uma ameaça à continuação das vendas altamente lucrativas de terras ocupadas pelos índios e da exploração do trabalho indígena.

Ao lado destes motivos políticos e comerciais de oposição à criação do S.P.I., havia os religiosos. O programa leigo de instrução dos índios, previsto nas diretrizes do S.P.I., marcou um desvio radical da secular prática brasileira de escravizar o clero de toda a responsabilidade e supervisão de seu bem-estar e de sua educação. Naturalmente a Igreja Católica ressentia-se desta ameaça àquilo que sempre se tinha considerado seu sacro direito à catequese entre os pagãos. Mesmo no meio daqueles que nunca tinham aceite a ideia da responsabilidade da Igreja, havia muitos que suspeitavam em dúvida, se selvagens primitivos poderiam melhor ser atendidos por funcionários públicos do que por padres, frades e freiras, os quais, sem laços de família, podiam dedicar-se irrestritamente ao serviço de seus semelhantes.

Constitui objetivo deste estudo responder a seguinte questão: “Como foi possível a fundação, em 1910, de um serviço tão estranho à filosofia dos direitos de estado, tão prejudicial aos interesses egoístas do comércio e tão contrário à tradição da supervisão eclesiástica do bem-estar indígena?” Implicita nesta questão há muitas outras de natureza mais específica: Por que se fundou o Serviço só vinte anos depois da queda do Império e da separação da Igreja e Estado e não nos primeiros anos da República? A quem deve o Brasil o S.P.I. e a política indígena refletida em suas atividades? As ideias ou a ação de um único indivíduo? A uma sociedade benfeitora ou organização eclesiástica? A seus despósitos ou exigências da classe intelectual ou da opinião pública? A influência de projetos semelhantes em outros países do hemisfério ocidental? Criou-se o S.P.I. para satisfazer uma necessidade que não podia mais ser ignorada ou apareceu ele como resultado fortuito de uma barganha política no Congresso Nacional?”

Não há aqui nenhuma tentativa de passar em revista o esforço secular da Igreja e da Córdia para proteger os índios do Brasil contra a exploração de seu trabalho e a apropiação de seus territórios de caça. Muitos estudos em língua portuguesa foram feitos sobre os resultados em grande parte inócuos daquele esforço bem intencionado. O leitor encontrará uma relação resumida de tóda a legislação de antes de 1910, favorável ou desfavorável aos interesses dos nativos brasileiros, na Publicação n.º 94 do Conselho Nacional de Proteção aos Índios, isto é, do conselho de supervisão do S.P.I. (1).

Na opinião do autor, o presente trabalho traz três contribuições distintas para o conhecimento histórico das origens do S.P.I. Historiadores brasileiros referiram-se brevemente a vários aspectos do conflito entre tribos hostis e seringueiros da região amazônica, colonizadores dos estados centrais e meridionais ou trabalhadores na construção de estradas de ferro. No entanto, o autor acredita que nenhum deles faz um estudo geral das múltiplas formas de profunda penetração civilizatória e invasão ampla das terras indígenas no Brasil, depois do advento da República em 1889. Tal estudo é brevemente apresentado nos capítulos iniciais como parte desta par-

(*) – Título da original intitulado: “The Origin and Establishment of Brazil’s Indian Service — 1500-1910” (Disserta de presented to the Faculty of the Graduate School of the University of Texas in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy). Austin, Texas, August 1955”. Traduxo por J. Philpoin.

1. L. Humberto de Oliveira (Com.) Colóniam de los indios e outros referentes ao indígena brasileiro (Rio de Janeiro, 1947).
cial à questão, em que medida a criação do S.P.I. é devida a uma necessidade real em 1910. O trabalho mostra que a penetração do território indígena por agentes da civilização tornou vulto maior, tanto em relação a sua profundidade como ao seu volume, durante os primeiros anos da República, e que daí resultou uma situação, por volta de 1908, que exigiu ação drástica e imediata, para assegurar a sobrevivência dos índios e a continuação do progresso econômico da nação.

Por muito tempo, estudiosos dos assuntos indígenas e historiadores brasileiros sabiam que, durante um ou dois anos antes do aparecimento do S.P.I., havia um debate acirrado na imprensa do país e nas sociedades científicas, discutindo a questão, se os índios hostis, que estavam obstroindo a expansão industrial e nacional e atrasando o avanço da construção de linhas ferroviárias e telegráficas, deveriam ser pacificados ou exterminados. Também, sobre este assunto, pelo que o autor acredita, não se publicou nenhum estudo formal e detalhado, antes do presente. Constitui uma das finalidades primordiais desta investigação a localização dos começos do debate e a revelação de seu desenvolvimento, passo a passo, através dos editoriais e artigos dos jornais mais importantes do Rio de Janeiro e de São Paulo, através das discussões e atividades de propaganda das sociedades científicas influentes destes mesmos Estados, e através das contribuições de destacados Indianistas nos Congressos nacionais e internacionais de 1908-1910.

A terceira parte deste estudo retrata, com bastante detalhe, os passos tomados pelo Governo Federal, parcialmente em consequência do debate descrito, para assegurar a responsabilidade do bem-estar dos índios. Descreve a maneira, pela qual o Ministro da Agricultura, pela primeira vez, se intromete no debate indígena, no começo de 1910, justamente quando este debate estava chegando a um ponto morto quanto à questão do controle eclesiástico ou governamental da instrução indígena. Refere-se também a alguns dos métodos, usados pelo Ministro, para averiguar, se o país estava em condições de aceitar um serviço governamental de proteção indígena. Passa em revista os regulamentos de 1910 do S.P.I. e procura mostrar, quais eram as forças responsáveis pelos principais setores na política indígena, resultante daqueles regulamentos. Finalmente mostra os passos, pelos quais o esboço do regulamento do S.P.I. se tornou lei, e termina com um relato da cerimônia inaugural, de 7 de setembro de 1910, que formalmente institui este Serviço, que ainda hoje está em atividade.

O autor acredita que também esta parte de seu trabalho constitui uma contribuição original para a história das origens do S.P.I.

A presente obra exigiu o exame cuidadoso de jornais brasileiros e das atas das sociedades científicas do Rio de Janeiro, de Campinas e de São Paulo, fontes do período de 1908-1910, que não se encontram com facilidade nos Estados Unidos. Grande parte da pesquisa, portanto, foi realizada no Brasil, em bibliotecas municipais, estaduais e nacionais, nos arquivos e museus estaduais e nacionais e nos arquivos nacionais do Rio de Janeiro.

A gratidão do autor é devida ao Dr. Herbert Baldus, diretor em exercício do Museu Paulista, pelas informações fornecidas e pelos serviços especializados do pessoal da biblioteca desse Museu; ao Dr. Frederico Lane, da mesma instituição, pelo uso de sua biblioteca particular e pela sua assistência gentil na pesquisa de dados em documentos raros e nos documentos pessoais de seu pai, Dr. Horace Lane, fundador do Colégio Mackenzie, em São Paulo; ao Dr. José Horácio Rodrigues, diretor da Seção de Livros Raros da Biblioteca Nacional do Rio de Janeiro, pela sua ajuda no adiantamento das pesquisas naquela instituição; ao Dr. Vilhena de Moraes, diretor do Arquivo Nacional do Rio de Janeiro, por serviços prestados pelos seus funcionários; ao Dr. Jorge Zarur, do Conselho Nacional de Geografia, pela grande quantidade de mapas que ajudaram na primeira fase deste estudo; ao Dr. Eduardo Galvão, diretor da “Secção de Orientação e Assistência” do S.P.I., por ter facilitado o contacto com outros membros do Serviço; ao Dr. Darcy Ribeiro, diretor do Museu do Índio, do Rio de Janeiro, e chefe da “Secção de Estudos” do S.P.I., pelas suas valiosas sugestões e sua ajuda indispensável na localização de informações essenciais para este trabalho; à Dra. Inocêncio Alberto Pires, diretora do Museu Nacional (Quinta da Boa Vista), do Rio de Janeiro, por informações de valor e permissão de usar os arquivos do Museu; à sua irmã, a Dra. Marieta Torres, arquivista do Museu Nacional, pela sua amável ajuda na utilização daqueles documentos; e à Dra. Nair Miranda Pirajá por informações pessoalmente conhecidas e recordações pessoais de seu pai, Rodolfo Miranda, Ministro da Agricultura e um dos principais responsáveis pela fundação do S.P.I. Embora estes amigos e conselheiros tenham contribuído...
buído muito para este trabalho, de forma alguma são eles responsáveis pelos eufóricos e omissões que possa conter.

O autor deseja igualmente agradecer ao Dr. Howard Cline, diretor da Fundação Hispânica da Biblioteca do Congresso, pelos seus conselhos sempre sábios; ao Dr. Charles Wagley, da Universidade de Columbia, pela sua leitura crítica da primeira parte deste trabalho; ao Dr. H. C. Tucker pelos dados fornecidos por sua biblioteca e por recordações pessoais do Brasil nos primeiros anos deste século; ao Dr. George Bochran, da Universidade de Marquette, e ao Dr. Samuel Guy Innis pelas respostas a questões específicas em suas respectivas especialidades; à Dra. Nettie L. Benson, bibliotecária da Coleção Latino-Americana da Universidade de Texas, pelos conselhos sobre a técnica de uma bibliografia em língua portuguesa; ao Dr. Lewis Hanke, da mesma Universidade, por ter facilitado o contacto do autor com cientistas brasileiros, pela descoberta no Brasil de dados que tinham escapado à sua atenção, e pelo exame crítico da pesquisa realizada; ao Dr. Carlos E. Castañeda, também da Universidade de Texas, pelo seu trabalho paciente e consciente no preparo desta dissertação; e aos membros do Comitê de Supervisão pela leitura cuidadosa deste manuscrito e pelas suas sugestões valiosas.

David H. Stauffer.

Austin, Texas.
Agosto de 1955.

I

O NOVO AVANÇO EM TERRITÓRIO INDÍGENA.

Durante as primeiras duas décadas da República, 1889-1908, o Brasil tornou-se intensamente interessado em seu vasto hinterland e em suas populações primitivas. Geógrafos, cientistas e engenheiros entraram no interior em números crescentes. Expedições com motivos políticos, científicos e econômicos abriram picadas até os recantos mais distantes do continente.

Este avanço não estava baseado em penetrações anteriores. As invasões dos dias coloniais, embora épicas, não deixaram quase nada que lhe pudesse servir de fundamento. Elas estavam tão bem delimitadas quanto à época, que vários historiadores lhes puseram datas categóricas. Basílio de Maria-

lihões, num trabalho geográfico altamente elogiado pelo Instituto Histórico e Geográfico Brasileiro, indicou um período de profundo avanço territorial, de 1526 a 1760, subdividido em ciclos de purgagem de ouro (segunda metade do século XVII), de caça de escravos indígenas (1562-1630) e de mineração de ouro (de 1693 até o fim do século XVIII); um período de expansão da criação de gado, 1590-1690; uma época das missões católicas no vale superior do Amazonas, no século XVII; e finalmente um período de invasão e colonização do Mato Grosso, Goiás e das regiões ao sul e ao oeste do Estado de São Paulo, no século XVIII (1). Mas tais incursões representavam antes vitórias sobre o espaço e o homem primitivo do que uma conquista duradoura da terra em si. Não deixaram nenhum legado de rede de transportes, de verdadeiro desenvolvimento territorial e colonização efetiva. Quando, no século XIX, se desenvolveu em certas áreas férteis do interior próximo, uma economia de fazendas à base de escravos, ela não representou uma penetração agressiva das terras dos índios como as anteriores. Com certas excepções nas regiões amazônicas da borracha e na fronteira dos estados meridionais, constituída de pequenas propriedades, o interior do Brasil esteve calmo durante o Império, e o índio gozou uma espécie de armistício da exploração e perseguição.

Novos incentivos para a expansão ao oeste apareceram com a queda do Império em 1889. Os mais poderosos eram de natureza política. Pela Constituição de 1891, uma federação de estados com relativa autonomia foi colocada no lugar de um governo centralizado que era o imperial. Presidentes de Estado aumentaram seus poderes à custa tanto da autoridade municipal como da nacional. Vastas regiões inabitadas tornaram-se próprio estadual e não federal, e o controle dos planos migratórios, para enchê-las, foi ficando gradativamente nas mãos dos Estados e de agências particulares. Desta maneira, a jovem República sentia-se como se desalojada do interior e quase isolada no Rio de Janeiro. Para contrabalançar este enriquecimento de seu poder e prestígio político, o Governo Federal lançou-se energicamente num programa de desenvolvimento de transportes e comunicações. Este programa foi descrito por Francisco Oliveira Vianna, autor brasi-
leiros dos mais distintos e autoridade no assunto das relações, íntimas no seu país, entre política e geografia e população, como um esforço para ligar as partes desconexas da nação com cordões, representados por trilhos e fios telegráficos (2).

Não foi este o único incentivo para a expansão rumo ao oeste. A jovem República, preocupada com dificuldades financeiras e fraqueza militar, temia a violação de suas fronteiras do oeste. A falta de comunicações significava que notícias de invasão levariam dias ou semanas para chegar à Capi-
tal. Tropas levariam semanas para chegar à zona ameaçada, em caso de um ataque. Para chegar até a fronteira da Bolívia, por exemplo, elas estariam em caminho durante trinta dias, descendo pela costa meridional e do Uruguai, subindo o Rio da Prata, controlado pela Argentina, e de lá subindo o Rio Paraná até Corumbá. Como muitas partes das fronteiras setentrionais e occidentais do Brasil estavam apenas vagamente definidas e quase completamente sem defesa, havia boas razões para não apenas ligar os principais centros de população de hinterland com o Rio de Janeiro, mas também para estender linhas ferroviárias e telegráficas através de floresta virgem e pântanos até os recantos mais inacessíveis do país.

Marcação de fronteiras e expansão territorial.

Muito antes do estabelecimento destas comunicações, no entanto, o Brasil tomou parte numa série de acordos, destinados a opor-se à ameaça imediata de conflitos por causa de limites. Na Primeira Conferência Internacional Americana, de 1839, o Brasil tomou parte junto com a Bolívia, o Equador, a Guatemala, e Haiti, Honduras, Nicarágua, Salvador e os Estados Unidos numa decisão para resolver logo e amigavelmente todos os desacordos pendentes sobre limites e direitos de navegação fluvial.

Este Acordo de 1839 preparou o caminho para uma série de oito tratados, durante as duas décadas seguintes, entre o Brasil e os governos dos países vizinhos.

Um tratado com a Argentina em 1888 terminou com as divergências sobre as fronteiras com aquêle país. Alguns anos mais tarde, em 1896, um tratado de amizade, comércio e navegação foi assinado com a Bolívia. As controvérsias sobre os limites com a Guiana Francesa e da Britânica foram finalmente terminados por um tratado com a França em 1897 e com o Reino Unido em 1901.

Os atriitos antigos por causa dos limites do Brasil com a Bolívia e o Perú foram finalmente resolvidos por tratados com cada país, em 1903 e 1904 respectivamente. Um tratado final de arbitragem foi assinado com a Argentina em 1905, seguido dois anos mais tarde pela marcação da fronteira do Brasil com a Colômbia. O último desta série de tratados, o de 1909 com o Perú, completou o estabelecimento da fronteira do Brasil com aquêle país e assim se fechou uma última brecha para uma invasão acidental ou justificável de território brasileiro (3).

Significativo para este trabalho é o fato de que êstes oito tratados, entre 1889 e 1910, abriam terras indígenas que de outra forma poderiam ter ficado por vários anos ainda sem serem perturbadas pela civilização ocidental. Aos acordos internacionais sobre fronteiras disputadas seguia-se em apenas semanas e meses, às vezes anos, a investigação de campos. Termas de reconhecimento, acompanhados por carregadores indígenas ou mestiços, guardadas frequentemente por destacamentos militares, picaram seu caminho através de pântanos e mato estafante. Estas expedições evitaram o contacto com índios hostis sempre quando possível, mas descrições de repetidos ataques e contra-ataques encontram-se em seus relatórios. Infelizmente para o índio, depois do reconhecimento e da determinação oficial das fronteiras ocidentais, a presença perturbadora do branco e de sua civilização pairava como uma nuvem permanente no horizonte. Tropas ficaram estacionadas para patrulhar as fronteiras. Caminhos já existentes foram melhorados e novos acrescentados. A supressão do comércio de contrabando mereceu mais atenção. O número de postos fronteiros foi aumentando. Estes acertos de gêneros apareceram, lembrando ao índio de que agora não se tratava de uma expedição passageira mas de ocupação permanente.

Uma ameaça ainda maior para a continuação do isolamento dos índios foi a aquisição pelo Brasil, em 1904, do território do Acre. Esta região foi cedida ao Brasil pela Bolívia, no céi-

--- 83 ---

--- 79 ---

ôbre tratado de Petrópolis, de 14 de novembro de 1903, ratificado no próximo ano por todas as nações. Por sua localização no nordeste da sucessora da capital perua Lima, o Acre estava geograficamente bem posicionado, como da Bolívia, ambos países desejavam a região como estabelecimento colonial, por causa de suas ricas florestas de borracha. Ela estava, porém, acessível ao Brasil pelos cursos superiores dos rios Perúis e Juruá, confinantes oceânicos do sistema do Amazonas.

Por causa de seu tamanho (o Acre é maior que Santa Catarina e sete outros Estados da União) e de seu sistema de comunicações desesperadamente inadeguado, o Presidente Rodrigues Alves prontamente dividiu o território em três unidades administrativas: Alto-Acre, Alto-Purus e Alto-Juruá. Os administradores mandados por ele para estas regiões comunicavam-se mutuamente, e com os seus superiores no Rio, através de um sistema telegráfico, o qual, por meio de postos intermediários, chegou até Manaus, a mais ou menos 1.500 kms ao norte do Acre. Este meio de comunicação estava tão falho e o Governo Federal estava tão preocupado com a boa administração do novo território, que o Presidente Afonso Pena decretou, em 1907, a formação de um conselho de obras públicas no Acre, para construir estradas de ferro, retirar obstáculos dos rios navegáveis e apressar a colonização de regiões desabitadas (4).

O interesse crescente do Governo Federal e a intervenção cada vez maior no desenvolvimento interno do território do Acre serviram como introdução ao índio do hinterland e aos seus problemas. Relatórios sobre exploração e massacre dos nativos naquela região não foram mais enterrados nos arquivos de políticos locais e estaduais, mas foram enviados diretamente aos ministérios e apresentados a um público nacional. Cientistas, engenheiros, educadores, agrónomos, oficiais do exército e funcionários do governo foram enviados pelo Rio, para administrar e desenvolver o Território. A este homem se deu uma oportunidade de presenciar o conflito profundo entre índios hostis e aqueles que procuravam explorar seu trabalho na coleta da borracha. Representantes do governo, como Thauamurgo de Azevedo que administrou a parte do território do Acre e à introduziu em 1906 um programa de reforma judicial, destinado a proteger os nativos de exploração e massacre, conseguiram uma compreensão devido, um desejo para ajudar a uma certa quantidade de experiência de como agir. Desta forma, homem como compreensão, experiência e simpatia para os índios que podiam ser encontrados no Rio de Janeiro, depois de 1908, para falar com autoridade sobre o problema da exploração e extermínio dos índios.

Expansão ferroviária.

Embora não constituísse um avanço tão rápido para o interior, como o trabalho de ajustamento das fronteiras e do desenvolvimento do território do Acre, a penetração ferroviária serviu também para levar os pensamentos e as atividades do governo da jovem República em direção ao oeste, às terras indígenas. Tal oportunidade não se tinha apresentado antes de 1889. O transporte ferroviário, de fato, tinha aberto novas terras de café no centro do Estado de São Paulo, mas não tinha entrado muito nas regiões densamente arborizadas e inexploradas, habitadas por tribos de índios hostis. Além disso, durante o Império, os poucos atritos entre trabalhadores ferroviários e indígenas raramente envolveram o governo diretamente. Aproximadamente uma quarta parte apenas dos 8.890 kms de trilhos, em uso para o tráfego em 1 de janeiro de 1889, era propriedade estatal. No entanto, a fonte utilizada para obtenção destes algarismos (5), revela que dos 4.995 kms projetados ou em construção naquele ano, quase a metade estava sob controle governamental, parecendo assim que havia uma tendência para o aumento das responsabilidades do governo na construção das ferrovias.

Durante a República esta tendência continuou e ligou-se a outra, tendo em vista a melhor cooperação entre as linhas principais e as mais independentes, inclusive a integração gradualista dessas últimas, cujo método de ligar centros de população sem plano pré-estabelecido tinha retardado o desenvolvimento de um sistema ferroviário eficiente e lucrativo. Linhas pequenas foram compradas pelo governo ou por companhias maiores. Encapicamente tornou-se o presente do dia. Linhas isoladas consolidaram-se em sistema. Por volta de 1907 uma rede nacional de comunicação ferroviária, pela maior parte controlada pelo governo diretamente ou então por cláusulas de contratos de arrendamento, estava abrindo sua

(4) — Afonso Pena resumiu este plano e sua motivação na sua mensagem presidencial ao Congresso de 3 de maio de 1907. V. Mensagens presidenciais: 1891-1926, vol. 1, pag. 584.

(5) — Adolfo Botelho, "Visão férrea nacional", Correio Paulistano, 24 de dezembro.
rote para o interior e encontrando resistência de algumas das tribos relativamente hostis (6).

Este avanço ferroviário post-imperial pode ser relatado resumidamente. Já em 3 de maio de 1890, durante a administração do governo provisório, nomeou-se uma comissão ferroviária para esboçar um plano geral de ampliação da red.

No relatório, apresentado dois anos mais tarde, recomendeu-se que a construção de algumas linhas compridas de penetração de regiões apropriadas e a ampliação de certas linhas “estratégicas” para chegar a alguns isolados postos fronteiriços (7). Tais sugestões não receberam atenção imediata. No entanto, campos sales em sua mensagem presidencial ao Congresso (3 de maio de 1901) advertiu que a segurança do Brasil estava em perigo, justamente por falta daquele tipo de comunicações que já foram recomendados em 1892. Ele recomendou a construção de “grandes artérias”, pelas quais tropas e gêneros pudessem ser transportados rapidamente a qualquer ponto ameaçado das fronteiras ocidentais. No ano seguinte, ele voltou a éste assunto, quando esboçou as vantagens militares que se esperava obter pela construção de uma estrada de ferro, que ia ligar os Estados do Paraná e Mato Grosso (3).

Em 1903, Rodrigues Alves enviou sua primeira mensagem ao Congresso Nacional e nela chamou a atenção especialmente para a necessidade de se melhorar as ferrovias do norte e de se construir uma ligação entre a Capital Federal e as fronteiras do sul e do oeste. Embora julgando que ainda não tinha chegado a época para grandes expansões, o Presidente assegurou à nação que as condições econômicas estavam melhorando e que o governo agora iria considerar a tarefa de construção de estradas de ferro como uma das suas obrigações principais (9). As linhas de “penetração” e as “estratégicas”, recomendadas pela comissão ferroviária em 1892, mereceram agora (depois de 1903) maior atenção. As assim chamadas linhas “de penetração” foram planejadas para ligar aquele

tente, isto é, o do Paraná, do São Francisco e do Maranhão. As linhas “estratégicas” (as vezes chamadas “militares”) foram planejadas para ligar a capital do país com os portos relativamente isolados das fronteiras terrestres: com Lavra-mento, por exemplo, na fronteira com o Uruguai, e com Corumbá, na fronteira com a Bolívia.

A marcha ferroviária pelo interior exigiu apoio governamental cada vez maior. Foi demonstrado como o Governo Federal começou a tornar-se dono e dirigente de estradas de ferro, durante os primeiros anos da República. Isto em grande parte foi o resultado de politicas. No entanto, desta forma, começou-se a obter um controle mais firme daqueleas estradas de ferro, que, depois de 1903, começaram a avançar em território inexplorado. As linhas “de penetração” e as “estratégicas” dependiam de apoio governamental. Sua finalidade era de atrair povoadores e não de servir a populações já existentes, assim eles eram em linha reta criando cidades e aldeias, e não em curvas em busca delas. Suas turmas de reconhecimento e de construção abriam brechas na floresta ainda não tocada pelo civilizado, e às vezes êste avanço foi bloqueado por índios hostis.

As medidas de proteção, necessárias para manter o avanço das estradas de ferro em face de tais obstáculos, exigiram subsídios e intervenção governamentais cada vez maiores. O custo das obras aumentou na medida em que elas tiveram que ser incluídos no pessoal. As vezes o uso mais econômico de batalhões especializados do exército se refletiu na construção do trabalho civil. Foi o governo que formou a arrependência e munições aos trabalhadores, que estipulou o número de colonizadores que deviam estar conscientes ao longo das linhas, e que se responsabilizou, em parte, pelo fornecimento de imigrantes para esta finalidade. Ao Governo Federal, muito frequentemente, os Estados cederam os direitos de propriedade relativos às terras margais estas linhas por cem quilômetros ou mais em ambos os lados. Assim a penetração ferroviária do interior longínquo, durante a primeira década do século tornou-se uma empresa comum entre homens de negócio e o governo. Quando, depois de 1903, tribos hostis do Brasil meridional tentaram sustar êste avanço, elas não apenas desafiaram as forças de expansão econômica mas principalmente o próprio Governo Federal.


“Regresso com de São João, próximo à zona infestada pelos índios. Verifiquei que está o pessoal ter aban-
have just come from a conference with a representative of the leading company, who asked that I now insist on immediate aid so as to prevent the dispersal of the laborers, who could not easily be brought together again. 11

Clovis de Gusmão, writing in 1942, recounted an incident that occurred in 1907 on the Estrada de Ferro Noroeste do Brasil (Northwestern Railroad of Brazil), a "strategic" line pointing toward Corumbá on the Bolivian border. Two engineers, he said, with a working force of more than three hundred laborers, were awaiting the arrival of a train that would carry them to the forward point of construction. Here is what happened, in the author's words:

One hour, two. Suddenly the train appeared in the distance, it drew closer. It carried the bodies of five men whose heads had been decapitated by the Indians. Needless to say, all the workers disbanded. On another occasion, two groups of sleeping men were massacred! Another dispersion. And in this manner, beset by these crises, the Estrada de Ferro Noroeste moved forward into the interior. 12

This was in a precarious condition by 1910 that its contractor notified the Minister of Travel and Public Works in Rio de Janeiro that work was on the verge of discontinuance because of the impossibility of finishing construction in the face of Indian opposition. 13

Undoubtedly there was provocation for many of the Indians' attacks. Repeating rifles were more deadly than arrows, and the railroad workers often rivaled the Indians in cruelty. A passage taken from an article of October.

---

11 Jornal do Commercio (Rio de Janeiro), December 4, 1907.


13 A brief account of this crisis in railroad penetration of São Paulo and the southern states appears in Amilcar A. Botelho de Magalhães, Rondon, uma relíquia da pátria. "Fé de ofício" do General Candido Mariano da Silva Rondon, de 1881 a 1930 (Curitiba, 1942), p. 69.
1908, in a Rio newspaper supports this view:

It is horrible what the workers of the Estrada de Ferro Noroeste are doing to the unfortunate Coroado Indians of this region between Bauru and Avanhandava. Their massacre is a kind of sport -- a highly entertaining form of game hunting. Several days ago, according to witnesses, a group of these Indians were celebrating in their own manner the rites of a wedding ceremony when suddenly they were attacked by railroad workers who assassinated men, women, old people and children, sparing only one young girl whom they abused in a most barbarous fashion before proceeding to the ransacking of the encampment. 14

This example of brutality, which brought swift and bloody reprisal a few days later, was not as exceptional a case as one might suppose. Botelho de Magalhães, acting secretary today of Brazil's Conselho Nacional de Protecção aos Indios (National Council of Indian Protection), has made it clear (Rondon, p. 69, and elsewhere) that in the growing conflict after 1900 between Indians and advance agents of western civilization, increasingly barbarous cruelty was practiced by both sides. Nelson de Senna, another devoted and reliable student of Indian affairs, expressed in 1908 his certainty that were it not for the existing reign of terror, the Coroado Indians of São Paulo would have entered readily into speaking relations with the white man and would, long since, have exchanged their bows and arrows for the picks and shovels of the railroad workers. 15 This belief may have been overly sanguine in its evaluation of the Coroados, but it shows clearly where Senna placed the ultimate blame for bloodshed along the rail lines. It was warfare without

14 Correio da Manhã (Rio de Janeiro), October 16, 1908. See also Diário Popular (Rio de Janeiro), October 29, 1908.
15 Nelson (Coelho) de Senna, Os índios do Brasil. Memória ethnographica, 2nd ed. (Belo Horizonte, 1903), p. 31.
quarter. Only recently Herbert Baldus, ethnologist of São Paulo’s Museu Paulista, reported a conversation with an old frontiersman who had hunted Indians in the early years of this century. When asked if Indian women were massacred as well as men, the old man answered: "We killed them all. An Indian girl is worse than an animal; she has poisoned fingernails." This, Baldus added, was the language of what ethnologists have labeled the "cultural clash."16

Reports of conflict between railroad workers and Indians dramatized a situation that both business and government found increasingly embarrassing. When government contracts offered financial inducements subject to completion of certain stretches of the line by set dates, frantic efforts to meet these deadlines resulted in more vicious treatment of Indian obstruction than the government could morally condone. Yet railroad expansion had become the symbol of economic progress, of increasing population density, of advancing agricultural and industrial frontiers, of national unity and security. The government was so deeply involved in this railroad extension and all the benefits to be derived from it, that it could not stand aside and view the Indian problem objectively. Since a few uncivilized and intractable Indians were thwarting the best interests of the Brazilian people, there seemed to be just cause for their removal, if only it were done unofficially and with as little publicity as possible. Nevertheless, the government was not proud of its rôle in this business and, by 1908, was searching for some other answer to the problem than continued Indian extermination.

Telegraph extension. As in the case of the railroads, the rapid development of inland telegraphic communications brought the young republic face to face with hostile Indians long isolated from direct contact with civilization. The little-known tribes of western São Paulo, Goiás, Mato Grosso and Amazonas had been left untouched by the early development of this form of communication. Telegraph lines designed to connect state capitals of the interior had, by 1889, barely crossed the northern boundary of São Paulo State. The provisional government took up the plan and created "comissões of penetration" to extend telegraphic communication not only to the capital cities of Goiás and Mato Grosso, but all the way to the western frontiers. Thus were founded the comissões telegráficas of Goiás, of Mato Grosso, of Paraná, of Rio Grande do Sul, of Ceará, of Pernambuco, of the Nordeste and, finally, one designed to connect Belém, at the mouth of the Amazon, with Manaus, almost a thousand miles upriver. These comissões were conceived by the young republic as attempts not only to improve communications but to open up the entire hinterland of Brazil. 17

This advance into predominantly Indian territories was affected through a series of projects, each requiring for its completion a period of several months, lengthened in more than one case to eight or nine years. In a thirteen-month period, for example, dating from March, 1890, a line was

17 A brief review of the development of these comissões may be found in Cândido M. da Silva Rondon, Rumo ao costume. Conferência realizada pelo General Rondon no D. I. P. em 3-IX-40, e discursos do Dr. Ivan Lins e do General Rondon, pronunciados na Associação Brasileira de Educação, 17 de setembro de 1940 (Rio de Janeiro, 1942), pp. 7-8.
extended from Cuiabá, capital of Mato Grosso, across some 320 miles of wilderness to Araguaiana, on the western boundary of Golás. In the years 1900 to 1904, Cuiabá was connected with the Bolivian border at Corumbá, thus fulfilling President Prudente de Morais' expressed wish of 1895 that the delay of railroad penetration to that strategic outpost be at least partially compensated for by this other form of communication. 18

Telegraph lines had been extended by 1906 from the southern tip of Rio Grande do Sul to the network of lines out of central Mato Grosso. It was in that year that a young army engineer, Cândido Rondon, received an almost impossible assignment — the construction of a telegraph line from the capital of Mato Grosso northwestward for seven hundred miles across the headwaters of the Tapajós River to the outpost town of São Antonio on the Rio Madeira, located four thousand miles due west of the coastal bulge.

The disquieting effect on the Indians of this rapid and extensive invasion of land which they had always considered their own was heightened by the manner in which this penetration was conducted. Like the railroads, telegraph lines in the deep interior did not always follow established routes of civilized travel but, instead, cut long slashes across almost unknown regions. Thus many of the Indians encountered by the survey and construction crews had never before seen the face of civilized man, nor the curious and, to some of these primitive peoples, terrifying mass of equipment that suggested a more dreadful invasion than was actually the case. The Indians were especially

18 Mensagens, p. 121.
troubled by signs of permanency about the advance. Not only telegraph poles and wires, but corrals and maintenance stations were strung out in the wake of the invading column. A wagon road eighteen to thirty-five feet in width was constructed close beside the telegraph poles to form the most direct, and often the only, means of transit between the wilderness outposts and the telegraph centers of the deep interior. 19

It should be noted, finally, that these major projects of telegraphic construction were entrusted to battalions of army engineers. This meant that during the period of our study a large portion of the working force represented involuntary labor; that is, impressed soldiers who, as punishment or for lack of money or influence, could not escape this arduous and dangerous assignment. Such men, when not constantly watched, stirred up trouble with those natives who were either too trusting or too belligerent. Many instances of Indian attack and loss of life on both sides could be

---

19 Detailed accounts of the stern discipline and excessive hardships of camp life on the comissões telegráficas, as well as descriptions of their many duties, including road and bridge construction, topographic survey, ethnographic study, zoologic and botanic collection, climatic observation and recording, and geologic investigations are recorded by an officer of Rondon's 1907-1910 telegraphic commission in western Mato Grosso; A. A. Botelho de Magalhães, in Impressões da Comissão Rondon, 5th ed. (Rio de Janeiro, 1942), pp. 108-109, 367-369, and scattered references. See also Missão Rondon. Apontamentos sobre os trabalhos realizados pela Comissão de Linhas Telegráficas Estratégicas de Mato Grosso ao Amazonas sob a direção do coronel de engenharia Cândido Mariano de Silva Rondon, de 1907 a 1915. Publicado em artigos de "Jornal do Comércio" de Rio de Janeiro em 1915. (Rio de Janeiro, 1916).
Thus, by the aggressive manner that often characterized the extension of telegraph lines through previously undisturbed Indian lands, as well as by the very extent of this penetration, there developed among many tribes of the interior a distrust and fear of the newcomer that in some cases hardened into resistance against all other features of the white man's civilization.

The after-effects of telegraphic penetration were often more disturbing than the original encroachment. Ethnologists and anthropologists, curious about the newly discovered tribes, hurried to reach them before their culture could be contaminated by contact with civilization. Naturalists, adventurers, reporters and photographers, missionaries, traders and, often, fugitives from society or justice — any or all of these moved in upon the Indian, often over roads constructed by the telegraphic commissions. Isolated primitive cultures were subjected to the disorganizing and frequently demoralizing influences of social and material innovations that were not in harmony with established custom or peculiar native needs.

The improved communication between large coastal cities and distant points in the interior which rapid telegraph-line construction made possible in the first decade of this century brought the Indian and his troubles closer to those Brazilians of the seashore who lived in physical isolation from Indian

---

20 Semna, Os índios, p. 30. The telegraphic commissions directed by Rondon differ from most others in their remarkable record of having lost many of their own personnel without taking the life of a single Indian. This achievement has a direct bearing on this study and will be considered in a later chapter.
disturbances. Newspapers in Rio de Janeiro like the powerful Jornal do Comércio ran a daily front page column entitled "Telegrammas," which featured bits of interest from the interior. Reports of Indian conflict made news and were published as fast as they came in. This flow of information from regions where the native was posing an increasingly serious threat to material progress aroused government concern and, at the same time, awakened public sympathy for the newly discovered Indian.

Scientific expeditions: ethnologic. The field study of Brazil's interior tribes represented a less formidable and less permanent, but nonetheless irritating, invasion of Indian lands. It, in turn, contributed its share to a growing tension in Indian relations under the Republic. Scientists specializing in the study of native culture had, of course, been active in earlier years. Prince Wind-Heuwied and Carl Friedrich von Martius had traveled among the Indians in the first half of the nineteenth century and contributed valuable monographs on native cultures. Couto de Magalhães, in 1863, visited the tribes of the Rio Araguaia in central Brazil, and in 1875 João Barbosa Rodrigues published his first study on the tribes of the Amazon region. It was, however, not until 1884, under the direction of Karl von den Steinen, that expeditions of real significance first sought contact with Indian cultures as yet undisturbed by the white man's civilization.

---

21 Herbert Baldus, Bibliografia crítica da etnologia brasileira (São Paulo, 1954), p. 13. This 357-page bibliography is an indispensable guide to the thorough study of Brazilian ethnology. The introduction (pp. 9-24) is a historical essay on the scientific study of Brazil's Indians from 1500 to the date of publication. A similar and more easily obtainable essay was prepared two years earlier by a competent scholar and professor of anthropology at the University of São Paulo, Egon Schaden. Entitled "O estudo do indio brasileiro: Ontem e hoje," it was published in the Revista de História, No. 12 (São Paulo, October-December 1952), pp. 385-401.
The discovery of primitive tribes in the upper Xingu region of Mato Grosso, as a result of von den Steinen's expeditions of 1884 and 1887, attracted wide attention which, in turn, encouraged an increasingly intensive search for hitherto unknown, or little known, Indian civilizations. Paul Ehrenreich, after studying the Botocudos of Espírito Santo and Minas Gerais and, in 1887, the newly discovered tribes of the Rio Xingu, started ethnologic research among tribes of the Rio Purús in the far western tributaries of the Amazon. Hermann Meyer, after studying the Botocudos of Santa Catarina, shifted in 1896 to unknown regions of Mato Grosso. Max Schmidt was deep in the forests of that same state in 1900 - 1901, pursuing his interest in native languages and handicrafts. Nine years later he was in the far western corner of Mato Grosso. Theodor Koch-Grünberg was working among Indians of northwestern Brazil in 1903 - 1905, and Fritz Krause, in 1908, was collecting artifacts for the Leipzig museum from the Araguaia Valley of central Brazil. 22

There were other scientists, not all as well trained as these, who traveled extensively among the Indians during this period: among them Telemaco Borba and Assonso de Escragnolle Taunay. Only the more significant expeditions by the most competent scholars of Indian civilizations have been noted here, but those few mentioned will suffice to suggest the formidable insistence with which isolated Indian cultures were deliberately sought out and investigated during the closing years of the Empire and the early years of the Republic.

22 Baldus, Bibliografía, p. 15.
To the Indian this was just one more form of invasion. No amount of care on the part of the ethnologist or anthropologist could offset completely the Indian's conviction that the white man was closing in upon him. Although these scientists usually spoke the native language or quickly made an effort to learn it, and although they were careful not to alter tribal customs, they nevertheless troubled the Indians by the increasing frequency of their visits and the growing size of their expeditions. Over the years, more and better equipment was brought in and larger stores of Indian relics were collected and carried out. Had there been lacking in Brazil the intellectual curiosity of ethnologists like Karl von den Steinen, and the publicity given their findings in scientific and popular journals, these Indians of the Xingu region and other isolated areas might have remained undisturbed for many more years.

Geographic investigations. Unfortunately for those Indians who dwelt secure from both the piercing advance of communication lines and the wandering search of trained ethnologists, there developed during this same period (1889-1910) an intense geographic interest in the country's lesser known regions. Wherever there remained on the maps of Brazil great blanks marked only with the word desconhecido (unknown), there geographers resolved to investigate. This wave of exploration was spearheaded by the Comissão Geográfica e Geológica do Estado de São Paulo. Moving ahead of the railroad advance in that state, this geographic commission sent successive expeditions after 1898 to the unexplored valleys of the Itapetininga and Para-napanema rivers. By 1908 almost all the east-west river valleys of São Paulo had been surveyed and correctly drawn on the new state map published in that year for the first national exposition in Rio de Janeiro. By this time other
states were engaged in similar projects. Expeditions were active along the disputed boundaries of Rio de Janeiro, Minas Gerais and São Paulo. Throughout Brazil able geographers were occupied with exploration and survey of mountain chains and river valleys unknown to cartography before their appearance in the path of railroad and telegraph lines.

In relating this surge of geographic interest and activity to the developing Indian problem, it is apparent and significant that this form of penetration, like that of boundary commissions, communication lines, and ethnologists, became increasingly intense during the first two decades of the Republic and was at full tide between 1900 and 1910, just at the time that the Indian problem came to a head. In November, 1908, one of Brazil's outstanding engineers and geographers, Francisco Bering, reviewed the achievements of the past three or four years and described the current phase of exploration as "geografia heróica." The nation's economic development, he said, depended upon continuing topographic survey and more detailed cartography. Only with the production of more accurate maps could the government correctly evaluate, or clearly explain to the public, the completed and projected improvements in mail, telegraph, railway, labor and health services.23

Geographic study of the interior was forced to keep pace with the economic development of the nation. For example, legislative approval of railroad concessions was delayed whenever there was inadequate information concerning

the regions involved. The eyes of business and government alike were turned
toward unknown or newly discovered lands to the west and northwest. In
the national House of Representatives one member arose in 1909 to request
that the green curtain hanging behind the president's chair be exchanged for
a large map of Brazil. This, he felt, would clarify discussion and expedite
the work of the House. "A map of this great country," he told his colleagues,
"should be constantly before our eyes." Such a request in the House of
Representatives was a sample -- in fact, a symbol -- of the nation's intense
interest by 1909 in the little-known regions of its vast interior. More tangible
evidence was provided that same year by the enthusiastic support of Brazil's
first national geographic congress. And by June of 1910, there was noticeable
in Brazil a strong feeling that the time had come to integrate the many regional
projects of exploration and survey into one nationwide program of geographic
investigation.

Like the other forms of penetration already treated, this geographic
exploration of regions inhabited only by native tribes met with a certain amount
of Indian resistance. Unlike the ethnologists, the geographers were seldom
conversant with Indian dialects. They had a job to do, and they were usually
anxious to complete it as soon as possible. Some of them ran into serious
trouble. In the valley of the Rio Peixe in 1905 an expedition of the Comissão

24 Representative José Carlos in the session of September 29, 1909,
Annaes da Câmara dos Deputados: Sessões de 16 a 30 de setembro de 1909,
VIII (Rio de Janeiro, 1910), 713. This publication will hereafter be cited
as Annaes da Câmara dos Deputados: 1909, VIII.

25 Jornal do Comércio, June 17, 1910, p. 4, cols. 2-3.
Geográfica of São Paulo was for many days under repeated attack by Coroado Indians. Almost a year later, in September of 1906, another party of that same Comissão Geográfica met with equally determined opposition. Four of its members were wounded in their canoe on the Rio Peixe by a shower of arrows from an overhanging ledge. Many other examples of such conflict could be cited. Attack and counter-attack, even when unattended by loss of life or serious injury, added to the growing bitterness of relations between certain Indian tribes and representatives of the encroaching civilization during the first two decades of the Republic.

Boundary commissions and government intervention in Acre, railroad and telegraph extension, ethnologic and geographic exploration -- all of these had contributed to a growing awareness of the Indian under the Republic. Each constituted a new violation of Indian seclusion. Each had excited the natives' suspicions and fears. Each had aroused in the native population some measure of resentment and open resistance.

The Indians who were opposing the advanced forerunners of civilization were being gradually exterminated. Those who had accepted the newcomers found themselves increasingly the victims of disease and exploitation. Although the wide publicity given the activities and discoveries of the agents of western expansion in Brazil served to bring the Indian and his problems closer home to the government and to the general public, and although that

26 A brief account of these attacks appeared in the concluding article (January 22, 1910, p. 5, cols. 4-7) of a series entitled "A evolução dos trabalhos geográficos em S. Paulo," written by the Comissão Geográfica's director, João P. Cardoso, and appearing throughout January in Rio de Janeiro's Jornal do Comércio. For a fuller account of this Indian conflict, see the official record of these expeditions: Comissão Geográfica e Geológica do Estado de S. Paulo, Exploração do rio do Peixe, 1907 (São Paulo, 1907), 16 pp. This commission will hereafter be cited as the Comissão Geográfica e Geológica de São Paulo.
publicity was increasingly sympathetic to the plight of the native races, nevertheless, it was widely believed in Brazil, as late as 1903, that the cruelty of native attacks and of the white man’s reprisals was a necessary evil accompanying economic progress and the first stage of territorial expansion into Indian-inhabited regions.

It was evident to most Brazilians that the Indians themselves had not initiated this struggle. They were too unorganized, too few in number, and too poorly armed to enter the white man’s territory with any hope of dislodging him from land he had already taken. Nor was plunder a sufficient incentive for the Indian to risk his life. The conflict between the native and the Brazilian was nothing more than desperate resistance on the part of the natives to the fearsome invasion of their hunting grounds. It was not easy for the government to justify or explain this new invasion of the Indians’ last refuge. Although the unjust treatment of the native population, together with the Indians’ annoying opposition to Brazil’s economic development in the interior, posed one of the nation’s greatest problems, there was still, in 1903, no strong expression of public opinion on the subject. Nor had a clearly defined governmental policy been adopted. Perhaps the grudging acceptance of this unfortunate state of affairs might have continued into later years had it not been strained, during this same period, by an even more desperate clash between the natives and those who were moving in upon them.
CHAPTER II

THE FIGHT FOR INDIAN LANDS

The early years of the Republic were characterized by accelerated frontier advance throughout the nation. Large areas of potentially productive land were wrested from the Indians, who had been left relatively undisturbed during the long reign of Dom Pedro II. This westward march of pioneer settlement, with exceptions in the Amazon region and in São Paulo, did not represent as rapid or as deep a penetration of the interior as did the border survey parties, the railroad and telegraph commissions, and the ethnologic and geographic expeditions already described. Nevertheless, it was attended with far greater injustice and was more bitterly contested by the native population of the heretofore unconquered wilderness. The white man's irresistible occupation of Indian hunting grounds, and his exploitation, displacement or extermination of the land's former occupants, marked the destruction of a way of life and the collapse of a primitive culture that had survived the colonial period and the first half century of Brazilian independence.

Rubber extractors in the Amazon. The most extensive of these invasions of the Indian territory took place in the tropical forests of northern Brazil. There, as early as 1877 with the advent of a prolonged drought in Ceará, mestiços of the dry backlands of the northeast began to move westward into the rubber-producing forests of the Amazon. Intermittent droughts during the remaining years of the nineteenth century and the first decade of the twentieth helped to maintain this migratory pattern.
An even greater inducement than drought, however, to settlement along the Amazon River and its thousands of miles of tributaries was the spectacular rise in the price of crude rubber during this same period. The advent of a bicycle craze in the United States in the 1890's, followed by the invention of the auto and an increased use of rubber in other commodities, created a heavy demand for this product which only the tropical forests of South America could meet. A slump in the price paid for latex occurred late in 1906 but was checked in 1908, and the rubber boom continued into 1910. In that year the dizzy spiral of prices finally collapsed before the more economical production of latex on rubber plantations introduced into the Far East at the turn of the century.

Under the combined influence of drought conditions in the northeast after 1877 and the growing demand for rubber gatherers after 1890, tens of thousands of workers moved into the Amazon forests - especially into the far western territory of Acre described in Chapter I. Perhaps nowhere else in Brazil was the growth of population so intensive during the first two decades of the Republic as it was in that remote region, twenty-five hundred miles west of Recife in the headwaters of the Purús and Juruá rivers. ¹ During one period of the rubber boom, the number of migrants entering the rubber forests of northern Brazil is estimated to have averaged twenty thousand a year. ²

---


The rubber gatherer, or seringueiro as he is called in Brazil, staked, each in his turn, his claim two hours or more upstream by canoe from the last habitation. There he built a small shack for himself or, in some cases, for the family that he brought with him. If alone, he sometimes forced an Indian girl to share his miserable existence, and this in itself was enough to antagonize the native population. Many of the seringueiros further enraged the generally docile tribes of the Amazon region by forcing them to collect specified quantities of latex and deliver them without fail at given intervals. If the seringueiro were sufficiently enterprising, he gradually enlarged the number of Indians working for him and hired overseers to track down and flog mercilessly those natives who did not bring in their full quotas.

Not all seringueiros mistreated the natives in this way, but Indians seeking revenge did not always discriminate between those who had harmed them and those who had not. Moreover, the proprietors who most cruelly exploited Indian labor were usually well prepared to defend themselves against attack, whereas the seringueiro who worked alone or with the sole aid of his family could be taken by surprise and overpowered with little difficulty. It is therefore not surprising that the members of the Roosevelt-Rondon scientific expedition in 1914 found the seringueiros of the upper

---

Madeira River living in constant dread of Indian attack. Just the unexpected appearance of Rondon’s canoe caused many of these isolated rubber gatherers to flee into the jungle. 4

Not all the migrants from Ceará worked independently. Many were hired as overseers by large rubber-gathering corporations whose extensive operations on vast tracts of land were controlled from headquarters in Manaus or in the larger coastal cities. These companies shared high dividends with their stockholders at home and abroad. They also paid heavy taxes to the Brazilian government. Thus it was to the economic interests of influential businessmen and government alike to overlook the inhumane methods by which Indians were forced to labor in the rubber forests.

As a general practice throughout the Amazon region, Indian and mestizo laborers were lured into the service of rubber-collecting companies by a combination of false promises and easy credit on future wages. The Indian, in his ignorance of the white man's labor system, spent whatever funds were advanced without realizing that they represented an obligation on his part.

Once in debt, it was almost impossible for the Indian to buy his freedom with the niggardly pay that he received for his labor, or by the sale of whatever commodities he received from the company in lieu of wages. The mestizo from Ceará usually fell into the hands of these companies through his desire to enjoy again some few of the luxuries or vices that he had once known before

4 Rondon, Lectures, pp. 117-118. See also page 130 for a brief account of the bitter struggle between seringueiros and Indians on the upper Aripuanã River, as far upstream as the waterfall of inferno.
entering the Amazonian jungles. He too accepted advance payments, fell into debt, and found that the only way to extricate himself and make the profits originally promised to him was to accept the onerous position of Indian overseer. In this role, he was expected, and often forced, by his employers to punish the native workers unmercifully for any form of laziness or rebellion. 5

Atrocities practiced by bosses of the Peruvian Amazon Company upon helpless Indian workers and their families in the Putumayo District (a rubber-forest region of Peru just beyond Brazil’s western boundary) may or may not have been equaled in Brazilian territory; nevertheless, they demonstrated to what extent civilized men could revert to bestiality when cut off from outside influence and observation and given the means to tyrannize over the mind and body of a primitive people. An expose in England in 1909 of the Putumayo situation by an American engineer, W. E. Hardenburg, received dramatic publicity in the London press. The fact that several British colonial subjects from the West Indies were among the enslaved workers of that company led finally to investigation by the British Foreign

---

5A short history of Indian mistreatment in the Amazon region may be found in Alípio Bandeira, "Discurso pronunciado por Alípio Bandeira na sessão solene de instalação da inspeccoria do Servíço de Proteção aos Índios e Localização dos Trabalhadores Nacionais no Amazonas," Coletânea de leis, atos e memoriais referentes ao indígena brasileiro, ed. Humberto de Oliveira (Rio de Janeiro, 1971), pp. 27-51. A more detailed treatment of actual cases of Indian persecution in the Amazon region may be found in Alípio Bandeira, A cruz indígena: Com a descrição de dolorosos episódios verdadeiros em que os nossos aborígenes têm sido vítimas de inomináveis barbaridades cometidas pelos civilizados (Porto Alegre, 1926).
Office in 1910, with subsequent publication of a consular blue book on the matter in 1912. 6

Increasingly frequent accounts of friction in the Amazon region between natives and exploiting seringueiros or rubber companies served to call the Brazilian government's closer attention to the Indian problem in the tropical forests of the North. This, however, was only one area where widespread persecution or replacement of the native population was troubling the nation's conscience in 1909.

Mate growers in the west and south. During the early years of the Republic, while the rubber boom was drawing thousands of migrants into the northern jungles, large tracts of good soil in the southern and western states were cleared for the cultivation of mate, a South-American form of tea. By 1910, to cite one example, the Motto-Laranjeiras Company was leasing some fourteen thousand square miles of southwestern Mato Grosso

---

6 Great Britain, Correspondence Respecting the Treatment of British Colonial Subjects and Native Indians Employed in the Collection of Rubber in the Putumayo District, Presented to Both Houses of Parliament by Command of His Majesty, July, 1912, Miscellanea, No. 8 (1912), (London, 1912). See also Hardenburg, The Putumayo: The Devil's Paradise (London, 1912). The Casement report is one of the very few detailed and carefully documented accounts in English of the methods used by at least one rubber company of the Amazon region to wipe out all forms of leadership and organized resistance among its native workers. The reader familiar with the sixteenth-century atrocities in Spanish America recounted by Las Casas will find equally gruesome details in this twentieth-century report of torture and murder by beating, drowning, shooting, burning and exposure.
and exporting annually about seven thousand tons of mate tea.  

The rapid development of this industry after 1886 was based largely on its attraction of former slaves from coffee plantations. With this ready supply of cheap labor, mate plantations spread out over Indian territory. The vegetation of upland savanna and scrub forest that had previously served the natives as a refuge and a hunting ground was destroyed by axe and fire. Again that part of the Indian population that was not driven from the land, or exterminated in an effort to retain it, lost the freedom of its nomadic, hunting economy and gradually became a bitter and demoralized segment of the plantation labor force.

Cattle ranchers in Goiás and Mato Grosso. During this same period, and especially apparent after 1905, the sandy upland savannas of the central inland states of Mato Grosso and Goiás became a mecca, not only for immigrants from the drought areas of the Northeast, but for vast numbers of squatters from Rio Grande do Sul, southernmost state of the Union.

Strangely enough, it was the introduction of cold storage into Argentine packing plants and shipping that set off this migration to the north. The frozen-meat trade, paying higher prices for top quality beef, drove the cattle centers of the older industry north into cheaper grazing lands. Squatters, no longer tolerated on the southern plains, streamed northward to the

---

7 Lionel Wiener, "The Railways of Brazil," Cassier's Magazine: An Engineering Monthly, XXXIX (April 1911), 530. See also the extensive report on immigration into Mato Grosso and its effect on Indian relations and the rapid development of the mate tea industry in that state, which appeared in Mato Grosso's Gazeta Official, April 2, 5, and 7, 1910. This journal will be cited hereafter as Gazeta Oficial.
nation's central plateau which became the last retreat of the "rough-stock" industry serving the jerked-beef and meat-extract factories of Brazil. A rancher near Posadas, in 1906, estimated the number of squatters passing his house each month at close to two hundred -- most of them accompanied by their wives and household effects and driving troops of mares, mules and horses before them. On being questioned as to their destination, they almost all replied that they were going to Mato Grosso where land was cheap and where there were cattle for all. 8

The grazing lands that attracted this wave of colonization were not wide open like those of the Great Plains of North America but interspersed with patches of forest, the last refuge of the inland Indians. 9 This meant that as the broken savana absorbed increasing numbers of cattlemen and their families, the Indian in his dwindling areas of hunting ground felt himself surrounded and constricted, unable to move freely, as in the past, from one wooded region to another. This situation in the western states was just one more threat to the future happiness and peaceful existence of the nation's Indian population.


9 The tribes of the western uplands of São Paulo and Mato Grosso were not all woods Indians. A little-known tribe of plains Indians, the Oti (not mentioned in the ethnographic section of the United States Bureau of Ethnology's six-volume Handbook of South American Indians), was gradually exterminated during the nineteenth century by cattle ranchers in western São Paulo. It is believed that there remained of them in 1903 only one man, four women, and four children. The benefits that the white man might have experienced through an alliance with this tribe, and the tragic account of the decimation of these people, have been related by Nimunądajú (Kurt Unckel), "Das Ende des Oti-Stammes," Deutsche Zeitung (São Paulo), 1910. The Portuguese translation of that article, signed by the author, has been reproduced in a recent study of the subject by Herbert Baldus: "Os oti," Revista do Museu Paulista, Nova série, VIII (São Paulo, 1954), 79-92.
Immigrant farmers on new land. The irresistible flow of internal migration into rubber, mate, and cattle regions was supplemented, and paralleled in time, by an unprecedented influx of European immigrants. It is worth noting some statistics on their numbers and the dates of their arrival because a fair proportion of these newcomers entered the hinterland and settled on lands adjacent to, or in possession of, Indian tribes hostile to white penetration.

Again it will be seen that the period of greatest activity of the sort detrimental to the Indian began in the late years of the Empire and approached its peak about 1888. Not until the 1880's had Brazil experienced a really pressing need for an enlarged labor force. With the abolition of slavery in 1888, without compensation to the owners, the old and traditional plantation system temporarily collapsed. The former slaves, anxious to begin a new life in a new environment, either flocked to the cities or found work in some other agricultural system than that of sugar cane or coffee. The owners of once flourishing coffee and sugar plantations, deprived of their labor force, also moved into the larger coastal and inland cities. The resultant decline in the production and shipment of coffee and sugar, two of Brazil's heaviest exports, precipitated a financial crisis that shook the Empire's already crumbling foundations. When it fell in November of 1889, the young republic inherited, as one of its toughest assignments, the task of breathing new life into the nation's bankrupt plantation economy.

Those states whose financial and political stability depended on revenue from the export of sugar or coffee quickly adopted high-pressure immigration schemes to supply a new source of plantation labor. These
efforts were immediately effective, but over the years it became evident that the demand for agricultural workers was an ever-growing one that could not be satisfied by state and private agencies alone. Thus a series of legislative measures, beginning in late 1906, authorized a slow return to federal control of immigration procurement and distribution. This action resulted in greater efficiency and an increased flow of immigrants after 1907. According to a graph produced by a reputable geographer, Pierre Deffontaines, the number of immigrants jumped from 58,000 in 1907 to 91,000 in 1908, and continued to rise until 1913. The numbers are of less significance than the trend toward their rapid increase at just the time when the Brazilian government was especially concerned with the ruthless manner in which her native population was being overrun.

As the older coffee plantations of São Paulo satisfied their most pressing need for cheap labor to take the place of former slaves, the stream of immigrants moved on into virgin territory. Thousands were encouraged by the government to settle along the "penetration" and "strategic" rail lines in hopes that their presence would discourage Indian interference with recently opened traffic, and that their industry would soon provide the produce necessary to make the railroads a paying operation. Unfortunately, the newcomers inherited the bitter hatred that had been aroused in the natives by the railroad advance into their lands, and thus, over wide stretches, conflict continued along the rail lines.

In order further to stimulate settlement of the so-called "uninhabited"

regions, centers of colonization were established in areas with good soil and relative proximity to rail transportation. The government had created several of these by 1908 on land donated by the states: two in Paraná, two in Minas Gerais, and one in each of the states of Espírito Santo, Rio de Janeiro and Santa Catarina. Three or four states, including São Paulo, aided the progress by creating additional centers, with or without federal aid. By May of 1909, immigrants had been distributed among twenty-six different centers, eleven of which were directly under national supervision.\footnote{Relatório apresentado ao Presidente da República dos Estados Unidos do Brasil pelo Ministro de Estado da Indústria Viação e Obras Públicas Afonso Calmon da Silva e Almeida no ano de 1908, 20. o da República, 1 (Rio de Janeiro, 1908), viii-x, \textit{Pelo Império e República}, 1894-1912, Documentos parlamentares (Rio de Janeiro, 1912), pp. 693-639. A map (1:2,000,000 kms.) showing the colonial centers of 1910 in the states of Rio Grande do Sul, Santa Catarina, Paraná, São Paulo, Rio de Janeiro, Espírito Santo and Minas Gerais may be found in Paul Ferrin, \textit{Les Colonies Agricoles au Brésil} (Paris, 1912).}

If the territories devoted to the twenty-six new population centers were truly selected for their fine soil and proximity to rail lines, why were their respective states so ready to part with them? And why were these valuable lands still uninhabited by nationals? There was, one very good reason: much of the land involved in this program was still subject to Indian attack. Since there were no border patrols to safeguard scattered settlers, these backland regions inhabited by hostile Indians were almost worthless until settled under an intensive program that could supply colonists rapidly in sufficient numbers to protect themselves from Indian attack. The government-sponsored centers
were designed for just that purpose. They represented a sort of "saturation settlement" that discouraged large scale native resistance. This naturally forced the Indian population to withdraw to poorer land or accept a miserable position in an alien economy.

Coffee planters in São Paulo. Brazil's most extensive occupation of Indian-inhabited lands, south of the Amazon region, took place in São Paulo and northern Paraná, after the coffee frontier shook off the temporarily crippling effects of slave abolition and nationwide confusion to resume, in the 1890's, its dynamic westward march. This was an assault upon Indian lands in a grand scale. Thousands of nationals spearheaded the drive, dependent largely upon Italian immigrants for their labor supply. Cutting their way back through the forested valleys of the Mogi-Guassú and the Pará rivers, they extended their plantations into the hostile Indian territory of the Rio Tieté, where the construction of the Estrada de Ferro Noroeste was encountering bitter resistance. All the way to the Rio Paranaapanema and southwest over the São Paulo border into Paraná, this green wave of coffee trees advanced inexorably. The falling price of coffee in 1905, like that of

12 The history of this westward march is told with meaningful diagrams and maps in Sérgio Milliet, Roteiro do café e outros ensaios: Contribuição para o estudo da história econômica e social do Brasil, 3rd ed. (São Paulo, 1941). For an emphasis on the economic history of coffee in Brazil, with detailed coverage of the spurt in production in 1901 and of the crisis in 1905-1906; see Assenso de E. Taunay, História do café no Brasil (Rio de Janeiro, 1941). Also, the reader will find an excellent twent, three page summary of the growth of the coffee industry in São Paulo from 1885 to 1926, supplemented by statistical tables, in Paulo Pestana [Director of Industry and Commerce], O café em São Paulo (São Paulo, 1927).
rubber in the following year, proved to be only a temporary setback. By 1908 the advance of coffee plantations through virgin forest and savanna had become more aggressive than ever.

Small farmers in Paraná and Santa Catarina. In the dense forests of Santa Catarina and central and southern Paraná, the Indian was threatened by an equally determined but less grandiose form of frontier advance. The cool climate of the southern region, unsuited to the cultivation of sugar cane or coffee, proved ideal for the type of diversified agriculture familiar to the newcomer from Europe. It was largely for this reason that Italians and Germans, often the children of earlier immigrants, led the advance into this region, supported by smaller numbers of Poles and Russians. Alone, or with their families, these men moved westward from immigrant centers that dated back to empire days - from Itajai, Blumenau, Brusque and Joinville in Santa Catarina, and from Morretes in Paraná. Gradually they infiltrated Indian territory, cleared small tracts of land and clung to them tenaciously. Their stubborn advance bore a close resemblance to that of the early North American backwoodsmen and pioneer farmers.

Because the immigrant settlers of the southern states did not completely destroy the forest and drive the Indian tribes before them, as did the planters on the coffee frontier, they were far more vulnerable to Indian attack. For this reason, they exerted increasing pressure on local and national authorities to secure from them the sort of military protection supplied by frontier forts and border patrols in North America. This clamor for military aid against the Indians both annoyed and troubled the Brazilian government which still, in the first decade of this century, was loath to take sides in the struggle between
Indian and immigrant. Clearly the colonizing efforts of the European farmers in Paraná and Santa Catarina were a valuable contribution to the nation's progress. They brought idle land into production, stimulated industrial development, and bettered communications. Nevertheless, the Brazilian government found it difficult to overlook the fact that these manifestations of progress were being achieved by Italians, Germans, Poles and Russians at the expense of relatively defenseless Indians who were no less Brazilian than the immigrants who were overrunning them.

Real estate concerns, wealthy businessmen, and politicians - all of whom speculated on rising land values under the impact of colonization - supported the immigrant pioneer's request for military aid against Indian attack. Appeals for such assistance appeared frequently during the first decade in the pages of local newspapers such as Der Urwaldbote, a German-language weekly published in Blumenau, Santa Catarina. The Indians themselves, once the sole occupants of the southern forests, were unable to present their side of the story in the local press or on the floor of congress. Their only protection from the sort of government military campaign requested by the European immigrants was the nation's troubled conscience and the average Brazilian's mounting distrust of European settlers who often refused to accept either the culture or the language of their adopted country.

An article representative of this form of pressure - complete with the description of an Indian attack, the massacre of one or more German or Italian pioneers, and a bitter denunciation of government failure to safeguard the lives of its frontier settlers, appears in Der Urwaldbote (Portuguese language edition), October 17, 1909.

The German immigrant's tendency to congregate among his own people, maintain his own national customs, to provide his own churches and schools
The steady refusal of state and federal governments to supply the military support requested by the European immigrants in the Indian-infested forests of Paraná and Santa Catarina during the first two decades of the Republic was caused, in large part, by the Brazilians' growing doubt as to whether the German settler, in his desire to retain his cultural and racial homogeneity, would make as good a citizen as the Indian, provided that the latter were given a chance to enter peacefully into the national life and culture.

The advance of the small-farm frontier in the southern states, more than that of any other form of penetration, caused the Brazilians to question whether it was to their advantage to allow the continued exploitation, displacement, and extermination of the native population.

and there preach and teach in his own language, was widely apparent in southern Brazil. In some agricultural colonies and small towns, the settlers not only obtained the right to conduct their municipal affairs in German, but succeeded in imposing their own language on the Brazilian minority. For these and other reasons, the Brazilian inhabitants of the southern states, as well as many local, state, and national government officials, became increasingly resentful of the influx of German immigrants after the turn of the century. A powerful indictment of the German colonists of Santa Catarina appeared in the Jornal do Comércio, Edição da Tarde, June 14, 1910, p. 5, cols. 5-6. Its author wrote: "This state is almost entirely dominated by Germans, politically as well as commercially and industrially. There are cities (in Santa Catarina) that appear on German maps under the designation of 'Allemansha Antarktika.'" A correspondent (name unknown) wrote for publication in Blackwood's Magazine in 1911 the following significant remarks: "They (the Germans, for the reasons summarized above) present a problem which causes some anxiety to the governing authorities of the Republic. They strike deep in the soil and they are suspected by the Brazilians of cherishing ambitions incompatible with the unity of the country." Speaking of the Germans' large families, the author stated, "There are many Brazilians who look forward with anxiety to what the German will do, perhaps at no very remote date. They do not fear the coming of the Kaiser with a fleet and an army. Against that danger they know they are protected by the United States. They fear the German within their gates." Anonymous, "The Immigrant in South America," Blackwood's Magazine, CX (November, 1911), 608-609. The reader will find imposing evidence in support of German's economic and political ambitions in southern Brazil in the following sources:
Industrial development and mining. Wherever the tide of immigration flowed, wherever population density mounted rapidly, there the forces of heavy industry followed to complete man's conquest of the soil. Great stretches of woodland were destroyed for no other reason than to supply ties for the railroads and fuel for their engines. Power and light companies constructed dams across clear-running streams and appeared unconcerned when stagnant and pestilential waters backed up into lowland areas occupied by the Indians. 15

Mining industries developed as fast as railroads made possible the economical transportation of heavy ores to processing plants in coastal cities. After 1903, the national government fostered the mining and processing of manganese and iron ore and encouraged a search for coal and oil. 16

Richard Tannenberg, Gross -Deutschland die Arbeit des 20. Jahrhunderts (Leipzig, 1911), p. 591. "South Brazil, Uruguay and Paraguay are countries of German culture. German will there be a national tongue." 15 Percy W. Bunting, ed., The Pan Germanic Doctrine (London and New York, 1904), p. 261; Frederick W. Wiles, "German Colonization in Brazil," Fortnightly Review, LXXIX (January, 1906), 129, 16. E. Chapman, ed., "German Political Designs with Reference to Brazil," Hispanic American Historical Review, II (November, 1919), 587. "Dr. Herman Loyal is quoted as writing in 1918 or 1919 about Santa Catarina: "Nowhere are our colonies, those loyal offshoots from the mother root, so promising as here. Today in these provinces over 50 per cent of the inhabitants are German or of German descent and the ratio of their natural increase far exceeds that of the Portuguese. Surely to us belongs the future of this part of the world. . . . Here indeed in South Brazil is a land where the German emigrant may retain his nationality, where for all that is comprised in the word 'Germanismus' a glorious future smiles." 15

15 One of the worst offenders was the Companhia Light and Power which, in 1906 blocked a navigable stream, the Rio Pirai, and backed it into a valley that already lacked proper drainage. Jornal do Comércio, January 24, 1909.

To the Indian, this exploitation of nature’s resources was a threat to whatever remained of his former seclusion and independence. It must have seemed to him that the invader was not only intent on occupying the best land but on destroying the rest. Such a thought could only drive him into deeper apathy or push him to more desperate resistance.

Lawless frontier elements: Cangaceiros. Certain distinctive characteristics of frontier life during the early years of the Republic further embittered the relationship between Indian and pioneer. The presence and activities of certain unrestrained and irresponsible groups resulted in a state of lawlessness not confined to any single village or state. Banditry, for example, was rampant in the backlands of Goiás, Baía, Pernambuco, Paraíba, and other states. Large roving gangs of marauders, known as cangaceiros, terrorised the inhabitants of large sections of the interior and destroyed rural settlements that refused the ransom they demanded. A form of gangsterism bred and prospered upon the costly and “enforced” protection of isolated communities. Accounts of wanton and ruthless destruction of homes and entire villages may be found in the Jornal do Comércio where such incidents of frontier outlawry received increasing attention from 1908 to 1910. Sometimes as paid agents of local “war lords” and other times as self-appointed champions of the common man against unpopular rule, the cangaceiros added an element of lawlessness to frontier life and, in so doing, helped to create an atmosphere that

17 Throughout April, 1910, the Jornal do Comércio carried articles on this problem, some of them referring to the wholesale massacre of small communities. See also an article on the cangaceiros in the Jornal do Comércio, Edição da Tarde, May 5, 1910, which cites cases of the murder of individuals and families in various sections of the interior.
bred distrust and fear in the Indian rather than friendship and cooperation.

Syrian traders. Another frontier element tending to complicate relations between the Indian and the white man in the period of this study was the Syrian trader. This newcomer, known to Brazilians as the mascate, began to arrive in Brazil at the turn of the century. Within a few years he was publishing newspapers in his own language in the state of São Paulo and worshiping in his own mosques.

Many of these immigrants from Syria and Lebanon, shortly after their arrival in Brazil, entered the interior as itinerant merchants. Working usually in pairs, they travelled extensively through the backlands, paddling and bartering their wares both in Portuguese settlements and in Indian villages. Although one may wonder what inducement they found in trade with the natives, it is nevertheless certain that they were active amongst them after 1910. Before that time it is likely that they were in contact with only the larger and more civilized Indian communities.

Protestant missionary reports have generally described the immoral character and exploitative business practices of the mascates as an unwholesome and disruptive influence on the Indians. According to eyewitness accounts, the Syrian traders encouraged drunkenness and exploited ignorance almost everywhere they went. The mascates were the Brazilian equivalent of the Indian traders in the United States who sold the natives firewater and firearms against all regulations. Whether or not the Syrian traders had an

appreciable influence in making more difficult the peaceful coexistence of the Indian and the Brazilian peoples in the interior, they were sufficiently troublesome to draw immediate opposition in 1910 from the newly created Indian Service. From that time forward, missionary societies and the Indian Service worked together to rid Indian communities of these irresponsible merchants.

Grilleiros. One of the most cunning violators of law and order, and a typical figure on the advancing line of settlement, was the grilleiro, falsifier of titles. It was most often he who made possible the large-scale appropriation of Indian-inhabited territory by the coffee planters and immigrant farmers of the central and southern states. To appreciate the grilleiro's operations, one must have some understanding of Brazil's property laws in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries.

All abandoned or uncultivated territory, even though occupied by native tribes, legally belonged, in the period of this study, to the state in which it was located or to individuals who, through inheritance, held often worthless title to ancient land grants known as semanrias. Recalling the old capitaniás and the fabulous grants of unsurveyed lands made in colonial days and never voided under the Empire, one can imagine how little territory was not considered private property. Unfortunately for the small farmer, it was an almost hopeless task to buy title to a small part of these large landholdings. The wealthy owners, not too sure themselves of where their lands began and ended, were seldom financially forced to sell. Nor were they anxious to lose the prestige that went with land proprietorship, or the advantages of
private game reserve for their hunting parties. 19

Blocked also in his attempt to secure title to a small piece of state-
owned land by costly and complicated paper work that only bribes could
speed, the poorer settlers became squatters on land that could be taken
on them at any time. No homestead law existed in Brazil to encourage
their permanent settlement and development of the soil, though a bill to
introduce such a system was presented in the federal House of Deputies in
1903 and was still pending action in 1910. All this meant, first of all, that
the Indians of the interior were annoyed by great numbers of propertyless
backwoodsmen and small cultivators who were constantly burning over new
pitches of scrub or forest, exhausting them by careless farming methods,
and moving again in an endless quest for virgin soil. Secondly, the con-
tions that militated against the purchase of small plots of land kept great
patches of the interior available for immense real estate deals involving
huge blocks of land inhabited only by squatters or by the Indians.

Before investigating these large-scale land purchases, it must be em-
phasized that the territory involved, i.e. much of the open savannas and
dense forests of western São Paulo, Paraná and Santa Catarina, was not
gally available for settlement by either nationals or immigrants. By right
prior and present occupation, these lands belonged to the Indians. By
legal sanction they either belonged to the states or to individuals who were
not making productive use of them and who were not inclined to sell. Since
a large proportion of this land could not be purchased legally from individuals,

19 Oliveira Viana, Evolução, pp. 130-131. See also Egon Schaden, "Último
vno de Nimuendajú," Anhembi-AN (March 1954), 95. According to Schaden,
there was little more than confusion and anarchy at this time in the whole
realm of property law.
or readily from state governments, it had to be wrested both from its lawful
owners and from the Indians who claimed it as their ancestral home. Seen
in this light, the advancing frontiers in central and southern Brazil under
the Republic represented a colossal land grab.

The grileiro helped to make the unscrupulous transaction possible by
handling the judicial aspects of the problem. He moved boundary markers
from their rightful locations or destroyed them altogether. He altered water
courses, either on land charts or on the land itself. He produced as evidence
of ownership decisions of imaginary judges and signatures of non-existent
witnesses. He made use of false or meaningless seals and produced counter-
feits of aged documents. As fast as he could steal the land by such dishonest
practices, he sold it in large blocks to coffee planters, or split it up in the
southern states for sale to small real estate companies or enterprising im-
migrant farmers. And five or ten years later, coffee trees or corn stalks
grew among the charred stumps of what had been the Indians’ home and
hunting ground. 20

Bugreiros. The professional hunters of Indians, the bugreiros, helped
to complete the wholesale land theft. It was their job to remove the Indian
from the areas secured illegally by the grileiro. In some cases, the bugreiros
were immigrants recently arrived from Europe. More often, they were
renegade mestiços. Although generally recruited from the lowest strata of
frontier society, some bugreiros were respectable citizens who took every

20 José Bento Monteiro Lobato, A onda verde (São Paulo, 1922), p. 144.
opportunity available to avenge the loss of their families or friends in past Indian attacks.

It is difficult to believe the stories told about these hired killers. Yet substantial evidence exists to testify to their brutal activities on the coffee plantation frontier of São Paulo and on the small-farm frontier of Santa Catarina. Often in the employ of large real estate concerns, they led expeditions against hostile Indian tribes who opposed the survey and settlement of newly acquired land. Then, as the white man's occupation of the area progressed, the bugreiros were hired as guides or leaders of small groups of a dozen to three dozen or more colonists, intent on avenging the latest Indian attack upon their community or upon the home of an isolated neighbor. Although they matched the Indian in their knowledge of forest lore, and though they went forth armed with repeating rifles, they avoided open combat and generally sought to surprise their victims in their sleep. This description of the bugreiros is not based on rumor or popularized accounts. References to night raids on Indian villages can be found in government documents. Details of such expeditions will be treated later when their introduction into the heated debate of the Indian question in 1909 contributed to a wave of public indignation.

More deceptive but equally destructive means of Indian extermination


O mesmo era costumado para convidar j o de boje, mais cruel e perigoso é incuramente efei-
were sometimes practiced. Newspaper accounts and an official report to the Minister of Agriculture attest to the fact that in the state of São Paulo, specifically, bugreiros were not averse to poisoning the natives' drinking water and leaving clothes contaminated with smallpox germs in the environs of Indian villages. Nowhere in Brazil, in 1908, was conflict between natives and Brazilians more bitter than in the western forests of São Paulo and Santa Catarina, where the grilleiros and bugreiros were clearing land for the advancing frontiers.

Indian resistance to the many forms of invasion and persecution heretofore described had, by 1908, visibly retarded Brazil's economic expansion and threatened the continued existence of the native tribes of the interior. This situation was sufficiently distressing to make necessary and urgent an attempt to deal with the Indian problem on a humanitarian basis and on a nation-wide scale.

In southern Brazil, as well as in the rubber forests of the North and on the plantation frontiers of the central states, the exploitation and extermination of the natives had assumed crisis proportions. Nor was there reason to feel that the situation would soon improve. The virgin soils and undeveloped resources of the wide inland plateau were drawing increasing numbers of farmers, cattlemen, plantation laborers, and rubber gatherers into Indian-

---

22 An account of a mission to poison the water supplies of several Indian villages, together with a brief summary of the gruesome results, appears in São Paulo's Diário Popular, April, 1888. A reference to water poisoning and the spreading of smallpox may be found in José Bezerra Cavalcanti, Exposição sobre a repulsão dos oficiais do exército posto a disposição daquele Serviço de Proteção aos índios e Localização dos Trabalhadores Nacionais (Rio de Janeiro, 1912), p. 19.
occupied territories where friction was almost inevitable. Furthermore, the nation was in the grip of an unprecedented desire to learn more about every mysterious corner of its vast territory and about the cultures of its most isolated Indian tribes. When geographers and ethnologists pushed their way back into remote regions, they too disturbed and antagonized the aborigines and provoked them to open hostility.

Never had the nation been as eager, or as well prepared financially and technically to develop its rich land resources, but such a development required either the cooperation of the Indian or his removal from the regions that were to be exploited. Unfortunately, the task of winning the natives' trust and friendship was a time-consuming one. Extermination seemed to be a faster and surer way to dispose of all present and future opposition. The massacre of Indians who posed a threat to the white man's advance became accepted practice throughout most of Brazil. So it was that increasing loss of life marred the faltering progress of railroad construction on the Estrada de Ferro Noroeste and the Estrada de Ferro São Paulo-Rio Grande in 1908. In that same year the market price of rubber and coffee was rising again, touching off another speculative boom and tempting a new land rush in the coffee and rubber regions that could only lead to further exploitation, displacement, and extermination of the natives.

German and Italian pressure groups in São Paulo and the southern states were clamoring in 1908 for state and federal protection for their countrymen who were attempting to settle on Indian-infested lands. Government action on this particular problem could hardly be postponed in the face of a 50 per cent increase of immigrants over the preceding year and indications of even heavier immigration in the years to come.
The Indian had undoubtedly become a national problem by 1908. Almost every ministry of the federal government was concerned over some aspect of Indian relations. Yet no central agency existed whose primary function it was to get to the roots of the problem. Although the Republican administration in 1908 was half-heartedly subsidizing a few Catholic mission stations on the fringes of hostile Indian territory, this could hardly be called a national program. On the policy-making levels of government, as well as in the nation's press, there was general recognition of the problem, but there was no positive and widely accepted approach to its solution. It almost appeared as if Brazil were unalterably resigned in September of 1908 to the gradual extermination of its hostile Indian tribes.
CHAPTER III

THE REACTION AGAINST INDIAN EXTERMINATION

Harmful publicity abroad. If it were possible to put one's finger on any single period or event in history and say "Here began the modern Brazilian Indian policy," the finger might well point to the proceedings of the Sixteenth International Congress of Americanists held at Vienna in 1908. The primary purpose of these continuing congresses, as they alternate biennially between cities of the Old World and the New, is the study of the origin, geographic distribution, physical characteristics, and culture of the indigenous races of the Americas. In the Vienna congress, the Indians of Brazil were to constitute a prominent part of the discussion.

Even before the Congress opened on September 9, the Brazilian emphasis was clearly evident. Paul Ehrenreich of Berlin, who had devoted a lifetime of study to the ethnologic classification of the South American Indians, was scheduled to read an important paper on the tribes of southern Brazil.

Four Brazilian learned societies were to be represented at the Congress by Manoel de Oliveira Lima, then at the height of his literary powers and serving at the time as Minister Plenipotentiary to the Belgian court.

---

1 The four societies represented at the Congress were the Instituto Histórico e Geográfico Brasileiro, the Sociedade de Geografia de Rio, the Instituto Arqueológico e Geográfico de Pernambuco, and the Centro de Ciências, Letras e Artes de Campinas, São Paulo. The last-named society was later to take a prominent role in the fight for Indian protection in Brazil.
The emphasis on Brazil was further evidenced by the excellent collections of Indian artifacts from that part of the world exhibited in the Vienna Museum as a special attraction for the delegates of the Americanist Congress. Franz Heger, Secretary General of the Congress, had personally negotiated for Austria, in 1906, the purchase and transport to Vienna of the extensive Indian collection of Brazil's Baroneza de Loreto. Furthermore, there was on display in the Vienna Museum for the first time, though still not in its entirety, the Johann Natterer Indian collection. It represented a study of more than eighty tribes of the Amazon region made during eighteen years of travel through Brazil. The twenty-five hundred or more artifacts gathered by Natterer had lain in their original packing crates for almost seventy years, awaiting an event such as this for their formal unveiling.

Surrounded by the tangible remains of primitive cultures that were still isolated and "unspoiled" at the time the collections were made, the delegates at the Vienna Congress were naturally interested in the extent to which these cultures had been altered or destroyed by subsequent contact with the white man's civilization. The director of the ethnologic section of the Vienna Museum undoubtedly sensed the interest in the present condition of the tribes represented in his museum's collections. On the opening day of the Congress, he made it clear that the true value of the Loreto and Natterer collections lay in the fact that they were all that remained of many of Brazil's lesser-known Indian cultures. It would be impossible at the present time, the director added, to gather such a varied collection as that of Johann Natterer, despite the more efficient tools and methods of modern ethnologic investigation. Too many of the original Indian cultures, he explained, were now destroyed
completely or so altered by contact with western civilization as to be no longer representative of a distinct, aboriginal way of life.$^2$

To the Brazilian delegates, the unfortunate reduction in the number of untouched primitive societies still available for study in Brazil was of lesser import than the tragic decimation of the Indians themselves. Early in the Congress, in an opening address on October 8, a delegate from Brazil’s northern state of Pará, Ignacio Baptista de Moura, disclosed the fact that the Indians of the Amazon region were being treated like animals by the so-called "civilized" invaders of their lands.

Baptista de Moura’s talk before the Americanist Congress in Vienna is of particular significance to this study because it reveals unmistakably the average Brazilian’s inability, as late as September, 1908, to take a positive stand against the further extermination of his country’s untrained Indian population. This inability to face the Indian problem squarely was largely the result of a natural hesitancy to sacrifice the advantages of rapid economic progress in order to treat the natives with the friendship and justice they deserved as the first inhabitants of the land. Baptista de Moura was troubled by the decimation of his country’s native population. Yet his pride in the industrial development of his region kept him alternating in his talk between gloomy references to the disappearance of the Amazonian Indians and optimistic reports on the growth of a new Brazil.

$^2$ Estado de S. Paulo (São Paulo City), October 12, 1908, p. 1, cols. 2-3. This journal will hereafter be cited as Estado de São Paulo.
Since one of the most significant things about that speech is the confusion in Moura's mind, reflected in his talk, as he tackled the crucial problem of Indian injustice in Brazil, his words are paraphrased or quoted here in the same haphazard, confusing order in which they were presented to the delegates of the Americanist Congress. Early in his speech, Baptista de Moura called attention to the gradual "disappearance" of his country's Indians:

We are the heirs of those ancient warrior tribes, many of whom accepted the yoke of civilization. The remainder, reduced to a nomadic existence, are gradually disappearing and carrying with them to their graves the mystery of their origin and of their numbers.

Baptista de Moura might have described at this point the manner in which the white man's persecution of the Indian contributed to this reduction of the native population. He chose, however, to overlook the reason for the Indians' decimation and jumped, instead, to a brighter subject. The Brazilians, he proudly declared, were not only the heirs of a vanishing race but the pioneers of a new race that was daily increasing in vigor and numbers, thanks to its expansive powers and its proven ability to absorb from European nations whatever might contribute to its own progress and civilization. Having thus paid tribute to German-Austrian contributions to the "new" Brazilian race (a touch of diplomacy, considering the location of this sixteenth Americanist Congress), Baptista de Moura returned to the Indian question with this foreboding prediction:

What remains of the first lords of the land, the Indians, is rapidly diminishing, and I think I am not being overbold in affirming that within fifty years the remaining Indians will have disappeared from this entire [Amazon] region of America, leaving behind them - unlike their counterparts of Peru and of Mexico - hardly a trace of their passage.

Here again, Baptista de Moura abruptly dropped the Indian theme and returned
to an optimistic account of economic developments in the Amazon region.

The speaker's vacillation between references to a declining Indian population, on the one hand, and to evidence of an advancing economy, on the other, ended in one last sympathetic reference to the Indians' tragic disappearance. If, from time to time, the natives resorted to killing a rubber collector or an innocent traveller, Moura explained, they almost always did so in revenge for the cruel treatment they received from those who called themselves civilized. Without attempting to explain what he meant by "cruel treatment," the delegate from Pará concluded with the words:

"Thus this race, so worthy of our study and of our compassion, is gradually vanishing." 3

The delegates were left guessing as to what the speaker was referring to when he said "Thus this race . . . is gradually vanishing." Was it civilized man's persecution of the natives, or their own low birth rate (mentioned earlier in the talk), that was decimating their numbers? Nowhere in the speech did Baptista de Moura clearly define the causes of the decline in numbers of the Indian population.

Although the delegate from Pará had avoided the subject of wilful Indian extermination, his repeated assertions of the rapid disappearance of Brazil's native peoples set the stage for what was to follow six days later. The director of the Vienna Museum's ethnography section had lamented the present scarcity

---

3 The preceding account of, and quotations from, Baptista de Moura's speech before the Congress of Americanists in Vienna on September 8, 1908, are taken from the Jornal de Comércio, October 26, 1908, p. 3, cols. 3-4. For original, see Igunesio Moura, "Sur le progress de l'Amazonie et sur ses Indiens," Verhandlungen des XVI internationalen amerikanisten-Kongresses: Wien, 9 bis 11 September, 1908 (Vienna and Leipzig, 1910), pp. 541-543.
of unspoiled primitive cultures in Brazil. Baptista de Moura had gone a step farther and called attention to the rapid disappearance of the Indians themselves. All was now in readiness for someone to explain clearly to the Congress just what was responsible for this tragic decimation.

In the morning session of September 14, a twenty-seven-year-old student of Indian affairs in Southern Brazil, Alberto Vojtech Frič (pronounced "Fritch"), arose to accuse Brazilian and European colonists alike of the deliberate extermination of Brazil's remaining savage tribes. Frič opened the dramatic exposé with the blunt statement that slave hunting, rapine, slaughter, and the premeditated introduction of deadly, contagious diseases such as smallpox into Indian villages were now completing the annihilation of the native population. Such brutality, Frič pointed out, was not confined to isolated regions of the Amazon rubber forests, but was commonly practiced amidst the flowering European colonies of the southern states.

The situation in the south, Frič said, was as follows: A few wealthy businessmen had purchased large tracts of land in areas where native resistance had discouraged extensive settlement by European immigrants. These lands, almost worthless when bought by the speculators, were sold in small sections at a profit of fifteen hundred per cent, just as fast as they were cleared of hostile Indians. Although the speaker did not actually describe the manner in which the bugreiros (professional killers of bugres, or savages) carried out their bloody mission, he cleverly prodded the delegates' imagination with the rather suggestive statement that he would refrain from telling them what he had
heard the Indian killers say about the "torture and murder of women and children." 4

Among the bugreiros - "these human hyenas" as Frič called them - were several who had taken pity on their helpless foes and had brought Indian women and children back with them to the cities. These captives, Frič said, were generally sold to individuals or to families who agreed to educate them. The speaker admitted that some families (notably Zimmermann and Gensch in Santa Catarina) treated their slaves well. He estimated, however, that more than one hundred Indian children had died during the past five years from lack of proper care while being reared under private auspices or in convents.

He went on to explain why Indian hunts were recurrent. The Indians, unable to avenge themselves on the bugreiros who had wronged them and unable to find their children in the cities where they were held, appeased their wrath by massacring helpless colonists in outlying settlements. The complaints against Indian atrocities, supported by politically influential land speculators, resulted in government authorization for new punitive expeditions.

Only the return of the enslaved children and the future protection of Indian tribes in government reservations (with assurance of such protection) could stop this inhuman warfare, Frič felt, and this had already been attempted. The State of Santa Catarina had granted them a large tract of land for the Indians' use, and he had been given the official title, "Pacifier of the Indians of Santa Catarina." He went on to describe for his fellow-delegates the

---

opposition that had forced him to abandon his reservation scheme. Many individuals, he explained, were determined to secure land concessions in the area which had been granted to him for the reservation. For this reason, he said, his projected plan was criticized in the local press and he himself was made the object of a smear-campaign through anonymous articles and false telegrams. Finally, Frič concluded with evident bitterness, action by the imperial emissary in Petropolis (summer headquarters for many of Brazil's government officials and foreign diplomats) had resulted in the annulment of his contract as a naturalist and field representative for the Berlin and Hamburg museums.

Before closing his talk, Alberto Frič made an effort to enlist the official support of the Americanist Congress in behalf of the persecuted Indians of Brazil. He first asked the delegates if they would agree with him that savages were human beings. Secondly, he asked if they would also agree that the Indian warfare provoked by a few greedy speculators in southern Brazil was unworthy of civilized man in the twentieth century and that the loss of hundreds of lives on both sides was a senseless waste. If, Frič said, the delegates were in accord with him on the only humanitarian answers possible to those questions, then, with their support, he would ask that the Congress

... protest these barbarous acts so as to clear this stain from the records of modern European conquest in South America and end forever this man-hunt and slavery. 5

In the discussion that followed, Eduard Selor of the Berlin Museum made an effort to soften the impact of this spirited Indian defense. He admitted that

5Frič, "Völkerwanderungen," Verhandlungen, p. 67.
it was unfortunately true that avenging expeditions had been sent against the Indians. He assured the Congress, however, that according to information just recently made available to him, the unjust and distressing acts described by Fric had now come to an end. Selar contended that the children captured during raids on Indian villages and taken back to the cities were not treated as slaves, as Fric claimed. As proof of this, the scientist added, he had with him a number of copies of a pamphlet on the education of Indian children in southern Brazil. The fact that it was published in Berlin just prior to the opening of the Congress and available for immediate distribution at the close of Fric's talk leads one to wonder if the disclosure of Indian slavery was anticipated and the statement printed in preparation for it. The information contained in the pamphlet was considered of sufficient interest and relevance to be inserted in the annals of the Congress and mentioned specifically on that publication's title page.

Eduard Selar then dropped the subject of Indian extermination. Like Paul Ehrenreich, who had previously opened the discussion of Fric's paper, Selar proceeded to attack the young naturalist's questionable conclusions concerning ethnologic and linguistic relationships between certain of the tribes of southern Brazil. The discussion became heated when Fric questioned the validity of a document referred to by the older scientist. When Selar protested Fric's comment as an insinuation, his words were interrupted by a signal from

---

6 Hugo Gensch, Die Erziehung eines Indianerkindes: Praktischer Beitrag zur Lösung der südamerikanischen Indianerfrage (Berlin, 1903).

7 Gensch, "Die Erziehung," Verhandlungen, Appendix, pp. 3-56.
the session's president, Vice-President Karl von den Steinen closed the meeting by refusing Frič the right to continue the discussion. This was not to be the end of it, however.

In the afternoon session, the president of the Congress himself, Wilhelm Freiherr von Weckbecker, called attention to the two controversial issues raised that morning by Alberto Frič. The first, he said, was a purely ethnological question involving problems of linguistic classification. Enough attention had already been devoted to that subject in the morning's discussion, he said, to make further debate unnecessary. The second question at issue, von Weckbecker felt, was strictly moral in its implications. Certainly, he said, the plight of the American Indian drew the sympathy of all civilized people and especially of Americanists, who had devoted their lives to a study of the native races. He added, however, this was a "question of humanity and perhaps of government policy." It therefore did not pertain to the business of a scientific congress. This matter, he said, like the first, must be closed to further discussion. 8

Although the session confirmed von Weckbecker's decision, Frič's account of Indian extermination, together with the discussion that followed it, had already been too well publicized to be smothered in Vienna. From Brazil's consul general and ambassador in Berlin came indignant protests against the "exaggerated tales" of injustice practiced by European colonists on the natives of the New World. The German press, like the German scientists at the

8 Verhandlungen, pp. LXIV-LXV.
Congresses, Ehrenreich, Selig, and von Weckbecker, made haste to discount Fric’s expose of Indian hunting and enslavement in the German colonial areas of southern Brazil. The Berliner Tageblatt and the Berliner Lokalanzeiger emphasized the fact that Alberto Fric was not a German but a Czechoslovakian subject, a native of Prague; by doing so they implied that the young man’s testimony was a politically inspired distortion of the truth, motivated by personal animosities and perhaps even by the desire to block Germany’s intensive colonization of Brazil’s southern states.

Back in Río de Janeiro, the venerable daily, Jornal do Comércio, carried three notices in two days of a petition from the Vienna congress to the Brazilian government requesting that Indian slavery be abolished in the state of Santa Catarina. It did not, however, pursue the question. It indirectly paid tribute to the humanitarian efforts of a young delegate to Vienna, but did not repeat Fric’s anti-German statements concerning land speculation, Indian hunts, the slaughter or enslavement of Indian women and children, and the public and official German opposition to the Indian reservation scheme. To do so would have meant taking sides in the struggle between the Indian and the colonist. This the press was not yet ready to do.

The von Ihering statement. Fric’s disclosure in Vienna, though contested by German scientists at the Congress, discredited by German press notices, and quickly dropped by the Brazilian press, caught the attention of a prominent scientist in São Paulo. This man, Herman von Ihering, realized Fric’s

---

crusading and non-scientific remarks in Vienna were damaging to Germany's reputation and, in some ways, unfair to the German colonists who, in Santa Catarina, were spearheading civilization's advance into the interior. However, rather than suppress the young Czezh's accounts of Indian extermination and slavery, von Ihering made plans to use this evidence of conflict as the opening wedge in an attack on the want of government protection for German colonists in the frontier settlements of the southern states. In a session of the Instituto Histórico e Geográfico de São Paulo, held on October 5, 1900, he followed his words of thanks for promotion to the rank of "honored member" with a request to speak in the coming session of October 20 on the question of the Indians of southern Brazil and to comment on the recent developments (meaning the Fric testimony) at the Congress of Americanists in Vienna.

Hermann von Ihering's prominent role in provoking an extensive and prolonged debate of the Indian problem in Brazil can only be understood in connection with Brazilian feelings toward him as a man and as a representative of "German science." Born in Giessen in 1850, the son of a distinguished jurist and author, von Ihering had come to Brazil in 1880 with a reputation as a specialist on mollusks. 10 He came originally on a honeymoon trip, found Brazil appealing, and decided to settle down with his bride in the state of Rio

---

10 The information here given has been taken from a biographical sketch written by Affonso d'Escragnolle Taunay, the man who succeeded von Ihering as director of the Museu Paulista in 1916. It was published in the Revista do Museu Paulista, XVII (1931), Part I, pp. 453-466. Critical comments on von Ihering or his wife represent a consensus of opinion among several people interviewed by the writer who knew the scientist or had been close to his associates or subordinates.
Grande do Sul. When forced by revolutionary developments to abandon his property in 1892, he had accepted the directorship of the zoology section of the Comissão Geográfico e Geológico de São Paulo and had continued, uninterrupted, his study of the plant, insect, and animal life of southern Brazil. Three years later he became director of the newly created Paulista Museum, a position he held until 1915.

Somewhat Prussian in his bearing and in his methods of administering the Museum, von Ihering assumed not only responsibility but also credit for much of the painstaking labor of his subordinates. With those who displeased him he could be biting almost sarcastically. Hard on others, he was even harder on himself. Work was a passion with him. The more difficult it appeared, the more it excited him. There was no schedule to limit his working hours.

While his associates rested on the many religious and national holidays, von Ihering worked as if he alone could, through his own endeavors, offset their wasted hours.

It was difficult for Brazilians to draw close to such a man. Writing almost exclusively in German before his appointment to the Museu Paulista, he contributed frequent articles to German-language newspapers in the southern states. He spoke Portuguese with a German accent and surrounded himself at the Museum with German scientists. He was the epitome of the European scholar of his day, who came to Brazil in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, imbued with the idea of raising the level of her scientific standards, determined to make an international reputation for himself, and hoping to return to his homeland to die.

The investigation carried on in Brazil by foreign-born ethnologists and
anthropologists like von lhering has not always been appreciated by the Brazilians, and this attitude had a direct bearing on the forthcoming Indian debate. Most of the scientists working among the Indians during the first two decades of the Republic were of German nationality. Not until more recent times have Brazilian scholars, trained in these sciences, moved out among the Indians in significant numbers. This meant that prior to 1910 most of the important contributions to the knowledge of the Indians' origin, languages, and cultures were written in the German language. Only a few of them were translated immediately into Portuguese for those who found German difficult. The Brazilians who gave any thought to the matter were naturally disappointed and somewhat annoyed to find that the ranking authorities on the Indians of their land were not Brazilians, and that the most accurate and up-to-date information on the natives was in the German, rather than in the Portuguese, language.

Almost all these investigators, thoroughly convinced that the last hour had come for the native races, were busy collecting, while there was still time, samples of clothing, handicrafts, weapons, objects of ceremonial or religious import - anything that could later be displayed as tangible evidence of past civilizations. Although some of these artifacts remained in Brazil,

11Baldus, Bibliografia crítica da etnologia brasileira (São Paulo, 1954), pp. 16-17. See also Nelson Coelho de Senna's sympathetic treatment of the German contribution to Brazilian ethnology in O que deve o Brasil à cultura e à cooperação germânicas (São Leopoldo, Rio Grande do Sul, 1935).

the bulk of them went to swell the excellent Indian collections of German and Austrian museums. Karl von den Steinen and Max Schmidt considerably enriched the collections of the Berlin Museum before returning to Germany to administer, in turn, the South-American division of that institution. Koch-Grünberg also collected for that museum, and Fritz Krause for the one in Leipzig. This exodus to Germany of valuable and extensive collections of artifacts, such as those on display in the Vienna Museum in 1908, further antagonized the Brazilian scientists who were finding it increasingly difficult to enlarge their own museum collections.

To Hermann von lhering, as to most of his colleagues, the Indian was merely a subject to be observed and classified—almost as if he were an inanimate object. His gradual disappearance was considered inevitable and was lamented, not so much as a human loss, but because it deprived scientists of the opportunity to analyze his aboriginal culture at leisure and so unravel the tangled thread of his past. It was not that von lhering was entirely insensitive to the plight of the Indian, but only that he was more sensitive to the problems of the colonist. For twelve years he had witnessed in the state of Rio Grande do Sul the impressive results of German enterprise, in both industry and agriculture. The sort of Indian hunting described by Frič had not accompanied the colonizing movement in this southernmost state. Unable to observe, either in Rio Grande do Sul or in eastern São Paulo, the worst aspects of the colonists' warfare with the Indians, von lhering was limited in his knowledge of the conflict to what he had read in newspapers. Much of his information was gleaned from German-language periodicals and newspapers such as the Urwaldsbote of Blumenau, Santa Catarina. What he read there was a very different story
from that told by Alberto Frič at the Vienna congress. It was a one-sided account - a never-ending protest against Indian brutality endured by the German settlers, a constant plea on the part of the colonist for more governmental protection.

It is not surprising, therefore, that von Ihering allowed some anti-Indian sentiment to creep into a scientific study of São Paulo's Indians, which he contributed to the St.-Louis Exposition in 1904. This monograph was written in English and was probably read by a very limited number of Portuguese scientists. Two years later, it was published in Brazil in an enlarged and revised edition, finally in the English language. The following year, while von Ihering was absent on a six months' tour of the leading museums of Europe, the study was translated into Portuguese and published in the 1907 volume of the Museu Paulista's scientific journal where for the first time to the public in the days and weeks immediately following Alberto Frič's protest in Vienna against Indian enslavement and massacre by German colonists in Santa Catarina, von Ihering's controversial statement will be quoted in a later paragraph.

At this point it is important to note the connection between Frič's talk at

---


The Americanist Congress and this study by the director of the Museu Paulista, Frič, persona non grata both in the German communities of Santa Catarina and among the highly-trained German scientists at the Vienna congress, had not hesitated to expose to world-wide attention the German colonists' persecution of Brazil's Indians. As already noted, this slap at the German people was not extensively supported or countered by the Brazilian press. Nevertheless, it caused many Brazilians to look with suddenly intensified disfavor upon German settlement in the southern states. It was just at this point, when German colonial expansion in the southern states was being viewed by Brazilians with an extremely critical eye, that von lhering's study of the Indians of São Paulo came to public attention. It happened in the following way:

The Almeida protest. Sometime before October 12, a copy of the controversial treatise fell into the hands of an elderly scholar and influential publicist in the state of São Paulo by the name of Silvio de Almeida. The paragraph on Indian extermination that Almeida discovered in von lhering's fifty-six page anthropological study seemed to him even more disturbing than the testimony by Alberto Frič in Vienna. Here was an eminent scientist, director of one of Brazil's finest museums, a man whose salary was paid by the state of São Paulo, not just discussing Indian extermination but apparently recommending it as an answer to the Indian problem.

Silvio de Almeida did not hesitate to lift the offending passage from context and quote it as the opening paragraph of his October 12, front page column in the Estado de S. Paulo. This, in translation, is the way it appeared:

The present-day Indians of the state of São Paulo do not represent an element [that contributes either] to labor or to progress. Because no serious and sustained labor can be expected from the civilized Indians of this, or any other, state of
Brazil, and because savage "Caingangas" are an impediment to the colonization of the backwoods regions they inhabit, it seems that we have no alternative but to exterminate them. 15

The reader will note the ambiguity in this paragraph that seems to condemn to extermination both the civilized and the wild Indians. But before assuming that von Lhering was suggesting the annihilation of savage Indians only, it should be questioned whether he was actually recommending the deliberate extermination of any of Brazil's Indians. The words "parece que não ha outro meio, de que se possa lançar mão, senão o seu exterminio" certainly suggest some sort of program of extermination. It should be remembered, however, that this was a translation of the 1906 edition that may or may not have been done by the author. The wording of the 1906 original bears a less sinister connotation. It reads: "... no other final result seems possible than that of their extermination." 16 Even these words, however, are deceptively vague in their meaning and leave the reader guessing as to whether von Lhering was merely foretelling the Indian's extermination or actually recommending it. Von Lhering's own explanation of this controversial passage will be presented later, in the proper sequence of events. At this point it is of less importance to know what he meant to say than to note what his critic, Silvio de Almeida, claimed that he said.

15 Os actuais índios do Estado de S. Paulo não representam um elemento de trabalho e de progresso. Como também nos outros Estados do Brasil, não se pode esperar trabalho serio e continuado dos índios civilizados e como os 'Caingangas' selvagens são um impedimento ao progresso das regiões de que habitam, parece que não ha outro meio, de que se possa lançar mão, senão o seu exterminio." Silvio de Almeida, Estado de São Paulo, October 12, 1908, p. 1, cols. 1-2.

16 Von Lhering, Anthropology, p. 12.
In his article of October 12, Almeida gave von Ihering no benefit of the doubt. This is a significant point. If the writer had felt any sympathy for von Ihering as a man, he would have weighed the scientist’s words, sought the true meaning behind them, and then used them to introduce a reasoned attack on the problems involved in Indian-white relations.

Silvio de Almeida’s protest was not primarily a discussion of the Indian problem, but more a personal attack on Hermann von Ihering and on what the columnist referred to as the “modern science imported from Germany.”

Here was a man, the writer said, who was likening the Indians to wild beasts; who was using a materialistic science to justify not only a “struggle for life” but the capture and enslavement of women and children and the slaughter of the weak and the helpless. Apparently, Almeida continued in a sarcastic tone, the murder of São Paulo’s ten thousand Indians meant little to this man. Most biting of all was the columnist’s prediction that a scientific theory designed to justify the exploitation of primitive races by representatives of a stronger race might well apply in the future to the exploitation of Brazil’s resources by the most capable among Europe’s imperialistic powers. In such a case, Almeida warned, the history of past invasions might be repeated, and once again the defense of Brazil might rest, in the final analysis, upon the loyal support of the black and Indian races - those so-called “inferior” races.

Although Silvio de Almeida’s article contained more than a personal attack, it offered little constructive criticism. The names of past and present defenders of the Indian - Father Anchieta, João Barbosa Rodrigues, Leolinda Daltro, and

---

17 Almeida, Estado de São Paulo, p. 1, col. 2.
padre Malan - were introduced in so casual a manner that the reading public could draw from them no helpful ideas, but only the feeling that these individuals were in accord with the writer's own deep sympathy for the Indian and the profound indignation aroused by von Lhering's words. The fact that Almeida, a strong propagandist for Auguste Comte's Positivist philosophy, referred sympathetically to the two Catholic padres, Anchieta and Malan, seems to indicate his sincere preoccupation with the need for greater love and understanding of the Indian, regardless of the methods used to solve the problems involved.

The importance of Almeida's October 12 attack on Hermann von Lhering cannot be overstressed. By publicizing on the front page of a leading São Paulo newspaper an apparently cold-blooded recommendation of Indian extermination by an unpopular German-born scientist, just at the height of a pro-Indian, anti-German reaction caused by Alberto Fric's accusations against the German colonists in Santa Catarina, Almeida, by focusing the attack on the words of a single man, provided a perfect scapegoat for those who had long sympathized with the Indian but had hesitation to denounce the heartlessness of the colonists as a group or the economic interests that seemed to be responsible for the ruthless treatment of the Indians on the advancing frontier. To speak against pioneers and railroads had been to speak against progress. To speak, however, against von Lhering and a "modern, imported science" had a nationalistic flavor that for reasons already stated (and others) was increasingly relished by many Brazilians.
The Horta Barbosa protest. A second protest against the "von Hering doctrine" followed close upon the first. On the same day, October 12, Silvio de Almeida received an open letter of support and praise from his young friend and coreligionist in the Positivist creed, Luís Bueno Horta Barbosa. Again the "extermination paragraph" was noted - this time in shortened but still explosive form - and again von Hering was branded as representing a heartless "imported science." One paragraph in particular illustrates the warmth of the attack and the nationalistic fervor that crept into it:

Against this ruthless and barbaric theory of a scientist alien to our sentiments and to our best preconceptions, patriotic Brazilians should arise energetically and eagerly lest our national character be altered and the traditions inherited from those who legitimately represent the soul of our Brazilian nation be lost through the stupid blindness with which some people are always quick to applaud and adopt the ways of so-called enlightened people. 18

Horta Barbosa strongly objected to von Hering's disparaging remarks about the Indian's inability to labor and enter into the life of a modern nation. Quoting from General Couto de Magalhães, a prominent Brazilian explorer and Indianist of the nineteenth century, he extolled the Indian's keen perception, his readiness to imitate, his eagerness to learn, and his cleverness in all the arts of war and peace. And, Horta Barbosa continued, what if some Indians did not enjoy the discipline of labor? They could still become Brazilians - speak the nation's language, abide by its laws, give their lives in its military forces. Even if they did not respond as magnificently as had the Indians of

18 L. B. Horta Barbosa, "Em defesa dos indígenas brasileiros," Jornal do Comércio, November 11, 1908, p. 12, cols. 1-2. This open letter appeared first in a smaller, inland-city newspaper, Cidade de Campinas, shortly after it was written on October 12. The underlined words in this passage were italicized in the Jornal do Comércio.
Mato Grosso, the Parceis, who now formed the backbone of the working population of the state, and who were presently keeping in repair the telegraph lines of Cândido Rendon's telegraphic commission, nevertheless, it was a moral duty, Horta Barbosa stressed, to protect them and help them.

This protest was more constructive in its criticism than was the first by Almeida. Quoting at length from an article written ten months earlier by R. Teixeira Mendes, leader and official spokesman for the Igreja Positivista (Positivist-church) of Brazil, Horta Barbosa presented a basic outline of action to be taken on the Indian problem. These primitive peoples, he said, 19

19 R. Teixeira Mendes, "Ainda os indígenas do Brasil e a política moderna," Igreja e Apostolado Positivista do Brasil [December 1907], 3–14. Positivist-writings contain several spelling peculiarities, one of which is the "ç" in place of "s." Henceforth, the above-mentioned publication will be cited as Igreja e Apostolado Positivista do Brasil.

For the reader unfamiliar with the unique religious development of the Positivist movement in Brazil, some few words here may help to explain the prominent role taken by its acting head (after 1903), Raymundo Teixeira Mendes, and several of its members in the forthcoming campaign for Indian justice and protection. After the Paraguayan War, R. Teixeira Mendes and a close friend, Miguel Lemos, carried their interests in Auguste Comte's Positivist philosophy into abolitionist activities among a group of young, liberal Republicans. In 1876, Comte's followers in Brazil formed a society which, four years later under Teixeira Mendes' direction, adopted the generally rejected religious aspects of Comte's philosophy and proceeded to hold regular Sunday meetings, open to the public, in which it began to propagate its teachings. In the following year, 1881, the society took the name "Igreja e Apostolado Positivista do Brasil" (Positivist-Church and Apostolate of Brazil).—José Verissimo, in a study of the religious aspects of Brazilian Positivism, wrote in 1923: "Because Positivism is more than a mere philosophic system; because it is a unified, complete, and universal doctrine embracing man and all that concerns him, it was easy for its followers to organize into a school, center their activities in a church and, thus united, begin to evangelize."—José Verissimo, "O positivismo no Brasil," Estudos de Literatura brasileira: Primeira série, 1895–1906, 1 (Rio de Janeiro, 1915), 53. Under the increasingly dictatorial supervision of Miguel Lemos and R. Teixeira Mendes, Positivism in Brazil became a directing force that governed its members' choice of vocations, political sympathies, family relationships, moral code— even their spelling and calendar system. When Miguel Lemos returned from a trip to Paris in 1881 and, with Teixeira
must be recognized and treated as free and independent nations. Still quoting
from Teixeira Mendes, Horta Barbosa stated that the Indians' territory must
be respected and their lives and welfare protected by law. The white man's
responsibility, he continued, was not to catechize but to protect the wild In-
dians and to provide them with the benefits of science and industry. Their
friendship and loyalty must first be won, and that, Horta Barbosa said, would
require the sort of program used so successfully by the Jesuits in the distant
past - music, presents and promises, clear and honest reasoning by men who
speak the natives' language.

Mendes, proclaimed that henceforth Brazil's Positivists would neither own
slaves nor take active part in politics, the decision was not supported by Pierre
Lafite, the leader of "religious Positivism" in France. For this and other
reasons, Lemos and his followers then broke away from French Positivism.
Despite restrictions on their political actions, orthodox Positivists ex-
pressed indirectly through their meetings, lectures, and publications their
wishes for a dictatorial republican government. They were in complete
sympathy when one of their "heterodox" brethren, Benjamim Constant, used
the military backing of General Deodoro da Fonseca to proclaim the Republic
in 1889. The profound influence of Positivism in launching the Republic has
been recognized by most historians and generally conceded in Brazil, even
by those who have little sympathy for Positivist teachings. The Igreja Positivista
still represented, in 1908, a small, high principled and powerful group of
scholars, military officers and wealthy families. Teixeira Mendes, its paternal-
istic leader after 1903, was considered by most of his contemporaries as a
saintly individual possessing one of the nation's finest intellects. His abolition-
ist activities of Empire days gave way to a growing interest in the welfare of
Brazil's native population - an interest that was in harmony with the ideals of
Auguste Comte's "Religion of Humanity."

The information presented here is taken largely from João C. de Oliveira
Torres, O positivismo no Brasil (Rio de Janeiro, 1943), pp. 528-56. A brief
study of the impact of Positivism on Brazil prior to 1895 may be found also in
Sylvio Roméro, Doutrina contra doutrina: O Evolucionismo e o Positivismo no
Brasil, 2nd ed. (Rio de Janeiro, 1895). A biographical study of Miguel Lemos
and H. Teixeira Mendes may be found in João Perneta, Os dois apóstolos / 3.
(Curitiba - Paraná, 1927). The most recent study of the impact of Positivism on
Brazilian politics appears in George Boehrer, Da Monarquia à República: História
229-335.
But above all, Horta Barbosa continued, the Brazilians must heed the advice of their renowned "patriarch of independence," José Bonifácio, who had called upon his nation back in 1823 to recognize its blame for the Indians' hostility and to make an effort to win back their friendship and loyalty through just conduct and patient understanding. Such was a program more worthy of the Brazilian people, Horta Barbosa said, than was the alternative suggested by Hermann von Ihering. Surely, he concluded, the noble ideas and sentiments of Brazil's wisest and most distinguished patriots lay closer to the solution of the nation's Indian problem than did the "stupid and heartless materialism of the theorist from the Museu Paulista,"

What is the significance of these two attacks on Hermann von Ihering and on his statement concerning Indian extermination? Each had assumed that the scientist's intentions were of the worst, and had given him no benefit of the doubt. Each had played upon the average Brazilian's distrust of a scientist who had come from beyond their borders and of a science that lay beyond their real understanding. Each had painted this man and this science as the true enemies of the Indian. The Indian's friend, then, was the patriotic Brazilian who, in the tradition of Padres Nobrega and Anchieta, of Couto de Magalhães and João Barbosa Rodrigues, of José Bonifácio and Teixeira Mendes, recognized the real potentialities of the Indian, if only he were loved and understood. These two protests, by their vilification of von Ihering and his materialistic science and by their eloquent defense of the natives' inherent goodness, combined with an almost irresistible appeal to the Brazilians' gallantry and

---

20 Horta Barbosa, Jornal do Comércio, p. 12, cols. 1-2.
benevolence, could not fail to touch off a new wave of romantic interest in
the Indian which was to express itself this time, not in the nineteenth century
form of idealistic prose and poetry, but in a practical and sustained effort
to end the bitter clash between the European and the native races.

With the protests of Silvio de Almeida and Luís Bueno Horta Barbosa
in October 1908, the Indian may be said to have begun his conquest of the
hearts of the Brazilian people. Hermann von Ihering and the scientific
theories he represented were about to lose a portion of the prestige they
had held in Brazil for almost half a century. The defense of the Indian and
the attack on von Ihering were now firmly launched.

Silvio de Almeida’s protest had been published on the twelfth of October
- a Monday morning. Sometime Tuesday the same paper, The Estado de São
Paulo, received from von Ihering an answer to Almeida’s protest, but failed
to publish it immediately. The editor found sufficient space in the Wednesday
issue, however, to insert two short notices on the subject. The first informed
the reading public that a Mr. L. B. Horta Barbosa, in an open letter, had
applauded enthusiastically the Almeida article. The notice referred to the
"extravagant theory of dr. [sic] H. Iering." The misspelling of von Ihering’s
name was to appear repeatedly in the next few months and causes one to wonder
if it were not the result of intentional carelessness. The second notice referred
to the receipt of von Ihering’s rebuttal which, the paper said, would be pub-
lished "opportune."2

20 Estado de São Paulo, October 15, 1908, p. 2.

21 Ibid., p. 1.
It is not easy to explain or justify this delay. Perhaps the editor of the *Estado de São Paulo* deliberately withheld publication of von lhering's answer as an expression of his disapproval of the scientist's Indian sentiments. In any case, he kept many of his subscribers in keen suspense. The big question in most minds was: "Will von lhering accuse Almeida and Horta Barbosa of misinterpreting his words, or will he stand behind his statement and attempt to justify Indian extermination?"

While von lhering and many others were impatiently awaiting the appearance in print of his rebuttal, and while he was still preparing for his October 20 speech on the Indians of southern Brazil and the Fric testimony in Vienna, a third attack was launched against him - this time in the city of Campinas, not far from São Paulo. With this third protest, the controversy for which von lhering was largely responsible made its first appearance within the chambers of a learned society in Brazil. It is this shift from direct attack in the press, by individuals acting independently, to discussion and attack within cultural and scientific societies of the state of São Paulo, that is the subject of the next chapter.
CHAPTER IV

WAS THE INDIAN DOOMED?

As the argument grew hotter over the disposition of hostile Indians who seemed to block the way to progress, both von Lihoring and his adversaries centered their attention upon the most controversial issue involved: the question of whether Brazil should remain indifferent to the extermination of her native population. The more-basic question of how best to pacify and civilize the Indian was not yet confronted at this early stage of the argument. The von Lihoring statement, as publicized and interpreted by Almeida and Horta Barbosa, together with Frics sensational expose in Vienna, had suddenly made the thought of willful Indian decimation seem unforgivably cruel and alien to the Brazilian temperament and to the nation's most cherished traditions. On the other hand, it was clearly apparent that a program of Indian pacification and protection would require the formulation of a definite Indian policy. That alone might take more time than would the unrestricted massacre of the hostile tribes. Moreover, any project designed to win the friendship and cooperation of savage Indians was fraught with difficulties and uncertainties. Its success would depend upon the nature of the various primitive races involved and upon their adaptability to the ways of modern civilization. It would be a dangerous, expensive, time-consuming task and a heavy responsibility.

Were the Indians worth so much trouble and expense? Would their future contribution to the nation's culture and economy repay the cost of pacifying, protecting, and civilizing them? Almeida and Horta Barbosa
believed that it would. In any event, they had both made it clear that Indian protection was a moral responsibility that Brazilians must shoulder, irrespective of the material benefits to be derived therefrom. According to their attacks on Hermann von Ihering, the latter was too coldly scientific in his reasoning to see the moral implications. It was obvious to von Ihering's opponents that although he had placed in his anthropological study that there seemed to be no alternative to Indian extermination, his true meaning was: "There seems to be no really practical alternative to extermination." Von Ihering was a practical-minded man, and his apparent endorsement of Indian extermination in Brazil was not only an expression of his sympathy for the German colonists in their conflict with the natives, but also the results of a conviction long held by almost all Brazilians that extermination, though cruel, was an easy, quick, inexpensive and lasting method of removing the Indian obstruction to national progress.

The easy and conventional method of dealing with Indian obstruction was now under strenuous attack. At the same time, a far more difficult approach was at last under serious consideration: that of assuring the natives' survival and peaceful existence within the framework of the white man's civilization. Silvio de Almeida and Luis Bueno Horta Barbosa had, in their attacks on von Ihering, denounced the traditional practice of extermination and recommended that the Indians be protected no matter what the cost in time, effort and expense. Their arguments were the early expression of a rapidly growing conviction in Brazil that future treatment of the native races must be governed by moral principles rather than by mere expediency.
Discussion in The Centro de Ciências, Letras e Artes

It is not surprising that the third protest against Hermann von Ihering's seeming approval of Indian extermination originated in the Centro de Ciências, Letras e Artes in São Paulo's busy and progressive city of Campinas. As the financial center of extensive coffee lands, boasting more than its share of industrial plants, this city of almost one hundred thousand people considered itself in 1908 to be in the vanguard of Brazil's economic expansion. Its location, only sixty miles northwest of São Paulo, and its strategic position as the southern terminus of the Mogi Guaçu Railroad system added to its attractions as a center of wealth and of modern culture.

Within an atmosphere of economic optimism and mental sophistication, the Centro de Ciências had developed rapidly, since its inauguration in 1901, and had become one of the most active and most highly respected of Brazil's learned societies. Diligent and successful in its efforts to be represented at the more important national and international conferences, it was one of the four Brazilian societies represented by Manoel de Oliveira Lima at the International Congress of Americanists in Vienna, Austria.

The Centro de Ciências, Letras e Artes of Campinas moved on November 1, 1908, to a new meeting hall located in a less commercialized part of town. The larger and more modern structure had a library, a museum, a lecture hall and many conveniences that the older building had lacked. One is tempted to speculate on the effect that such a "graduation" to a splendid new center of operations might have had on the boldness with which the Centro de Ciências initiated and maintained leadership during the following months in an extensive campaign to protect the nation's Indian population. For a brief account of the founding of the Centro de Ciências and for a review of some of its more illustrious members from 1901 to 1908, see "Centro de Ciências, Letras e Artes de Campinas," Correio Paulistano, November 2, 1908, p. 3. The society, and the journal that bears its name, will be cited hereafter (except in quotations) as the Centro de Ciências and Revista de Centro de Ciências.
The Centro de Ciências' special interest in Hermann von Ihering's "extermination statement" stemmed in part from the fact that it had followed closely the proceedings of the Vienna Congress through the reports of its representative. The Society felt it had an indirect share both in the business and in the problems of the Congress. The picture of Indian decimation in the Amazon region, vividly drawn by the delegate from Pará, followed by Alberto Frič's scathing denunciation of professional Indian hunting in Santa Catarina, had squarely placed the issue of Indian extermination not only before the delegates of the Congress but, just as clearly, before the societies represented therein.

The Centro de Ciências had a further reason for taking an immediate and prominent part in the discussion of the Indian problem. This society was the only one of the four represented at the Vienna Congress that was not isolated from the Indian population by location on the coast. Although the city of Campinas was no longer on the frontier, which had moved beyond into western São Paulo, it nevertheless formed the center of a region that had been taken from the Indian and broken to the plow within the memory of many of its citizens. Whatever bitterness attended that struggle seems to have faded by 1908, leaving only a nostalgic memory of the days of the Indian frontier and of the exciting early years of the advancing coffee plantations. Thus the Centro de Ciências, because of its relative nearness to the Indian problem in both time and space, had reason for assuming leadership among Brazil's learned societies in the national discussion now agitating the country over the Indian's mistreatment and extermination.

Finally, the Centro de Ciências had a reason for opposing Hermann von Ihering on the basis of an aroused sense of nationalism. Although
Campinas was a far-smaller-and-more-inland-city-than São Paulo, it had experienced its share of irritation over foreigners. The pressing need for workers on surrounding plantations to supplant the slave-labor force of Empire days, in addition to the heavy demand for man power to supply the city's growing industries, had resulted in a large influx of European settlers into the area. According to statistics of 1909, almost five hundred immigrant families were concentrated in two population centers within the township of Campinas, and nearly seventeen thousand colonists of diverse nationalities were independently hired on plantations and in other agricultural enterprises on land within the city's jurisdiction. 2

However badly needed, the newcomers could not avoid arousing in the established Brazilian population a measure of irritation that was more often felt than publicly expressed. When the members of the Centro de Ciências read about Frie's protest against the extermination of Indians by European settlers in western Santa Catarina, and then learned that a prominent German scientist was attempting to justify such action in the pages of their own state museum's scientific journal, they may well have reacted on the basis of an already-roused feeling of nationalism against the "non-Brazilian" population.

For these and other reasons, the Centro de Ciências, Letras e Artes of Campinas took an immediate interest in the controversy provoked by the Frie testimony and the von Ihering statement. Luis Bueno Horta Barbosa,

---

2 These statistics were presented to the national House of Representatives by one of its members in support of a request for certain economic privileges desired by the city of Campinas. Anais da Câmara dos Deputados Republica dos Estados Unidos do Brasil: Sessões de Novembro de 1907, XII (XIV de Janeiro, 1910), pp. 730-731.
whose open letter to Silvio de Almeida was the second protest against von
Ihering's words, was a secondary school teacher in Campinas and the offi-
cial orator of the Centro de Ciências. Although he had acted independently
of the society, his protest was made that of the Centro by a fellow member,
Tito de Lemos, in a meeting of that body on October 17. Only a small sec-
tion of the older man's talk was incorporated into the minutes of the session,
but it is worth noticing here because of its influence in spreading the con-
troversy into other societies.

Considering that the "Centro de Ciências, Letras e Artes" has among its objectives the study of the indigenous race, and especially its art; and considering that, for this reason, we cannot be indifferent to the Indian's welfare, all the more because this unfor-
tunate American race, notwithstanding the martyrdom it has suffered, is one of the factors in our nationality, I suggest that this institution, by whatever method it deems most convenient, officially invite the geographical societies of São Paulo and Rio de Janeiro to join with it in a firm protest against the inhuman theory of Indian extermination held by Dr. H. Ihering [sic], whose scienti-
ific knowledge I admire, so as to prevent the weight of that knowl-
dedge and the prestige of his public office from attracting proselytes

This protest by Tito de Lemos before the Centro de Ciências took a
more positive approach to the issue raised by Hermann von Ihering than
had the earlier attacks by Silvio de Almeida and Horta Barbosa. Tito de
Lemos respected von Ihering as a scientist, and, for that very reason,
felt the potential danger of allowing so influential a man to voice publicly,
and unchallenged, the idea that Indian extermination was necessary or
inevitable. Troubled by the thought that Brazilians might accept von
Ihering's "survival of the fittest" philosophy, just at a time when the
Indian was most in need of protection, the motion by Tito de Lemos on

---

3 "Acta da 306. a sessão ordinaria de 17 de outubro de 1908. " Revista
do Centro de Ciências, Letras e Artes de Campinas. No. 31 (June, 1913),
pp. 71-72."
October 17 placed the Indians figuratively under the protection of the Centro de Ciências and invited two of the most powerful societies in Brazil to join in an official rejection of von Ihering’s stand.

Before closing his talk, Tito de Lemos added to the motion already quoted a suggestion that the civil authorities investigate the massacre of Coroadó Indians near Avanhandava along the Estrada de Ferro Noroeste. If they found it to be true that the hunting of Indians there was becoming a "novel and most entertaining kind of sport," as the Correio da Manhã (October 16, 1908) claimed that it was, then the perpetrators of this injustice should be punished under article 294, paragraph 1, of the Penal Code.

This recommendation combined with the suggestion that the geographical societies of São Paulo and Rio de Janeiro be invited to join the Centro de Ciências in its protest against the von Ihering statement, was warmly applauded and unanimously approved by the members present.

Von Ihering’s answer to the Almeida protest. Three days later, on October 20, 1908, Hermann von Ihering’s article in rebuttal of Almeida’s October 12, 1908, attack against him, was finally printed in the Estado de São Paulo. It is difficult to guess from a reading of this caustic reply just what his intentions were in answering Silvio de Almeida. Certainly they were not conciliatory. In a rather argumentative tone, von Ihering began by reiterating his belief that the Indians of Brazil were a non-productive element in the national economy. To substantiate that opinion, he quoted a statement by the highly respected nineteenth century explorer and student of Indian affairs, Souto de Magalhães, which pictured the baptized Indian as

Ibid., p. 72.
a degraded man. Drawing upon this and other sources to demonstrate the almost universal degeneration of the civilized Indian in Brazil, von Ilhering added that this unfortunate development had thus far proven to be beyond the ability of the government to prevent.

Only the Jesuits, von Ilhering said, had ever worked effectively among the Indians on a large scale, and that was because of their consuming devotion to a cause they believed in—a cause for which they were willing to sacrifice their comfort and their lives. That was why they could work miracles in raising the Indian cultures to a level the natives could not maintain without the padres and would probably never reach again. The time had passed, von Ilhering pessimistically affirmed, when conditions permitted such a noble work. The Indians had diminished in number and the Republican constitution would not permit, as before, their supervision by the clergy. There were at present, he admitted, some capable and devoted padres laboring among the Indians: Franciscans in São Paulo and fathers of the Orfanato Christovam Colombo in Paraná. But the scientist maintained—the present unselshful dedication of a few missionaries was not of great significance. The pessimistic treatment of the civilized Indians' cheerless future ended with the following remark:

Certain it is that the good fathers merit our sympathies for the zeal and abnegation with which they are dedicating themselves to the education of the Indians; but it would be an error to expect these charitable efforts to result in any substantial progress of the national life.

Couto de Magalhães, "Ensaião de anthropologia: Região e raças selvagens," Revista Trimestral do Instituto Histórico, Geográfico e Etnográfico de Brasil, XXXVI. Part 2 (1873), pp. 35-310. The title of this journal varies over the years since its first issue in 1839. Henceforth it will be cited as Revista do Instituto Histórico e Geográfico Brasileiro.

Von lhering's answer to Silvio de Almeida's protest of October 12 was thus far little more than a dreary, disheartening analysis of the government's and church's inability to prevent the rapid and almost universal degeneration of the Indians of Brazil when brought face to face with the white man's civilization. If the national government had been unable to do anything constructive for the Indian because it lacked the necessary spirit of love, dedication and abnegation of the missionaries of old, and if the time had passed when any great contribution to Indian welfare could be made by the Church, then what hope remained for the indigenous population of Brazil? Why bother to civilize the Indian if, in the process, he were stripped of his own culture and left a bewildered prey to all the vices of a new culture that he would not, and could not, accept wholly as his own?

With this pessimistic evaluation of the Indian, expressed at the outset of the argument by von lhering, the pendulum swung to the diametrically-opposite extreme from the idealistic conception of the "noble savage" voiced by the Indianists of nineteenth century romanticism in Brazilian literature. Von lhering, with his sombre picture of the civilized Indian as a degraded, unproductive and non-pliable element in the national life, was threatened to turn out the lights of the radiant future his opponents were beginning to envision - a future in which the Indian would take his place beside the white man in a new bond of understanding that would make effective the long-awaited union of the races and their cultures.

Having presented this depressing analysis of the "degenerate" civilized Indian and his inability to contribute to the nation's economy, von lhering hastened to add that he did not consider the natives' degradation and uselessness as a laborer to be sufficient cause for his deliberate extermination.
Although the scientist did not actually say this, he at-least implied it by outlining a four-point program designed to safeguard the survival of the remaining tribes. First, von lhering said, we must cede to the Indians the land they need, and we must guarantee their possession of it. On this point, he affirmed, the government of São Paulo had not always acted with wisdom or with justice. Second, he continued, we must respect the Indians' ideas and feelings. They cannot be expected to conform to the white man's moral codes and cultural patterns. Third, the hostile tribes of the Rio Pêixe should be left in peace whenever and wherever possible. It was to be expected, von lhering added, that the colonists of that region would seek revenge after Indian attacks. However, the unnecessary and unreasonable massacre of natives should be punished by law. Finally, the scientist declared, an extensive propaganda campaign was needed to interest the state governments as well as the federal government, in the welfare of the Indian people.

The four-point program enumerated above unfortunately constituted a very small part of the scientist's rebuttal. Since this constructive portion of his argument was almost completely ignored by his critics, it is well to note here and remember that von lhering, as well as those who opposed him, recognized at this early stage of the Indian debate, the urgent need for the lawful protection of Indian lands and for the intervention of federal and state governments to save the Indian population from extinction.

Although von lhering assured his critics and reading public that there were humanitarian as well as scientific reasons for adopting the program of Indian isolation and protection that he had just outlined, he did not elaborate in the slightest on the humanitarian aspects. Had he devoted just
a few words to the moral implications involved, he would figuratively have taken the wind out of the sails of those who were criticizing him for his cold-hearted, materialistic approach to the Indian problem. Instead, he jumped directly to the scientific reasons for preserving Brazil's remaining tribes.

In an extended (six paragraph) development, von Lhering argued for closer study of the country's primitive cultures by Brazilian scientists. He pointed out that the collections of Indian artifacts housed in the museums of Brazil were inferior to those gathered by foreign ethnologists and carried to the museums of Germany and Austria. It was high time, he declared, for Brazil to follow the example of the European collectors and to emulate the serious and scholarly approach to Indian studies exemplified by the North Americans' excellent Bureau of Ethnology. This section of von Lhering's reply to the Almeida attack contained interesting information and valuable advice. Perhaps it was effective in calling the attention of Brazilians to the long-neglected field of ethnologic research. Its placement, however, at this point in the debate allowed von Lhering's critics to use it as confirmation of their belief that the foreign scientist had only one reason for favoring the Indians' survival: namely, the hope of preserving their cultures intact as objects of study for ethnologists like himself.

Not until the close of his long and disjointed exposition did von Lhering raise the controversial issue of Indian extermination. Even there, in the last few lines, he might have appeased Almeida and his other critics with a clear disavowal of any intention of recommending deliberate decimation of the native population. Instead, the scientist answered Almeida in a blunt and argumentative tone, and brushed off the columnist's attack with a
depreciating reference to the appropriateness of the title under which Almeida's protest had appeared; namely, "Divagações," meaning "Stray thoughts" or, more literally, "Wanderings." Von Lhering announced that he attached little value to the "philanthropic wanderings" of his critic which were unrealistic and therefore "neither good politics nor good science.

If, von Lhering continued, his detractor wished to portray him as an Indian persecutor, simply on the basis of a few lines from a scientific publication, then the best answer to him was that he should visit the Indian display at the National Exposition in Rio de Janeiro in which he (von Lhering) had attempted to glorify the simple life of Brazil's primitive Indians.

Hermann von Lhering would have saved himself much future argument and abuse if he had stopped with that reference to his Indian display. Unfortunately for him, he added one final paragraph that made it easy for his adversaries to misconstrue his intentions at this time, as well as those expressed in his later arguments. His closing words are translated here to allow the reader to judge for himself what the scientist's true feelings were about Indian extermination:

I confess frankly that to me personally the "Coroado" Indian of the Rio Peixe, who does not believe the promises of white men and who suspects even his own people who happen to live in friendly relations with the Brazilians, is a more agreeable person than the civilized Indian who is only a caricature - as much of Indian culture as of modern civilization. They enjoy their life in the forests and do not want our civilization, and I do not see the necessity of imposing it on them. "Sint ut sunt, aut non sint." That is my feeling about them as a man; but as a citizen and in keeping with my political beliefs, I cannot stand by and watch the march of our culture halted by Indian arrows. And certainly the life of the backwoodsman and colonist is worth more to us than the life of the savage. The fate of the Indians is certain. Many of them will accept our culture; the remainder will continue to be our enemies and, as such, will gradually disappear.

Von lhering was certainly not the first to consider Brazil's economic development of greater importance than the well-being, or even the lives, of individual savage Indians who attempted to block it. Many Brazilians, for many years, had been rationalizing the continued mistreatment and extermination of the natives with this same idea. They had been quieting their consciences with the thought that the building of a greater Brazil was an end that would justify any means. However, in this period of growing concern over Indian relations, no prominent figure in Brazil had wished or dared to spell out this selfish and cruel idea in public. The fact that it was a currently unpopular German scientist who finally did so, caused many Brazilians to re-examine the "economic development" justification for Indian mistreatment and to renounce it as being a sample of German scientific reasoning unworthy of the Brazilian people. Von lhering's public endorsement of the idea that the spread of the white man's culture must not be thwarted by Indian arrows and that the life of the irreconcilable Indian was of less importance than that of the colonist meant that Brazilians must either continue to hold that same opinion in common with him (a distasteful thought) or else renounce it altogether in favor of a more sympathetic attitude towards the native population.

Von lhering and the Fricc accusations. The twentieth of October, 1908, was an eventful day in von lhering's life, as well as in the history of the Indian debate that was developing about him. His sharp reply to the Almeida attack had appeared that morning in the Estado de São Paulo, as already noted. That very evening he was scheduled to speak before the Instituto Histórico e Geográfico de São Paulo on the subject of São Paulo's Indians and the Fricc
exposé at the Americanist Congress in Vienna. The last third of his speech that night was to be identical (with the exception of the reference to Almeida) to the second half of the article published that morning. Thus it contained the most explosive part of that earlier pronouncement. The first two thirds of the talk were designed to discredit Alberto Fríc and to give the members of the society the "true" story of Indian-white friction in the southern states of Brazil.

It was a regular session of the Instituto Histórico and attendance was lower than usual. This may well have been an expression of disapproval of von Ihering's stand on the Indian question, though it is doubtful that the society had yet received from Campinas the Centro de Ciência's official request for support against the "von Ihering doctrine." Only nine members were present including von Ihering and his son, Rodolfo, who was acting secretary of the meeting.

Hermann von Ihering opened his talk with a review of the more pertinent details of Alberto Fríc's actions at the Congress of Americanists in Vienna, Austria. He told the members about the accusation leveled by the young Czechoslovakian against the so-called "German sponsored" newspaper campaign and diplomatic action in Brazil that had caused the collapse of his Indian reservation scheme and led to the termination of his contract with the Berlin Museum of Ethnology. He went on to recount how Fríc had accused the German colonists of cruelly persecuting, killing and enslaving the Indians of Brazil, and had proposed that the Congress petition the

"Decima primeira sessão ordinaria, em 20 de outubro de 1908, " Revista do Instituto Histórico e Geográfico de São Paulo, XIII (1908), pp. 456-457."
Brazilian government for an end to the hunting and enslavement of these primitive peoples.

Such accusations on the part of Alberto Fric were highly exaggerated, von lhering asserted. He proposed now to clarify the issue with more accurate information collected from letters and newspaper clippings in his possession. In the first place, he began, Alberto Fric was not dropped from the Berlin museum without good cause. The [Museum had found it necessary to dispense with the services of the Czechoslovakian naturalist because he had "initiated in Santa Catharina [sic] an anti-German campaign, attempted to found a pro-Indian league, and systematically stirred up public opinion against the Germans."

After touching lightly upon the surprise and indignation with which Brazil’s ambassador and consular-general in Berlin had received word of Fric’s accusation of German cruelty in Santa Catarina, von lhering proceeded to quote at length from an article in a Berlin newspaper which presented its own description of the Indian troubles in southern Brazil in an effort to demonstrate the exaggeration and distortion of Alberto Fric’s account. There is a tendency, in reading the following quotation, to embellish it slightly; just as in the case of Fric’s testimony there is a feeling that one should discount to some extent the more dramatic statements. Coming from someone like Fric, who was strongly sympathetic towards the plight of the Indians, the following account might well have been questioned; coming, however, from a German paper intent on protecting the

---

This information appears to have come from a letter received by von lhering from the Berlin Museum of Ethnology. The above quotation from von lhering’s talk, like those which follow, are taken from H. von lhering, "Os índios do Brasil meridional," Correio Paulistano, October 29, 1908, p. 1, cols. 1-4.
good name of its colonists in Brazil, the words now publicized by von Herder convinced many Brazilians that the situation was far worse than they had thought. This is what von Herder read, presumably from an article in the Berliner Lokal anzeiger, translated into Portuguese by himself:

The Indians attack isolated colonists in the cruellest manner. Those threatened in this way eventually write into avenging expeditions during which the so-called "bugreiros" pay back in the same coin the cruelties practiced by the Indians. On surprising an Indian village, they kill everyone; whereas the colonists themselves usually take children, and sometimes women, back with them and accept them into their homes. In Joinville, for example, a doctor and a baker were each educating an Indian girl, in Blumenau the prisoners are accepted and cared for by the Franciscans and by the sisters of "Espírito Santo," as well as by ordinary folk. Actually, there are cases where the care of these Indian children is overdone, and they fare better than the colonists' children. That is the slavery that befalls the Indian and to which Mr. Fric is referring.

With this answer to Fric's accusations of Indian enslavement, von Herder moved on to a more personal attack. Like Paul Ehrenreich at the Americanist Congress in Vienna, he set out to discredit the young man as a scientist. Fric, in past years, under the name of Vojtech Fric, had written some damaging articles against the inhumane treatment of Indians, making it clear that although the bugreiros, those who were hired to direct or guide the Indian hunts, were often Indians or part Indians themselves, yet the real blame fell squarely upon the Polish and German colonists. In one such article, printed in the periodical Globus (Braunschweig) on February 28, 1907, Fric had described some of the most cruel aspects of the Indian massacre and then had attributed the vindictive raid to an earlier and quite innocent attempt of a few Indians to approach a colonial settlement on a riverbank where they had in the past found a ready supply of shell food. They had not come to kill, Fric said, but only because they
needed food and remembered that it had once been plentiful there. This conclusion was based on his study of the sambaquis (piles of shells and artifacts of a past culture) found in that region. Von Lhering, a specialist in the study of molluscs before his coming to Brazil, was able now to expose the younger man's lack of scientific training and his failure to keep abreast of the writing on this subject. But to do so required not only the treatment of sambaquis but also the repetition of Fric's description of Indian hunting that preceded his discussion of the shells.

Fric's gruesome account, paraphrased by von Lhering for his colleagues of the Instituto Histórico, included references to an expedition in Paraná against the Botocudo Indians. It told of bounties paid, so much per head, and explained the quick and easy method of assembling retaliative expeditions after Indian attacks by means of widespread telegraphed reports. The account went on to tell of Winchester rifles that Fric claimed to have seen in western São Paulo, whose stocks were ornamented with Indian teeth. It told of bounties in that state of as much as one hundred and thirty marks for each pair of Indian ears, and of the delight experienced by certain bugreiros at the sight of an Indian shot in the top of a tree, dropping down from branch to branch to lie dead at last on the ground.

On the basis of Fric's unreliability as a scientist, a contention supported by the younger man's erroneous treatment of the sambaquis, von Lhering evidently expected his fellow members to doubt the veracity of the naturalist's accounts of Indian hunts as well. Explaining to the small gathering of the Instituto Histórico that he himself, in his thirty years of ethnologic study in Brazil, had never witnessed or read elsewhere such exaggerated and distorted incidents as those related by the credulous young
naturalist, he proceeded to give the society his own version of the true nature of the conflict between whites and Indians in southern Brazil.

There actually were expeditions, von lhering admitted, led by so-called "bugreiros," but these men did not simply kill for diversion. He knew of one Indian hunter in Santa Catarina, for example, whose wife and children had been massacred by Indians and who, since that time, had always been prompt to join the avenging parties which followed each Indian invasion of the colonists' territory. Also, he continued, there were no unnecessary cruelties or sale of Indian children. Though some children were captured and educated by the colonists, he declared, most of them quickly escaped to the woods. Those who did not return to their tribe were no longer recognized as Indians, even by their parents. In Santa Catarina, the scientist continued, where colonial expansion was more vigorous than in São Paulo, there seemed to be ample justification for Indian extermination. Von lhering assured his fellow scientists and historians of the Instituto Histórico e Geográfico de São Paulo that:

It is to be expected that the colonists, when provoked by attack, should pursue the Indians, and, to do so, they need guides who are perfectly acquainted with the woods. These are the so-called "bugreiros" with whose services neither the colonists nor the authorities can dispense. Obviously these hunters, who thus place themselves at the service of the colonists, receive remuneration; but never, as Mr. Fric narrates, a payment per dozen ears!

On these matters, von lhering admitted, he was not speaking from personal observation. Nevertheless, he offered two or three good reasons for doubting the truth of Fric's statements. First, he argued, the stories told by the young naturalist could not be true or he (von lhering) would have read about them, since it was his custom to keep himself informed on everything written about the Indians. Second, Fric's description of the
bugreiros' collections of Indian teeth and of bounties paid per dozen of ears must be a ridiculous mistake because the "institution of bugreiros" was not known in São Paulo where the naturalist had claimed to witness these practices. Finally, the scientist concluded, the ornamentation of rifles with Indian teeth must be mythical, for it would be a hazardous and foolish act on the part of an Indian killer to thus call the natives' attention to his deeds and draw upon himself their enmity and revenge.

Although the scientist seemed sure of himself in thus ridiculing the younger man's report, it will be seen later that von lhering's information concerning Indian relations in western São Paulo was inadequate for such a scathing rebuttal. Less than two months after telling his society that the "institution of bugreiros" was unknown in the state of São Paulo, the scientist contradicted himself by answering another attack upon his theories with a statement that Indian hunts were not only known in São Paulo but were more ruthless there than those among the German colonies of Santa Catarina.

It was time for von lhering to leave the discussion of Indian extermination and to close with his account of Indian collections in European museums. Before doing so, he repeated, with source references, the original paragraph that had motivated the protests by Silvio de Almeida, Luis Bueno Horta Barbosa, and Tito de Lemos. After reading the controversial extermination paragraph, von lhering have explained in an aside to his small audience what his intentions were in writing that statement. The explanation appeared as a footnote in the newspaper Correio Paulistano that published the entire speech that has been summarized here. It read.
When I speak of "extermination of the Indians," I am naturally referring only to those who, through irritations and attack, are a real obstruction to the expansion of our culture.

Why had von Lhering worded his original statement so obscurely as to require a footnote to soften its implications? And why had he made no effort in his public answer to Silvio de Almeida's attack upon him to assure his readers that he was not recommending indiscriminate slaughter of all Indians not incorporated into the white man's civilization? Did he feel that scientists would understand, and that the opinion of others did not matter?

One final passage from von Lhering's speech is quoted here because, like the others that have been reproduced, it allows the reader to draw his own conclusions about the man who figures so prominently in this study.

In a closing remark about Indian extermination, he said:

From all this, there remains of Mr. Frick's accusations only the fact that the colonists, threatened and assaulted, have taken vengeance through organized expeditions sent against the Indians.

No one can doubt that in the course of these attacks and [the resultant] avenging expeditions, the whites also have committed atrocities, but this occurs also in other wars and revolts.

The Americans did the same when their colonizing efforts were hindered by the Indians, and Germany, still today in East Africa, has to defend the lives of colonists by armed force. It is absurd to expect things to be different in Brazil. It is our duty to protect and educate the Indians who submit to our civilization, but those who are opposed to our culture do not deserve the same consideration, taking into account the fact that the life of the backwoodsman or of the colonist is worth more to us than that of the savage when resisting our culture.

The hour was late when von Lhering closed his talk. The meeting was quickly adjourned, and there is no comment in the records as to how
the speech was received. Three years later, however, von Ihering himself wrote about the warm reception of his speech and the absence of any voice of opposition amongst his listeners - a fact that made it difficult for him to understand the subsequent failure of his fellow members to stand by him publicly when he needed their support.

Melillo's evaluation of the Indian. Just four days after von Ihering's talk and the appearance of his answer to Almeida in the Estado de São Paulo, the Centro de Ciências, Letras e Artes of Campinas met in session again. It was immediately apparent that the members of this body had no intention of dropping the subject of Indian extermination. In this meeting of October 24, the protest by Tito de Lemos in the preceding session was strongly supported in a lengthy discourse by one of the youngest members of the society, Vicente Melillo.

With due modesty Melillo explained that his purpose was not to improve upon what his associates had already contributed to the worthy cause of Indian protection, but rather to stimulate others to further efforts in its behalf. Quoting von Ihering's original extermination paragraph, now so widely publicized, Melillo paraphrased for his fellow members the section of the scientist's answer to Almeida in which he had reiterated and reinforced his opinion of the worthlessness of the Indian to Brazil's life and economy.

The public expression of such a belief, Melillo affirmed, demanded

---

an additional protest from the Centro de Ciências, couched in the strongest terms. What if the Indian were not a good worker, he asked. That did not justify his extermination. For what if the death penalty were decreed against all members of the white race who did not, or could not, contribute substantially to the nation's labor force? Furthermore, with all respect to Couto de Magalhães (whom von Lhering had quoted on the subject of the destructive influence of an alien civilization on the Indians), the degrading effect of native contact with the white man's civilization was certainly no excuse for Brazilians to bar the Indians from their rightful share in the national life and culture.

Vicente Melillo called special attention to the seeming contradictions of von Lhering's statements of October 20 in answer to Almeida: "theorías que se contradizem e considerações que se contradizem completamente." Melillo told his fellow members that he could not understand how a scientist could so thoroughly denounce the effects of catechization on the Indian, and then, in the same study, praise the Jesuits for their successful labors among the natives in the past. Nor could he see how von Lhering could appreciate the nobility of the savage Indian, as he claimed he did, and yet denounce him as worthless and doom him to complete extermination.

Melillo was a sincere and devoted Catholic and, as such, he was particularly disturbed by von Lhering's depreciating attitude towards present-day catechizing and civilizing efforts of the clergy. Not only was the young member of the Centro de Ciências proud of the work done by

11 All quotations and paraphrased material from Melillo's talk of October 24 in the Centro de Ciências are taken from Melillo, "Os índios do Brasil," Revista do Centro de Ciências, No. 23 (1908), pp. 137-140. The above quotation appears on page 138.
the Jesuits in the past, he was optimistic over what could be done in the future through the same high devotion and consecration of the Catholic clergy. The Brazilian government, Melillo warned, was shirking its responsibility to the Indians by its failure under the Republic to support financially the Church's present efforts to catechize the native population.

His discourse was not as strong a personal attack on von lhering as were the previous protests. Perhaps the speaker's age accounts for that. Yet the effect of this speech on the rising tide of feeling against the marked scientist of the Museu Paulista was none the less powerful. The same anti-German feeling crept out in this talk that had shown itself in the earlier protests. For example, early in the speech he referred to the "barbarity of our scientific civilization" and then drew attention to the word "citizen" used by von lhering in describing himself. There was also a rather bitter note of nationalistic resentment against the government's readiness to open its treasury to pay visiting lecturers from abroad at the same time that it refused to support adequately the labors of the Catholic missions among the Indians.

In this early phase of the Indian debate - this series of charges and countercharges, of constructive criticism and personal attack - we must avoid becoming lost in the maze of interesting but nonessential particulars. Clearly the most constant and pervading sentiment in the arguments of von lhering and his adversaries was the growing conviction that it was time that something were done for the Indians. There was as yet no argument as to whether that "something" should be military protection of the colonists, protective legislation for the Indians, isolation of the native population on reservations, their incorporation into civilized communities,
or finally, as Vicente Melillo now recommended, a more liberal government subsidy to the Church for the catechization of the natives.

Melillo's speech of October 24 before the Centro de Ciências in Campinas marked another step forward on the road to government action in regard to the solution of the Indian problem. It was more than an argument against von lhering's sanction of the extermination of hostile Indians. It did more than call for united action in protest against such injustice. Melillo, like von lhering four days earlier, spoke for an organized campaign in behalf of the natives. Unlike the scientist, however, Melillo made it clear that the purpose of arousing the nation on this matter was not just to force the government to separate two contestants who were not fighting cleanly. On the contrary, he urged a campaign that would not separate, but would rather bring the Indian and the white man together in a bond of mutual understanding and of lasting friendship. This effort would not be successful, he warned, unless the Brazilians first realized that it was they, and not the Indians, who were to blame for the bitter conflict between the races. Melillo supported his argument with an extensive description of past injustice on the part of the white man. Is it any wonder, he questioned, that these good and brave people resorted to force and treachery, considering that it is almost always they, the Indians, who are the victims of the treachery and deceit that we ourselves practice? Taking advantage of our position as the conquering race, we give them abundant reason for retaliation.

It is Melillo's acceptance of the white man's blame for the twentieth century crisis in Indian relations that stands out as the most significant part of his October 24 speech. Other men in recent years had voiced this
Horta Barbosa had introduced the idea into this heated debate. Melillo again presented it convincingly to the many Brazilians who were searching earnestly for a lasting solution to the Indian problem. His unselfish attitude was none other than the old-fashioned, idealistic approach of the nineteenth century romanticists, born again out of a reaction against the coldly scientific arguments of Hermann von Hering and the increasingly unpopular philosophy of the survival of the fittest.

For almost half a century, the "noble savage" had been lost and almost forgotten. In the challenging and prophetic words of Vicente Melillo, one can see the Indian's tragic figure being invoked from the distant past:

"It is time, gentlemen - present circumstances force it upon us - to begin a determined and patriotic campaign on behalf of the Indian race, whose rights and whose destiny have been defied by learned men. A campaign to reveal the true nature of the Indian and to restore him to his rightful place in contemporary thought and history."

He closed his address with an eloquent challenge that did much to spur the Cento in Campinas to further action on the Indian problem. Re-ferring to the injustice practiced against the North American Indians and to that nation's inability to abolish Negro slavery without bitterness and bloodshed, Melillo voiced this noble expression of national pride and of hope for the future:

"If in North America the march of civilization depends upon force, it is perhaps because, among the stars of its flag, there does not appear (as in our heavens it does, majestic and serene) the Southern Cross, symbol of love - of a love that must soon come to redeem, as it did the Negro, the Indians of Brazil!"

The records of the session show that Melillo was warmly applauded.
Two of the society's members rose to express their appreciation for the humanitarian sentiments expressed and the excellence of the address. One of the two was Tito de Lemos, who thanked the younger man for referring so kindly to his talk of the preceding week on the same subject.

Almost by coincidence, it was in this same session of October 24 that another man of major importance to this study, Casaio Biagio, was elected to membership. Later he was to become one of the best known and most highly respected leaders of the Brazilian Protestant church. In October, 1908, he was a young teacher in the Presbyterian Theological Seminary of São Paulo and a founding member of the Sociedade Científica de São Paulo. He and Vicente Melillo, two of the youngest members of the Centro de Ciências - one an ardent Catholic and the other a Protestant leader - were to work together in the following months as two of the strongest supporters of the campaign soon to be officially launched in behalf of the Indian.

Almeida's contribution: a new attitude. Just two days after Melillo's talk, Silvio de Almeida devoted another of his Monday morning columns to the subject of von Lhering's "extermination argument." This time the elderly publicist and scholar wrote with fewer dramatics. His purpose now was not to shock the general public but rather to answer, convincingly, von Lhering's countercharges against him and to raise the argument to more constructive levels. Although he lacked the German scientist's knowledge of anthropology and ethnology - a fact that he readily admitted - his literary ability and the righteousness of his cause gave him a decided

\[\text{Acta da 307ª sessão ordinária de 24 de outubro de 1908, "Revista} \\
\text{do Centro de Ciências", No. 31 (June 1913), p. 72.} \]
advantage over his adversary.

Though courteous in his language, Almeida did not ease the pressure of his attack on von Ihering. To the scientist's words in his article of the twentieth, "It seems that Dr. Silvio de Almeida does not like my opinion...," Almeida answered with emphasis: "Frankly, neither I, nor anyone else, likes it!" Von Ihering had accused Silvio de Almeida of expressing ideas in his first protest that were neither good science nor good politics. Admitting now that von Ihering's knowledge entitled him to an evaluation of what was "good" science, Almeida none the less maintained that science, like the gospel tree, should be judged by its fruit. Moreover, he declared that he experienced some difficulty in perceiving the good in a science that attributed to certain Indian tribes a fatal inertia that made them incapable of progress. In answer to von Ihering's sarcastic comment on his "Divagações filantropicas," he pointed out that the remarks in his October 12 column entitled "Divagações" had not, in this instance, strayed or wandered unrealistically from the exact wording of the scientist's statement on Indian extermination as it appeared in the Museu Paulista's journal. Nor had it strayed, Almeida emphasized, from the only interpretation possible of that heartless verdict, namely, that the eradication of wild Indians was justified in the process of colonizing the Southwest.

This second attack by Silvio de Almeida did not lean as heavily as his first upon the word of past authorities to support his own belief that the

\[\text{Silvio de Almeida, "Divagações," Estado de São Paulo, October 26, 1908, p. 1. The quotations and paraphrased material from this article that appear below are likewise taken from this source.}\]
hostile Indian could be tamed and assimilated into the nation's culture and economy. In keeping with this tendency to rely less upon the testimony of the past and more upon present-day evidence, the columnist chose for his one and only reference to Horta Barbosa's October 12 open letter to him, the younger man's description of labors currently being performed by the once hostile Pareci Indians in the upkeep of telegraph lines in the deep interior of Mato Grosso. The columnist referred to only one authority from the past, José Bonifácio, whom he had mentioned in his first attack on von Lhering, and whom Horta Barbosa had quoted at length in his protest of that same date, October 12. Almeida's brief quotation, like Horta Barbosa's, was taken from a request made in 1823 by Bonifácio that Brazilians refrain from further persecution of the native races. 

---

No discussion of the Indian debate of 1918-1910 would be complete without mention of the considerable influence exerted upon it by the writings of José Bonifácio de Andrada e Silva, Brazil's "Patriarch of Independence." On the day before he was elected president of the Constituent Assembly, June 1, 1823, Bonifácio presented before the national legislature an eloquent appeal for justice and mercy in the treatment of Brazil's native population. This message, the famous Apontamentos para a civilização dos índios bravos do império do Brasil (Program for Civilizing the Wild Indians of the Empire of Brazil), outlined a sensible and highly ethical program by which the natives could be pacified, civilized, and assimilated into the national life and economy. Unfortunately, the statesman's counsel was considered overly idealistic. Couto de Magalhães attempted to put it into practice in the latter half of the century, but his attention was diverted to other matters. For more than eighty years, Bonifácio's program was almost completely ignored, although his abolitionist writings formed a strong foundation for the campaign that resulted in Negro slave emancipation in 1888. After that date, the Positivists, who had long revered the name of José Bonifácio if he were the patriarch of their own philosophic movement, shifted their interest in abolition to Bonifácio's other dream, the assimilation of the Indian population into the national life. Thus it was that in the Jornal do Comércio of December 7, 1907, R. Teixeira Mendes, as spokesman of the Igreja Positivista do Brasil, summarized Bonifácio's Apontamentos in a plea of his own for the more just and meritorial treatment of the Indians. And so it followed in natural sequence that the Positivists, Silvio de Almeida and Luis Bueno Horta Barbosa, used the statesman's words a few months
In keeping, too, with the trend towards the acceptance by Brazilians of the blame for past and present conflict between the white and Indian races, Almeida added several incidents to Vicente Melhio's list of cruelties practiced upon the natives. He included a newspaper account (Diario Popular of Rio de Janeiro, April, 1888) of the deliberate poisoning of the natives' sources of drinking water - an act which resulted in the death of three thousand Indians soon after the crime and another eight hundred a few days later. He also described the massacre of an Indian wedding party near Avanhandava on the Estrada de Ferro Noroeste - an incident already recounted in the first chapter.

Almeida expressed justifiable surprise and pleasure at von Ihering's recommendation that land be ceded to the Indians and that their rights to the land be protected by law. A bit facetiously, he claimed that he had been about to congratulate the scientist on his conversion when, farther on, he came upon von Ihering's beliefs "as a man and as a citizen."

Almeida took full advantage of his adversary's harsh statement, repeating it carefully and then discussing it for the reading public as follows:

Dr. Ihering, as a man, would have the Indians' land respected; but Dr. Ihering, as a citizen, cannot have them interfering with the march of an invading civilization. The conflict between these two criteria could not be more patent than in this attempt to justify the later when they attacked the von Ihering "doctrine." No voice out of the past spoke louder in the cause of Indian pacification and assimilation, as it was debated in 1909-1910, than did that of José Bonifácio. See Manoel Miranda, O programa de José Bonifácio pela redenção da raça indígena, Carta aberta a Ernesto Senna, Rio de Janeiro, 1911; Homenagem a José Bonifacio no 83. anniversário da independência do Brasil, Inauguração do Serviço de Prêncipes aos índios e Localização de Trabalhadores Nacionais, 7 de setembro de 1910, (Rio de Janeiro, 1910); Silvio Romero, História da Literatura Brasileira, 3rd ed., II (Rio de Janeiro, 1943), 213-220; "José Bonifácio and Brazilian History," Hispanic American Historical Review, VIII (November, 1928), pp. 527-550.
curious theory that Indians should be left undisturbed, so far as possible, but exterminated once they embarrass our territorial expansion. I, on the other hand, believe that there will "never" be justification for usurping the much reduced territory that still remains to the rightful owners of all this vast and ancient land of Brazil.

This was a bold expression of the new Brazilian approach to the Indian problem. The troublesome contradiction that Almeida now attributed to von Ihering was the same that had pervaded the talk about the Amazon region by Ignacio de Moura at the International Congress of Americanists in Vienna a month before. It was the same contradiction that until recently had troubled the entire nation. Now, at last, an influential publicist denounced that contradiction as not only unnecessary but as a "curious theory" held by a German scientist. Almeida's greatest contribution to the movement towards government protection for the Indian was this unqualified answer to the question "What about the hostile Indians that block the nation's economic development?" His answer was refreshing in its positiveness: "... there will 'never' be justification for usurping the ... territory that still remains to the rightful owners. ..."

In this second argument on the Indian question by Silvio de Almeida, just as in the recent arguments of von Ihering and of those who attacked him, government intervention of some sort was strongly urged as essential to the attainment of any effective and lasting solution of the Indian problem. What effect such recommendations had on government policy is difficult to measure - perhaps very little at this early stage. In any case, Almeida's feelings on the matter were strongly worded:

Without sentimental exaggeration of any sort, the State, which is the instrument of the law, can and must intervene in the conflict between the arrow of the Indian and the rifle of the backwoodsman.
Thus far, the controversy between Hermann von Hering and his opponents had centered in the cities of São Paulo and Campinas. Rio de Janeiro was as yet hardly aware of the growing excitement over this burning issue in its neighboring state. No immediate results had followed the Centro de Ciências' request for a supporting protest from the Instituto Histórico e Geográfico Brasileiro in Rio. Nor could immediate results be expected from such a body whose Olympian detachment from current discord was never easily upset. It remained for the acting head of the Positivist movement in Brazil to open the debate on the Indian problem in the press and in the learned societies of the nation's capital. R. Teixeira Mendes proceeded to do this with all the enthusiasm and fervor of his earlier pronouncements on behalf of the Indians.
CHAPTER V

THE SPREAD OF THE INDIAN DEBATE

It should be understood that in Brazil at the time of this study, even as now, most of the prominent figures of the professional world, whether scientists, politicians, churchmen, military officers, or scholars, were members of one or more of the learned societies of their cities or states. Often they attended the meetings of two or three different groups and, in addition, were corresponding members of several other societies located in distant parts of Brazil and in cultural centers of Spanish America, the United States, and Europe. When the leaders in the various professions wished to air their views on a given topic, or make public their most recent scientific studies, literary creations, or historical monographs, they generally presented them first before their respective societies. Then, often, the studies were given to the press and published in the excellent journals of the various institutes.

This meant that in Brazil, more than in our own country, the public presentation of a man's views on a controversial issue might easily and quickly draw a powerful society into the general discussion. As we have seen, Hermann von Hering's extermination statement first appeared in Portuguese translation in the pages of his own museum's scientific journal. Thus the Museu Paulista, from the very start, was deeply involved in the Indian debate. Moreover, its German-born director continued to use the
Museum's annual publications as a sounding board for his personal opinions on the subject of Indian pacification and assimilation. It has been noted, too, that Horta Barbosa's protest against von Hering's extermination paragraph was picked up and amplified, five days later, by the Centro de Ciências, Letras e Artes of Campinas, of which he was the official orator in 1909.

The similarly inspired protests by Tito de Lemos and Vicente Melillo originated in the regular sessions of that same society, and, finally, Hermann von Hering used the lecture hall of the powerful Instituto Histórico e Geográfico de São Paulo to present his answer to the accusations made by Alberto Frías the preceding month at the Congress of Americanists in Vienna.

The Igreja Positivista's stand. The arguments against Indian extermination presented by the Positivists, Silvio de Almeida and Luís Bueno Horta Barbosa, drew the Igreja Positivista into the 1908–1910 Indian debate in much the same manner in which the Museu Paulista, the Centro de Ciências, and the Instituto Histórico of São Paulo were implicated. Horta Barbosa's attack on von Hering, though it appeared first in the local press of Campinas, was published about three weeks later in the official organ of the Igreja Positivista. ¹ Shortly thereafter it was reprinted, in its original form, in the November 11 edition of the Jornal do Comércio under the subheading "Em defesa dos indígenas brasileiros." Together with the Horta Barbosa protest, there appeared a reprint of a letter of November 3 written by R. Teixeira Mendes, head of the Igreja Positivista, to Cidadão Afonso

¹Igreja e Apostolado Positivista do Brasil, No. 271 (November 1908), pp. 9–14.
Augusto Moreira Pena, president of Brasil. Repeating von Ihering's extermination statement as quoted by Horta Barbosa, Teixeira Mendes advised the nation's chief executive that:

In São Paulo, a scientist by the name of Dr. H. Ihering, on page 215 of volume seven of the Revista do Museu Paulista, dares to preach the extermination of Brazil's natives; that is, dares to recommend the assassination of thousands of innocent persons.²

With the publication of Horta Barbosa's protest by the Igreja Positivista press and its subsequent reproduction a second time by R. Teixeira Mendes in the Jornal do Comércio, together with his (Mendes') own message to the nation's president, it became clear that the Almeida and Horta Barbosa attacks against von Ihering's coldly scientific theories regarding Indian extermination represented more than just the personal views of two ardent Positivists; they expressed, just as certainly, the official stand of the Igreja Positivista.

Von Ihering did not bother to answer publicly this first attack by Teixeira Mendes. The reference to himself may have escaped his attention, buried as it was on page twelve of a Rio daily and included with other material under a general heading not suggestive of the subject of Indian extermination. However, the next formal attack to appear in the journals of the nation's capital drew his immediate attention. It disturbed and angered him more than any that had originated in his own state of São Paulo because it came, this time, not from the pen of a publicist, a school teacher, or a philosopher, nor from a speech presented in a cultural center, but directly and officially from the staff of a rival museum, the Museu Nacional of Rio de Janeiro.

²Jornal do Comércio (Rio de Janeiro), November 11, 1908, p. 12, cols. 1-2.
The Museu Nacional and the debate. Relations between the museums of Rio de Janeiro and São Paulo had never been cordial. Rivalry and bad feeling dated back to 1895 when von Ihering, as director of the newly-founded Museu Paulista in the outskirts of São Paulo, made an address at the inaugural ceremony which slighted the Museu Nacional in a way that could hardly have been accidental. One other state, von Ihering said, had established a museum "with a staff of qualified scientists and with facilities superior" to those of São Paulo's newly-organized Museu Paulista. That state, he added, was the northern state of Pará, and the museum to which he referred was the one directed by his good friend, Dr. Goeldi. 3 The only interpretation of von Ihering's words that was possible was that the German scientist considered his own newly-founded museum already superior, both in facilities and personnel, to the Museu Nacional in Rio de Janeiro, that had been established in 1886 and had been building its collections and training its personnel during the past nine years.

Von Ihering's remarks, published in the Museu Paulista's journal of 1895, reached the Museu Nacional just as that institution's publication was going to press. João Baptista de Lacerda, its director since its organization, was deeply offended by the German scientist's attitude and insulting words. In a biting reply to von Ihering's comments, Lacerda wrote in his own museum's journal that the director of the Museu Paulista must have been motivated, in his inaugural address, by

... an understandable desire to feed the pride of the Paulistas and by the wish to impress state officials with his own incomparable

Lacerda admitted that he had not yet had the "good fortune" of visiting the new museum and "admiring the scientific organization" referred to by Dr. von Hering. However, he added with bitter sarcasm, he hoped that he might "enjoy this venture some time before [his] death." Even in 1895, São Paulo was only eight or ten hours distant from Rio de Janeiro by train.

Returning to the year 1905, thirteen years after the original argument, von Hering and Baptista de Lacerda were still directing their respective museums. There is reason to believe that rivalry still colored their relationship. Lacerda was not the only member of his museum's staff who harbored memories of past friction with von Hering of the Museu Paulista. Professor Domingos Sergio de Carvalho, director of the anthropology section of the Museu Nacional since 1893, had, according to von Hering, attempted to interfere with the awarding, at the National Exposition held in Rio during the past few months, of the grand prize of merit to the Museu Paulista's Indian display, which largely represented the ideas and efforts of its hard-working director, Hermann von Hering.

---


5 Ibid., p. xix.

6 A description of this display and a brief mention of the award it received was published in the Revista do Museu Paulista, VIII (1911), 5-6. See page 115 for von Hering's reference to the attempt by Sergio de Carvalho to interfere with the Museu Paulista's receipt of that award.
It is worth knowing something about this anthropologist, Sérgio de Carvalho, because as technical consultant to the Minister of Agriculture in 1910 he was destined to play an important role in the development of government Indian policy. Though sixteen years younger than Hermann von Hering, Carvalho had been with the Museu Nacional since 1895, the year of the inauguration of the Museu Paulista. Trained as an agricultural engineer, he was for many years director of the Sociedade Nacional de Agricultura. Already, in the years prior to 1906, he had shown a personal interest in the welfare of the Indians, and it was his interest, as much as his apparent disliking for von Hering, that caused him to draw the Museu Nacional into the debate over Indian extermination.

In the 381st gathering of the staff of the Museu Nacional on November 25, 1906, Sérgio de Carvalho read von Hering's notorious extermination statement to his fellow staff members. In addition, he read the paragraph that followed it, which is here quoted because it belongs together with the extermination paragraph. Undoubtedly, it had influenced those whose attacks on von Hering have already been summarized, even though until this time none of the scientist's adversaries had specifically referred to it. In translation the German scientist's words as read now by Carvalho on November 25 were as follows:

Indian conversion has not produced satisfactory results; these Indians who have intermarried with the Portuguese immigrants have only been a bad influence on the habits of the rural population. I am convinced that it is for this reason, primarily, that São Paulo State is obliged to import thousands of immigrants, since it cannot rely upon any dependable and effectual labor from the native population. 7

---

Sergio de Carvalho admitted that it was unusual for an institution like the Museu Nacional to involve itself in affairs that were not strictly scientific, yet he felt that it could not remain silent while the director of a state museum was "counseling the extermination of the Indians of Brazil." Carvalho's talk does not appear verbatim in the minutes of this session. The records merely summarize his words and indicate that he spoke at some length on the inaccuracy of von lhering's statements regarding the Indians' uselessness as workers. In addition, the anthropologist sharply criticized the practice in São Paulo of pouring state funds into immigration projects while doing nothing to instruct the Indian in the skills of productive labor.

In conclusion, he announced that alone, or with the support of his colleagues, he intended to prepare a formal protest in answer to von lhering's statements. Carvalho's stinging attack on his fellow scientist of the Museu Paulista and his decision to protest formally von lhering's theories on Indian extermination were warmly received by the staff members of the Museu Nacional.

Amaro F. das Neves Armond, director of the botany section, proposed that the protest suggested by Carvalho be published in the museum's journal. For the present he asked that the secretary write into the minutes the fact that he, Neves Armond, deeply regretted that Dr. von lhering's scientific orientation had led him to "counsel the cruel expedient of exterminating the nation's Indians." Hildebrando Teixeira Mendes (not to be confused with Raimundo Teixeira Mendes of the Igreja Positivista) suggested that the proposed protest be prepared by Sergio de Carvalho personally and that it be published in the Jornal do Comércio as well as in the Archivos do Museu Nacional. Furthermore, he suggested that a special meeting be called in the near future for the hearing and approval of Carvalho's protest. In accord with that suggestion,
a short notice was circulated on December 3 among six staff members of the Museu Nacional whose names appeared upon it - a notice that advised them of the reading at 1:00 P. M. the following day of a protest against the "barbarous system of Indian extermination counseled by the director of the Museu Paulista." 8

The special session of December 4, with nine staff members in attendance, was called to order tardily at 2:00 P. M. by the museum's director, Baptista de Lacerda. His opening remarks were followed by a few general comments from Sergio de Carvalho as an introduction to the protest that he was about to read for the approval of his colleagues.

Carvalho's special interest in the Indians and his sympathy for them are clearly apparent in this carefully worded attack on von Lhering's extermination statement. The Indians, he affirmed, were the true children of the land. They had welcomed the early colonists with confidence and kindness. Surely, Carvalho reasoned, the long-suffering natives must now consider the white man's civilization inferior to their own when judged in terms of the treatment of weaker races. The present misunderstanding and friction in Indian-white relations, the anthropologist assured his listeners, was not the fault of the natives. The blame rests, he said, on the present generation of Brazilians, because they aid the immigrant with ample privileges under law but completely ignore the needs of the Indian population.

8 MS in the Museu Nacional, Pasta 51, Documento n.º 234. The museum's director and secretary, together with the reader, Sergio de Carvalho, were to bring the number of this gathering to nine.
In Carvalho's opinion, the theories expressed by the German-born scientist were unscientific as well as inhumane. If the white race were superior to the Indian, as von Ihering had implied, then it excelled, Carvalho asserted, only in its selfish ambition and in its sordid desire to enslave and rule by force. The Indian, far from being an inferior being, was, in Carvalho's words:

...in most cases intelligent, industrious and capable of good work when competently directed and considerately handled. 9

The title of the paper read by Carvalho ("Protest Formulated by the Staff of the Museu Nacional against the Idea of Extermination of Brazil's Indians, Suggested by the Director of the Museum of São Paulo") indicates that its author and his associates were no less reticent than Almeida, Horta Barbosa, Tito de Lemos, Melillo and R. Teixeira Mendes in assigning the worst possible motives and designs to von Ihering's words. Early in the protest, Carvalho attributed to the German scientist the "suggestion of delivering up to extermination thousands of human beings." In the following paragraph, he referred to the:

...twisted reasoning that is being used to sanction the cruelty that has long been practiced upon the Indians of Brazil, and that

---

9"Protesto formulado pela congregação do Museu Nacional contra a ideia de exterminio dos indigenas brasileiros [sic], sugerida pelo director do Museu de S. Paulo," MS in Sergio de Carvalho's handwriting in Museu Nacional, Pasta 51, Documento n.º 236. This document is signed by all members present at the special hearing, with the exception of the recording secretary. I wish here to express my thanks to the museum's director, Heloísa Alberto Torres, for permission to use the archives of the Museu Nacional, and to Marietta Torres, keeper of the archives, for her friendly cooperation and valuable aid.
has reached the extreme of merciless slaughter, conducted in the name of the law and of the national interest. 10

It is no wonder that von Lhering was hurt by this protest. He had learned in past weeks to expect such an attack as this from philosophers and churchmen but not from a group of fellow scientists. Carvalho's protest was the handwriting on the wall for von Lhering. It meant that he could not even depend upon the scientists for support of his scientific beliefs. In place of the support von Lhering may have expected from the staff of the Museu Nacional, he found, in the closing words of Carvalho's protest, a defiant challenge:

Now that the director of a national scientific body, availing himself of the prestige that belongs to the institution he represents, is attempting to encourage violence in the interests of colonial expansion, the staff of the Museu Nacional feels itself obliged to sanction this protest, certain, however, that the public will not permit the victory of this criminal idea. 11

The protest was unanimously approved and signed by Carvalho's colleagues. No alterations were suggested. In the discussion that followed the reading, Hildebrando Toixeira Mendes (a mining engineer) declared that:

... a public employee who counsels such an inhuman, criminal course of action reveals with incredible audacity the most serious lack of good judgement deserving, in [my] opinion dismissal from public service, considering that he has opened himself to

10 "Protesto formulado," Doc. 236.

11 Ibid. This protest may be found, correctly reproduced, in the Jornal do Comércio, December 6, 1909, p. 4, col. 4, and in the Archivos do Museu Nacional, XV (1909), 256f.
prosecution under the statutes of the Criminal Code. 12

Just two days after Carvalho's protest was read and approved in
the Museu Nacional, it was introduced to the reading public of the nation's
capital by the Jornal do Comércio as a protest against the opinions of

... Sr. Dr. von Theeig [sic] ... who, as a means of
civilizing the uncultured regions of Brazil, counsels the
extermination of the natives, in volume seven of the
journal of ... 13

With the publication of the Carvalho protest, the subject of Indian ex-
termination became a living issue in the nation's capital. The Museu Nacional
received letters of congratulations and support, both from individuals and
from societies. The first of these was dated December 5 and came from
the Centro Republicano Conservador de Niterói, just across the bay from
Rio de Janeiro. Its message was brief but reassuring to the members of
the Museu Nacional who were curious as to how their stand on the Indian
question would be received by other scientists and by the general public.
It read as follows:

To the worthy and patriotic staff of the Museu Nacional
we extend our support of your protest against the extermination
of the natives, certain that civil authorities will not permit the
victory of this criminal idea. 14

12 "Acta da 382. a sessão da congregação do Museu Nacional, realizada
em 4 de dezembro de 1908, em virtude de convocação extraordinaria,"
Registro das actas (MS). The above statement is taken from the minutes of
the meeting and may not be an exact quotation of the engineer's words.

13 Jornal do Comércio, December 6, 1908, p. 4, col. 4.

14 MS in the Museu Nacional, Pasta 51, Documento n.° 237. This
message was later published in the Jornal do Comércio, December 15,
1908, p. 4, col. 2.
R. Teixeira Mendes of the Igreja Positivista was also quick to express his approval of the action taken by the Museu Nacional. In a long article published in the December 9 issue of the Jornal do Comércio, he first quoted from Horta Barbosa’s protest of the preceding month. After that introduction to the subject, Mendes repeated that journal’s announcement of the museum’s attack on von Ihering. In conclusion, together with a few comments of his own, Mendes quoted the latest protest in its entirety. Evidently he wished to be certain that the humanitarian stand taken by the Museu Nacional on the Indian question would not be overlooked by the people of Rio de Janeiro.

The Associação de Proteção aos Selvícios do Brasil and the von Ihering statement. On the same day, December 9, before von Ihering could answer the museum’s attack, one of the most powerful protests launched thus far against his unpopular opinions was made in a regular session of the Associação de Proteção e Auxílio aos Selvícios do Brasil. The strange history of this society, the Association for the Protection and Aid of the Indians of Brasil, will be presented later in this study. For the moment, the society itself is of less importance than the arguments presented by its founder in support of the Museu Paulista’s protest and in rebuttal of the von Ihering statement.

The strength of this freshness attack on the German-born scientist of the Museu Paulista derived from the fact that its author had spent five years, from 1896 to 1901, among the villages of seventeen tribes of the Araguaia and Tocantin river valleys, in the most isolated regions of the state of Goiás. The speaker was an authority on the living habits and the potentialities of the wild Indian. This was a voice that could not be muffled by the weight
of adverse evidence from the past nor contradicted by scientific predictions of inevitable extermination.

This protest is of special interest because its author was a woman, known among the Indians she loved as "Mamãe" [Mama] or, more frequently, "Cáiaça," under the Indian term for "Dawn Star." Her real name was Leolinda de Figueiredo Dallro. In 1870, while still a young woman, she had left a teaching position in Rio de Janeiro and, with one of her sons, had entered the forests of Goiás to educate the Indians of that region and to protect them from exploitation. Now, twelve years later, at the time of her protest against von Lhering's theories, Leolinda Dallro was a well-known figure in Rio de Janeiro, not only because of the publicity given to her past experiences in Goiás, but because of her almost daily association in public with a group of five or six full-blooded Indians whom she had brought back to the capital and educated in the customs and courtesies of twentieth-century metropolitan life.

The formal protest that Leolinda Dallro read before the Associação de Proteção in Rio was as bitter in its personal attack on von Lhering as any of those that had preceded it. In biting tones, the speaker questioned the possibility that the scientist who recommended extermination of the Indians could be a Brazilian. Certainly, she explained, his sentiments concerning the natives were not those of her fellow countrymen, and the sound of his name was equally foreign. Surely, she added caustically, the morbid German fear of the "red peril" - of racial contamination of any sort - would seem to be justified if a man like Hermann von Lhering carried a trace of Brazilian (which included Indian) blood in his veins.
In Senhora Daltro's opinion, the German scientist's "counsel of extermination of more than a million Brazilians" was an audacious and criminal idea that violated all precepts of moral behavior. Furthermore, she added, it brazenly flouted the humanitarian principles endorsed at the Hague Peace Conference in 1907. How far removed from the noble and high-minded statesmanship of Ruy Barbosa, she declared, was the materialistic science of Hermann von Ihering.

Like Carvalho and his colleagues of the Museu Nacional, Leolinda Daltro assailed von Ihering's depreciatory evaluation of the Indian's character and ability to labor, on the ground that it was not in accord with the latest findings of anthropological research. From the experience of her years among the Indians, she spoke eloquently of the inherent good and the potential value to Brazil of the friendship and cooperation of these primitive people:

I confess that never have I seen, in any of these tribes, an Indian in the savage state who was an assassin, a thief, a drunkard or a seducer. Intelligent, kind, grateful, obedient, and thirsty for instruction, they respect justice and derive pleasure from their manual labor. 15

With pity and nostalgia, the speaker recalled the manner in which her Indian friends cultivated their fields with sticks and splinters of stone, only to lose their crops, their fields, their freedom - even their lives - because of the insatiable greed of the white man. From direct experience she supported the contention already advanced in earlier protests that civilized man, rather than the untamed native, was largely responsible for the present warfare between the white and native races. Her strong feelings on this matter found

bold expression in the following paragraph:

Human animals, they call them! And so they are, but only when those who consider themselves civilized rob them of the grain they plant and of the animals they raise, or drive them from the lands they irrigate with the sweat of their brows and take away from them their wives and daughters who are the only real happiness they know. As a rule the Indians do not retaliate and when, rarely, they do, it is always with distaste, with heart-breaking sacrifices, and as a natural and necessary reaction provoked always by the ambition, the lust and the authoritarianism of the pseudo-civilized men who have not lost their shameful mania for enslaving human beings. 16

Leolinda Daltro was firmly convinced that the forest Indians desired the benefits of civilization, even though they feared the white man. Their only need and request, she said, was for instruction, administered by those who set a moral example by their conduct. The speaker assured her listeners that beneficial results were certain to accrue from any extensive program of Indian instruction. Her own Indian friends in Rio de Janeiro, whom she had personally educated and brought to the capital, were a living example, she affirmed, of the benefits to be derived from such a program. All of them, she reminded the society, were "voting citizens, artisans, good men without vices of any kind, exceedingly generous, dignified and refined." 17

With the completion of her own protest against the von Lhering "doctrine," Leolinda Daltro asked that another protest be read before the society and entered in the minutes of the session - this one prepared and signed by the five Indians of whom she had been speaking. This second attack must have

16 Daltro, Da catechese, p. 625

17 Ibid., p. 625.
made a special impression on von Fltering for, in a bitter review of the
Indian debate written in 1911, he singled it out as one of the memorable an-
noyances of the "campaign" launched against him. Undoubtedly this pro-
test against native extermination, formulated and legibly signed by a group
of once completely uncivilized Indians, came as something of a shock to the
sorely pressed German scientist. The unique circumstances that surround
this little-known document make it worth reproducing here in its entirety:

The Brazilian Indians whose signatures appear below, already
incorporated into civilized society and representing in this capital the
Guaraní, Guajajara, Charrante and Carapa tribes, protest with
surprise and wonder against the opinion of Dr. von Fltering who, in
this modern age of the twentieth century, believes that the progress
of civilization demands the extermination of all our brothers of the
forest and, therefore, of all the members of the race that is most
genuinely Brazilian. We can guarantee to the illustrious director of
the museum of Sao Paulo that no Indian of our uncivilized tribes
will ever approve the massacre of human beings, unless it occur
during the sacred defense of the rights that nature confers upon us,
as well as upon men of great scientific learning but of no humanitarian
instinct. On the basis of a moral code that governs the entire civilized
world, we oppose Dr. von Fltering's science and disagree completely
with his opinion, which represents a monstrous aberration of the
human mind. The laws of morality are sufficient reason and foundation
for this very necessary protest.

The protest presented by Leolinda Daltro and her students were
only
applauded and unanimously approved by all members in attendance. The further
activities of the Associação de Proteção e Auxílio aos Selvicolas do Brasil will
be treated later.

The manner in which the writings of P. Teixeira Mendes in the Jornal do

18 Revista do Museu Paulista VIII (1911), 114.
19 Daltro, Da catechese, p. 626.
Comércio, and the protest by the staff of the Museu Nacional, had aroused
the interest of the nation's capital in the subject of Indian extermination did
not pass unnoticed in the state of São Paulo, where the controversy had be-
gun. In the Centro de Ciências of Campinas, Tito de Lemos (one of the
first to attack von lhering's statement) arose in a regular session of December
12 to advise his fellow members of the action taken by the staff of the Museu
Nacional. Lemos suggested that the museum in Rio de Janeiro be informed
that the Centro had already, clearly and publicly, denounced von lhering's
"subversive doctrine of Indian massacre," and that it now stood ready, with
the support of constitutional guarantees of citizen equality, to engage in a
nation-wide movement to protect the lives of Brazil's unfortunate natives
who had been the "sport" of criminal aggression. 20 Though it was not clear
in the records of this meeting just who was expected to initiate this consolidated
action on behalf of the Indians, there is at least evidence of certainty on the
part of the speaker that such a national movement would soon develop.

This sort of message of congratulations and support from one society
to another was a beginning step toward such a program. It was an expression
of adhesion to a common cause and an assurance of solidarity in whatever
action was to develop. For these societies, just as for individuals, the
strength of numbers was an important factor in determining the boldness
with which they moved forward toward an effective solution of the Indian
problem. Even the small Centro Republicano Conservador of Niterói was
welcomed into the fold by a warm letter of thanks from the Museu Nacional

20 "Acta da 313. a sessão ordinaria," Revista do Centro de Ciências,
Letras e Artes, No. 31 (June 1913), p. 77.
... patriotic and enthusiastic support of the protest signed by our staff against the cruel idea of Indian extermination counseled by the director of the museum of São Paulo. 21

Von Hering's answer to the Museu Nacional. Ever since November 11 when R. Teixeira Mendes first introduced von Hering's extermination statement to the people of Rio de Janeiro through the pages of the Jornal do Comércio, there had been developing in the nation's capital a mounting curiosity as to whether the German-born scientist actually desired the extermination of many or all of Brazil's Indians, or whether he was being slandered or misinterpreted by his many adversaries. Not until the middle of December was that curiosity satisfied when the Jornal do Comércio printed von Hering's answer to the protest signed by the Museu Nacional.

Again the scientist missed an opportunity to refute the now well-established belief that he condoned or recommended large-scale Indian extermination. He could have eased the pressure on himself by the use of conciliatory language and by a clear explanation of his motives and intentions. Almost certainly he did not desire a formal program of extermination that would decimate the entire Indian-population of Brazil, but he was too stubborn to admit it. Instead, his effort to explain the true meaning of his original statement about extermination was both cursory and irritatingly argumentative. These were his words:

To begin with, it should be understood that I never spoke of "Indian extermination," but rather pointed out the difference between the semi-civilized natives who submit to our authority and those ferocious Indians who are completely refractory to every effort on our part to subject them to our social system and who live in cruel

and continuous warfare with their neighbors. 22

Von Hering's only other attempt to dissociate his name from the idea of widespread extermination of the Indians was an implication, later in the article, that the attack against him was merely the result of his earlier comments about the extermination of the Coroados, the Intractable Indians of southern Brazil. This simply was not true. From the first protests of October 12, he had been attacked, whether justly or not, for the careless or ruthless suggestion of unlimited Indian extermination.

Von Hering, although he still did not appear sincerely interested in a reconciliation with his adversaries, nevertheless was not anxious to continue this one-sided debate. The only way that he could retire from the controversy that was daily growing warmer was to divert the attack from himself to some other agent. This he proceeded to do very cleverly by presenting his critics with a list of three culprits whom he claimed were directly responsible for the unfortunate practice of Indian extermination. First in this list was the inexorable law of the survival of the fittest. Second was the system of Indian hunts that prevailed in the state of Sao Paulo where (in von Hering's opinion) the Brazilians themselves far surpassed the German colonists of the southern states in their relentless massacre of the hostile Indians. Third on his list was the government's failure to protect the colonists from Indian aggression and thus maintain peace between the warring factions.

22 This quotation from von Hering's reply to the Museu Nacional, and those which follow, are taken from H. von Hering, 'Exterminio dos indigenas ou dos sertanejos?' Jornal do Comercio, December 15, 1908, p. 2.
Von Ihering's belief in the inevitability of Indian extermination was implicit in the question that formed the title of his latest rebuttal; namely: "Extermination of the Natives or of the Backwoodsmen?". The scientist put the choice to his readers as follows:

Inasmuch as ruthless warfare is being waged between these untamed Indians] and the pioneers of Brazil's modern culture, one can either join with the Museu Nacional in taking the part of the natives, thus sacrificing the backwoodsmen and colonists, or join with us in requesting the protection of these frontiersmen, thereby approving the extermination of the uncivilized forest Indians.

There seemed to be no doubt in von Ihering's mind that once the Brazilians understood the situation in these terms, they would accept whatever Indian extermination seemed necessary to assure the colonists' safe advance into the interior. "We now leave this discussion of the wild Coroados," he wrote, "whose fate is decided..." He expressed no regret over the apparent necessity of sacrificing one of these two elements of the national life. Most important to him was the desirability of convincing the Brazilian people that Indian extermination was not a German invention but a law of nature. Von Ihering's prediction of the eventual extinction of the Indians of Brazil was worded in such a way that it sounded more like a defiant rejection of his opponents' sentimentality than an objective, scientifically justified prophecy. He put it this way:

The numbers of these [intractable Indians] are rapidly decreasing; their extermination is progressing without interruption. It is irrelevant whether the opinion of the Museu Nacional or that of the Museu Paulista is victorious, since neither has any influence in stopping a process that is unfolding with the certainty of a natural law.

Moreover, von Ihering continued, this extermination was being effected through conflict with Brazilians as well as with German colonists. Contradicting now his earlier statement of October 20, the scientist claimed that São
São Paulo, too, had a form of Indian hunt. In the western part of the state, he explained, where colonists were nationals rather than German immigrants, the expeditions sent against the natives were composed of great numbers of impressed Guarany Indians, and the bugreiros were, for the most part, criminals. Unlike the Indian hunts in the German colonial area of Santa Catarina, von Hering declared, the expeditions in São Paulo, when successful, resulted in the massacre of every man, woman and child in the native villages they attacked.

In his effort to direct the Brazilians' attention to Indian extermination and mistreatment in other parts of the country than in the German-occupied regions of the southern states, von Hering went into detail on the unfortunate plight of the semi-civilized natives of São Paulo. He pointed out that in that state the tame Indians were being:

decimated by fevers and contagious diseases and exploited by deceitful friends, contractors, plantation owners and, at times, by padres or members of the regular clergy.

Often, von Hering continued, the Indians were forced to labor without compensation. When, on occasion, they received land of their own, they could not rely on the support of local authorities to uphold their lawful right to it.

Von Hering went on to complain of the stupidity that had led his critics to attack him rather than the government which was basically responsible for the natives' distress. The nation's official Indian policy, he stated, was hopelessly indefinite and everything pertaining to the treatment of the natives was in a state of complete anarchy. The representatives of law and order, he added, paid no more attention to the assassination of tame Indians than they did to the massacre of the wild Coroádos. This series of protests should not be directed
against himself, von Lhering wrote, but against the official manner of dealing with the Indians. He reminded his readers that the government's failure to assume its responsibility had already been called to European attention by Alberto Fric at the Americanist Congress in Vienna. Any day, now, von Lhering warned, the government's careless neglect of Indian disturbances could cause a wave of unfavorable discussion abroad. That would be unfortunate, he added, considering that some European nations had already begun to legislate against emigration to Brazil, or were considering such action, on the basis of the danger of Indian attack on frontier settlements. Von Lhering assured his readers that Brazil was sorely in need of colonists, but could not hope to attract them in sufficient numbers unless she accepted the responsibility of guarding their lives and the fruit of their labors.

In North America, Chile, and Argentina, the German-born scientist continued, military forts protected the settlers on the more exposed frontiers. A special police force, he argued, had solved the Indian problem in other countries and could do the same in Brazil. Not only would it relieve the colonists of the arduous and perilous duty of avenging Indian attacks, but it would save native women and children from massacre by the bugreiros and settlers of western São Paulo State. Only through government action in the form of military aid to the colonists, von Lhering concluded, could the brutal warfare between settler and Indian be halted.

The following quotation is especially significant. It comes closer to revealing the scientist's intentions in arguing the Indian question than does any other passage in this rebuttal or in his two previous public statements:

There is no blacker page in our present attempt to civilize Brazil than this cruel warfare between Indian and backwoodsman,
and it is no pleasure for me to call attention to the barbarities that are practiced in it. The whole complexion of this problem changes the moment the backwoodsman's defense is entrusted to a body of special police.

Here von Ihering was, in his third and last public discussion of the extermination theme, admitting that he experienced no pleasure in calling attention to the barbarities of Indian warfare. Nevertheless, unlike the German scientists at the Americanist Congress in Vienna who had attempted to silence the story of Indian extermination in Brazil, von Ihering had been quoting excerpts from Frey's shockingly detailed accounts of the bugreiros' methods of torturing and massacring their Indian victims. To these accounts, he had added vivid descriptions of Indian hunts as printed in German newspapers. And as if this were not enough, the scientist had gone on to present his own version of the bugreiros' activities in Santa Catarina, and had then, finally, claimed that Indian extermination through surprise attack on Indian villages was even more bloodthirsty in São Paulo than in the southern states.

Probably not even von Ihering would have denied that he had consistently written in such a way as to awaken the Brazilians' alarm and indignation over the serious state of Indian affairs. With few exceptions, his treatment of the subject of Indian extermination had been deliberately argumentative and had served only to provoke his critics to repeated attacks. Whether through stubbornness or through callous indifference, the rising Brazilian concern for the rights and personal welfare of the Indians as human beings, von Ihering had, almost single-handed, ignited a flame of controversy over the Indian question and fanned it into a roaring fire. His success in doing so argues for the theory that his predominant role in the early stage of the debate was not that of an unwilling victim of personal attack, but rather of an instigator of an
argument that he felt might eventually lead to government military support of the colonizing movement in the south.

It is quite possible that the scientist had, from the very beginning, recognized the Vienna expose of Indian extermination and the violent reaction to Almeida's discovery of his own (von Lhering's) statement on the subject as a heaven-sent opportunity to start a heated public discussion of the Indian warfare that was blocking the nation's economic advance and resulting in suffering and death for the immigrant pioneers of the southern states. It is also possible that von Lhering had early feared that this discussion, like those on the same subject in the past, would break up without the positive results he hoped for, if the disputants avoided the unpleasant and disturbing particulars of brutality practiced by both the Indians and the colonists in their bitter warfare. Certainly von Lhering had not avoided these details nor allowed his assailants to do so, even had they wished to.

In the closing words of his answer to the protest by the Museu Nacional, von Lhering formally withdrew from the controversy he had created and propagated. He declared that he would take no further part in discussions that might arise over the subject of Indian extermination. He assured his readers, in rather blunt language, that there were no scientific affirmations in his original anthropological study of the natives of São Paulo that he had any reason to modify. The fact that the monograph had been re-edited in English and later translated into Spanish for study in Argentine universities, he added, was proof that he had achieved "his one ambition, a mastery of South Brazilian ethnology."

Although he did not intend to take further part in the Indian debate, von Lhering left with his critics a few last infuriating remarks to keep the fires of
controversy burning in the months ahead. In his customary argumentative tone, he made it clear that although there could be a difference of opinion between his museum and the Museu Nacional as to which contestant in the border warfare, Indian or backwoodsman, should be sacrificed to extermination, there could be no difference in opinion concerning the idealistic notion that the savage Indian could materially benefit the nation’s culture or economy. In a last defiant challenge of the opinions of the Museu Nacional, von Ihering wrote:

It is simply not true, Mr. Sergio de Carvalho describes the Indian as “in general, intelligent, industrious, and capable of good work when competently directed and considerately handled. . .” Everything we know of the natives of southern Brazil clearly shows that the opposite is true. Far from being a progressive and productive element [in our national life], the civilized natives are indolent, indolent, and indifferent, and it will not make the slightest difference to the culture and progress of these states if such natives continue to exist or not. Only under compulsion, when reduced to something like the state of slavery, are these savages capable of making any real contribution.

Repeating Couto de Magalhaes’ opinion that the civilized Indian was a “depraved individual,” von Ihering reminded his readers that a no less competent American general by the name of Custer had maintained the belief that “The only good Indian is a dead Indian.”

With that derogatory and pessimistic evaluation of the nation’s Indian population, Hermann von Ihering retired from the controversy his writings had provoked. The ideas he had expressed, however, were to continue to revolve like whetstones and throw off occasional sparks as blades were sharpened upon them.

Teixeira Mendes’ answer to von Ihering. First to reply to the latest statement by the German scientist was R. Teixeira Mendes of the Igreja
Positivista. Shocked and disturbed by the implications of von Ihering's question: "Extermination of the natives or of the backwoodsmen?" Teixeira Mendes replied in an article published in the Jornal do Comércio: "Neither extermination of the natives nor of the backwoodsmen; humanity and justice for all." Surely, he continued, the principles of justice and humanity do not permit the extermination of men, women and children, simply because they dwell in a land coveted by Germans and Latins who have already passed from the primitive to a modern stage of civilization.

The Sociedade Nacional de Agricultura's opinion. On the 17th of December, 1908, in a meeting of the directoire, the Society approved a motion in the press and expressed its confidence in the Government's ability to solve the Indian problem by providing "instrução e colonização agricultura" to those "que forem vendidos pelo carinho e pelo bonds do Estado." Thus the Sociedade Nacional de Agricultura, an official consultant for the Ministry of Industry, Vinho and Public Works, supported Dr. von Ihering on one fundamental point: that the Federal government itself must take the action to bring the warfare being waged between the Indians and the persistent invaders to an end. The appearance of the Indian question in the press marked the introduction of the Indian debate into the press and the learned societies of the nation's capital. The press government, or, more accurately, those... agreed with him on one fundamental point; namely: that the national and state governments

---

23 Teixeira Mendes, "O sertão e a defesa dos indígenas brasileiros," Igreja e Apostolado Positivista do Brasil, No. 276 (December 15, 1908), p. 2. This statement was reproduced in the Jornal do Comércio, December 16, 1908, p. 8, under the heading "Igreja e Apostolado Positivista do Brasil."
governments must take positive action to halt the warfare being waged between the white and Indian races. The Sociedade Nacional de Agricultura was no exception to the rule and had its own ideas as to how the federal government should stop hostilities in the interior. It officially recommended the adoption of an intensive educational program directed by personnel of the agricultural stations located in Indian-occupied territory. The society believed that as the confidence of the natives was slowly won by the patient friendship and honest dealings shown by the personnel of the agricultural centers, the Indians would begin to imitate the farming practices they observed at the stations and, over a period of time, become willing students of a more general course of instruction designed to harmonize their primitive way of life with the cultural pattern of the white man. 24

The Brazilian government, or, more accurately, those government officials, state and federal, whose interests and responsibilities involved one aspect or another of Indian relations, had undoubtedly followed the development of the Indian debate in the pages of the Estado de São Paulo and the Jornal do Comércio. Some of them were attending or corresponding members of one or more of the societies that had taken part in the growing controversy during the past three months. The government authorities were thus aware of the criticism that had been leveled against them for their failure to establish a definite Indian policy and for their unwillingness to involve the national government directly in the conflict between the hostile Indians and the invading white men.

24 Jornal do Comércio, December 19, 1908, p. 4, cols. 5-6.
Thus far in the debate, however, the emphasis on the advisability of
government action was overshadowed by the more dramatic aspects of the
almost personal quarrel between von lihering and his critics. It was not the
criticism directed against the government, but rather, the attack on the
German-born director of the Museu Pacliata and his scientific theories
that dominated the first stage of the Indian debate. It was partly for this
reason that the demand for direct government intervention in the Indian
question was not sufficient to move the public authorities to positive
action.

The fact that the Brazilian government did, two years later, assume
a directing role in Indian affairs can be attributed in large measure to the
work of individuals and societies who kept the issue of Indian protection and
assimilation alive during the year 1909. It is their campaign of positive
action - of committee discussion, speech-making, pamphlet distribution,
public criticism of injustices practiced against the natives, pressure exerted
directly on government authorities, and the careful blueprinting of a practical
solution to the Indian problem - that carried the nation forward toward the
establishment of a government Indian service in 1910.
CHAPTER VI

THE CAMPAIGN FOR GOVERNMENT ACTION

Certainly it would be an oversimplification to claim that on any one day, or with any particular public assertion, the Indian debate suddenly shifted its emphasis from attack on von Hering and his ideas to an organized effort to induce the government to intervene in the warfare between the Indian and the white man. The change of emphasis would be more accurately defined as a trend than as a shift. Almost from the start of the debate, strong references had been made to the need for government action, and, with similar overlapping, a month or two months ahead, von Hering's theories were still to draw sharp criticism, even though the major interest had turned to the importance of government action in the solution of the problem. Only in retrospect is it possible to discern where the Indian debate showed signs of having entered a new and more constructive phase in its development.

The writings of R. Teixeira Mendes serve to illustrate the shifting emphasis described above. In criticizing von Hering's contention that either the colonists or the Indians were doomed to extermination, he was so completely absorbed in the effort to express his righteous indignation over the immorality and stupidity of such an assertion that he failed to offer any constructive criticism. However, two days after his first outburst, he wrote more objectively on the subject. His statement, published immediately in the Jornal do Comércio (December 13), made it clear that he, like von Hering himself, believed that the Indian problem in Brazil could be solved by government intervention.
Example set by a state president. To demonstrate his interpretation of the proper government approach to the Indians, Teixeira Mendes quoted extensively from an interesting press account of a meeting that had occurred some five months earlier between several high-ranking government officials of the state of Rio Grande do Sul and two partly-civilized representatives of an oppressed Indian tribe of the interior of that state. From the hills of Nonohay, the article read, two Indian chiefs had made their way to the state capital, there to tell the "papai grande" (great-father) of incursions into the lands they had long and peacefully inhabited. State President Carlos Barbosa had listened sympathetically to their tale and instructed his Minister of Public Works to dispatch immediately an investigating and surveying team to the disputed regions to make a full report so that the state might act to safeguard the Indians' full territorial rights. The chiefs were much pleased with this action of the "great father." They left him bows and sheaves of arrows in token of their gratitude and friendship, and they carried back to their villages several large photographs of their benefactor so that he would henceforth be known among their people. It was through prompt government action of this sort, Teixeira Mendes inferred, that friction between the Indians and the colonists could be settled amicably without resort to bloodshed and the necessity of government-sponsored military intervention.

---

1 Teixeira Mendes, "Um exemplo da verdadeira conduta republicana em relação aos indígenas," Jornal do Comércio, December 18, 1908, p. 7, as quoted from Correio do Povo (Porto Alegre), July 26, 1908. See also Teixeira Mendes, "O sentiment e a defesa dos indígenas brasileiros," Gazeta e Apostolado Político do Brasil, No. 275 (December 15, 1908), pp. 7-8.
Pressure exerted on the government of São Paulo. The news of Carlos Barbosa's official action in behalf of the oppressed Indians of his state caught the public's fancy and spread rapidly. It appeared in Rio de Janeiro's morning edition of the Jornal do Comércio on December 15, 1903 (as noted above), and the following evening it was known to Tito de Lemos, a familiar figure in the ranks of those who had been debating the Indian question in the Centro de Ciências, Letras e Artes of Campinas. Lemos passed the story on to his colleagues in a regular session of the society on December 19 and proposed that the Centro send President Barbosa an official message of congratulations for his manner of handling the Indian problem in Rio Grande do Sul. In praising Barbosa's action, Lemos referred specifically to the decision to guarantee to the Indians their right to the lands they inhabited, until such time as the natural evolution of their tribal culture should make a gradual change from collective to private ownership possible.

When the speaker had finished, Luís Bueno Horta Barbosa arose to pursue the subject of the significance of government action. First he called attention to von Hering's latest statement on the Indian question (Jornal do Comércio, December 15, 1903) and specifically reviewed the scientist's accusation that the government of São Paulo, unlike that of Parana and Rio Grande do Sul, had remained completely oblivious to the massacre of its hostile tribes and to the heartless exploitation of its tame Indian population. Horta Barbosa reminded his fellow-members that strength and authority carried responsibilities. A small and impoverished state, he declared, might be partially excused for shirking its duty to the people, but such indifference and neglect on the part of a state as powerful and progressive as their own was inexcusable and contemptible. The government of São Paulo, he argued, had the strength to protect
its native population from the inroads and persecution of the white men and, at the same time, the means to protect its colonists from the attacks of savage Indians. But instead of safeguarding the lives of either one of the parties to this dispute, the government was inflaming the controversy by supplying arms and ammunition to private companies for the indiscriminate use of laborers on public works projects and in railroad construction gangs.

It was time, Horta Barbosa asserted, for the Centro de Ciências to use its influence to promote a realistic attack on the underlying causes of the current crisis in Indian affairs. With that purpose in mind, he urged the Centro to "agitare esse sujeito sistematicamente, guiado por moral e religiosas principles." 2

The procedure that he advised the society to follow was designed to educate both the reading public and the government authorities on the unfortunate plight of the Indians and the pressing need for government action to protect them and to direct the integration of their way of life with that of the white man. Assuming that under a republican form of government, official policy and legislation generally represent the will of the people, the speaker stressed the importance of forming a sound public opinion on the Indian question and directing it toward influencing the government to accept its moral and civic responsibilities. This could be done, he claimed, through the medium of lectures and informative studies distributed in pamphlet form, as well as by means of articles published in the daily press and in other journals of wide circulation. Such emphasis on educating the public would not exclude, however, a definite attempt to instruct and influence the government

authorities directly. Such might be accomplished, Horta Barbosa con-
cluded, through a series of motions and petitions formulated by the Centro
de Ciências.

The society welcomed their orator's challenging proposal with evident
enthusiasm. Gustavo Enge was inspired to recount some experiences of his
own and of other scientists that illustrated the primitive Indian's innate
respect for others and friendly tolerance of the white man's seemingly pecu-
liar desires and customs. Other members hastened to support the proposed
campaign. Tito de Lemos, always prompt to applaud and expand upon any
expression of Indian sympathy expressed by a fellow-member, recommended
that a petition to the state government be drawn up without delay and officially
signed by the directorate in the name of the society. Horta Barbosa suggested
that such a document also bear the signatures of as many members of the
Centro, and as many fellow-citizens, as possible. Evidently this idea was
also welcomed for shortly after its presentation, the Society's president
closed the meeting with a word of praise for the consistent harmony that
characterized his colleagues' treatment of scientific matters.

The petition suggested on December 19, 1908, was composed by Horta
Barbosa with the collaboration of a fellow schoolteacher who shared his be-
liefs in the humanitarian teachings of orthodox Positivism in Brazil. That
man, Basílio de Magalhães, had been introduced to the tenets of religious
Positivism through the guidance of Silvio de Almeida, the eminent scholar

---

3 Note the qualification: "harmony in scientific matters." A few months
later that harmony amongst the members of the Centro de Ciências was
severely strained by religious implications not yet apparent in the Indian de-
bate in early 1909,
of São Paulo who had first exposed von Thering’s extermination statement. Magalhães was not an active member of the Centro de Ciências, but he took an immediate and deep interest in the welfare of the Indians. It was he, according to Horta Barbosa, who was largely responsible for the excellent literary style that embellished and strengthened the statement.

Its wording, as read by Horta Barbosa in the next session of the Centro de Ciências, was clear and forceful. The petition charged that the Society and all those who signed the petition were acting under their constitutional rights as citizens in condemning the shameful contrast offered by São Paulo’s economic and cultural record of progress on the one hand and her complete disregard for the lives and property of her native population on the other. In an attempt to shake the government out of its inertia, the carefully phrased document charged that such indifference on the part of government officials was far more reprehensible in the twentieth century than in colonial days when the conquerors were less civilized and when the odds against the Indian were not so overwhelming.

The Indian himself should not be expected, Horta Barbosa declared, to initiate the change of attitude that would resolve misunderstandings and end the fears and friction that held the races apart. That must come from the representatives of the higher civilization. But surely, Barbosa continued, the state would not find the task of mediation an unwelcome and distasteful one.

All information used here concerning the Barbosa-Magalhães petition and the proceedings of the meeting in which it was read and approved is taken from "Acta da 315.ª sessão ordinaria de 26 de dezembro de 1908," Revista do Centro, No. 31, pp. 79-30. The petition was published separately in an earlier issue (No. 20, pp. 141-142) under the heading "Representação ao governo em prol dos indios."
On the contrary, the merciful care of the primitive Indians was "a duty sublime" - a glorious opportunity to demonstrate the true depth of São Paulo's culture and the progressive spirit of her government. On a continuing note of challenge, the authors reminded the president of São Paulo that his state was the cradle of José Bonifácio, Patriarch of Independence, and of the immortal composer, Carlos Gomes. And just as their fame rested in large measure upon their identification with the welfare of the underprivileged races, so would the future glory of São Paulo rest upon its response to the present need of the red Indian.

Although Barbosa and Magalhães disclaimed any attempt to formulate a plan for civilizing the Indians, they recommended a definite course of action designed to establish amicable relations between the races. First, they said, São Paulo's government, like that of Rio Grande do Sul, should follow the example of the United States of America in establishing treaties with Indian tribes as autonomous units. Next, the authors, in accord with von Thering, urged their state to patrol the areas where Indians and colonists were in conflict so as to stop the senseless massacre of innocent people. Third, they asked that the assassination of Indians be no longer excused without trial simply because it was allegedly in defense of life, property or honor. Fourth, the government was asked to stop supplying railroad workers and laborers on public works projects in Indian territory with arms and ammunition. Finally, the petition called upon the state to halt the practice of classifying the Indian-inhabited territory as unoccupied land with the intention of bestowing it upon individuals - nationals or foreigners - or upon railroads, real estate companies, and business concerns.
Viewing the Indian question in its larger aspects, the two professors stated how important it was to destroy in the mind of the oppressed savage the inherited and constantly reinforced expectation of persecution from the white men that had become a terrible tradition of extermination, injury, and exploitation. Such a tradition, they explained, during its formation over the centuries, had caused the act of reprisal against intruders to become a natural habit and, sometimes more serious than that, a venerated religious practice.

It was partly for this reason, Horta Barbosa continued, that no attempt to civilize the wild Indians could possibly succeed, unless it were preceded by a successful campaign to win their complete confidence. This was a task, Barbosa implied, that could best be handled by the state, for it required a consistent policy and a coordinated program of action along an extensive frontier. It was a job, Barbosa added, that he and all those whose names appeared on the petition confidently placed in the capable hands of their state government with the expectation of realizing at last the dream of Carlos Gomes and José Bonifacio, and of all those patriotic Brazilians of the past whose sympathy for the Indians had represented the true national spirit—the dream of a united people, proud of its assimilation of the descendants of the aborigines whom Yves d'Évreux, in the seventeenth century, had claimed to be easier to civilize than the peasants of France.

When Horta Barbosa concluded his reading of the petition, he received a warm demonstration of approval from his colleagues, some of whom congratulated him personally for the high moral tone and stately eloquence of the petition they were ready to sign. Vicente Melillo enthusiastically proposed that it be written into the minutes of the session. His wholehearted acceptance
of the work of two Positivists, whose interpretation of the future role of the Catholic Church in Indian affairs differed markedly from his own, attests to the strictly secular character of the Indian debate at this time. The authors might have used the petition to suggest methods of civilizing the Indians, and such a discussion would have involved the question as to whether government employees or the clergy should work among the natives and supervise their education. Instead, they avoided the religious implications and appealed to the moral principles shared by all the members, whatever their faith. The stress was wisely placed on the immediate need for government action in defense of the Indian, and on that point there was unanimous agreement.

Though not immediately effective, this petition was a significant step forward. Basílio de Magalhães, many years later, described this document as the "cry of alarm that resulted in the secular and official Indian service of Brazil," actually, as we have seen, this was not the first expression of alarm or the first evidence of pressure brought to bear upon state officials or the federal government. Nor was this petition from Campinas considered by state authorities to be of sufficient importance to merit a prompt reply.

Several months passed before it received an answer. Nevertheless, it was a major contribution to the campaign for Indian rights and protection. Its forcefulness and eloquence served to heighten the enthusiasm of the Centro de Ciências over the developing campaign, and more specifically, to convince several of its members that their adopted cause was eminently just and worthy of their sustained efforts and devotion.

Further criticism of the government in an international congress. At about the same time that the Centro's petition to the president of São Paulo was beginning to enjoy a wide circulation in the journals of São Paulo and Rio de Janeiro, the national government itself was jolted by the reappearance of the Indian extermination theme in the proceedings of the Fourth Latin-American Scientific Congress, meeting in late December, 1908, in Santiago, Chile. This conference, known also as the First Pan-American Scientific Congress, was certainly not a place where the Brazilian government would want its shortcomings paraded before the public eye. That, however, is what happened and the experience undoubtedly had some influence on the nation's growing awareness of the need for government action in behalf of the Indians.

The way in which the subject of Indian extermination crept into the Scientific Congress in Santiago is in sharp contrast with the manner in which it had been introduced into the Americanist Congress in Vienna by Alberto Frei three months before. This time it was a Brazilian who raised the subject - not a visiting naturalist from Czechoslovakia. The man responsible was Nelson Coelho de Senna, a prominent young thirty-two journalist from the interior state of Minas Gerais. His interest in the Indians dated back at least as far - at least as the preceding scientific congress of 1905 in Rio de Janeiro, where he had read a somewhat sketchy ethnologic study of Brazil's native tribes. Three years later, in November, 1908, he had published a revised and enlarged edition of the paper and submitted it for approval and presentation the following

---

Nelson Coelho de Senna, "A idade da pedra no Brasil: O nosso periodo neolitico. Archeologia e monumentos praeistoricos no Brasil." This study was published as "These III da sub-comissao de sciencias anthropologicas" in the proceedings of the Third Latin-American Scientific Congress, and also in separate form under the abbreviated title, A idade da pedra no Brasil (Belo Horizonte, 1905).
month at the Fourth Scientific Congress in Santiago. It was this enlarged edition that referred to the current discussion of Brazil's Indian problem and aired its more controversial aspects before the international gathering.

Senna's treatment of the subject of Indian extermination comprised only a small part of his seventy-six page monograph. It was limited to a series of five extensive footnotes that had been annexed, evidently, just prior to publication. The theme was introduced, as so often in the past two and a half months, by a careful reproduction of the von lhering extermination statement as it had appeared in volume seven of the Revista do Museu Paulista.

"We underscore these horrible and inhumane words," the journalist declared, and "lament the fact that they could have come from the pen of so learned and distinguished a man!" In case there is some question as to how the writer from Belo Horizonte learned of the von lhering statement and its discovery by Silvio de Almeida, it should be noted here that the young journalist was a corresponding member of both the Centro de Ciências in Campinas and the Instituto Histórico e Geográfico de São Paulo. It is not unlikely that through their publications, or through personal and professional correspondence with their members and directorate, he had kept himself informed on the Indian debate as it developed in these societies.

Senna, Os índios do Brasil: Memória etnográfica (Belo Horizonte, 1903). This paper, as presented in the Scientific Congress and as discussed below, may be found in translation under the title "Los indios del Brasil" (trans. Clemente Barahona Vega) in the Trabajos del Cuarto Congreso Científico (1° Pan Americano), celebrado en Santiago de Chile del 27 de diciembre de 1908 al 3 de enero de 1909, Vol. XVII (Santiago, 1912), Fasc. 1, pp. 396-402. See especially footnotes A-D, pp. 396-402.
In one of the longer footnotes of his paper, Senna described an Indian hunt that had taken place in Santa Catarina, evidently hoping that the gruesome account would not only shock his fellow-scientists at the Santiago conference but would support his contention that violence would never solve the Indian problem in Brazil. It was a detailed account of how twenty-four men under the leadership of the famous bugreiro, Martinho Marcellino, fell upon a sleeping Indian encampment at two in the morning on a Sunday in February of 1905 and massacred all the Indians, irrespective of age or sex. Such brutality on the part of the colonist, Senna argued, had only incited the Indians to renewed reprisals. Each murderous Indian hunt, though it had resulted in the destruction of an Indian village, had turned other Indian communities into war camps.

The state of Minas Gerais, Senna declared, furnished ample evidence to prove that force was not the answer to Indian opposition. Fertile lands with abundant water, once agriculturally productive, now lay desolate, abandoned by colonists who could no longer withstand the assaults of marauding Indians. Peace would come to his state, the writer predicted, when the authorities set aside adequate and clearly marked areas for the aborigines and guaranteed their permanent possession of such lands against all forms of colonial invasion.

Senna did not consider isolation on Indian reservations the only answer to the problem. He imparted his firm belief that friendship and understanding on the part of the civilized races, if clearly demonstrated and patiently maintained, would win the affection and the eager cooperation of the red man. To support his opinion, the writer referred to what had happened in northern Brazil when a telegraphic commission in that region, after the loss of many of
its workers in Indian attacks and counter-attacks over a period of years, altered its tactics in 1905 and began to meet hostility with a calm display of good will. The results, he affirmed, had been phenomenal. According to recent reports, the once savage Indians of the modern state of Maranhao were at present busily engaged in building homes for the newly-arrived telegraphic personnel.

It is not easy to weigh the influence of this paper on the progress of Brazil's developing awareness of the need for large-scale planning and coordinated action in the realm of Indian affairs. Someone other than Nelson de Senna read the study, if it was presented orally, for he could not be present at the meeting. Perhaps it was partly because he was not there that no heated discussion developed over the more controversial aspects. Nor was its description of an Indian massacre singled out for the sort of local and international publicity that Alberto Frics's accusations had received following the Americanist Congress in Vienna. Senna's paper drew no immediately apparent repercussions. Nevertheless, it voiced a bold denunciation of von Hering's ideas on Indian extermination before a brilliant assemblage of his fellow-scientists. Among them was Baptista de Lacerda, who had signed this museum's protest against the German scientist earlier in the month.

What is more important, the young journalist's call for a wiser and more humane Indian policy in Brazil, voiced as it was before the representatives of almost all the nations of the Western Hemisphere, tended to force his government to justify its present Indian policy before the eyes of its neighbors to something it could not do—or else begin to build a new policy that would show off to better advantage abroad.
An Indian-affairs expert’s plea for justice and mercy. Of all the protests called forth by von Bering’s statement concerning Indian extermination, none was more eloquent or more convincing than that of Cândido Mariano da Silva Rondon, Army Colonel and Chief of telegraph-line construction in the state of Mato Grosso. Rondon was an ardent Positivist—a fact that largely accounts for his appointment to engineering and scientific duties rather than to activities of a more warlike nature. It was he who was responsible for the telegraphic commission’s change of policy after 1905 to meet the Indian hostility with the new and amazingly effective weapons of open friendship and absolute justice.

From a telegraph outpost station deep in the Amazon forest, Rondon wired Baptista de Lacerda of the Museu Nacional on February 4, 1909, to express his wholehearted support of the stand taken by that museum on the question of Indian extermination. The fact that news of the Indian debates had penetrated the deepest wilds of western Mato Grosso to reach a survey and construction crew that had been almost isolated from outside contact since they entered the forests in 1907, is clear evidence that by 1909 the Indian question had assumed a vitality and urgency that would not be denied attention.

Rondon’s telegram was a significant contribution to the Indian debate, not only because of the wide publicity it received, but because it brought into the controversy the opinions of a highly respected explorer and scientist who, like Leolinda Daltro, had a visible amount of Indian blood in his veins and who understood the most primitive savages through the experience of close contact with them for many years. As an officer of the telegraphic commissions in northwestern Brazil since 1890, Rondon could offer undeniable evidence that
the hostile and uncivilized Indian could be pacified and trained to be of service to the nation.

Speaking in his telegram for the efficacy of justice and mercy in the treatment of the natives, Rondon assured Baptista de Lacerda that the fiercest savages, once convinced of the friendly intentions of strangers, would suspend hostilities despite bitter memories of the most heartless persecution. Already, he reminded the museum director, the wild Bororos of São Paulo had accepted the white man's friendship and were living in peaceful relations with their neighbors under the compassionate care of the Salesian priests. The telegraphic commission under his command, Rondon reported, was now at work in the lands of the Pareci-Cabixi tribes, where it was receiving from these primitive people "greater aid in our labors than could possibly be provided by non-Indian workers." Their ability to learn the skills of art and industry, he asserted, and the variety of their rudimentary handicrafts, attested to their capacity to absorb the advantages of civilization.

One paragraph in particular summed up Rondon's opinion of von llering's pessimistic belief that the primitive Indian could not contribute anything of value to the nation's culture and economy. The words rang with conviction and indignation:

From the depths of this endless forest, inhabited only by Parecis, Cabixis, Tapanhunas, Backairins (sic), Cajabos, and Nhambiquaras; from the heart of Brazil's northwest where hide the legitimate sons of the land of José Bonifácio, of Tiradentes and of Benjamin Constant from the captivity and extermination (counseled by) the von llerings of all times, I hasten, Mr. Director, to assure you that the Indians, no matter what their tribe, are as susceptible as the most civilized westerner to love and goodness, not to mention their intelligence so commonly recognized since colonial times? 

---

Although Rondon's attack on von Hering was perhaps unfair to the scientist, based as it was on someone else's interpretation of the original extermination statement, nevertheless, it was a powerful factor in the ultimate success of the campaign under way to arouse public interest and force government action on behalf of the Indians. His opinions concerning the natives attracted thoughtful attention and commanded universal respect. It was well-known that they were founded on long experience in dealing with primitive and often hostile Indians; also that they came from a man whose judgment could be trusted. Rondon, in his past teaching duties, as well as in his present work, had demonstrated the same strength of character and disciplined, scientifically trained mind that had tempted some Brazilians to trust von Hering's judgment on the Indian question as against that of less practical men. He was as practical-minded as von Hering, and, what is more, he had tangible results to prove that his methods of Indian treatment had already pacified warlike tribes that had long blocked the white man's advance — tribes such as those which von Hering had doomed to justifiable extermination.

Undoubtedly Rondon's telegram and the publicity it received influenced government thinking on the Indian question. Since Rondon was the chief of a strategically important government service, it follows that whatever success he had in gaining the active cooperation of once-hostile Indians was fully recorded in reports to his superiors in the nation's capital. When, through his telegram to Lacerda, his ideas suddenly caught public attention, it was to be expected that the government officials responsible for Indian affairs should examine the records of the operations of Rondon's telegraphic commission more closely, with a view to endorsing the engineer's methods of Indian
pacification and thus making his policies their own. By such action, the government could counter the mounting criticism against its failure to act on the Indian question by portraying Rondon's success as a government, as well as a personal, achievement.

The director of the Museu Nacional, to whom the telegram had been directed, evidently recognized its value to the campaign under way to force government protection of the natives, for he made certain that it appeared in several different journals of Rio de Janeiro. In the Jornal do Comércio, it was reproduced together with Lacerda's answering wire, addressed to Rondon at the telegraphic station, Barão de Capena, Mato Grosso. The reply read as follows:

Your authoritative opinion comes as a strong support of our protests against the inhumane doctrine of Indian extermination suggested as a means of populating the rude backlands of Brazil. All applaud your generous attitude on this question.

Von Ihering's break with the Instituto Histórico of São Paulo. There is clear evidence to show that the wave of Indian sympathy aroused by the publicity given to Rondon's protest and those that had preceded it was of sufficient depth to alter the calm routine of von Ihering's life and damage the high esteem with which he had been held by many of his fellow-scientists. By the latter part of February, when the Instituto Histórico e Geográfico de São Paulo met for its first session of 1909, following the enervating heat of summer and the distractions of the carnival holidays, the feeling against von Ihering among certain members of the society was too strong to disguise.

It should be recalled that the Instituto had, some weeks prior to this meeting of February 20, received a formal request from the Centro de Ciências of Campinas for solidarity of opinion against the sentiments expressed by von Ihering concerning the ethics of Indian extermination. The Instituto Histórico had not acted upon the matter. To do so would have involved an embarrassing discussion and, perhaps, a vote of support or censure of the German-born scientist who happened to be not only a founding member of the society but one of its select group of "honored members."

Von Ihering knew of the Centro's request, and he was far from satisfied with his society's decision to ignore it. As a distinguished member of the Instituto Histórico, he was surprised and hurt that his fellow-members had not immediately answered the Campinas society with a solid vote of confidence in him and in his scientific opinions. Irged by his colleagues' refusal to support him openly against the flood of abuse that had poured in upon him, he was psychologically disposed to see injury and insult in almost every look and word of his fellow-members.

Early in the meeting, he arose to register a complaint. Why, he asked, had the title of his lecture before the society during the past October been altered without his permission in the annual publication to read "Os indios do Brasil meridional" (The Indians of Southern Brazil) instead of "O caso dos nossos indios" (The Situation as Regards our Indians), as he had originally worded it? The fact that the man who arose to justify the change was none other than Torres de Oliveira, a member of recognizably strong anti-Ihering feelings on the Indian question, served to strengthen the scientist's suspicion that the alteration was a personal slight.
The happenings of the following session of the Instituto Histórico reinforce the contention that considerable antagonism existed in that society against von Ihering and the harsh statements he had made on the Indian question. Both von Ihering and his son, Rodolfo (acting secretary of the meeting) were present. For both of them it was the last session they attended, either that year or the next. Early in the meeting two pamphlets from the pen of corresponding member Nelson de Senna were formally presented to the society in his name. One of them was the paper submitted to the scientific congress in Santiago the previous December, bearing the strong denunciation of von Ihering's extermination paragraph. Whether or not Senna, by this presentation, had intended to create a scene in the Instituto that would force discussion of the controversial issue it had been avoiding so carefully, the seeming audacity of the presentation appeared to von Ihering and to his son as a final insult that left them no alternative but immediate severance of relations with the society.

The German-born scientist was perhaps correct in his interpretation of the stratagem behind the presentation of Senna's "Os índios do Brasil," although, as already stated, it was common practice for authors to introduce their latest works to the professional world through the learned societies to which they belonged. The man who formally accepted the two studies in the name of the society was Alfredo de Toledo, a "distinguished member" of the Instituto, according to his title in the membership roll. Like Torres de Oliveira, who had in the preceding session explained his alteration of the title of von Ihering's speech, Toledo was destined in the months ahead to take a prominent role in the opposition to von Ihering's stand on the issue of Indian pacification and civilization.
The presentation of Senna's works was followed immediately by a few words from Joaquim José de Carvalho, which sounded like an effort to pour oil on the suddenly troubled waters. According to the sketchy minutes of the session, Carvalho expressed pleasure in "having heard the words of Dr. von Ihering." The records do not explain this statement. The only information we know is that it was this man Joaquim de Carvalho, who in later sessions was to oppose strongly the society's support of government efforts to inaugurate a secular Indian service. And on that point, he was in full accord with von Ihering.

Thus, by March of 1909, there were signs that von Ihering was at last finding some measure of support. It is not that his statements on the Indian question were drawing adherents to his cause, but rather that the debate was beginning to force old friends and close associates either to support him openly or be classed among those who had turned their backs upon him.

Following Carvalho's attempt to ease the embarrassment and hard feeling caused by Toledo's formal acceptance of the Senna papers, João C. Gomes Ribeiro arose and read a study of his own on the Indians of São Paulo.

---


10The title of this paper, according to the minutes of the session, was "Ouace os indígenas que habitavam as costas de S. Vicente e os campos de Piratinha, nos tempos da conquista?" It is most likely the same study that appeared in volume XIII of the society's annual publication under the title Os indígenas primitivos de S. Paulo, (Guayanazes, Tapuías ou Túpis?"
Dr. Gomes Ribeiro's development of this controversial thesis was much appreciated, and, following the reading, its shortcomings were discussed by Drs. Hermann von Thering and Joaquim J. de Carvalho. No one else requesting to speak on the subject, the president closed the session. 13

Organization of an Indian Committee by the Centro. The records of the historical and geographical societies of Rio de Janeiro and São Paulo attest to the increasing attention devoted to Indian affairs in their meetings of 1909-1910. The almost exclusive preoccupation with that subject in the session just reviewed would have been unusual two years earlier. In the Centro de Ciências, Letras e Artes of Campinas, the Indian question had already overshadowed all other interests.

In the regular session of March 27, Erasmo Braga joined the ranks of those who were leading the campaign for Indian protection. Many who remember this outstanding Protestant leader are perhaps unaware of the prominent part he played in the Indian debate. Speaking on the subject of a mid-nineteenth century study of the Indians of São Paulo made by Arouche

Braga summarized the army marshal's enlightened program for civilizing the Indians and criticized the Brazilian people, as well as their government officials, for having failed, during the past half-century, to act upon that program, or upon any other.

The time had come, Braga assured his colleagues of the Centro, when Brazilians could no longer postpone their responsibility to the Indians. They must use their sovereign power, as granted by the Constitution, to insist on effective government action. The friction between the native and white races, he asserted, had reached crisis proportions. Indian slavery was still being practiced. Treatment of the natives of São Paulo, he informed his fellow members, had recently been described as unbearable by the famous engineer, Teodoro Sampaio, in the Boletim da Comissão Geográfica de São Paulo. At home, Braga continued, the nation was poisoned by the suggestion of a program of Indian extermination that had sprung, in his opinion, from Hermann von Hering's accidental and awkward wording of his scientific beliefs. Abroad, there was the imminent possibility of a thorough exposure of barbarities practiced against the natives in Brazil—an act that would grievously shame the Brazilian flag.

The speaker assured the Centro that the situation was not hopeless; that much could be done for the natives of Brazil on the pattern of Indian policy in North America. To support this contention, he read aloud from a

States Government report of 1907 that concerned the problem of 
treatment. Also, he read several pertinent excerpts from a letter 
the same general subject written by a high administrative officer of New 
University. Braga was clearly optimistic over the possibility of re-
ving the quandary that characterized the present state of Indian affairs 
Brazil, if only the public could be made to see the necessity for positive 
humanitarian action on a nation-wide scale.

Braga's closing words challenged the Centro to press forward in the 
ampaign it had so eagerly initiated. He reminded his colleagues that the 
ty of Campinas, in the past century, had contributed generously and nobly 
the abolitionist movement and the advent of the Republic. Now, it was 
: hope that from this same city, and particularly from the Centro de Ciências, 
era might develop a crusade for the freedom and protection of the Indians 
at would spread throughout the entire land. 13

The response to this challenge was highly enthusiastic. The minutes 
of the session record the fact that Braga was complimented by all the 
members present for a "magnificent and patriotic address." Tito de Lemos 
expressed his delight in seeing the whole-hearted accord with which his 
fellow-members received Braga's inspiring suggestion that the Centro lead a 
crusade for Indian justice. He informed the society that thus far no answer 
had come from the government of São Paulo to the petition addressed to the 
President of the state during the past December. However, he added, the 
ack of response should not discourage the society in its plan to push forward 
on the humanitarian movement it had initiated.

du Centro, No. 33 (December 1913), p. 52.
It remained for Amilar Alves to propose the nomination of a permanent committee of American ethnography within the society, together with a temporary committee charged with the task of investigating all practical means of handling the Indian question, both within the press and without. The motion setting an ethnographic committee, when put to a vote, was rejected. A second motion, however, recommending the organization of a temporary "indianizing" committee, was unanimously approved. Appointed to this committee by the president were those members who had already shown special interest in the matter: Luis Bueno Horta Barbosa, Tito de Lemos, Erasmo da Gama, Vicente Melillo and Amilar Alves.

The committee itself was not long in selecting Horta Barbosa as its leader. Under the title "Comissão Promotora da Defesa e Civilização Indígenas" (Committee for the Promotion of the Protection and Civilization of the Indians), it promptly notified other societies and institutions of its intention to launch an organized movement in support of government action on behalf of the native population. It offered its unqualified support to all efforts on their part to further the welfare of the Indians. Also, it requested from those institutions copies of whatever they published concerning the natives and their problems.

A letter directed to the Museu Nacional on April 8, 1909, illustrates the committee's special interest in the problem of Indian protection and its efforts to avoid the subject of civilizing techniques. The committee's primary aim, this document explained, was to induce the government to mark clearly the boundaries of Indian inhabited lands, and to guarantee, against forms of exploitation and invasion, the safety of their lives and the security...
The committee's most impressive and most widely distributed appeal to adherence to the cause of Indian protection to the cause of Indian protection was a six-page pamphlet entitled "A questão indígena: Apello à opinião publica do Brazil, pela Comissão Promotora de Defesa do Indio" (The Indian Question: Appeal Directed to Brazil's Public Opinion, by the Committee to Promote the Protection and Civilization of the Indians). It opened with a brief synopsis of the centuries-old injustice practiced against the Indians and the failure to prevent this abuse, despite efforts of Brazil's most respected and learned patriots. In the light of present developments, the message continued, some form of government protection of the native was absolutely essential. Having driven the Indians from the coast and river margins, the ever-expanding white population was, according to the Committee, once again engaged in a colossal effort to occupy the deep interior.

The Comissão Promotora, in this public appeal, divided the Indian question into two aspects: first, protection; and second, incorporation into the national community. The second aspect, involving the problem of civilized the Indian, must wait upon the successful completion of the first, the Committee stated. Not until the Indians felt secure from exploitation and persecution would they draw close to the white man and learn from him.

The efforts of the Centro de Ciências, and, more specifically, of its newly-organized Comissão Promotora, to arouse public interest and force
government intervention in Indian affairs, continued to move forward through
the early months of 1909 on a wave of anti-von Ihering, anti-extermination
feeling. Almost every speech and article, including the appeal directed to
the public, either quoted or referred to the German-born scientist’s less
diplomatic statements and then pleaded for Indian protection. In this manner,
the Committee held the Indian debate to the original subject of pacification
versus extermination, and avoided the controversial questions of education-
lar procedure that were certain to arise if an attempt were made to formulate
civilizing techniques.

However, by April of 1909 there were those among the Indian sympa-
thizers who began to question the practicality of certain recommendations
made by the Centro de Ciências. For the first time since the beginning of
the Indian debate in October of 1908, von Ihering’s criticism of his opponents’
stand as impractical sentimentalism found support among those who either
shied at last to voice their earlier convictions, or who began to fear
that government intervention, if too strongly encouraged, might lead
to usurpation of church responsibility for Indian instruction.

It is the growing schism within the ranks of the Indian sympathizers
- the inevitable shift of the subject of debate from extermination versus
pacification to an even more controversial issue, church versus secular
responsibility for the instruction of the Indians - that now needs to be
analyzed.
CHAPTER VII

DISAGREEMENT OVER CIVILIZING TECHNIQUES

Perhaps it was inevitable that dissension should arise, sooner or
ter, among those who had thus far been firmly united by their opposition
to von Thuring's disparaging evaluation of the natives and his indifference
to the extermination of those who blocked the nation's cultural and economic
conquest of the interior. As an alternative to continued decimation of the
decreasing native population, they had argued convincingly for pacification
and protection. They were in general agreement that the task of establishing
peaceful relations between the Indian and the white man involved problems
of such magnitude that only the Government could handle it effectively.
However, it became increasingly evident in 1909 that they were not in accord
on the question of how far the Government should go in its intervention in
Indian affairs.

Some of the most outspoken participants in the Indian debate visualized
the Government in the role of educator as well as protector. They pictured
the advantages of having government representatives among the Indians, ready
to supervise a nationwide program on the local level and able to report their
needs and activities directly to the federal ministry concerned. But there
were other individuals, equally sympathetic to the needs of the Indians, who
felt that the Government's activities should be circumscribed geographically
and limited to legislative action, top-level planning, military support when
required, and generous financial backing. Finally, there were those who had
opposed von Thuring's ideas concerning extermination but accepted his opinion
that the Indians should be isolated from all contact with the white man's civilization.

Criticism of impractical sentimentality. The split in the ranks of the warring opposition, which characterized the development of the Indian debate in the latter part of 1909, was undeniably evident in the discussions and the Indianist activities of the Centro de Ciências. In a regular session of that body held on April 10, a distinguished scientist and founding member, Campos Novaes, challenged what he called an "excess of idealism" on the part of the Society's Indian commission, the Comissão Promotora. He believed that the Indian question was more a scientific than a social problem and should, therefore, be approached through careful investigation rather than through unreasoning sentimentality. He advised his colleagues not to blind their eyes to the realities of the Indian problem. Three million inhabitants of São Paulo State were being defied by three thousand savages. Furthermore, he declared, wherever fertile, wooded lands remained in the eastern and southern states of Brazil, there the conquest and productive use of the earth had been seriously retarded by the presence of hostile Indians.

The gravity of this situation, Novaes affirmed, demanded something more practical than the petition to the state government drawn up by Horta Barbosa and Basílio de Magalhães. Several of the requests and suggestions in that document were, in the speaker's opinion, contrary to the purposes of recent legislation concerning land distribution and occupation. Novaes assured the society that railroad workers were legally entitled to carry firearms for their own protection, and that corporation or government ownership
of land traversed by railroad lines, even though inhabited by Indians, was recognized necessity. Results would not come, he warned, from recommending the impossible. It was his opinion that the Comissão Promotora could do better to direct some of its attention to the plight of the civilized forces who, in "this new and crucial situation" were locked in warfare with the forces of barbarism.

This request for a more practical view of the Indian problem led Horta Barbosa to take the floor in defense of his committee's objectives and sentiments. Thanking Novaes for his realistic presentation of the matter, he admitted the value of such thinking but insisted that the ideas expressed in the petition to their state president were not at all impractical. Horta Barbosa's remarks, though tempered with words of respect for the older member, drew from acting-president Penciano Cabral a reminder that heated discussion was by regulation and tradition not tolerated in the society's meetings.

Calm was soon restored, though the controversial issue was not immediately dropped. Campos Novaes quickly assured his fellow-members that his only wish was to see the successful conclusion of the campaign for government action which was progressing so satisfactorily. His suggestions, he said, had been made with only that in mind. Horta Barbosa, still troubled by the distinguished member's implication that the Comissão Promotora was being prompted in its actions by impractical sentimentality, took the floor again to read two especially significant letters of congratulations and support received.

recently by the Indian committee. One of these messages came from an outstanding literary figure in Brazil, Coelho Netto, and the other from Army Engineer Lt. Coronel A. R. Gomes de Castro, a powerful spokesman for the Igreja Positivista and a prominent figure in Republican ranks. The meeting closed with a gesture of compromise on the part of the society's president who appointed another member, Gustavo Enjo, to the Indian committee and recommended that a commission uniting the Centro's zoological and historical committees be set up to study the Indian question under the chairmanship of Campos Novaes.

Evidently the Novaes attack had shaken the self-confidence with which the Comissão Promotora had been conducting its propaganda campaign in behalf of Indian protection and civilization. Perhaps that accounts for the fact that during the weeks that followed the stormy session of April 10, various members of the Indian committee took turns in reading at length in the Centro's weekly meetings letters which expressed the congratulations and support extended to them by influential individuals and societies throughout Brazil. Two of those messages have already been mentioned. Several others deserve special attention and are treated here in the order in which they were read before the society by the Comissão Promotora.

In the closing minutes of the April 10 session already discussed, Amilar Alves notified his fellow-members that the Masonic lodge "Independencia" of Campinas had recently announced its adherence to the aims and the sentiments of the Indian committee. It is difficult to measure the influence of Freemasonry's support of the Centro's campaign. There is reason to believe that it was extensive. It is certain that Masonic interest in the progress of the Indian
debate was not limited to the state of São Paulo. The lodge "Independência" directed a circular on April 21 to all its fellow chapters of Brazilian Freemasonry, calling upon them to support in every way the effort to safeguard the remaining Indians and incorporate them gradually into the national life and culture. That could be accomplished, the message added, without detriment of any sort to the material or mental progress of Brazil. Three months later, in the National Masonic Congress of 1909 in Rio de Janeiro, one of the motions most enthusiastically debated and unanimously approved was that which supported government intervention in the task of protecting and civilizing the Indians of Brazil. 2

In the session of the following week on April 17, the Indian question again occupied the entire proceedings. Erasmo Braga opened the subject with the report that the American director of São Paulo's Mackenzie College, Horace Lane, had expressed his unqualified approval of the society's efforts in behalf of the Indians. Following this and a further notice of support, Horta Barbosa arose again to defend the work of the Indian committee as being scientifically sound and practical. He pointed out that João Barbosa Rodrigues, one of Brazil's finest ethnologists, had also counseled tolerance and patient friendship as superior to force in taming the most hostile tribes. It would be a great injustice, the speaker believed, to label that scientist's beliefs as idealistic. Horta Barbosa's justification of the humanitarian approach

---

2 This information appears in a letter dated April 8, 1910, and directed to Rodolfo Miranda, Minister of Agriculture, from the Loja Maçônica "Independência," which was published in the Relatório apresentado ao Presidente da República dos Estados Unidos do Brazil pelo Ministro da Agricultura (Ministério da Agricultura, Pecuária e Abastecimento) do Brasil, no ano de 1910 (Rio de Janeiro, 1910), II, 27. This publication will hereafter be cited as Relatório do Ministério da Agricultura: 1910.
the Indian problem almost filled the minutes of the session. The meeting ended with a brief reply from Campos Novaes, who expressed his continued belief that the society's opinion of the Indian's character and potential worth is overly idealistic. The problems involved in helping the natives, he stated, demanded considerably more thought. In his opinion, charitable methods of civilizing the wild Indians would be ineffective at the present time, since these people were "in no condition to be civilized."³

Messages of approval and support were received from men of high government office during the weeks that followed. The society's records show that a dispatch from São Paulo's secretary of agriculture, Cândido Rodrigues, was read in the session of May 8, along with a letter to Horta Barbosa from the president of the state of Paraná, Dr. Francisco Xavier de Silva. Rodrigues thanked the Comissão Promotora for its official approval of the government's action during the past month in encouraging the vice-commissioner of the Order of Capuchins to resume the order's educational work among the Indians of São Paulo. The notice from the president of Paraná explained and enclosed a copy of State Law number 853 of March 22, 1909, which treated the subject of educational opportunities for Indian children and the demarcation of Indian-occupied territories in various parts of the state.

His message praised the Comissão Promotora for its humanitarian labors and thanked it for its recent expression of congratulations for pro-Indian government.

³ "Acta da 328.ª sessão ordinaria de 17 de abril de 1909," Revista do Centro, No. 33, pp. 56-57. The minutes of this session do not make it clear whether these few words were the extent of Novaes's answer to Horta Barbosa or whether he spoke at greater length.
efforts in Paraná.

Campos Novaes remained silent in this session, although his words of the preceding week led Horta Barbosa to discuss again, at considerable length, the procedure to be followed in civilizing the Indian. His speech was an eloquent defense of the efficacy of a generous and friendly approach in dissolving the natives' distrust and enmity, and, according to the minutes of the session, it was warmly received.

The argument thus far in the Centro de Ciências involved one basic question: namely the practicality of peaceful methods of civilizing the Indians. Actually, the attack by Campos Novaes on what he considered to be over-sentimentality and idealism on the part of the Indian committee was simply a carry-over of von Lhering's earlier argument. Indeed, the German scientist might well have been thinking of Novaes, among others, when later he expressed his surprise and disappointment over the fact that not one single man of his own scientific convictions on the debated subject had come forward to support him publicly in the closing months of 1908.


5 It is evident from an article written by Campos Novaes in February 1908, that he was as unsympathetic as von Lhering to the plight of the Indians who were blocking the white man's advance into their lands. Speaking of the treachery that characterized the warring tactics of the Tapanhumas, Novaes wrote: "There are civilized Indians and there are those who are wild beasts and assassins. The methods of treating them cannot be identical." Novaes, "Los desiertos desconocidos de San Paulo," trans. Clemente B. Vega, Trabajos del Cuarto Congresso Científico, XVII (Santiago, 1912), Part 3, pp. 450-461.
The Comissão Promotora may not have realized in 1909 the advantages of having a powerful and respected voice of opposition within the membership of its own society. The arguments advanced by Novaes spurred them on to take a more active role in their projected campaign in much the same way that von der Linth's earlier statements had provoked his adversaries to outspoken defense of the natives whose plight many of them had previously ignored.

Incoming letters read by Horta Barbosa and others during the months of 1909 indicate that the Comissão, in its effort to enlist the support of individuals and societies in a concerted drive for government action on the Indian problem, was especially active in its correspondence during the early weeks of the campaign while subject to the annoying criticism of their fellow-member of the Centro.

Moreover, the cynical doubts expressed by Novaes as to the usefulness of a humanitarian approach to the hostile Indians, to say nothing of his skepticism over the value of closer relations with any of them, wild or tame, forced Barbosa and his fellow-enthusiasts to plan their actions with care and to examine their beliefs and sentiments critically with a view to justifying them in the Centro whenever challenged. Thus Novaes kept them from thinking superficially or moving too fast. With his restraining influence, the Comissão Promotora was able to lead a crusade without wasting its energies on inconsequential matters or unattainable goals.

In the critical period of 1909, when the Comissão Promotora was the center of wide discussion on how best to end the conflict between the Indian and the white man, the influence of that body was increased by the fact that it was forced to discard impractical ideas and, at the same time, gather
convincing evidence to support certain realistic measures that might otherwise have been considered impossibly idealistic.

There was another good reason for the success with which the Centro's Comissão Promotora campaigned on the Indian question in 1909. Its members avoided open discussion of the religious implications of Indian education. A flareup argument over the role of the Catholic church in any future work among the natives was soon to arise in Brazil, but not in the Centro de Ciências. Actually, there was every reason for discord there over the religious aspects of the Indian question. Among the members of the Comissão Promotora, Vicente Mello was an outspoken advocate of church catechism and clerical supervision among the natives. Erasmo Braga was already showing signs of the administrative ability that was to make him a leader in the nation's Protestant movement. He favored unrestricted missionary labor among the Indians in cooperation with, but not under the direct supervision of local representatives of a government program. Horta Barbosa, the committee's chairman, was a dedicated member of the religious school of Brazilian Positivism and, as such, was in favor of government supervision of the Indian's welfare, both on the local and on the national levels. He expected that a government program would make use of the experience and consecrated services of the missionaries of all creeds, just so long as they did not work to destroy the native's culture or emphasize religious indoctrination to the exclusion or detriment of a broader training in agricultural skills, social aptitudes, and the basic principles of medicine and sanitation.

Fortunately, the members of the Comissão Promotora did not allow their religious differences to cause dissension among themselves. Their
discussions in the Centro, their correspondence on the Indian question with individuals and societies, their petitions and appeals to public opinion and to government authorities, all demonstrated a quality of compromise and a breadth of vision that grew out of the constant effort to build constructively on the basis of their agreements and avoid the issues that could lead to argument. So it was that the diversity of religious belief in the Centro's Indian committee prevented it from plunging forward on a one-sided, bigoted propaganda program that would have stirred resentment in certain quarters and limited its effectiveness. Instead, the emphasis was placed on the generally accepted humanitarian procedures for pacifying and protecting the Indian and winning his trust and cooperation.

Even in the Centro there were times, in 1909, when the discussion of civilizing techniques wandered close enough to religious issues to hurt the sensibilities of one or more of the members and demonstrate the danger involved in pursuing the argument into those controversial realms. It was specifically pointed out in the May 22 session that the Centro did not represent or speak for any one religion. In a meeting five months later, however, Vicente Melillo criticized what he considered to be anti-clerical bias on the part of the directory of the society. Twice in the course of that session (October 23) he asked the president for a direct answer to the question of whether a man could continue to hold his religious convictions and belong to a cultural and scientific society. The president assured Melillo that this was possible, and that the Centro respected the religious beliefs of each and all of its members. 6

6 Brief references to these discussions appear in the minutes of the sessions of May 22 and October 23, 1909, in the Revista do Centro, No. 33, p. 59, and No. 34, pp. 55-57.
It was in the period between those two discussions of the Centro’s religious sympathies that the society’s Indian committee made a significant change in its official title. The alteration was announced by Erasmo Braga in the July 5 session. He advised that the Comissão Promotora da Defesa e Civilização dos índios would dispense with the part of its title that concerned the civilizing of the Indians and would hereafter be known simply as the Comissão Promotora da Defesa dos Índios (Committee to Promote the Protection of the Indians). Although the alteration may have reflected a desire for simplification of the title, it is not likely that such a change would have been made unless the committee was agreed that the task of civilizing the Indians was not a major concern in their campaign, as they had at first thought it should be.

Outside the Centro de Ciências, the Indian question had ceased to be an all-absorbing matter. Not until September of 1909 was it to regain the prominence that it had enjoyed during the last months of 1908 in international congresses and in the press and learned societies of Rio de Janeiro and São Paulo. Nevertheless, there were occasional speeches and articles that kept the subject alive and served to identify certain individuals with the stand they would later take in the final and crucial developments of the Indian debate.

Religious controversy in the Associação da Proteção e Auxílio aos Selvícios do Brasil. In Rio de Janeiro, the Indian aid and protection society in which Leolinda Daltro and her Indian friends had voiced their protests against von Tering in December of 1908 was inactive during most of 1909. The curious history of that ephemeral society illustrates the disruptive influence
of the religious disagreement so carefully avoided in the Centro de Ciências.

The society had been formed in March of 1903 by Leolinda Daltro with the aid of Sergio de Carvalho, author of the famous protest by the Museu Nacional, and of Henri Raffart, one of the directing officers of the Instituto Histórico e Geográfico Brasileiro. Known as the Instituto de Proteção aos Indígenas Brasileiros, the society held its first meetings in the lecture hall of Rio's venerable Instituto Histórico. Leolinda Daltro, being a woman, was not admitted to the auditorium and so was forced to "listen in" on these sessions from an adjoining room. Her bitterness toward the clerical opposition to her educational program among the Indians of Goiás from 1896 to 1901, and her crusading efforts to promote a strictly non-religious work in the future, were known to all members of the group and powerfully counteracted by two or three of them who spoke at considerable length on the glorious achievements of the clergy in their work among the natives.

7 A brief account of the role played by these two men in the creation of the Instituto de Proteção in 1903 appears in the Jornal do Comércio, April 29, 1903. The story is told in greater detail in Leolinda Daltro's published memoirs: Da catechese dos índios no Brasil: 1896-1911 (Rio de Janeiro, 1920), p. 431.

8 Unfortunately for Leolinda Daltro's peace of mind and for the effectiveness of her labors in behalf of the Indians, she was outspokenly anti-clerical. From the moment that she entered the interior in 1896, she had made it clear to all that her methods and intentions in educating the natives were basically secular. This admission, together with the unfavorable impression created by what appears to have been a domineering personality, had brought her a cold reception from local authorities in Goiás where the influence of the Catholic church, bolstered by a large influx of regular clergy from abroad, was far stronger than in the coastal cities. During her five years among the Indians, the open opposition of local church and government authorities to her education program had intensified her crusading zeal and developed in her a bitterness that she found increasingly hard to disguise. In her memoirs published in 1920 (Catechese dos índios), she referred to that opposition as "persecution," and in the preface, page xx, she stated: "Each document [of this volume] has its distinct place in the history of my journey among the Indians.
When all efforts to foster a plan for the non-religious instruction of the natives (described often by Brazilians as "lay catechism") were blocked in the early meetings of the newly-founded society, Leolinda Daltro, Henri Raffard, and the organization's president, Francisco Raphael de Mello Rege, withdrew their support and the Instituto de Proteção lay dormant for five years until September, 1908.

At that time it was reactivated by Leolinda Daltro under the presidency of Adolfo Gomes d'Albuquerque. Leoncio Corrêa, then Director of Education in the city of Rio de Janeiro, was elected its honorary president and carried its message directly to a branch society in Paraná which in 1909 favorably influenced Indian legislation in that state. "Within four months, however, and not long after the protests by Leolinda Daltro and her Indian friends against von lhüning's statement advocating extermination, the association fell again became inactive. Its president had been called to Minas Gerais, and Leolinda Daltro was contemplating a return to her Indian tribes of Mato Grosso and Goiás in answer to a dying request of her friend, Indian Chief Sepé - a request delivered in person by a small group of Indians who had "come to get her and bring her home." 9

Unable to procure from Miguel Calmon, Minister of Industry, Travel and Public Works, the teacher's pension she must have to support herself and her work in Goiás (she asked for no other financial aid), or the official approval of

and of my martyrdom." See also page xxi: "... unequalled moral suffering" and the words that head the extensive errata section at the close of the work: "Betrayed Once Again."

9 A. G. d'Albuquerque, "Resumo historico da Associação de Protecção e Auxílio aos Selvicolas do Brasil" sic, " in Daltro, Catechese dos índios, pp. 629-633. This society will be referred to and cited hereafter as the Associação de Proteção.
her labors needed to obtain the cooperation of local authorities in the interior, Leolinda Daltro went directly to the nation's president, Afonso Pena. Even there she failed. The story of that effort to secure government support of her cause, which lasted over a period of several months, was recounted sympathetically in several leading journals of Rio de Janeiro. It was suggested in one newspaper that the government, by spending a few thousand "reis" to help Leolinda Daltro's civilized Indian friends return as teachers to their own people in Goiás, would do a far nobler and more effective service to the nation than it was presently doing by chasing the savages about the country with carbines.

Leolinda Daltro's unsuccessful efforts to obtain the support she desired from the national government actually worked to the best interests of her Indians. Not only did it bring them favorable publicity in the press, but it kept her in Rio during the September reunion of Brazil's first national geographic congress, a gathering in which she was to take a conspicuous part.

Disagreement in the Primeiro Congresso Brasileiro de Geografia.

The Congress had been carefully organized under the direction of General Gregorio Thaumaturgo de Azevedo, a powerful figure in government circles. It was he who in 1906, as governor of a section of the newly-created territory of Acre, had initiated a program of strict reform to protect the natives from exploitation and massacre. Everyone knew of his sympathies for the Indian. Working with him in the task of organizing the Congress were two other men who shared those Indianist sentiments openly: A. O. Viveiros de Castro, the

---

10 Folha do Dia, January 6, 1909; Jornal do Brasil, February 21, July 9, 1909; O País (hereafter cited as O País), March 6, 1909; and Correio da Manhã, March 6, 1909.

11 Folha do Dia, August, 1909, reprinted in Daltro, Catechese dos índios p. 546. See also pp. 311-512.
committee's general-secretary, and José A. Boiteaux, first secretary. The influence of these three men on the selection of personnel to direct the various sub-committees perhaps accounts, in part, for the fact that strong spokesmen for Indian aid and protection were in a position to select the papers to be read in the anthropology-ethnology division, to direct the discussion of civilizing techniques, and to formulate the motions that requested the Congress to petition the national government for immediate action on the Indian question.

Gathered together inRio's handsome Monroe Palace for the opening session of September 7 were many who had already expressed their support of the campaign for government action. Among them were Tito de Lemos and Gustavo Enge of the Centro de Ciências. Enge was officially representing the Society's Comissão Promotora. Torres de Oliveira, who had recently antagonized von Thering in the Instituto Histórico of São Paulo, was also in attendance. So was his colleague of that society, João C. Gomes Ribeiro, who had read the controversial study on the Indians of São Paulo which von Thering criticized in his last statements before withdrawing from the Instituto. Likewise present were Baptista de Lacerda and Neves Armond, who had signed the Museu Nacional's influential protest against the von Thering extermination statement.

It is a significant fact that the man largely responsible for the Indian debate, the butt of all the protests and abuse, did not attend this congress. As the director of a state museum within easy traveling distance of Rio de Janeiro, his absence was almost inexcusable. As a prominent figure among the scientists of Brazil and a man who took pride in the fact that he kept up to date on the latest writings and developments in Indian studies, as well as in his own zoological specialties, his failure to attend his country's first national geogra congress can only be explained by sickness or by an understandable desire to
avoid what he and many others knew would be an embarrassing situation. Certainly it was known in advance in scientific circles that the papers scheduled for presentation and discussion in the ethnologic section would almost all either allude to von Lhering and the controversial subject of past, present, and future treatment of the Indians, or else center upon that matter exclusively. The contents of one of the papers, "Os índios do Brasil," had already hurt von Lhering by their presentation nine months earlier at the scientific congress in Santiago, followed by their sudden and embarrassing appearance in the Instituto Histórico of São Paulo as a gift of the author, Nelson de Senna. This time, in the geographic congress, Senna was present to read the paper in person.

Six men addressed the Congress in its opening session. Two of them have already been mentioned: Thaumaturgo de Azavedo and Viveiros de Castro. The next to the last speaker was Coronel Ludgero de Castro, who was also a strong proponent of government action to protect the Indian population. Like so many other army officers, he was a Positivist, and it is therefore not surprising that his few words concerned José Bonifacio and the fact that there was special significance in the opening of the Congress on September 7, Brazil’s Independence Day.

It seems more than coincidental that the last speaker was Nelson de Senna, the previously mentioned journalist from Minas Gerais. In his opening remarks he called attention to the presence in the auditorium of Brazil’s new president, Nilo Peçanha, who had succeeded to that post less than three months before upon the death of Afonso Pena. The speaker referred to the chief executive as one of the younger generation of Republicans so badly needed by the Nation at the present time. Commenting on the general aims of the Geographic Congress,
he declared that despite the prodigious labors of scientists from abroad during the past century, much still remained to be done to civilize the vast and practically unknown "Far West." Senna was here voicing the spirit that was to dominate every session of the Congress - a feverish desire to learn more about the land and all that lay within it. His last words brought a burst of applause. If, he said, he had appeared unduly animated in the course of this brief address, it was because he had expressed himself with "the warmth and sincerity of a patriotism that belongs to youth, to a Republican, and to a Brazilian."

During the following days, many of the scientists already familiar to the reader attended the sessions of the anthropology-ethnography division under the direction of José Verissimo. Elected to the directing committee with Verissimo were two men who deserve special attention. The first, António Ferreira de Souza Pitanga, had, as early as 1901, denounced the white man's oppressive treatment of the Indian and, as a lawyer, suggested means by which the native could be safeguarded by law from further exploitation. The nineteen-page article published in the journal of the Instituto Histórico e Geográfico Brasileiro, appeared in abbreviated form four years later in 1905, and then a third time just prior to the Geographic Congress. Souza Pitanga's deep concern over the Indian question was well known to all who had read his previous statements in which he had said:

---
12 Anais do Primeiro Congresso Brasileiro de Geographia [sic], 1 (Rio de Janeiro, 1910), 131. The series of volumes under this title will hereafter be cited as Anais do Primeiro Congresso Brasileiro de Geografia.
If in our continent there exists one phenomenon that cries aloud for scientific and philanthropic attention, it is without question the judicial status of the aborigine. 14

The other member of the ethnography section's directing committee was Antonio Carlos Simoes da Silva, a young lawyer who had become interested in the Indian problem through close contact with the Sociedade Nacional de Agricultura. It was he who had invited Leolinda Daltro to take part in the Congress. However, after considerable discussion with her in the days following that invitation, he had evidently decided that her outspoken anti-clerical views might be too strong for a scientific conference. Whatever his motives, he had suggested that she refrain from speaking during the proceedings and leave the matter in his hands. Leolinda Daltro was dismayed by this development and interpreted it as another illustration of clerical interference. Hastily she prepared a statement which she submitted to the ethnographic committee for approval shortly before the beginning of the Congress. It was summarily rejected and therefore not read in the sessions of that gathering. 15

However, her statement was later published in the annals of the Congress under the abbreviated heading "Memória," despite its powerful denunciation of what its author labeled "clerical abuse and incompetence among the Indians." 16


15 These are the facts as recounted in the December 30, 1910, session of the Associação de Proteção e Auxílio aos Selvícolas do Brasil by its president A. G. d'Albuquerque, and published in Daltro, Catechese dos indios, pp. 633-634.

16 Daltro, "Memória," Anais do Primeiro Congresso Brasileiro de Geografia, IX, 161-173. This paper is not treated in detail in this study because it was not published in time to affect the development of the 1909 campaign for government intervention in Indian affairs.
Apparently, Simoens da Silva, and perhaps others of the committee on which he served, had feared that the reading of the Daltro paper would antagonize certain delegates who might otherwise support an effort to obtain from the Congress an endorsement of government responsibility for the Indian. When it became clear in the plenary session at the close of the Congress that a majority of the members of that body favored a non-religious form of Indian education and supervision, then the "Memória" was accepted for publication in the records. Before considering the final test of strength on the religious issue, it is worth noting briefly the contents of the papers devoted to the general subject of Indian treatment which were presented in the anthropology-ethnography section. It was there that the religious implications of the Indian problem became apparent and were discussed with frankness.

The paper read by Simoens da Silva, though far milder in its criticism of Catholic missionary efforts among the natives than was the statement Leonilda Daltro had wished to present, does not display the clerical sympathies that she suspected in his actions. On the contrary, his only direct reference to the Church (Catholic or Protestant) placed the blame for the Indians' suffering not only on armed railroad employees and military escorts sent with boundary demarcation expeditions, but also on:

respectable members of the so-called catechists (groups of veritable exploiters of ignorance and poverty) in a majority of the foreign missions. 17

Simoens da Silva's paper was largely concerned with the necessity for government intervention in Indian affairs. Calling attention to the latest description of Indian massacre in notices of August 27 and 28 in the Jornal do Comércio, he

Neglect of the Indians is obvious: not one of our nation's presidents nor a single one of its ministers whose interests are affected by this situation has concerned himself with the problem, has made any effort to protect the Indian, civilize him, encourage him and help him to become a productive agent in the national life through the intelligent use of his special capacities and skills. 18

Once again von Thiiring was criticized as "a foreigner by birth" who had spread throughout Brazil the "criminal idea" of "assassination of creatures who are in large part defenseless and considered by law to be minors and wards of the nation." 19

The Indian problem could be solved in Brazil, the speaker declared, by local and state cooperation in a program of Indian protection centered in a ministry of the federal government. Instruction of the natives should be supervised by the government and completely secular. Every care must be taken to assure the proper use of funds, and the instructors who were selected as government employees for this program should be absolutely trustworthy.

Simoens da Silva admitted that the task of civilizing the Indians would at first be slow and difficult. One act of treachery on the part of a white man, he warned, would destroy months of devoted labor. For that reason, the most essential part of the program would be the clear demarcation of Indian lands and the immediate punishment under the Penal Code of any violation of the Indian's rights as a citizen.

The government program outlined by Simoens da Silva had been carefully prepared to form a practical combination of the best suggestions already advanced by Leolinda Dalto, by his own Sociedade de Agricultura, by the Centro de Ciências and by other societies and individuals. It recommended, among

other actions, the more effective use of the skills and teaching potentialities of the already-civilized Indians, and the wide distribution among the natives of cloth, seeds, farm tools and working utensils. The time was propitious, he said in closing, for a great work to be undertaken in the cause of the Indians. The protection they so badly needed was now the responsibility of a "statesman and true man of action [President Nilo Peçanha]" - such a man as the Indians and the nation had long awaited.  

It is remarkable to what extent a predominantly social problem absorbed the attention of the scientists of this gathering. Although it is true that the greater portion of Nelson de Senna's contribution was a straight ethnographic study and the last part of Simoes da Silva's paper was concerned with the removal to foreign museums of artifacts and bones that ought rather to be treasured in Brazilian collections, nevertheless, of the five papers published by the anthropology-ethnography section of the Congress, only one did not actively debate the more controversial issues of the Indian question.

One other paper remains to be described - that of Norberto J. A. Jorge-entitled "A catechese e civilização dos índios do Brasil." The title suggests the author's predominant interest in the religious aspects of the Indian problem, although his opening remarks, like those of Nelson de Senna and Simoes da Silva, concentrated on Hermann von Ihering's ideas on Indian extermination in an effort to invoke sympathy for the "helpless and tormented children of the forests." According to Jorge (and this statement deserves special attention), the German-born scientist's "stupid and inhumane" counsel to destroy the true heirs of the land had actually succeeded in awakening the Indianist  

---

sympathies of all true patriots and stirred the conscience of both the national and the state governments.\(^{21}\)

It was the speaker’s opinion that the large sums of money currently spent by the government to subsidize immigration would be far better used if they were devoted to a program for civilizing the Indians. The natives, he declared, were accustomed to the climate and almost immune to many of the fevers and diseases of the Amazon forests and semi-tropical highlands. Their skills could be directed to productive labor in regions where immigrants from Europe could not survive and prosper. Seventy per cent of the newcomers from abroad, he claimed, were of little or no value as agricultural laborers and exerted a pernicious influence on the character of the Brazilian people.

Norberto Jorge, like Simocens da Silva in the same Congress, was offering the potential labor force of the still-uncivilized Indian population as a substitute for the nation’s costly and unsatisfactory immigration program.

Introducing the subject of the Catholic church’s participation in Indian affairs, Jorge reminded his colleagues that there were other than practical reasons for government action on the Indian question. A moral obligation was involved. Indians were being hunted like animals, according to newspaper accounts, while legislators dreamed of elections and ignored their country’s welfare. The government need only decree certain laws, restore others, and, in the speaker’s words:

> officially entrust this mission [of civilizing the Indians] to those religious orders already in the field, and favor them with the aid needed to advance this program.\(^{22}\)

The Catholic church’s ability to handle the assignment, he maintained, had already been demonstrated by the heroic labors of Dominicans in Goiás since


\(^{22}\)Ibid., IX, 205.
1893, of Benedictines in the Rio Branco territory of Amazonas, and of Salesians in Mato Grosso since June of 1894.

Leaning heavily on quotations from Robert Southey, Silvio Romero, Eduardo Prado, Nelson de Senna, Joaquim Netuno, and others, Jorge developed his argument that no method of Indian instruction could succeed unless it obeyed the principles already demonstrated by Catholic missionaries. None but these men of God, he affirmed, could bring the blessings of civilization to the persecuted Indians. And, he added, if it were not for the expulsion of the Jesuits by Pombal in the eighteenth century, there would not today be a single savage in need of such attention. Jorge admitted that at the present time, just as in the past, there were those who would deny the divine right of the Catholic church to catechize among the unbelievers. But, he argued with assurance:

Entrust the Catholic missionaries with the task of civilizing the Indians and we shall quickly see an end to this degrading spectacle of the constant massacre of native Americans.

When the Congress met once again in plenary session on September 15, the anthropology-ethnography section presented three general conclusions for the official approval of their fellow delegates. One of them recommended the passage of legislation that would prohibit the collection, on the public domain, of artifacts intended for foreign museums. The other two read as follows:

1) Official protection of the Indians throughout Brazil is urgently needed:

2) The Primeiro Congresso Brasileiro de Geografia recommends that federal, state, and municipal authorities, in providing this indispensable protection, bind themselves to uphold the Indian’s lawful rights and make every effort to prepare him to meet the demands of the nation’s economy and to accept the advantages of its civilization; and finally it recommends that the authorities take

23 Ibid., IX, 184.
24 Ibid., IX, 192.
whatever action is necessary to halt the suffering and mistreatment that has victimized the forest tribes. 25

Religious implications were carefully avoided in those recommendations as was to be expected. To raise questions as to how the Government would spend its money or select its personnel, even before there was any certainty that it would act on the Indian problem, would have complicated the issue unnecessarily. The program of clerical supervision recommended by Norberto Jorge was no less dependent on government action than was that of Simões da Silva. By working together at this stage, all those delegates who were convinced of the immediate need for Indian protection believed that they could move the Government to action.

One member of the Congress, however, was unwilling to postpone the inevitable clash over the question of church versus government supervision of Indian protection and education. Leolinda Delcro, still smarting from the rejection of her "Memoria" and from Norberto Jorge's eulogies of two Dominican friars who had opposed her work among the Indians of Goiás, arose in the closing minutes of the plenary session to introduce a motion of her own. It was a dramatic moment according to press accounts of the following days - a woman dared to confront so large and distinguished a gathering with a request for immediate action on one of the most controversial issues of the time. "I propose," she said,

that the Primeiro Congresso Brasileiro de Geografia request the civil authorities to establish a program of secular education among the Indians with the aid of the Republican government - that form of instruction being the only one compatible with the statutes of its constitution. 26

---

25 Anais do Primeiro Congresso Brasileiro de Geografia, I, 211-212.
26 Ibid., I, 216.
The Daltro motion, according to a later press account, evoked a heated discussion in which former Senator Coelho Lisboa and the general-secretary of the Congress, Viveiros de Castro, argued in favor of the motion. It was the Senator who finally put the proposal to a vote and, in a show of applause, announced its approval by a majority of thirty-five to twenty-eight. The session was thereupon closed by the Marques de Paranaguá, president of the Congress. In his closing remarks he announced, significantly, his hope that the adopted recommendations would soon be put into practice.\textsuperscript{27} His words carried weight, for he too, like several others who had openly championed the Daltro motion for a government program of protection and education, was a prominent figure both in political and professional circles: a city magistrate, state counselor, former senator, and president of the conference’s sponsoring organization, the Sociedade de Geografia do Rio de Janeiro.

In the closing address of the final session on the following day, September 16, José Maria Moreira Guimarães undertook to describe the task that confronted the members of the present congress. These were his challenging words:

And now we will try to dedicate ourselves to another and another, and yet another expedition — not limiting our efforts to mere exploratory assaults on our unknown regions. We will conquer these mysterious lands; we will tame our forests and snatch our tormented fellow citizens from the deplorable situation in which they find themselves here in the twentieth century. And we will not attempt to destroy them, for such is inhumane, barbarous, criminal. We will spread over our backlands and make every effort to bring to civilization these first inhabitants of Brazil.\textsuperscript{28}

\textsuperscript{27} A Noticia, September 18, 1809.

\textsuperscript{28} Anais do Primeiro Congresso Brasileiro de Geografia, 1, 243.
The extensive support given to the suggestion for Indian protection in the course of the Geographic Congress, and especially the dramatic success with which the motion for a non-religious Indian education program was debated and officially approved by a majority vote in the plenary session of September 15, spurred the proponents of secular Indian instruction to even greater efforts. Hoping to take advantage of what appeared to be a favorable wind, Leolinda Daltro and Simoes da Silva scheduled a meeting of Indian sympathizers for September 17 to organize for the third time the Associação de Proteção e Auxílio aos Selvícias do Brasil.

Gathered together in the lecture hall of the Sociedade de Geografia this time rather than in the Instituto Histórico, the enthusiastic group listened to a frequently applauded address by Coelho Lisboa and to shorter speeches by José Hoteaux, Thaumaturgo de Azevedo, and Leolinda Daltro. Among those elected to honorary membership were other familiar figures on the stage of the Indian debate; among them: Horace Lane of Mackenzie College, loyal supporter of the Centro de Ciências' Indiantist activities; Adolfo d' Albuquerque, former president of the newly-founded Associação; Leoncio Corrêa, Director of Education in Rio de Janeiro and the man responsible for integrating the efforts of the Associação in 1908 with those of similar Indian-aid societies of São Paulo and of his own native state of Paraná; Cândido Rondo; chief of the telegraphic commission still laboring in the forests of western Mato Grosso; Simoes da Silva; Domingos Jaguaribe who, some weeks earlier, had visited the Centro de Ciências and recommended in one of its sessions a government donation of lands in São Paulo for an Indian reservation program, and who, incidentally, was one of the members of the ethnography committee in the past congress; and finally, Sergio de Carvalho, author of the Museu Nacional's protest against von Ihering. The names listed serve to illustrate
more effectively than could a generalized statement the interrelationship that existed among the men and societies that worked since 1903 in a common cause, even though they were sometimes far removed from each other geographically.

The first meeting of the Associação de Proteção had an auspicious beginning, but there was trouble ahead. Leolinda Daltro expressed a belief that with Niló Peçanha directing the nation during the following months, and with the generous support already demonstrated in the past geographic congress, the dawn of a new day was breaking for the Indians. In this she was not mistaken, although her own society was not to play the significant role in that drama that she had hoped it would.

New dissensions soon arose over what part the Catholic church would take in the future program of Indian instruction. According to a report written several years later by the society's president, Adolfo d'Albuquerque, the Associação again became inactive within a few weeks of its third founding ceremony - abandoned by Leolinda Daltro and her adherents because of the clerical sympathies they claimed to find within its membership. The records of the early meetings were believed by d'Albuquerque to have been inaccurate and are now presumably lost. He himself gave no information on the activities that caused Leolinda Daltro's accusation of clerical sympathies. He admitted, however, that the Sociedade de Geografia, at the time of the walkout described, refused the Indian-aid society the further use of its lecture hall for the very opposite reason — a too open display of anti-clerical bias.

\[29\] Jornal do Brasil, September 26, 1909.

\[30\] A. d'Albuquerque, "Resumo histórico," in Daltro, Catechese dos índios, pp. 634-636.
New signs of discord in the societies of Rio and Sao Paulo. The argument over church versus secular instruction of the Indian as introduced at the September geographic congress by the contributions of Simoens da Silva, Norberto Jorge, and Leonida Daltro and dramatized by the heated discussion and vote on her motion in the plenary session of that gathering, and as further observed in its most destructive form in the disintegration of the Associação de Proteção e Auxilio aos Selvícias do Brasil, threatened in late 1909 to spread into institutions that had hitherto been successful in avoiding any serious and prolonged discussion of this inescapable aspect of the Indian question. The powerful Instituto Histórico e Geográfico Brasileiro, for example, finally turned its attention to the controversial issue on September 28, just a few days after the close of the Geographic Congress. It was the society's orator, Conde de Afonso Celso, who introduced the matter with an optimistic prediction on the valuable contribution that the Indian race would make in a future union of all Brazilians. He reminded his distinguished colleagues of the outstanding services rendered to the Indians by the Jesuits in the past and compared the spirit that had motivated them with the revolting ideas and sentiments of a certain foreign scientist who had advised that the natives be exterminated. 31

Afonso Celso was warmly applauded and then followed at the speaker's stand by a familiar figure from the Geographic Congress, Souza Pitanga, author of the sympathetic judicial study on the Indians that has been mentioned. Confirming the preceding speaker's statement that Indian captivity still existed

in Brazil, Pitanga assured his listeners that force had never won the natives' respect or cooperation, nor would it solve the present crisis in Indian-white relations. The Indians, he said, when treated properly, made valuable allies and excellent fellow workers. Reminding the society that the natives had rendered invaluable aid to the early colonists and explorers who handled them fairly, Pitanga spoke of the manner in which the illustrious Cândido Rondon was currently making use of the labor of previously hostile tribes in the maintenance of his telegraph lines. In that remarkable accomplishment, Pitanga declared, there was concrete evidence that the Indian could be pacified and directed into a role of service to the nation.

Souza Pitanga closed with a suggestion that the Instituto Histórico officially petition the national government to halt the persecution and massacre of the Indians. (Such a request from as politically influential a society as this one, following close upon the motions approved by the Primeiro Congresso Brasileiro de Geografia, was not to be taken lightly by the governing authorities.) Pitanga's proposal was heartily approved by his colleagues and referred by the acting president of the session to the society's ethnologic committee, which at that time was under Pitanga's direction. 32

The Instituto Histórico held its last meeting of the year on October 21 with the president of Brazil, Nilo Peçanha, in attendance. Summarizing the year's proceedings, the society's permanent secretary, Max Fleiuss, voiced a rather significant note of warning. The Instituto, he said, was "not an arena for heated discussion nor a sounding board for personal prejudice." It was

rather, a place of study and meditation—a retreat, he said, from the noisy distractions of transient affairs. Scholarly disagreement over the nation's history, geography, or ethnology was always welcome, he assured his colleagues, in so far as it encouraged a more careful selection and use of information, but personal squabbles should not be allowed to injure the dignity and prestige of their honored society. 33

The Instituto Histórico e Geográfico de São Paulo was no less troubled than its sister society in Rio by the threatened intrusion of the Indian question. Already it had experienced the first tremors of what was to come, though von Thering's withdrawal from the society after the second session of 1909 had temporarily removed the major source of irritation. By the close of the year, however, the Instituto Histórico of São Paulo was feeling the repercussions of the argument over the Catholic church's role in the task of Indian instruction under government supervision. Evidently, too, the society was troubled by the angry words of past sessions and the threat of more to come. There seems to be no other explanation for what occurred in its final session of January 25, 1910. In that meeting, the Instituto's secretary, Dinamérico Augusto do Rego Rangel, after summarizing the proceedings of the year 1909, quoted in full the words of warning presented by Max Fleiss in the closing session of the Instituto Histórico in Rio three months before. 34

The growing disagreement over methods to be used in civilizing the Indians, especially the question of Catholic church supervision of such a task,

33 "Sessão magna commemorativa do 71.º anniversario," op. cit., Vol. 120, pp. 398-399.

34 "Relatório dos trabalhos," Revista do Instituto Histórico e Geográfico de São Paulo, XIV (1909), 452.
was in most part a development of late 1909. In earlier months, as already
noted, almost every speech and article on the Indian question — almost every
petition or motion on the subject in societies or congresses — had argued for
government intervention. That concentration on one all-important goal largely
explains the ultimate success of the 1909 campaign for official action. With
the first indications of government interest in the problem, however, those
who had worked together toward that end began to disagree among themselves
as to how the Government might best accomplish the mission it now seemed
ready to accept. The debate over religious versus secular orientation of the
future program of Indian education tended to split the societies that were ar-
guing the question into rival camps. Under the impact of that breakdown of
internal harmony, the societies lost their power to direct the search for an
answer to the Indian problem. Their continued debate of the controversial
aspects of the question in 1910, bitter though it was at times, tended increas-

ly to reflect government action rather than influence it. Thus, it is through
the eyes of a cabinet minister, rather than through those of Brazil’s learned
societies, that the final steps in the development of an Indian service must be
viewed.
CHAPTER VIII

THE GOVERNMENT'S APPROACH TO THE INDIAN PROBLEM

Official action in defense of the Indian in Brazil may be traced back to June, 1909, when certain administrative changes occurred in the national government which prepared it to accept a greater measure of responsibility for the native population. On the fourteenth of that month, as already noted, President Afonso Pena died in office, leaving Brazil in the capable hands of its vice-president, Nilo Peçanha.

The new chief executive was a younger and more energetic leader than his predecessor. Born in Campos in the state of Rio de Janeiro in October, 1864, he had moved directly from a professional training in law into active propagandist activities in the cause of abolition and the Republican movement. After the proclamation of November 15, 1889, he was elected a deputy to the national Constituent Assembly and reelected until 1903, when he succeeded a fellow Republican, Quintino Bocaiuva, as governor of the state of Rio de Janeiro. From that position, he was elected vice-president of Brazil in 1906.

Peçanha's strength, as he shouldered the presidential responsibilities in 1909, lay as much in the powerful support he was able to draw upon, as it did in his dynamic personality and administrative experience. As an early champion of the Republican cause and a recognized leader of the entrenched Republican party in Brazil, he had the support of the old guard of the Partido Republicano Conservador, those giants of the Senate like Pinheiro Machado and Quintino...
The incoming president also enjoyed the strong support of a large proportion of the land-holding class that had turned its back upon the Emperor and joined the Republican ranks after Isabella's abolition of slavery in 1883. They knew, and, in general, approved of Pecanha's intentions to strengthen Brazil's economy by an increasingly effective program of internal development, bolstered by an enlarged flow of immigrant labor. In their need for farm-hands to take the place of the slave-labor force they had lost and to work the land opened up by the railroad advance into the interior, they not only supported Pecanha's ambitious immigration program, but they began to consider seriously the idea expressed so often in recent months by Rondon, Teixeira Mendes, Horta Barbosa, Nelson de Senna and other ardent fellow Republicans, that the Indians and the unlettered mestiços of the backlands could be trained to fill a part of that labor need, especially in areas where the climate was not conducive to immigrant settlement.

The fact that Pecanha was obviously a mestiço did not seem to hurt his

---

1 José Gomes Pinheiro Machado, senator from Rio Grande do Sul (1891-1915) and wealthy proprietor of extensive grazing lands, had engineered the alliance that resulted in the election of Afonso Pena and Nilo Pecanha in 1906. As vice-president of the Senate for many years and candidate more than once for the Nation's presidency, representing the Partido Republicano Conservador of which he was head, Pinheiro Machado exerted an enormous influence on Brazilian politics. See Lucio Mendonça, Caricaturas instantâneas (Rio de Janeiro, 1937), pp. 59-68. Quintino Bocaiúva, elected to the Senate from the state of Rio de Janeiro in May, 1909, became its vice-president in June of the following year. Together with Pinheiro Machado, he was influential in defeating the "Civilista" candidate for national president in 1910, Rui Barbosa, and securing instead the former Minister of War, Mar. Hermes da Fonseca, to carry on the program of the Republican party. The political power wielded by these two men in late 1908 was reviewed in "As manobras Pinheiristas," Jornal do Comércio, December 6, 1908.
popularity among the conservative and militaristic elements of his party. On the other hand, his own mixed blood, like that of Leolinda Daltro and Cândido Rondon, may help to explain his interest and cooperation in the successful effort during his brief term of office to inaugurate a government service with the primary purpose of bringing both the Indian and the mestigo inhabitants of the isolated interior into the nation's culture and economy.

The new Ministério da Agricultura and Rodolfo Miranda. The same month that he was sworn into office, President Nilo Peçanha took an important step forward in the direction of increased governmental interest in Indian affairs. He replaced the Ministério da Indústria, Viação e Obras Publicas (Ministry of Industry, Travel and Public Works) with a Ministério da Agricultura, Indústria e Comércio. The logic behind that action and the manner in which it allowed a government ministry to concentrate more fully on the basic problem of Indian-white friction throughout Brazil requires a brief explanation.

By Decree Law number 1,142 of November 22, 1892, the Secretaria de Estado dos Negócios da Agricultura, Comércio e Obras Publicas (the Empire's Ministry of Agriculture, active since 1836) was eliminated and the above-mentioned Ministério da Indústria, Viação e Obras Publicas created in its place. Unfortunately for the cause of better relations between the native and the encroaching white man's civilization, the new ministry was primarily concerned with engineering statistics and progress reports: the speed of telegraph and highway construction, the cost to the Government per kilometer of railroad advance, the development of the mining industry, the strategic placement of electric power stations, the spread of factories, and the growth of cities.

Overloaded as it was with responsibilities of a technical nature, the
Ministério da Indústria was not especially interested in the ethical implications of the damage done to primitive cultures by the forces of economic expansion. Yet, throughout the first two decades of the Republic, there was no other ministry charged with the difficult task of attending to the welfare of the native population. The administrative load carried by the Ministry was further increased by a gradual shift from state to federal supervision of immigration. With the added responsibilities of immigrant attraction, colonial settlement, and soil development, the Ministério da Indústria was so heavily burdened that President Rodrigues Alves, in his message to Congress of May 3, 1906, insisted that a ministry of agriculture be created to relieve the Ministério da Indústria of the duties pertaining to land settlement and agricultural production.

In keeping with the President’s wishes, a ministry of agriculture was officially established (though not immediately implemented) on December 29, 1906, by Legislative Decree number 1,506. Its anticipated duties were itemized by the incoming president, Afonso Pena, in 1907. The new ministry, he told Congress, would be a central agency responsible for all special services connected with the encouragement of agricultural production. These would involve theoretic and practical instruction of field agents, model agricultural projects for demonstration purposes, widely scattered zoological and meteorological stations, special services of immigration, colonization, and propaganda, geologic study, and agricultural statistics. The regulations of some of these...

---

2 Mensagens presidenciais: 1891-1926. Documentos parlamentares, I
(1891-1810), 372-377.

3 Ibid., I, 599.
services, the President announced, were already drawn up for approval. It was his expressed hope that the Ministério da Agricultura would soon be prepared to assume its vital role in the implementation and direction of these essential agricultural agencies.

Despite the apparent interest taken by Afonso Pena in the establishment of this new ministry, it was not until June 21, 1909, a week after his death, that the Ministério da Agricultura, Indústria e Comércio was activated by authority of the earlier decree. Its first director, Antonio Cândido Rodrigues, was Minister of Agriculture of the state of São Paulo at the time he was asked by President Nilo Peçanha to oversee its first stage of organization. He held the office for five months, from June 21 to November 26, 1909. Francisco Sá then assumed directorship for three days, until the post could be filled by the man who is often regarded as Brazil's first minister of agriculture.4

Fortunately for the cause of Indian justice, the man chosen by Nilo Peçanha to direct the Ministério da Agricultura after November 29, 1909, was as anxious as the President to settle the conflict between the primitive and civilized races. That man was Rodolfo Nogueira da Rocha Miranda. His outstanding contribution to the development of Brazil's Indian service can best be understood and appreciated if something is known of his family and professional background.

Rodolfo Miranda knew the land and understood its laboring classes and native population as well as or better than any other Brazilian politician.

---

4 For more detailed information on the first two ministers of agriculture and on their brief terms in office, see Dusáneo de Abranches, Gouverno e congressos da República dos Estados Unidos do Brazil: Apontamentos biográficos sobre todos os presidentes da República, ministros de estado, e senadores e deputados ao Congresso Nacional: 1894-1917 [sic] (São Paulo, 1918), I, 173-181.
of his time. His early years were spent in the interior of São Paulo, on the vast land holdings of his father, the Baron of Bananal. His aristocratic birth and his marriage at an early age into one of the wealthiest families of Brazil, did not act as a barrier between him and the humble workers of the rural population. Soon after his marriage, he moved onto land of his own (in São Simão, São Paulo) and lived at first in rustic simplicity and close association with those who labored for him. Gradually his coffee plantations flourished. By 1910 they were considered among the richest and most ably administered in the state.  

His sincere interest in the welfare of the agricultural worker extended to the problems of factory hands throughout the country. In the city of Piracicaba he employed more than six hundred laborers, immigrant and native born, in a textile factory that he owned and ably directed in addition to his coffee plantations and commercial interests in other parts of the state. Undoubtedly there were larger fortunes than his in Brazil, but none founded as solidly upon direct and continuing personal management. When he was appointed to organize the Ministério da Agricultura, Indústria e Comércio, he brought to this difficult task a wealth of administrative experience in all three branches of that ministry's operations. More important to this study, he approached the job with an intimate knowledge of the laborer's problems, as well as the nation's critical need of additional laboring hands.

Rodolfo Miranda, in his effort to help the Indian during his one-year term as Minister of Agriculture, owed much of his success to his own popular

---

5 Information used in this chapter on Miranda's business operations is taken from the introduction to a personal interview published in the Jornal do Comércio, February 21, 1910, p. 5, cols. 1-2.
in Republican party circles. The support he received from politicians in power made it possible for him to sidestep government debate on controversial issues of his Indian program, and push it through to legislation despite opposition from many quarters. It is useless to speculate here on whether an Indian service would have been implemented in 1910 under any other political party. It is relevant, however, in the light of Miranda's importance to this study, to explain briefly how a man raised in a home atmosphere of monarchist sympathy became so influential a figure in the ascendant Republican party.

Miranda was a Republican of long standing. Even before the ranks were swelled in 1888 by plantation owners who resented Isabela's liberation of their slaves (she did so while her father, Emperor Pedro II, was visiting in Europe), Rodolfo Miranda was campaigning for an end to slavery. Recent examination of his family archives shows that he announced the fall of the Empire, and actually celebrated it, two days before Deodoro da Fonseca proclaimed the Republic in Rio de Janeiro. Soon after, he was elected to represent the state of São Paulo in the Constituent Assembly, and this at the age of twenty-eight. He was the youngest member of that body. His widow today, age eighty-seven, believes that her husband's Republican convictions did not come from his friend and certainly not from his family, but rather through long study and meditation. There is reason to believe that his sympathies for the slave and the common man, as well as his Republican beliefs, were strengthened, if not originally suggested, by his close contact with liberal thought in the intellectual centers of Europe, where he studied for brief intervals as a young man.

6 Poema da Manhã (São Paulo), September 29, 1952, Section "Vida social e domestica," pp. 1, 3.

7 Information in a letter to the author from Rodolfo Miranda's grandniece Nair Miranda Pirajá, February 16, 1955.

8 These voyages were common among members of Brazil's rural aristocracy. At the turn of the century Miranda lived for two years with his wife in Paris, where his son attended King's College in London.
Despite his frequent visits to European capitals, and the many responsibilities of his agricultural, industrial, and commercial enterprises, Miranda held his seat in São Paulo’s House of Representatives throughout the period from 1891 until his assumption of the post of Minister of Agriculture in 1909, and in all that time he was recognized by his political opponents not only as a gentleman, but also as an aggressive fighter, in the Republican ranks. Still a member of his party’s steering committee in São Paulo during the hotly contested presidential campaign of 1909-1910, opposing Rui Barbosa’s civilista movement, Miranda was in an excellent position to barter, whenever necessary, the benefits of his political influence in exchange for the support of his efforts in behalf of the Indians.

Miranda’s first duties as Minister of Agriculture were not directly concerned with the Indian problem, though they paved the way for later action in that field. With his accustomed enthusiasm and energy, the minister began to draw to himself and to his department every government agency and service that dealt with problems of land development. Most important of those to our study were the agency of immigrant distribution and the services of agricultural protection, agricultural inspection, and agricultural statistics. Without enquiring into the responsibilities of those several agencies, which did not entail direct contact with the Indian population, it is evident that by the middle of January, 1910, the Ministério da Agricultura had assumed powers of intervention in state affairs more extensive than those held in the past twenty years by any single department of the national government.

Its agents supervised all state land bestowed upon the federal government for colonial centers. Agricultural inspectors were stationed in every state to examine and report on soil conditions, floods and droughts, plant pests, and animal diseases. Experiment stations and education centers slowly developed
through the initiative of those agents and the stimulus of an increasing flow of tools, seeds, and practical information through their hands into those of the same Indian and mestizo population. Miranda and his Ministry of Agriculture were thus, in late 1909, moving into position for a direct assault on the basic causes of friction between the Indian and western cultures.

**First signs of a government Indian service.** Miranda first drew public attention to his interest in the Indian question when, on January 24, 1910, he paid an official visit to the Museu Nacional in Rio de Janeiro. Accompanying him was Sergio de Carvalho, whom he had recently appointed as his technical adviser. It was quite natural that Carvalho should make this visit with Miranda, for he had directed the anthropology section of that museum for many years. It was he who had drawn up the museum's protest against the von lhering statement in December, 1903, and supported Leolinda Caltro's early efforts to organize her ill-fated Associação do Proteção e Auxílio aos Selvícios do Brasil. It is interesting to note that here, in 1909, he was working in an advisory capacity for the man who was about to lead the Government into action on the Indian problem. João Baptista de Lacerda, the museum's director, and Edgard Roquetta-Pinto, an assistant in the anthropology section and later strong champion of the Indian cause, accompanied Miranda closely in this tour. They too had signed the protest against von lhering's extermination statement.

After an extended appraisal of Indian artifacts and many questions about the warfare, handicrafts, and agricultural methods of various Indian tribes, Miranda finally confided to those about him his intention to utilize the energy and abilities of Brazil's Indians to the mutual benefit of themselves and of the nation. They had been generally treated over the centuries, Miranda declared,
as if they were not human beings and the rightful owners of the land. They ought to be encouraged to congregate in villages, he continued, where they would be granted the same privileges extended to immigrants. But, Miranda added significantly, there should be no attempt to replace their form of religion with one that outsiders might consider superior, but which would destroy the natives' cultural pattern. He made it clear that, as a Republican, he could not envision a form of Indian instruction outside of constitutional formulas. 9

It seems likely that Miranda carefully planned both the time and the place for this public announcement. The statement, whether it was meant to be or not, was the long-awaited reply to the 1909 campaign for government action and, more specifically, a reply to the petitions of the Primeiro Congresso Brasileiro de Geografia three months previous. Moreover, it was a bold answer to the controversial question of secular versus church instruction of the natives. Considering the importance of this statement, it is no surprising that it was staged among the Indian collections of the museum that had in 1908 led all other institutions of the capital city in denouncing the idea of Indian extermination. It could not have been presented under more favorable conditions than in the midst of those scientists who had already publicly professed their sympathy for the Indian. Their enthusiastic response to Miranda's words probably accounts in part for the equally sympathetic receipt of the news by the reporters who covered the tour of the museum and overheard the words of the Minister.

9"Visita ao Museu Nacional, " Jornal do Comércio, January 25, 1910, p.3.
Notices in the Jornal do Comércio during the next two days clearly expressed the agricultural minister's sympathies for the Indian. Just as clearly, they pointed out that the Government's provisions of land, agricultural implements, farming techniques and protection of life and property would not be accompanied by any attempt to alter the deeply meaningful religious and social practices that serve to strengthen and sustain a primitive culture. Such views were not likely to please the advocates of clerical supervision over the Indians. However, they had been presented outside of government office in apparently casual conversation. Thus they were more an expression of personal feeling than an official statement by the government, and as such they could be altered, if necessary, without embarrassment to the administration.

The timing of the announcement also deserves attention. It proceeded by one day the wide dissemination of an invitation from the Sociedade de Geografia do Rio de Janeiro to take part in a welcoming celebration for Cândido Rondon on his triumphant return after three years of exploration, scientific investigation, and telegraph construction in the forests of Mato Grosso and Amazonas. The reaction to Miranda's announcement of possible government action on the Indian problem thus appeared in the press together with notices of Rondon's approach by sea down the coast of Brazil. The Minister of Agriculture could not have chosen a more favorable time to launch his scheme of government aid to the Indian than upon the full tide then running of public enthusiasm over the return of that national hero.

The press reaction to Miranda's announcement shows that certain newspaper writers, if not the public at large, attached special significance to the

10 Jornal do Comércio, January 26, 1910, p. 4, cols. 3-4.
fact that Rondon would now be available for possible assignment under the Ministério da Agricultura as a guiding hand in whatever form of Indian service Miranda had in mind. A notice in the Jornal do Comércio, on January 27, predicted correctly that the two men would be in conference on the matter very soon after Rondon's arrival, which was to be the first week of February.

Those who commented on the Minister of Agriculture's professed sympathies for the natives and his desire to aid them with government support were generally inclined to compare his proposed methods of Indian treatment with those already demonstrated by Rondon. Raymundo Teixeira Mendes, for example, speaking for the Igreja Positivista do Brasil, prefaced his discussion of Miranda's statement with extensive quotations from the Jornal do Comércio's earlier reviews of the agricultural minister's announcement in the Museu Nacional and of Cândido Rondon's imminent return from Amazonas and his possible role in the implementation of a national Indian service.

Teixeira Mendes warmly applauded Miranda's public expression of sympathy for the Indians. At last, he said, the national government, like Carlos Barbosa's administration in Rio Grande do Sul, was moving in the direction suggested in 1823 by the venerable Patriarch of Independence, José Bonifácio. The program briefly suggested by the Minister of Agriculture showed signs of true Republican orientation, according to Mendes, and deserved the praise and gratitude of the Igreja Positivista.

Drawing upon the wisdom of José Bonifácio and Auguste Comte, and upon his own Republican convictions and fertile mind, Mendes supported Miranda's ideas and amplified the proposed program. He agreed that the Indian's institutions, as well as his life and property, must be protected. However, he believed that the program should include instruction in dress, cleanliness, musical arts, home building, farming and all the accomplishments that
might serve to encourage a sedentary, more comfortable, and, what he felt would be, a happier existence. That instruction, he maintained, should be entrusted to the missionaries of all faiths, provided they were willing to work among the Indians without destroying the values of their culture or demanding government military aid under the pretext of avenging or preventing Indian attack. The practicality of such a program, he declared, had already been demonstrated by the success of Cândido Rondon’s pacific and humanitarian approach to the hostile tribes of Mato Grosso and Amazonas. 11

Teixeira Mendes was not the only representative of the 1909 group of crusaders for government action to rally at once to the side of the new champion of Indian justice. Luis Bueno Horta Barbosa, speaking in a regular session of the Centro de Ciências, Letras e Artes of Campinas on the last day of January, spoke at length on Miranda’s project as outlined in the press and expressed his deep satisfaction over the prospects of government action in the near future. He then proceeded to an account of Rondon’s difficulties and ultimate success in the pacification of the fierce Pareci and Rambiquara tribes of Mato Grosso. Rondon would soon be arriving in Rio de Janeiro, Horta Barbosa told his colleagues, and it would be an honor for the Centro de Ciências to be represented in the welcoming delegation. He suggested that the society’s corresponding member, Rui Barbosa, would be an excellent and willing candidate for the honor of that assignment. 12

Rodolfo Miranda took another important step on or before February 5, 1910. Thus far he had been receiving with interest whatever information was sent to him concerning the Indian problem. Now he decided to seek information more directly. To the state of Maranhão, in the basin of the Amazon system, he sent an old friend from Republican ranks, Cândido de Freitas. According to a press release, Freitas was entrusted with a delicate mission. In line with his instructions, he was to observe carefully certain tribes of Maranhão and send back to the Ministry of Agriculture detailed information on their capacity for work and on the extent of their interest and skill in agriculture and industry. Also, he was to report in detail on the nature of the land they occupied, the best methods to be used for drawing them closer to consumers' markets and centers of civilization, and the amount of land they would need or desire in the form of nationally protected reservations. In addition, he was to use his influence as the direct representative of the Ministry of Agriculture to secure the cooperation of state and local authorities in a sort of dress rehearsal of certain reforms that Miranda considered basic to the Government's future program of Indian protection.

Rondon's return and accelerated government action. It is fitting that Cândido Rondon be introduced to the reader at this point, for it was in the wide publicity and imposing reception accorded him on his homecoming to

---

13. *Jornal do Comércio*, February 5, 1910, p. 5, col. 1. This announcement of the Freitas mission displays a certain assurance on the part of its writer that a definite government program of Indian aid and protection would follow the ground-breaking activities of Miranda's representative in Maranhão and the approaching conference between the Minister of Agriculture and Cândido Rondon.

14. Miranda's official instructions to Freitas, dated February 7, received wide publicity. Their first appearance in print was probably in the *Jornal do Comércio*, February 10, 1910, p. 4, cols. 3-4.
Rio that he entered the hearts of his countrymen and first became identified with Miranda's effort to build a government service of Indian protection.

Three years earlier he had entered the forests of western Mato Grosso on an assignment of telegraph construction and scientific investigation that some other engineers had considered humanly impossible. One of them had gone so far as to question publicly the futility of the project. Probably he would not have done so if Rondon's exceptional qualifications for the task had been as well known in 1907 as they were in 1910. Rondon was familiar, from his childhood, with the topography and climate of western Mato Grosso; he had been born there, close to the city of Cuiabá. He understood the half-breeds and Indian guides who accompanied his expeditions, he himself being a mestiço with a noticeable strain of Indian blood in his veins.

For months during 1908 and 1909, stories came out of the interior that helped to convince the public that success invariably followed his activities. They were dramatic tales, perhaps exaggerated, but for that very reason, noticeably effective in creating an aura of greatness about his name. They described how he had continued to march for many hours through the steaming forests in a semi-conscious state of fever, refusing to ride a mule or ox because all his men were not similarly mounted; how he had dragged camp equipment by his teeth across a surging river, when his officers and men were no longer physically able to help him; how he was customarily the last to retire to his hammock at night but was always dressed and shaved before the bugler rose to waken the slumbering camp.

15 A. A. Botelho de Magalhães, Impressões da Comissão Rondon [sic], 5th ed. (Rio de Janeiro, 1942). This work includes hitherto uncited or little-known episodes from the explorations and encampments of the telegraphic commission directed by Rondon in Mato Grosso. Biographical information on Rondon has been taken from the following sources: Clovis de Gusmão, Rondon: A conquista do deserto brasileiro (Rio de Janeiro, 1942); Oto Carlos Bandeirante,
When it became known in late 1909 that Rondon had completed his job and had emerged from the forests to begin his long water voyage back to Rio de Janeiro, these stories, and many others, received wide circulation. They stirred the imagination of Brazil’s youth and cheered those who sought assurance that great things could come out of their mestizo race. Here was a man they could match against the proud sons of other nations — and he was part Indian. He was living proof that the assimilation of the Indian into the nation’s life and culture, into its very bloodstream, was more than a humanitarian ideal — it was a possible solution to the Indian controversy that could strengthen the Brazilian people as well as unify the nation.

Better known to the general public than his scientific and engineering feats was his remarkable success in winning the friendship and cooperation of hostile Indian tribes. The methods he used to achieve that result had been perfected over a period of many years. Working as adjutant to the capable and high-principled director of the first telegraphic commission in Mato Grosso in 1890 and 1891, Major Antônio Gomes Carneiro, Rondon had witnessed the transformation of the savage Bororó Indians into friends and co-workers on the telegraph line. That change in the natives was inspired by nothing more than the patient evidence of friendship and an army-backed guarantee of protection of Indian life and property. Rondon, on his own command in the following years, established amicable relations with every hostile
tribe that lay in the path of his telegraph lines. Musical instruments were carried on his expeditions, for he found truth in the adage that "music hath charms to soothe the savage breast." Watchdogs were used to prevent surprise attack. When absolutely necessary to break up an assault, guns were fired into the air. Never were they aimed deliberately at an Indian. If forced to retire from such conflict, Rondon and his men left presents behind them, sometimes on the very spot where they had left their blood.16

Rondon had by 1910 not only captured the admiring attention of the general public; he had earned the respect and openly-expressed approval of some of the most distinguished scientists and politicians of the nation. One of the motions passed unanimously in the final session of the Primeiro Congresso Brasileiro de Geografia on September 15, 1909, had called special attention to the telegraphic commission of Mato Grosso and praised its chief for the gentleness and patience with which he was dealing with the hostile tribes of that state. No other engineer, explorer, or scientist working in the interior at that time was thus honored by special mention.17 Even in a Brazilian

16 Collections of these accounts and extensive treatment of Rondon's techniques of Indian pacification can be found in the previously cited work: Magalhães, Rondon, and in the following: Missão Rondon, Aportamentos sobre os trabalhos realizados pela Comissão de Linhas Telegráficas Estratégicas de Mato Grosso ao Amazonas sob a direcção do coronel da engenharia Cândido Marianca da Silva Rondon, de 1907 a 1915. Publicado em artigos do "Jornal do Comércio" do Rio de Janeiro em 1915 [sic] (o do Jâneiro, 1916); Boletim de Magalhães, Peaes Certas do Brasil, 2nd ed., Brasiliense, CKV (Rio de Janeiro, 1941). According to Bastão de Magalhães, Em Relação aos brasileiros (Rio de Janeiro, 1946), p. 21, Rondon had by 1910 won the friendship of eight tribes of Mato Grosso and installed some measure of trust in the minds of five others. All are listed.

17 Anais do Primeiro Congresso Brasileiro de Geografia, I (Rio de Janeiro, 1910), 222.
presidential message to Congress, where proper names rarely appear, that of Cândido Rondon received attention from Afonso Pena, just a month before the latter's death in June, 1909. 18

The warmth of Rondon's reception in Rio is not wholly explained by his fame as an explorer, engineer, and pacifier of Indians. Like the Minister of Agriculture, he had the ardent support - one might almost say the devotion - of three powerful segments of Brazilian society and politics: the Positivist church, the Army, and the Republican Party. His attachment to the orthodox branch of the Positivist movement, the Igreja Positivista under the direction of Miguel Lemos and Teixeira Mendes, was a relationship that influenced his every act. The antiquated spelling in his personal correspondence and official reports, the Comte calendar system often used in dating them, his glorification of womanhood and the home, his refusal to enter politics or accept less arduous and more lucrative positions that might involve the taking of life or that offered less opportunity to serve humanity and his nation - these and other rules of life and qualities of character identified him as a Positivist. They brought him not only the full and highly influential support of his co-religionists, but won him the high respect of all who knew him.

As a soldier, a lieutenant-colonel at the time of his return from Mato Grosso, he was idolized by the younger officers and honored by his peers. For several years he had taught various engineering sciences in the military academy on Rio's Praia Vermelha, the "West Point" of Brazil. And like Benjamin Constant, the most famous of all Brazil's Positivists, Rondon had a devoted following among the army officers who had studied under him.

18 Mensagens presidenciais, I, 661.
The ties that bound him to the Republican Party were almost as strong as Miranda's. His political sentiments had long been known. The year in which he graduated as a "student-lieutenant" from the military academy in Rio, 1889, Rondon took an active part (according to one source, an important part\textsuperscript{19}) in the November 15 overthrow of the Empire and proclamation of the Republic.

Since Rondon was soon to make outstanding contributions to the creation of a government Indian service, the facts of his life and reputation are significant to this study. His practical experience among the Indians and his consuming desire to protect them, his enviable combination of high principles and strength of character, and his unparalleled popularity among all elements of the nation's social and political life made him the most powerful voice on Indian affairs in the country.

It is plain to see what Miranda had in mind when he chose to announce his dream of a government Indian service in the midst of the widely publicized preparations for Rondon's homecoming celebration, and then let it be rumored in the press that his next move was contingent upon a conference with the returned telegraphic chief. As already noted, the Minister of Agriculture was himself a powerful man in every way. Moreover, in his efforts to develop an Indian service, he was working under the sympathetic eye of another political figure of vast energy and recognized Indianist sympathies, President Nilo Peçanha. These two men had the political power between them to legislate or decree into existence almost any form of Indian service that they determined upon. Neither one of them, however, could have "sold" the program to the nation the way Cândido Rondon could, if he were willing to do so. His public

\textsuperscript{19}Bandeira Duarte, \textit{Rondon}, pp. 21-24.
endorsement of an Indian service and, more important, his personal supervision of its organization and its activities, was recognized by Miranda as almost vital to the success of his plans. Rondon's return to Rio in 1910 made it possible for Miranda to enlist his aid and so draw him into a triumvirate that, in its dedication to the cause of Indian justice, was an almost irresistible combination.

In the early afternoon of February 6, 1910, the ship "Araguaya" with Rondon aboard, anchored in Rio's Guanabara Bay. A special welcoming committee set out in four launches, accompanied by numerous other smaller craft, to greet the returning engineer on shipboard. Among the party were his family, the president of the Sociedade de Geografia, several distinguished scientists and engineers, three generals and several lieutenant-colonels and majors, a cabinet minister, a senator and four congressmen. As the group returned to the pier, a military band in one of the boats played martial music. The wharf was completely covered with admirers and representatives of almost every high office of the Republic. A group of schoolgirls, dressed in the national colors of white and green and representing all the states of the Union, was given a front row position. While military bands on the dock played, Rondon was showered with petals. One of the schoolgirls presented him with a wreath and welcomed him back to Rio de Janeiro. Other speeches followed to which Rondon replied eloquently but simply that he had only carried out orders and that the credit for his success belonged to his officers and men.

Those who were not standing close enough to observe it, already knew that Rondon was ill with malaria; that his arrival had been delayed a day or two by doctor's orders for a rest in Bala.

The high point of the ceremony for Rondon was probably the speech that followed his own. It was delivered by an Indian girl who, with a small
group of her people and their friend, Leolinda Daltro, was representing the
active Associação de Proteção e Auxílio aos Selvagens. Her words
expressed the true significance of Rondon's work amongst the Indians:

To you, patriotic explorer, none are more grateful
than we, the Indians, for your clear and indisputable demonstra-
tion that love alone is sufficient to draw into the civilized fold
those of my people who still live in barbarity. My brothers of
the forests have sent me here to welcome you and express for
them our unyielding gratitude. Welcome home, great friend and
protector of the Indians. 20

During the days and weeks that followed, Rondon and his treatment of
the Indians continued to hold the nation's attention. From February to May
the Jornal do Comércio ran a series of eight or ten articles on the daily
experiences of the Rondon telegraphic commission, written by the expedition's
medical officer. Commercial advertisements reflected the public's interest
in Rondon. A manufacturer of medicines advertised his products as having
been praised by the above-mentioned doctor for their resistance to adverse
tropical conditions. The advertisement appeared repeatedly in the Jornal do
Comércio under the caption "Expedição Coronel Rondon." Some newspapers
of the interior devoted an unusual amount of space to Rondon in those early
months of 1910. The Gazeta Oficial of Mato Grosso, for example, naturally
enthusiastic over the warm reception given their native son on his return to
Rio de Janeiro, devoted almost three columns to cabled descriptions of the
event, and another two columns to the names of those in Cuiabá who had wired
felicitations at state expense. This was a large share of the paper's total

20 These words, together with the preceding account of Rondon's
welcome, are taken from an extensive article in the Jornal do Comércio,
February 7, 1910, p. 1, col. 8 and p. 2, col. 1. See also Jornal do Brasil
contents, for the Gazeta Oficial, though probably the largest-selling newspaper of the state, seldom consisted of more than four pages.

The publicity given Rondon did not detract from the attention paid to Miranda's announcement of government interest in the Indian. The description of the telegraphic chief's enthusiastic welcome to Rio has been presented in some detail to explain how just the opposite occurred. Rather than detract attention from Miranda's program, Rondon's return created an atmosphere highly sympathetic to the agricultural minister's decision to involve the government in an Indian welfare program.

First reactions to Miranda's scheme of government action. During the last three weeks of February, the newspapers of Rio de Janeiro and Sao Paulo published the reactions of many prominent individuals and societies to Miranda's announcement in the Museo Nacional and to his later instructions to the representative he sent to Maranhao. Several of them came from persons or organizations that had actively debated the Indian question in past months. A few of these reactions are summarized here to identify, and measure the strength of, the forces of popular support which cheered Miranda to further efforts in his plan to build a government Indian service. They are presented chronologically for the reader's convenience.

Four days later, several of Rondon's answering telegrams were printed in the same journal. In the last week of March, the Gazeta Oficial was still publishing news and biographical information about Rondon, almost five and one-half columns on March 24 and twice that amount in the combined March 26-29, six-page edition, which printed a condensed account of the expedition's activities and achievements from 1907 to 1910. And finally, the edition of March 31 carried three columns of reprints from Rio de Janeiro papers on the welcoming celebration of the preceding month.
One of the first political groups to congratulate Miranda personally (in a letter dated February 9) for his intended support of a plan for Indian protection was the Centro Republicano Conservador of Niterói. With more enthusiasm than accuracy, it expressed its belief that a new day was dawning for the native race:

From 1500 to 1823, 323 years passed without the slightest altruistic movement in support of the true owners of this beloved land. From 1824 to 1910, for another 86 years, the holy fight for the defense of the natives has been limited to that sole aspiration of José Bonifácio, of the Positivists, the members of that humble nucleus devoted to Benjamin Constant, and now to the Republican government as the promise of the true realization of Bonifácio's dream. 22

It should be noted that the advocates of government intervention in Indian affairs during the public debate of the question in 1908-1909 generally be-littled or completely discounted the humanitarian labors of the past by both the Catholic clergy and the local and state authorities. This inaccuracy drew some protest from representatives of the Catholic church and from a few scholars, but by and large it went unchallenged.

Two days after the first congratulatory notes were published, there appeared on February 11, on the front page of the recently established (December 1909) anti-Republican afternoon edition of the Jornal do Comércio, an article entitled "Um Bello Sonho Inútil: A Catechese dos Selvicolas" (A Beautiful, Useless Dream: The Instruction of the Indians). The spirit behind Miranda's efforts was highly praised, but the idea of interfering with the natural laws of the survival of the fittest was considered foolish. The author, identifying

---

The first to challenge the unknown author’s criticism was a longtime resident of French colonial areas of the Far East, and a recent arrival in Brazil, Eugène Duchemin. On the basis of his experience in those regions, he compared the savage Indians of Brazil with the fierce, uncivilized natives of tropical Cochín China, Cambodia, and Laos. The use of force, he declared, had never proved effective there in improving relations between the white man and the natives. In the jungles of those distant lands, he informed his readers, just as in Brazil, a chief of telegraph construction was the first to demonstrate the efficacy of patient and friendly treatment of the hostile aborigines. Duchemin’s careful description of the methods used by the French in recent years to contact, initiate trade, and finally win the cooperation and friendship of the natives effectively argued for a less pessimistic attitude than that displayed by the author of ‘Um bello sonho inutil.’

Scattered indications of support of Miranda’s Indianist plans and activities continued to appear in the press and in the personal correspondence directed to the Minister of Agriculture during the following days. At about the time that Duchemin was answering Miranda’s critic, the Secretario Geral of the city of Campinas, Benedicto Octavio, conveyed through personal correspondence the Centro de Ciência’s official endorsement and fervent approval of the Minister of Agriculture’s plans for government protection of the Indians and the defense of the more meaningful traditions of their culture.

A few days later, Miranda received a letter of congratulations from


person Coelho de Senna. Several pamphlets accompanied it, one of them
perhaps, the study "Os índios do Brasil" that he had submitted in 1908
to the Scientific Congress in Santiago and presented the following year at the
Primeiro Congresso Brasileiro de Geografia in Rio. Senna notified his friend
that as a Christian and a Republican he was deeply touched by his efforts in
behalf of the Indians. Under the Republic during the past two decades, he
noted, only the heroic, voice, and actions of Cândido Rondon had spoken for
the civil authorities in support of a program for civilizing the natives. The
plan recently outlined by the announcement at the Museu Nacional and in the
directives to Clodoaldo de Freitas on his mission to Maranhão was, in Senna's
words, the "official initiation of a humanitarian crusade to absorb the Indian
into the life of a free nation." 26

The Grand Orient of Masons of the state of São Paulo, in an official
commemoration of Miranda's instructions to Clodoaldo de Freitas, assured the
Minister that his noble and humanitarian sentiments and his initiative in
"incorporating our unfortunate brothers of the forest into Brazilian society"
would bring lasting glory to his name. The Grand Orient went on to remind
Miranda that his plans for government aid for the Indians were a projection of
a goal formulated by Brazilian Masonry almost a year earlier. The Society
reviewed the fact that on April 21, 1909 (as noted earlier in this study), the
lodge "Independencia" of Campinas had directed an eloquent circular to its
brother lodges throughout the nation, calling for support in the effort to protect
the vanishing Indians and incorporate them into the national culture. In July

of that same year, the message continued, the national Masonic Congress in Rio de Janeiro had discussed at length and approved unanimously a
motion that called upon the federal government to intervene in Indian af-
- 
and to instruct and civilize the wild tribes of the interior. 27

Two days later an extensive interview with the Minister of Agriculture
was published in the Jornal do Comércio. Following a strongly sympathetic
treatment of Miranda as plantation owner, industrialist, and cabinet minister,
the study presented some illuminating thoughts on the subject of the Indians.
As asked if his plans might be little more than a dream, Miranda answered that
the role he expected the Indians of the twentieth century to play was no greater
than that which they had so nobly taken as guides and instructors of the earliest
colonists. But, he added significantly, if it were a dream and the Indian did
not learn from civilized man, then at least civilized man would learn from
the Indian, for one always learns by teaching. The interviewer did not try
to counter that logic, but assured Miranda that he got the point and recognized
the fact that he was interviewing a practical man. 28

On the following day, February 22, Miranda's answer to Nelson de
Senna appeared in the same journal and clarified the point that his (Miranda's)
intentions in bringing the Indians under the closer supervision of the govern-
ment were not motivated by practical reasons alone. Federal authorities must
act on the Indian problem, he declared, not so much for the purpose of profit-
ing from the assimilation of the natives into the working force of the nation, as

27 This information is taken from a letter addressed to Rodolfo Miranda
on February 19 and printed in the Relatório do Ministério da Agricultura: 1910,
II, 5.

for the purpose of correcting past mistakes and mitigating the hardships of the Indians' nomadic jungle existence. Again in this letter, as in almost all his other answers to messages of support, Miranda stressed the point that the program he had in mind would not attempt to alter the Indians' way of life through coercion, as had been attempted in the past, but would try merely to bring tranquility into the lives of those who were seeking refuge in the fastness of the forest from the cruelty of the white man's civilization. In closing, he thanked Senna for his support as "one of those who are fighting at the government's side for the redemption of the Indians."

The last of the messages to be considered here is that written by Edgard Roquette Pinto and officially approved by the staff of the Museu Nacional in its session of February 23. He reminded Miranda that the Museum had more than once in the past championed what he called the "scientific and purely altruistic labor of initiating a practical program in support of Brazil's Indians." It was with deep pleasure, he continued, that the Museu Nacional now expressed its complete approval of the Minister of Agriculture's plan to guarantee the Indians' lands and protect their personal and spiritual liberty. Such a program was in perfect harmony with the teachings of science, Roquette Pinto affirmed, for it was basically nothing more than official permission to the aborigines to evolve naturally and freely.

Like the other persons and organizations that were backing Miranda in his efforts to help the natives, the Museu Nacional placed special emphasis on the ethical considerations and humanitarian sentiments that motivated the Minister's actions. The cost of implementing a government service was considered of little importance. So was the possibility of failure. Clearly the basic issue was the government's moral responsibility to protect the Indian from
further exploitation and massacre. The inspiring message closed with
the assurance that whatever opposition might be forthcoming, Miranda was
acting with a spirit that would bring honor to his name. The last words read:
Irrespective of the results of the Republican and patriotic conduct
of the agricultural minister, the future will know how to appreciate
the resolutions of this moment, giving to his name the prestige that
humanity confers on those who place at its service their energies,
their minds, and their hearts. 29

It is clear in these and the many other expressions of praise and co-
operation that by late February, 1910, the movement for government aid and
protection of the Indian had found a champion in the Minister of Agriculture,
Rodolfo Miranda. This man, though accustomed to transacting the business
of his cabinet position with remarkable dispatch, had, during the past few
weeks, felt his way slowly in approaching the Indian problem. The central-
ization under his ministry of the many agencies of land development increasingly
placed the Indian and his problems squarely under his jurisdiction. It was a
responsibility that he was eager to accept, even though he had good reason
to believe, from the heated debate of the Indian question in the Geographic
Congress, in the historical societies, in Leolinda Daltro's Indian aid and
protection association, and elsewhere, that public opinion was not unanimously
in favor of extensive government intervention in state affairs, particularly in
the realm of Indian education.

With rare tact, the Minister of Agriculture had timed the first announce-
ment of his intentions concerning government action on the Indian problem so as
to receive an immediately favorable response. Rather than commit his ministry

29 "Acta da 397. a sessão," Registro das actas das sessões da congre-
zação (MS in Museu Nacional).
to any definite program that might arouse sufficient opposition to kill it in the incubating stage, Miranda had outlined his plans informally in an out-of-office conversation, in directives to a personal representative on special assignment in the Amazon region, and in his answers to the letters of approval and support that he received in increasing number. Those individuals and institutions that had participated in the campaign for government action during 1889 hurried to enlist, quite publicly, under Miranda's banner. Their reaction to the Minister's experimental steps toward government intervention in Indian affairs was almost universally favorable. Their assurances of support not only strengthened Miranda in his faith that the Indian question could be solved through the positive action of his ministry; they served also as valuable propaganda for the scheme he had in mind through their appearance in the Jornal do Comércio and other journals, and their reproduction in the annual report of the Ministry of Agriculture to the nation's president.

Whatever feeling there was as to the impracticality of the projected program was countered in February by emphasis upon the humanitarian and moral aspects of the question.

With Cândido Rondon recovered from his illness and available for possible assignment to directorship of an Indian service, and with strong evidence of wide support and recognition of the need and "rightness" of such an agency as he contemplated, Rodolfo Miranda was ready by the third month in 1910 to bring the federal government into the fight for the rights and happiness of Brazil's remaining Indians.
CHAPTER IX

FORMULATION OF AN INDIAN POLICY

The many laudatory expressions of support received by Rodolfo Miranda in response to news of his tentative plans of late January and early February, 1910, for a government-sponsored Indian Service encouraged him to take the steps that would definitely commit his ministry to action on the Indian problem. Furthermore, the lack of any visible organized resistance to his plan was evidence in support of his belief, and that of his fellow enthusiasts, that public opinion was at last overwhelmingly in favor of a centrally-administered, non-religiously orientated service of Indian education and protection. In that assumption he was basically correct, for no significant opposition to his efforts was to trouble him throughout the coming weeks of February, March, and early April.

Rondon's contribution to the government effort. Miranda's first official move to further his Indian scheme, after signing the February 7, 1910, directive that sent Clodoaldo de Freitas to the state capital and Indian communities of Maranhão, was an effort to enlist in his cause the active support of the recently-returned telegraphic chief, Cândido Rondon.

The day after his triumphant arrival in Rio, Rondon was visited by a representative of the Minister of Agriculture, though it is doubtful
that any serious business was discussed at that time. Rondon was not yet recovered from the malarial fever that had caused him to stop in Baía a few days before on his voyage down the coast of Brazil. Three days later he was still confined to his bed and, at the request of his physician and a consulting specialist, was not receiving visitors.

By the weekend of February 12-13, he was sufficiently recovered to receive a distinguished caller from the Museu Nacional - its director, João Baptista da Lacerda. The scientist praised Rondon for the successful conclusion of his exploration and construction assignment in Mato Grosso and informed him of his unanimous election to corresponding membership in the National Museum.

Three days later, Rondon presented himself in the presidential offices of Catete Palace and reported to Nilo Peçanha on the major accomplishments of his telegraphic commission. With him, he took the son of the chief of the Pareci Indian tribes, Libovio, whom he had honored with the title of Major in the Brazilian army in recognition of his people's labors in helping to maintain the telegraph lines that Rondon's commission had recently constructed across their territory.

With hopes of concluding his business commitments in Rio by

1 Jornal do Comércio, February 8, 1910, p. 2, col. 4.
2 Ibid., February 11, 1910, p. 4, col. 3.
4 Ibid., February 17, 1910, p. 4, col. 5.
February 28, when he planned to leave with his family for a convalescent stay in the small nearby town of Nova Friburgo, Rondon called upon the Minister of Travel, Francisco Sá, on the twenty-first of the month to report on the progress of telegraph construction between Cuiabá, capital of Mato Grosso, and Santo Antonio da Madeira, fourteen hundred kilometers northwest across the mountains and tropical valleys of the Serra do Norte. In that conference, Francisco Sá authorized Rondon to proceed with the organization of a project of telegraphic extension into the almost isolated territory of Acre in the farthestmost western bulge of Brazil.  

Three days later on Friday, February 25, Rondon visited Rodolfo Miranda in the Ministério da Agricultura, accompanied by an Indian (probably Major Libonico) and a young officer of his telegraphic commission, Lt. Nicolau Horta Barbosa. After thanking Miranda for the honor paid him by the official visit of his representative earlier in the month, Rondon discussed with the Minister of Agriculture at some length the living conditions and customs of the nation's Indian population. Special attention was devoted by Miranda to the tribes of the southern states where opposition to the white man's advance had been most bitter. It was during that conversation that Rodolfo Miranda asked Rondon to organize the government Indian Service that he had first spoken of in the Museu Nacional. Probably the invitation was not a formal one that called for an immediate answer,

---

February 28, when he planned to leave with his family for a convalescent stay in the small nearby town of Nova Friburgo, Rondon called upon the Minister of Travel, Francisco Sá, on the twenty-first of the month to report on the progress of telegraph construction between Cuiabá, capital of Mato Grosso, and Santo Antonio da Madeira, fourteen hundred kilometers northwest across the mountains and tropical valleys of the Serra do Norte. In that conference, Francisco Sá authorized Rondon to proceed with the organization of a project of telegraphic extension into the almost isolated territory of Acre in the farthestmost western bulge of Brazil.

Three days later on Friday, February 25, Rondon visited Rodolfo Miranda in the Ministério da Agricultura, accompanied by an Indian (probably Major Libonio) and a young officer of his telegraphic commission, Lt. Nicolau Horta Barbosa. After thanking Miranda for the honor paid him by the official visit of his representative earlier in the month, Rondon discussed with the Minister of Agriculture at some length the living conditions and customs of the nation’s Indian population. Special attention was devoted by Miranda to the tribes of the southern states where opposition to the white man’s advance had been most bitter. It was during that conversation that Rodolfo Miranda asked Rondon to organize the government Indian Service that he had first spoken of in the Museu Nacional. Probably the invitation was not a formal one that called for an immediate answer.

---

for the _Jornal do Comércio's_ February 26 account of the interview gave no indication as to whether Rondon accepted it or not.

Miranda made the offer of directorship of the new Service more definite a few days later when, on March 2, he wrote a personal letter to Rondon, who had delayed his departure from Rio.

He informed the telegraphic chief that the altruistic and humanitarian spirit that had consistently motivated his (Rondon's) treatment of the Indians of Mato Grosso, and the deep understanding he had shown in his successful attempts to transform them from hostile savages into solicitous guides and friends, demonstrated the qualities required of the man who would organize and direct the Indian Service that he hoped would soon be established in Brazil.

The Minister of Agriculture did not describe in detail the aims or intended procedures of the program he had in mind. In one brief paragraph, he informed Rondon that the government would adopt a new form of Indian instruction, based on Republican principles and divorced from racial prejudice and preoccupation with religious proselytizing. It would be a specialized service directed from the nation's capital and active in all the states where the presence of an Indian population required its patient and steadfast efforts.

Miranda assured Rondon that the offer was definite and the appointment almost certain, though the program would still have to be approved and financed by the ministry to which it belonged. In closing, he stated that there was no doubt in his mind that the common
aspiration for Indian justice would at last be satisfied, if the proposed Indian Service could count upon Rondon's scientific training, his moral principles, his Republican spirit, and his driving will power - the qualities of character that had made him the nation's foremost explorer. 6

The likelihood of Rondon's accepting the post offered by Miranda was strengthened by the action of the ministries of travel and of war which, in late February, split the former telegraphic commission of Mato Grosso into three distinct units, with different assignments, and relieved Rondon of active command of the Fifth Battalion of Army Engineers, which was to continue with fresh troops to maintain existing telegraph lines and extend their construction in Mato Grosso, western Amazonas, and the Acre territory. Rondon was promoted to the rank of Lt. Colonel and named supreme director of the telegraphic commissions working in the areas mentioned. 7 In that capacity, with headquarters in Rio, he was able to accept the added responsibility of organizing and directing Miranda's envisioned program of Indian instruction and protection.

Rondon's letter of acceptance of the post of organizer and director of the proposed government Indian Service is one of the most important documents in the history of the present Serviço de Proteção aos Indios. Its significance lies in the fact that it is a qualified

---


7 Gazeta Oficial (Mato Grosso). No. 3, 078, March 1 & 3, 1910, p. 3, col. 4.
acceptance, contingent upon the adoption of Rondon's own recommended methods of Indian instruction and protection and upon the avoidance of certain other procedures that to him appeared futile or harmful in the light of his past experience and his convictions as a member of the Igreja Positivista do Brasil. In effect, Rondon’s letter of acceptance addressed to Rodolfo Miranda on March 10, 1910, spelled out in some detail an Indian policy that the Brazilian government was constrained to adopt as its own, if it accepted the policy’s author as chief of the prospective government Indian Service.

Certain ideas and sentiments in Rondon’s acceptance letter deserve special attention. In the opening paragraph, it is important to note that full credit was given Miranda for the idea and initiation of the project that was soon to materialize in the Indian Service. The telegraphic chief stressed the point that he was accepting the directorship of services that now, and by your initiative, the government of Brazil is soon to implement in behalf... of our Indians.

With the explanation that he did not consider it fair to accept the offer to head the new agency without first clarifying his own sentiments regarding the Indian problem and his ideas as to how that problem should be confronted, Rondon proceeded to define what he believed the

---

8 This quotation and other quoted and paraphrased material from Rondon’s letter of March 10 cited later in this study may be found in either of the following sources: Relatório do Ministério da Agricultura: 1910, II, 8-13; Jornal do Comércio, March 10, 1910, p. 3, col. 8 and p. 4, col. 1.
projected Service should and should not be. It was too early, he believed, to expect the natives to accept and assimilate all the benefits of the white man's industry and arts, or to conform to customs that so often derived from the white man's religious beliefs. As a member of the Igreja Positivista, Rondon recommended that the Indians be incorporated into the life of the nation without first passing through a phase of religious indoctrination. That, he added, could come later when Positivism had "triumphed sufficiently." In later months, some of those who criticized the new Indian Service did so on the grounds that it was a proselytizing organ of the Positivists. That accusation has always been denied by members of the Service, and there are no grounds for it in Rondon's description of the educational methods he expected the Agency to adopt. "Our government," he wrote to Miranda, will not be able, within its Republican mold, to catechize the Indians under any of the forms practiced by the abolished official religion or by any other metaphysical or scientific doctrine.

At this developmental stage of the Indian policy, there was much uncertainty as to who would work amongst the Indians. Rondon felt that native instruction of all kinds (short of the prohibited indoctrination) would have to remain open to what he called "iniciativa particular" (private interest). It would therefore be the duty of the Indian Service to keep a vigil on all those separate efforts to make certain that none of them resulted in fraud or in oppressive treatment of the natives. The protective functions of the new agency, Rondon declared, were so vital a part of its overall responsibility that the Service might
well bear the name: "Inspectoría Federal de Protección Fraterna aos Indígenas do Brasil [Federal Inspection Agency for the Brotherly Protection of Brazil's Natives]." That title, he believed, would be appropriate because it would indicate immediately not only the limits of official action but also the manner and spirit of the intervention.

One of the major responsibilities of the Indian Service, Rondon predicted, would be the task of protecting the natives from the theft or unsanctioned exploitation of the land they dwelt upon. Whenever possible, he declared, the Service should return to the Indians whatever territory had been usurped. When that was impracticable, the natives should be given sufficient land of equal or greater value, measured in terms of the needs of their economy. Those transactions, he said, would be arranged in friendly accord with the Indians concerned.

Operating constantly in good faith and in a fraternal spirit, the Service might even alter the habitat of certain tribes, Rondon continued, when the best interests of the nation as a whole seemed to justify such drastic action. He went on to describe an agreement that had already been made between the Parecis Indians of northwestern Mato Grosso and the telegraph commission that he had directed in that area, by which the Parecis would in the near future abandon the territory they had inhabited for centuries and settle in the fields and forests of the Serra do Norte, close to the telegraph stations where construction on the lines was in progress and where no other Indian
tribes were located. There, in their new home, they would be under the protection of the Brazilian army engineers under Rondon's command, and in return, they would devote a part of their time and energies to the maintenance of the telegraph lines.

Rondon pointed out the fact that Indians who required vast areas of dry tableland in order to exist on the meager game reserves of those regions might be content with a government land grant of far smaller proportions, if it contained richer soil and greener pastures. He assured Miranda that when the Indians inhabited regions that were rich in mineral or vegetable resources which they themselves did not prize, there was no need to remove them from the land in order to facilitate its exploitation. On the contrary, experience showed that when the natives were carefully informed of the white man's intentions and asked for permission to enter their lands in peace and friendship, they seldom refused the request. Trouble arose, Rondon maintained, only when the intruders disturbed the natives' villages or cultivated fields, dishonored their families, stole their lands, or exploited their labor.

The description of what was being done for the Parecis Indians by a telegraphic commission was intended by Rondon to illustrate the methods that he expected the Indian Service to adopt, if he were accepted as its director. Referring still to the Parecis Indians, he explained how the suitability for cattle raising of the new lands they would occupy would gradually tempt them to keep herds of animals for their food supply and cease their wide and constant search for
game - a search that prevented a sedentary way of life. Animal breeding would be encouraged at the outset by supplying the natives with cattle and other domestic animals that might be of practical use. On the richer soil of the Serra do Norte, the Parecis could continue their planting, aided by the gift of labor-saving tools and simple farm machinery.

As the Indians gradually became accustomed to dwelling in a fixed location, they would be increasingly receptive to the white man's friendship and counsel. New ideas, however, would not be forced upon them. The initiative would be their own to covet the advantages of civilized living and to adopt, either by requested instruction or by simple imitation, whatever customs did not seriously conflict with the mores of their own culture. It would always be kept in mind by the Indian Service that the Indian does not take kindly to enforced instruction in ideas and practices that have moral or utilitarian worth in the white man's culture, but no immediately apparent value in that of a primitive forest tribe.

The new Service, as Rondon visualized it, would maintain close and constant relations with the scattered Indian tribes by means of a staff of carefully selected field representatives. Their assignment would be to study and supply the Indians' material needs and to act locally or through the central office to punish those who killed or molested them. In effect, it would be their dedicated task to help the Indians to substitute for inter-tribal warfare and needless friction with the white
man, a reign of friendly and mutually beneficial relations between the whole national community of Brazilians. In all their labors, Rondon declared, success would depend less on what specific methods they employed to solve the problem than on their spirit of selflessness and their unwavering devotion to the best interests of their native charges.

In closing, Rondon gave Rodolfo Miranda an opportunity to retract the offer of directorship of the Indian Service, if he did not agree with the methods expounded in the letter of acceptance:

In the event that you accept, Mr. Minister, the procedures of government action that I have just expounded—methods that appear very limited in scope but which, nevertheless, constitute a major undertaking and, in my opinion, the only approach capable of insuring practical and just results—then I shall be prompt to collaborate in the labors that you have, of your own accord, decided to implement in our country, which will resolve, to the extent that such is possible at this time, the most serious problem confronting any Brazilian statesman...

Five days after the date of Rondon's letter of qualified acceptance, Rodolfo Miranda telegraphed his reply. The closing words read:

I approve, without exception, the methods that you recommend—all of them designed to protect and help the native without forcing him to accept our religion and our habits.

Rondon acknowledged the receipt of Miranda's message of March 15 accepting his proposed methods of operating the new Service, by a

---


10 Jornal do Comércio, March 17, 1910, p. 4, col. 2.
telegraphed reply from Nova Friburgo. Its publication in the Jornal do Comércio marked the successful conclusion of the Minister of Agriculture's efforts to place his infant Indian Service in what might be termed the loving hands of a man whose ability and prestige almost guaranteed its public acceptance.

Some, or perhaps most of the methods of approaching, civilizing, and protecting the Indians that Rondon had listed in his acceptance letter as being essential to the successful operation of a government Indian Service may already have been considered by Miranda. However, there is no evidence to suggest that the Minister of Agriculture had previously formulated a list of procedures such as that presented to him by the telegraphic commission chief. One would suspect that if his plan had actually reached the blueprint stage by early March, he would have supplied Rondon with more than a one-paragraph, generalized description of the agency he proposed to place in his hands. Without assuming that the methods outlined by Rondon were original with him or that they constituted the first itemized list of procedures used by Miranda in drawing up the regulations of the Indian Service, it can be said to Rondon's credit that every suggestion he made in his acceptance letter was included in the draft regulation of the Serviço de Proteção aos Índios as approved by presidential decree on June 20, 1910.

Promises of state support. The Minister of Agriculture's

---

month-long effort to bring Candido Rondon into partnership with him on his projected Indian Service was partly paralleled in time by a similarly successful effort to obtain guarantees of support from the governors of states where the federal Agency would expect to operate among Indian populations. Without their official support, it would have been futile for Miranda to proceed with his plans. There was no way for the government to obtain state lands for Indian reservations except by voluntary grants from the state authorities or from private owners. Nor was there any hope of effective action in the prevention of encroachments on Indian territory by lawless elements or unscrupulous business interests unless local and state authorities cooperated with the Service's field representatives.

The official circular that Miranda sent out on March 5, 1910, to all the states where an Indian problem existed or could possibly arise, was worded in such a way as to make it extremely difficult for the state executives to either ignore it or refuse the cooperation that it requested. The replies that came in to the Minister's desk in the following days cannot be fully appreciated unless one has read the contents of the original request. Note the combination of force and diplomacy:

Since the general announcement of my plan to initiate a program of non-religious instruction of the aborigines, the manifestations of enthusiasm and sympathy awakened by the idea have been so universal and unequivocal that I am convinced that the sentiment behind that proposal represents a lofty national aspiration; and, impelled by that conviction, I am soliciting your aid in the momentous work of Republican civic
spirit which is the proper definition, it seems to me, of the task of extending the benefits of free labor to our unfortunate countrymen, branded as renegades from civilization because they have not bowed under the weight of a regime of barbarous captivity.

I am sure that in order to facilitate the work that is about to be undertaken by the federal government, you will make every effort within the limits of the jurisdiction and competence of your administration to provide the Indians not only with the protection they deserve as human beings, but also with the benevolent assistance that they merit as helpless rustics.

And, deeply obliged to you, I send in advance my warm thanks for the cooperation that you, in your far-sightedness, offer to my ministry in this service that, in my opinion, is of tantamount importance to the Republic.12

Several states answered Miranda's circular immediately. Each of them praised the Minister of Agriculture for his intended policy of "catequese dos índios." Before examining their replies, it should be noted that the term "catequese," according to several Brazilians questioned by or for the writer in Rio de Janeiro, and according to general dictionary usage in Brazil, has been applied under the Republic to define a formal program or process of instruction that might or might not be religious in nature. Miranda, in his message to the state presidents, had referred to his project as "catechese [sic] leiga" (lay instruction). Rondon, however, always avoided the term "catequese" in speaking of the work of the Indian Service. The state presidents, in answering Miranda's circular, attached varying degrees

of religious significance to the term. Confusion arises from the fact that there is no word available or acceptable to the Brazilians that bears the same connotation of a formal course of instruction that "catequese" does, without the religious implications. Even Leolinda Bento used the term in describing her strictly secular educational activities, and she entitled her memoirs: Da catechese dos indios no Brasil.

One of the first to answer the Minister of Agriculture was Pedro Celestino, president of the state of Mato Grosso. He informed Miranda that he had long favored the idea of a national Indian Service. He explained that he was all the more amenable to the federal plan because of the high proportion of the nation's Indian population that dwelt in his state and needed whatever aid could be extended to them. The president of Pará, a small state in the northeastern tip of Brazil, was equally enthusiastic and assured the Minister of Agriculture that he would aid and forward his "noble mission" in whatever way he could. His (President João Machado's) reply was printed in the Jornal do Comércio together with that of a sectional judge of the state, Venancio Neiva, who not only offered "fervent applause" for the idea of government instruction of the Indians, but also congratulated Miranda on his choice of Cândido Rondon to head the new agency. His message,

13 Gazeta Oficial, March 8, 1910.
though appropriate, was a bit premature, preceding as it did by two days, Rondon's qualified acceptance of the post on March 10.

The president of Goiás, Urbano Gouveia, hastened to inform Miranda that his state had experimented with "todos os sistemas de catechese." None of them, he claimed, had produced significant results. The only plan for helping the Indians that had proved satisfactory, he added, was the encouragement of trade with them along the banks of the Araguaia River. Under the influence of that stimulant, the Indians had begun to labor in their villages and learn the arts of navigation. Progress had ceased, however, when the trading business failed for lack of subsidizing funds. The natives had returned to their primitive mode of living, and their villages had disappeared from the river's edge. President Gouveia closed his account with a bit of diplomacy that easily matched Miranda's tactics. Imparting his desire to reestablish navigation on the Araguaia River, he explained that if the federal government could help him in that enterprise, he would then be in a position to support effectively the Minister of Agriculture's "magnificent program."

Whether a bargain was later arranged on this matter or not is another story. Miranda made no reference to the Araguaia River project in his acknowledgement of the message.

From the smaller state of Piauí, in northeastern Brazil, came

---

an unequivocal offer of support in the effort of "catechese leiga" from President Manoel da Paz. His telegram was printed in the Jornal do Comércio together with the previously mentioned answer from President Goveia.

To the authors of these first replies to his March 5 circular, Rodolfo Miranda telegraphed a brief acknowledgement on or before March 9. Their approval of his project, he said, and their expressed desire to aid the Indians in every way possible had fortified his own resolution to move forward with his plans to accept governmental responsibility for the welfare of the country's native population.

Shortly after the receipt of the first series of replies to the March 5 circular, Miranda received word from his native state of São Paulo. Answering in the name of his government, Secretary of Agriculture Padua Salles promised that São Paulo would do all in its power to satisfy what he termed the "desideratum" of the federal government. More specifically, he assured Miranda that unoccupied state lands would be available to the Ministry for use as population centers for São Paulo's Indians. 16

Miranda's grateful acknowledgement of that offer was published in the March 16 issue of the Jornal do Comércio (page 4) directly beneath the reproduction of Rondon's long acceptance letter. In this telegram, as in the one sent earlier to the other governors, Miranda carefully repeated whatever assurances of support had been made to

his ministry. Thus, when his acknowledging telegrams appeared in
the Jornal do Comércio and state journals, the cooperation promised
by the governors went doubly on record before the public eye. The
zeal with which the Minister of Agriculture publicized the many ex-
pressions of approval of his plan, not only in the press but in the an-
nual report of his ministry, revealed his desire to make it commonly
known that the plans for a government Indian Service that he was soon
to submit to President Nilo Peçanha for approval rested upon solid
foundations of state as well as public approval.

During the second week of March, while Miranda was still
awaiting Rondon's answer to his formal offer of directorship of the
future Indian Service, several other states telegraphed their approval
of his Indian plan. President Nogueira Accioly of Ceará, in the dry
northeastern corner of Brazil, advised the Minister of Agriculture that
although no uncivilized natives remained in his state, he nevertheless
wished to express his complete accord with the Minister's "magnificent
and patriotic efforts." 17

Governor Jeronimo Monteiro of Espírito Santo, a coastal state
just north of the nation's capital, informed Miranda that he would be
happy to instruct all those who were already working in behalf of the
Indians in his state to contact the Minister of Agriculture directly, so
that they might henceforth act in complete accord with his instructions

17 Jornal do Comércio, March 13, p. 4, col. 1. Also Relatório
and thus make certain that Espírito Santo aided, in the most effective way possible, the "brilliant and noble effort... to realize a truly national aspiration."  

From the powerful inland state of Minas Gerais, President Prado Lopes telegraphed an offer of full and enthusiastic support. Like the governor of Espírito Santo, and in almost identical words, he praised the Minister of Agriculture's hope and plan to "bring our brothers of the forest into the community of civilized men."  

Even the state of Santa Catarina, whose Indian hunts and rumors of German imperial designs had troubled the national conscience and enlivened the Indian debate of past months, answered the Minister of Agriculture's request for cooperation. The message, however, could not have been worded more briefly. In translation, it read:  

Florianópolis, 8. - You can count on support, State, service of Indian instruction. Cordial greetings. - Gustavo Richard, State President.  

Late in the month (March 23), Miranda heard from the president of Rio Grande do Sul, Carlos Barbosa, whose benevolent treatment of the Indians of his state had earned him the title of respect: "Papai Grande" (Great Father). Barbosa assured the Minister

---

19 Ibid.
20 Ibid.
of Agriculture that he was completely at his service in whatever Indian protection plans he had in mind. His message was particularly useful to Miranda as propaganda for his projected work of native instruction, because it described a highly successful effort currently in progress in Rio Grande do Sul to civilize the semi-wild inhabitants of the Indian community of Lagoa Vermelha. Even cynics like von Lhering and Campos Novaez must have been impressed by the state president's description of the progress made by Indian children in that school.

The students had at first been suspicious and irregular in their attendance, Barbosa told Miranda. However, they had soon taken a lively interest in their primary-grade subjects and in the practical instruction they received in farming techniques. As a result of the schooling, and with the aid of their professor's direction, pupils were transforming their primitive ranch huts into more comfortable homes. The children, Barbosa continued, were intelligent and quick to learn. Some were already reading in Portuguese after a surprisingly brief period of instruction. The school had been founded, the state president said, with the generous aid of a Catholic padre by the name of Father Bruno, who inspected it annually. 21

Carlos Barbosa’s unsolicited account of how primary education and instruction in farming methods were revolutionizing the lives of

---

a community of half-savage Indians of Rio Grande do Sul was later reinforced by the description of a somewhat similar educational experiment in the state of Pará. The governor of that northern region of Amazonian forest assured Miranda that the Minister’s noble plan to initiate a national service of Indian instruction had awakened in his state and in his own heart the same enthusiastic feelings that it had drawn from every other source. His telegram, dated April 6, 1910, a month after Miranda’s original circular, did not explain why the awakening he spoke of had been so late. It is possible that the religious emphasis placed upon Indian instruction in Pará accounted for the state’s hesitancy to approve a government-supervised education project.

The governor informed Miranda that his state had long been convinced that the surest and most efficient way to civilize the natives was to concentrate attention upon the younger generation. Guided by that policy, two schools had been founded in the environs of the colony of Santo Antonio do Prata and the village of Ourém, both of which were centers of large Indian populations. One hundred and eighty students, many of them Indian boys and girls, attended these two schools under the direction and instruction of dedicated religious workers. No mention was made by the governor as to whether these missionaries were Catholics or Protestants.

The message closed with an assurance that the government of Pará would cooperate fully in the Minister of Agriculture’s “praise-
worthy intentions" of civilizing the nation's Indian population. 22

Rodolfo Miranda, in thanking the governor of Pará for his pro-
mise of support, reiterated the fact that the work of the Indian Service
would be directed solely towards serving the best interests of the
native without any preoccupation with religious sectarianism, which
was contrary to the spirit of the Constitution. 23

The exchange of telegrams in March and early April between
state governors and the Minister of Agriculture may have contributed
significantly to the formulation of Indian policy in 1910. It is possible,
for example, that the account of how previously isolated and uncivilized
Indians had benefited from a temporary trade opportunity on the Ara-
guata River in Goiás influenced Miranda to insert in the regulations
of the future Indian Service the clause that recommended the con-
struction of maritime ports wherever they might serve an Indian coastal
or river-bank community. São Paulo's offer of land for Indian reser-
vations made it possible for Miranda to write into that same draft reg-
gulation (body of rules and provisions designed to govern the organi-
zation and activities of the future Indian Service) a series of measures
concerning the allotment of unoccupied lands for the permanent location
of nomadic or dispossessed Indian tribes. Finally, the description of
how easily Indian children were learning to read and to improve their

23 Ibid., p. 27. Also Jornal do Comércio, May 1, 1910, p. 5,
col. 4.
homes and farming techniques in the Indian school at Lagoa Vermelha, Rio Grande do Sul, together with the account of educational experiments with Indian children in two schools in Pará, may have been instrumental in causing Miranda to include as one of the services of the new agency (though Rondon had not originally suggested it) the formal schooling of Indian boys and girls in primary-grade subjects and in occupational skills.

The real value of the correspondence between Miranda and the state presidents, as implied earlier, was that it gave him the green light to create an agency designed to operate extensively on state lands in cooperation with state and local authorities. Without the support they promised, which Miranda diligently publicized, the effectiveness of federal action in rural areas could have been completely nullified by opposition from petty officials who were jealous of states' rights or motivated by selfish interests.

Loyal support and mounting opposition. The search for the events and forces that helped to shape the new Indian policy during the critical months between Rondon's return to Rio on February 6, 1910, and the day when Miranda submitted the draft regulation of the proposed Indian Service to Nilo Peçanha for the presidential signature on June 16, leads to a brief review of the public reaction to news of Miranda's progress on his "Indian plan." The term "public reaction," as used here, does not refer to any measurable expression of sympathy or approval from the general public at large. Rather it refers to the
opinions expressed by prominent individuals, editorialists, societies, and state institutions. It is likely that some of their ideas, as well as those of Cândido Rondon and of the state presidents, found their way into the regulations of the Indian Service.

The Centro Republicano Conservador, early in March, assured Miranda that he had its approval and its full support in his noble effort to "draw from out the forests into closer bonds with us, our abandoned and forgotten fellow Brazilians." Miranda received the message on March 7 and answered it soon afterward. Referring to the Centro as "that illustrious political body," he told them how pleased he was to see that his old companions of the "tumultuous days of [Republican] propagandizing" were still faithful to the "pure doctrine that had been their banner in the battles of their apostle [Benjamin Constant]." He thanked them sincerely for keeping alive that intimate and heartfelt solidarity of belief from the past and offering it now to someone who was trying, with the support of all who truly loved the Republic, to obtain for the Indian the rights of equality and fraternity - a task that he considered both a duty and a gospel. 24

Miranda's Indian plan was enthusiastically received by the Masonic lodges, several of which had already taken part in the controversial debate of earlier months. The Minister of Agriculture evidently

considered their support of real value. He wrote to the Grand Orient of São Paulo on March 4 and, in his opening words, spoke of the patriotic ideals and devotion to the cause of justice that had upheld that organization in its battles for Independence, for Abolition, and for the Republic. That same spirit, Miranda said, was now clearly evidenced in the Grand Orient's support of the efforts to extend the rights of equality to the unfortunate Indians. Miranda emphasized the concept of equality—something he had not done in his past correspondence and public announcements. He declared that the Republic must not discriminate in law between the uncivilized native and the man of culture, between the proletariat and the wealthy class. All, he claimed, must have the same rights. 25 The Indian Service later provided carefully for the enforcement of equal rights for the Indian.

During the months of April and May, other Masonic lodges announced their adherence to Miranda's plan for a government Indian Service. Four of these messages of support were printed in the pages of the Ministério da Agricultura's annual report. 26 They came from the lodges: "Independencia" of Campinas (dated April 6, 1910), "Charitas" of São João d'El-Rey (April 2, 1910), and "Aurora Caondonense" of Caconde (May 9, 1910). All four of these letters expressed a hope that the new Service would be organized in such a way as to remain

---

26 Ibid., 21-23.
free of religious entanglements.

From the Centro de Acadêmicos of Rio came an equally strong request for a non-religious orientation of the future Indian Service. The official communication addressed to Miranda and dated March 29, 1910, was signed by a committee of five, headed by the name of its author, R. Teixeira Mendes. In his previous discussions of the Indian problem, Mendes had expressed the official policy of the Igreja Positivista when he argued that Indian instruction should be completely secular. His criticism of other religions and philosophies than his own was seldom aimed at any one faith and was rarely severe in tone. Speaking, however, as a member of the Centro de Acadêmicos, he declared that the nation's Indians had long been subject to either complete abandonment or to forms of religious instruction that offered them neither religious freedom nor protection from their many oppressors.27

The letters received by Miranda in March and April that advised against religious indoctrination of any sort in the future program of the Indian Service may have served to strengthen the Minister of Agriculture's original design to keep the federal agency completely secular in its orientation. However, these sometimes bold anti-clerical pronouncements, such as the messages from the Masonic lodges and from the Centro de Acadêmicos, could not fail to antagonize

27 Jornal do Comércio, March 31, 1910, p. 4, col. 3.
loyal Catholics who were proud of their Church's long tradition of Indian instruction and fearful lest the Republican government be led by Positivist and Masonic sympathies to curtail or attempt to suppress Catholic labors among the natives.

They were further annoyed by the anti-Catholic sentiments of a contributor to the Jornal do Comércio by the name of Conego Wolfsenbuttel. Every eight or ten days from March through May or June, he expressed through small notices in the "Requested Publications" section, some form of anti-clerical bias. His remarks in the April 16 edition are fairly representative:

Is it the dollar, is it the pound sterling, is it St. Peter's money, or is it faith, accompanied by the desire for martyrdom, that must convert the Indians?

And if this faith no longer exists, if we do not have men who want to be poor like Christ, if no one wants to be a martyr for the Christian faith, then leave the eminent Minister of Agriculture, Dr. Rodolphe Miranda, in peace to use his method of catechism - which really is not catechism - conforming as it does to the legal statutes of the Republican constitution. 28

Before reviewing the more heated developments of the debate over Catholic-church versus government-employee supervision of native instruction - a debate that was to grow in intensity as the date of presidential examination of Miranda's regulations of the Indian Service drew nearer - some attention should be given to three or four other significant expressions of pro-Miranda sympathy and support.

28 Jornal do Comércio, April 16, 1910, p. 7, col. 3.
They are treated only briefly because it is questionable how much influence they had at this late date on the formulation of Indian policy as set forth in the terms of the Indian Service.

One of the Minister of Agriculture's most powerful champions was the next president of Brazil, Marshal Hermes da Fonseca. The nation learned of that fact when an interview with the Marshal was published in Panfala and Comercio de S. Paulo on April 23, 1910, and reprinted widely in Brazil during the following days. Fonseca, in that interview, had occasion to remark:

I approve in every way of everything that the Minister of Agriculture is doing, and I hope that he will continue to serve under my administration.

Fonseca was sworn into office on November 15, 1910. A new Minister of Agriculture succeeded Miranda in 1910 but closely followed his predecessor's policies regarding immigration, land development, and treatment of the Indians. It may interest the reader to know that the man who shouldered Miranda's responsibilities and forwarded the work he had begun was in 1910 the Grand Master of the Grand Orient of Freemasonry in São Paulo, which had openly supported Miranda's Indian plan during the past few months. Hermes da Fonseca, in the interview mentioned, praised the Minister of Agriculture especially for his efforts in behalf of what he called "Indian colonization," and he expressed his own conviction that the Indian could be utilized by

---

29 Jornal do Comércio, April 26, 1910, p. 3, col. 4.
the nation in many ways.

Messages of approval of Miranda's plans came from distant parts of Brazil, and not only from interior states with large Indian populations. An official expression of congratulations was addressed to the Minister of Agriculture on April 28, 1910, by the Liga Maritima Brasileira of the state of Pernambuco. 30

In Rio de Janeiro, speaking before the politically influential Instituto dos Advogados do Brasil (Institute of Lawyers of Brazil), H. Inglez da Souza on April 28, 1910, reviewed the past legal status of the nation's Indians. With a brief reference to the Minister of Agriculture’s intentions of drawing the Indians into closer relations with the white man’s civilization, he told his colleagues that such a move would require a comprehensive system of laws designed to provide the Indians with opportunities, rights, and protection equal to those enjoyed by the Brazilians with whom they would increasingly associate. 31

With the Indian Service almost a reality, the long and dedicated efforts of the Centro de Ciencias, Letras e Artes of Campinas to induce

31 Inglez da Souza, "O selvagem perante o direito," O direito, Vol. 112 (May-August 1910), pp. 5-18. The wording of the title and the last part of the author's name make it easy to confuse this study with an earlier work of 1905 by A. F. da Souza Pitanga, which was published under the same title in Volume 109 of the same law journal. The earlier study was previously discussed in connection with Souza Pitanga's part in the Primeiro Congresso Brasileiro de Geografia and in Leolinda Daltro's efforts to reorganize her Associação de Proteção e Auxílio aos Selvícolas do Brasil.
government action on the Indian question came to an end. The Centro's retirement from the field of controversy was slow and seemingly reluctant. A letter from Rodolfo Miranda was read in the session of February 19, 1910, which complimented and sincerely thanked the members of the Society for their initiatory labors in the movement for Indian justice that was now well launched. The records of the meeting do not give any further information as to the contents of Miranda's message.

The news of São Paulo's willingness to donate to the federal government the unoccupied land needed for the future home of the state's poorly located or dispossessed Indians reached the Centro de Ciências in March, in a directive from São Paulo's Secretary of Agriculture. After its announcement in the session of March 19, Luís Bueno Horta Barbosa arose to inform his colleagues that the state's offer to cooperate with the plan of the Minister of Agriculture in Rio marked the close of the Centro's long campaign to induce government action on the Indian problem. He warmly thanked his fellow members for the loyal support they had given the society's Comissão Prometora da Defesa dos Indios. Its labors, he explained, were no longer required, now that the Minister of Agriculture had taken up the task of organizing a government Indian Service. As president of the Committee,

---

The motion was approved, and the board dismissed the session with a statement of appreciation of the efforts of the Comissão Promotora.

In the same week of the following week, the Centro de Ciências approved a notice that offered a corresponding membership in the Lisbon Inter-Board. According to the records, Dr. A. L. C. de Sousa wrote a note of some length on the character and achievements of the director of the board and proposed that the Centro send him an official representation at his selection by the Minister of Agriculture in honor of the incoming Indian Service.

Although the Centro's Indian committee was no longer active, Dr. A. L. C. de Sousa continued to advise the Society on Miranda's progress in establishing an Indian protection agency within the Ministério da Agricultura. It is possible that sometime in May he visited Miranda and wrote him correspondence from him, for on the twenty-eighth of April, he resigned for his colleagues of the Centro de Ciências the rules general aims and procedures of the projected Service.

In the leaving the story of the Centro's part in the creation

---

12. 'Acta da 17ª sessão ordinaria de 19 de março de 1910, "

13. 'Acta da 18ª sessão ordinaria de 28 de março de 1910, "

14. 'Acta da 17ª sessão ordinaria de 28 de maio de 1910, "
of the modern Indian Service in Brazil, it is of interest to note that the inauguration of that agency in late 1910 did not end Horta Barbosa's activities in the cause of Indian justice, nor his society's interest in the natives' welfare. He became secretary of the Service after its inauguration in September, 1910, and in 1911 he held an equally responsible position as field inspector among the hostile Caingangue Indians of São Paulo who were still obstructing, with mounting loss of life on both sides, the advance of railroad construction of the Estrada de Ferro Noroeste do Brasil. His success in the gradual pacification of those Indians was reported in the April 1, 1912, session of the Centro de Ciências with great satisfaction by his former co-worker in the society's Comissão Promotora, Vicente Melillo.

When the speaker suggested that a message of congratulations be addressed to Horta Barbosa at the nearest telegraphic outpost, a former critic of the Comissão's "idealism and sentimentality," José de Campos Novaes, arose to suggest an address where their fellow member would more surely receive the message. Moreover, he urged that the telegram be sent at once, and he then spoke in great detail on the work of his young colleague among the Caingangues. 36 The fact that he was so well acquainted with the methods used by Horta Barbosa in pacifying this savage tribe - an undertaking that until 1912 had been considered by himself and most other Brazilians as beyond all hope

of accomplishment - must have pleased, if not surprised, his fellow members. The historian who plans to make a careful study of the Indian policy in Brazil after 1910, as determined by the regulations and procedures of the Indian Service, would do well to consider not only what the Service did for the Indian but also what effect it had on a man like Campos Novas who in the Fourth Scientific Congress in Santiago, Chile, in 1908 (see footnote 5, page 167) declared that Indians who act like wild beasts should be treated as such, but who in 1912 stood before his scientific society and praised the work of a man who was winning the friendship of the most intractable Indians of São Paulo with a policy of warm friendship, sincere interest, generous aid, and absolute justice.

Final attack on the proposed Indian Service. The most bitter opposition to Miranda's plans began in mid-April, 1910, and continued through the month of June. As previously stated, the opposition was largely the result of fear on the part of loyal Catholics that those who were framing the regulations of the Indian Service would be tempted by published expressions of anti-clerical feeling to adopt procedures for educating and protecting the Indians that would preclude religious instruction of the natives and place Catholic missionaries to the Indians under the direct and restrictive supervision of government agents.

Not all of the criticism aimed at the new Service came from Catholics. Several critics who claimed to have no religious prejudice and no church affiliation, accused Miranda and Rondon of leaning so far away
from the traditional Catholic emphasis on religious instruction that they were falling into another form of catechism - that of the Positivist philosophy and the vague idealism of the Igreja Positivista.

Some idea of the warmth of the attack of April-June, 1910, on the suspected Positivist and anti-clerical leanings of the projected Indian Service can be drawn from the following review of a few of the most widely publicized criticisms of Miranda's plans.

The first attack to appear in the Jornal do Comércio carried the provocative title: "A Pretentida [sic] Cathecense Leiga" (The Proposed Lay Catechism). It was printed on April 13, 1910, and it repeated a previously publicized definition of Miranda's plan as a beautiful but impractical dream. Its author argued that it would be a miracle if wild Indians could be educated. There was little reason, he felt, for believing that the modern missionaries, armed with the "Rights of Man," were more likely to accomplish that miracle than the dedicated evangelists of all times who carried with them the symbol of the Cross and the Law of the Ten Commandments.

The writer admitted that Cândido Rondon was not an ordinary, "religiously-indifferent Republican functionary" but rather an admirable sectarian, animated [in his dedication to the welfare of the Indians] by the most profound religious faith.

If, the author continued, the illustrious Minister of Agriculture had

---

several dozen Rondons at his command, then it would be a different matter. But Rondons did not come in dozens. The majority of the personnel of the Indian Service, it was argued, would be political appointees who would naturally lack the spirit of selflessness that had strengthened the missionaries of old.

The next significant attack on the suspected errors and failures of the future Indian Service was printed on April 27, 1910, in the *Jornal do Comércio: Edição da Tarde* and reprinted by request the following day in the regular morning edition of that journal. It was apparently an editorial. Its author announced the fact that the early pronouncements of the Minister of Agriculture had received their share of wreaths and flowers, but that the plan's generous and altruistic motives had now (April 27) ceased to blind the public to its less obvious and less praiseworthy qualities. Now, the argument continued, the true character of the Minister of Agriculture's beliefs and intentions were at last being weighed and analysed. It was the writer's opinion that the advocates of the new Service were still entranced by a false impression that a Positivist-inspired program of Indian aid would be more effective than the past and present labors of Catholic missionaries. The editorial closed with these words of warning and advice to the Minister of Agriculture:

To avoid the controlling influence of Catholicism and, in doing so, to fall under the spell of Positivist sectarianism, which lacks the Catholic church's justification for ascendency on the basis of past [success in labors of Indian welfare and instruction], is to repeat the same blunder that has been so strongly rebuked.
It is essential that the State guard itself against a tendency to favor any one of the various creeds. We need less utopia and more common sense. 38

R. Teixeira Mendes, speaking once again in behalf of the Igreja Positivista, declared in a pamphlet written May 5, 1910, that the projected Indian Service would be reverting to practices of the Middle Ages if it attempted to catechize the Indians with a Catholic, Protestant, Positivist or any other philosophical or theological system. If, he asserted, the Catholic church wished to work among the natives, then it should be free to do so. However, he added, the missionary enterprise of any religious organization should be financed by its own members, who should be glad to do so, if they sincerely believed in their faith and in its values to the heathen. Moreover, the missionaries should not expect the Indian Service to protect them from the natives with military force or in any other way. The Europeans, Teixeira Mendes explained, had occupied the Indians' land by force, and it was no more a crime on the part of the natives to attempt to drive the white man out than it was a crime for the Portuguese and Spanish to drive the Moors out of the Spanish Peninsula or for the Pernambucanos to eject the Dutch in an earlier century.

Teixeira Mendes emphasized the point that the Indian agency to be created under the Ministry of Agriculture must limit its activities

to the fraternal protection of the Indians against the exploitation of business interests and "false missionaries." However, he added, the Service should protect worthy missionaries from the destructive forces of selfish, industrial adventurers. In closing, Teixeira Mendes wrote:

At the present moment, the humanitarian and patriotic attitude of Citizen Rodolpho Miranda, Minister of Agriculture, assures us that the brotherly protection (not the catechism, which is impossible) of Brazil's Indians will soon be put into operation by the government. 39

Some of Miranda's critics may have taken comfort from Teixeira Mendes' words, knowing that if the spokesman for the Igreja Positivista were in favor of continued missionary work among the Indians, limited only by regulations against their financial or military support by the government, then the Service would probably be organized according to that plan. It was widely known that Mendes' opinions were highly respected by Miranda and practically law in the eyes of Rondon. However, the attack on the suspected anti-clerical orientation of the future Indian Service continued to mount in intensity.

One of the most dramatic incidents in this last phase of the debate over church versus government supervision of Indian instruction developed in the weekly sessions of the Instituto Histórico e Geográfico de São Paulo. The heated discussion of the matter in that traditionally calm society of scientists and scholars suggests the tensioness of the

atmosphere into which the Indian Service was born.

The circumstances under which the society's honored member, Hermann von Ihering, had withdrawn from the Instituto early in 1909 were not forgotten by his former colleagues. Although he still was not attending sessions, he was nominated on February 5, 1910, to the society's three-man Scientific Committee. During the session of the following week, J. C. Gomes Ribeiro informed the society that von Ihering was currently seeking, without success, to find an auditorium where he could deliver scientific lectures. Ribeiro proposed that the Instituto offer von Ihering the use of its lecture hall. Dinamérico Rangel, the society's secretary, advised against the suggestion, explaining that it was not the policy of the Instituto to take the initiative and offer its facilities to those who did not personally request them. He suggested instead that the records of the meeting include a statement to the effect that von Ihering's continued absence from the Instituto's sessions was deeply regretted by his fellow members.

Von Ihering and his son, Rodolfo, remained absent from the sessions of the weeks immediately following, and it was fortunate that they did not choose to renew their attendance at the ninth meeting of the year on May 20. In that session, Torres de Oliveira, the member who had earlier antagonized von Ihering with his explanation of the rewording of the title of the German scientist's article on the Indians

---

40 Revista do Instituto Histórico e Geográfico de São Paulo, XV (1910), 450.
of São Paulo, arose early in the proceedings to propose that the Institute send official congratulations to the Minister of Agriculture on his plans for a government Indian Service.

Oliveira introduced his motion of congratulations with a report on Miranda's efforts to launch the Service. He spoke of the Minister's choice of Rondon to direct the new agency and he touched upon Miranda's recent moral and financial support of the Salesian Indian mission in Mato Grosso. He impressed upon his fellow members his conviction that now, in 1910, more than ever before, the nation had need of such a service. The extension of telegraph lines, the construction of strategic roads across the backlands, the building of new and deeply penetrating, inter-state railway lines— all these dynamic forces of economic expansion, he declared, were drawing the Indian and the white man into a bitter duel that would inevitably lead to the natives' extinction, unless they were effectively protected.

The Service envisioned by the Minister of Agriculture, Oliveira continued, would not concern itself with sectarian differences but would probably combine legal protection with some form of religious instruction. The speaker did not elaborate on that point, on which he was somewhat in error as will be seen by later analysis of the regulations of the Indian Service. He concluded his remarks with a request that his motion to congratulate the Minister of Agriculture be approved, not only as a recognition of the prudent steps that Miranda had already taken, but as an incentive for him to press forward his plans and bring his patriotic and humanitarian work to a successful conclusion.
Immediately following Oliveira's statement, Padre Julio Maria (newly welcomed to membership in the Instituto in the early minutes of the session) requested the floor and advised strongly against approval of the motion of congratulations. According to the records of the session, Padre Maria objected to the motion on the grounds that:

... the Minister of Agriculture's plan was not to catechize the Indian, a task that could only be accomplished by religious missionaries, but actually to conquer him and subjugate him by brute force. 41

A later press account of the argument states that the new member, in his lengthy treatment of the matter, placed special emphasis on his conviction that the Minister of Agriculture's choice of a Positivist to direct so important a service as that of Indian instruction was contrary to the nation's habits and traditions, and would lead gradually to the rejection of Catholic participation in the work of civilizing the Indians. 42

The next member to express himself on the subject was the society's official orator, Rafael Sampaio, who had earlier in the meeting formally welcomed Julio Maria into the Instituto with an eloquent discourse on the Padre's high moral character and superior intellectual qualifications. Sampaio hastened to defend the Minister of Agriculture,

---

41 Revista do Instituto Histórico e Geográfico de São Paulo, XV, 442.
arguing that his selection of Cândido Rondon to direct the Indian Service was not motivated by anti-Catholic sympathies, but rather by the telegraphic chief's irreproachable character and his long experience in the art of pacifying wild and hostile Indians. After backing that argument with another reference to Miranda’s financial support of Padre Malan’s Indian mission in Mato Grosso, Sampaio stated that he could not vote with Maria against the motion in question. It was evident, he said, that Father Maria, in attacking the Minister of Agriculture on the supposition that he intended to catechize the Indians with Positivist teachings, revealed a prejudice of his own in favor of a Catholic orientation for the service of Indian aid and protection. In closing, Sampaio informed the society that although he himself was a Catholic, he could not accept the unconstitutional partiality to that creed in a government Indian Service, and he would therefore vote unreservedly in favor of Oliveira’s motion to applaud the Minister of Agriculture for his work in the general interests of humanity.43

Following Sampaio at the speaker’s stand was Estevam Leão Bourroul, one of a three-man committee that had formally introduced Padre Maria to the Instituto earlier in the evening. The records of the session do not quote or summarize his words, but the May 27 account in the Jornal do Comércio divulged the following information. Bourroul began with an announcement of his complete agreement with

Father Maria because of the obvious fact that the Minister of Agriculture intended to introduce into the national government through his Ministry, the Positivist philosophy that had already "done so much harm to the nation." Any sort of catechism, he continued, that excluded the Catholic missionary and his methods was not a catechism but a program for military conquest. He therefore declared that he would vote with Maria against the Oliveira motion.

The debate was continued by Coronel Ludgero de Castro, who argued in favor of the motion despite his ready admission of the successful labors of Catholic missionaries among the Indians. He supported Miranda's selection of Rondon to head the new agency, and he stated that although he (de Castro) was of the Catholic faith, he could see no anti-clerical prejudice in the Minister of Agriculture's efforts to avoid all forms of religious catechizing in the operation of the Indian Service.

In an effort to prevent the argument from getting out of hand, Joaquim José de Carvalho asked the president to postpone a vote on the motion until a later session. It was Carvalho who had attempted to still the troubled waters of the March 5, 1909, session when almost every phase of the proceedings seemed to be a direct insult aimed at his friend, Hermann von Ihering. Carvalho, in requesting postponement of a vote on Oliveira's motion, could not refrain from adding to the heat of the debate by expressing his own feelings. He told his fellow members that although Miranda was raising his children in the
Catholic faith, he might easily be tempted to accept Rondon's "Positivist-inspired program of Indian instruction."

Before the president could intercede on Carvalho's motion for postponement of the vote, Gomes Coelho rose to inform his colleagues that Miranda could not possibly intend to obstruct the continued services of Catholic missionaries among the Indians. He based his argument on the fact that he had personally heard him praise the work of the missionaries of that faith.

The weight of opinion was now seen to be on the side of the Minister of Agriculture. The next two speakers, A. Moreira da Silva (another member of the committee that had presented Padre Maria for membership that evening) and State Senator Luis Piza, both supported Miranda's intentions and actions on the Indian question. Following their statements, Gomes Coelho and Ludgero de Casto requested that the Institute proceed with the vote. J. J. de Carvalho's motion for postponement of the vote was first defeated by a large majority of the members. Then Torres de Oliveira's motion for official approval of Miranda's efforts in behalf of the Indians was put to a vote, and it, too, was passed by a large majority.43

43 Jornal do Comércio, May 27, 1910, p. 7, cols. 1-2. The minutes of the session list the following members as having voted in favor of the Oliveira motion to congratulate Miranda: Domingos Jaguariibe, Gomes Ribeiro, Moreira da Silva, Afonso de Freitas, Joaquim Pinto da Silveira Cintra, Gentil de Moura, Luis Piza, João Wetter, Oscar de
The Instituto's disagreement over what role, if any, should be given to religious instruction in Miranda's proposed government Indian Service was directly called to his attention by more than one member of that society. As secretary of the Instituto, Dinâmérico Rangel sent the Minister of Agriculture his personal greetings attached to a copy of the controversial Oliveira motion which reads as follows:

I propose that the Instituto send to the Minister of Agriculture a formal message of praise and applause for the methods that he is adopting in his plan to protect, instruct, and civilize our Indians; [furthermore, I suggest that the message convey to him the society's] sincere hope that his humanitarian and patriotic action will result in the establishment of a regular and permanent service that will safeguard the life and property of our fellow countrymen - the first inhabitants of our backland regions. 44

A more informative letter concerning the debate was addressed to the Minister of Agriculture by Ludgero de Castro, one of the members who had spoken in favor of the Oliveira motion. Describing the

Sá Campello, Alfredo de Tololo, Ludgero de Castro and Rafael Corrêa Sampaio. (The Jornal do Comércio account adds to this list the names of Gomes Coelho and Dr. Krugger. It may have been referring to Edmundo Krug who, according to the records of the session, refrained from voting.) The Instituto's records show that the following members did not vote: Torres de Oliveira (who had introduced the motion), José Bonifácio da Oliveira Coutinho, Eugenio Alberto Franco, and the society's secretary, Dinâmérico Rangel, who had "retired from the meeting because of illness." The records list the following members as having voted against the Oliveira motion of congratulations: Padre Julio Maria, J. J. de Carvalho, I. X. de Assis Moura, José Maria do Valle, and Estevam Leão Bourrel. This list from the minutes of the May 20 session of the Instituto may be found in: Revista do Instituto Histórico e Geográfico de São Paulo, XV, 443.

argument in detail, he informed Miranda that the motion had been opposed by five eminent "cidadãos-monarchistas catholicos orthodoxos," but supported by a large majority of the members present. He hastened to add that not one of the dissidents, in arguing against the motion, had questioned in any way the Minister of Agriculture's patriotism or integrity. Following a personal request that Miranda remain true to the Republican principles that he had championed for so many years—principles that would not permit sectarian partisanship of any sort in a government Indian Service—Ludgero de Castro signed his name officially as the president of the Junta do Distrito da Liberdade (a Republican party organization within the city of São Paulo). 45

A more extended treatment of the controversy within São Paulo's illustrious Instituto Histórico would include Miranda's answers to Dinamérico Rangel and Ludgero de Castro, both of which were published in the Ministry's Relatório of 1910 (Volume II, pages 25-26). Those answers, together with accounts of another heated, though brief, outbreak of the argument in the society's session of June 6, are not treated here because they shed no further light on the forces that were operating on Miranda and his assistants during the period from March to June, when they were drawing up the regulations of the future Indian Service.

Editorials in the Jornal do Comércio: Edição da Tarde continued through the months of May and June to criticize the "Positivist orientation" of the proposed Indian Service. The journal printed several sharp attacks on the foolish idea that anything but force could stop the current revolt of the Coroadão Indians of São Paulo against the construction crews of the Estrada de Ferro Noroeste do Brasil, at and beyond the station of Francisco Glycerio; or the less serious but more thoroughly publicized revolt of the Cajabi Indians of the Paranatinga Valley of Mato Grosso against the representatives of rubber-gathering concerns in that area. The afternoon edition of the Jornal do Comércio made full use of those sudden flare-ups of warfare between the Indian and the white man to argue against Miranda’s belief that it was the Indian, not the colonist, who needed the protection of the Indian Service, and against Rondon’s repeated affirmation that the Indian never attacked the white man without good reason. 46


Details of the conflict between Indians and railroad workers along the Estrada de Ferro Noroeste do Brasil can be found in the Jornal do Comércio, May 26, 1910, p. 4, cols. 6-7 and May 29, 1910, p. 6, cols. 1-2. A company of troops was sent to patrol the area in the first week of June.
There seems to be no way to measure the proportionate influence on Indian policy of the various expressions of public, private, and state approval or criticism of the projected Indian Service. In a general summary, it can be said with certainty that Rondon's March 10 outline of the procedure to be followed by the Service, if he were chosen to direct it, was incorporated in toto into the draft regulation of the Servico de Proteção and formed a substantial portion of that document. Whether many or most of his ideas were already contemplated by Miranda or not is impossible to determine.

The correspondence between the Minister of Agriculture and the state presidents definitely encouraged Miranda and all who supported his plan for a national Indian Service, because it promised him the support he would need to make the work of that agency effective within the geographical and judicial boundaries of the various states. On the basis of that correspondence, Miranda could write into the regulations of the Service definite procedures for moving Indian tribes from disputed or inhospitable areas onto unoccupied and more fertile

The brief revolt of the Cajabi Indians of Mato Grosso and the extensive use of that occurrence as an argument against the discrimination that the future Indian Service was expected to show towards the Indians in their warfare against the white men, can be traced through the following sources: Gazeta Oficial (Mato Grosso), February 19, 1910 (p. 1, col. 1), February 24, March 19, May 14, May 19 (p. 2, cols. 1-4), May 21 (p. 2, cols. 3-4), May 28 (p. 1, col. 3), and June 25 (p. 2, cols. 2-3); Jornal do Comércio: Edição da Tarde, April 25, 1910, p. 1, col. 1 and April 28, 1910, p. 1, col. 3; Jornal do Comércio, April 23, 1910, p. 4, cols. 6-7, April 27, 1910, p. 5, col. 6, and May 15, p. 5, cols. 3-4.
land donated by the states.

The heated argument over church versus government, or Catholic versus Positivist, orientation of the future Indian Service account in part for the fact that the draft regulation carefully avoided any mention of a particular faith or philosophy. Nothing was included in it that could be interpreted as a disparagement of missionary work among the Indians or as discrimination against any theological or philosophical system of belief. If there had been no argument over religious aspects of Indian instruction during the months that the plan of operation of the Service was formulated, it is quite possible that the draft regulation would have included certain Positivist ideas, expressed in the usual Positivist phraseology, that would later have antagonized the adversaries of that school of thought. Also, the regulations might have spelled out the original intentions of keeping Indian instruction completely secular. Despite the professed opinions of Rondon and of the political and Masonic organizations that had publicly stated that religious instruction should have no place in the government effort to civilize the Indians, the regulations of the Indian Service do not include a single clause that forbids evangelizing activities by non-government agents.

The draft regulation was ready for presidential approval by mid-June. Its terms were still unknown to the public at that time—a fact that was demonstrated by the many errors made by both critics and supporters of the new Service as they discussed its probable form
during the early months of 1910. With its formal approval by Nilo Peçanha on June 20, 1910, Brazil adopted a modern Indian policy that, with few changes, is still in effect today. It remains here to summarize that policy as set forth in the June 20 "Regulation of the Indian Service," and to describe the last official steps that led to its formal implementation in the inauguration ceremony of September 7, 1910.
CHAPTER X

INAUGURATION OF THE SERVIÇO DE
PROTEÇÃO AOS ÍNDIOS

The Indian Service, as established in 1910, has been generally
considered by Brazilian historians to be the personal creation of Presi-
dent Nilo Peçanha, Minister of Agriculture Rodolfo Miranda, and Lt.
Colonel (now Marshal of Brazil since his 90th birthday, May 5, 1955)
Cândido Rondon. It is certain that each of these leaders played an essen-
tial part in its establishment. Some credit, however, must be given to
two less prominent figures whose off-stage labors contributed signifi-
cantly to the overall plan. The unsung efforts of those men, Domingos
Sérgio de Carvalho and Mário Barbosa Carneiro, are treated here to-
gether with the actions of the major characters, in the sequence of events
that led to the formal inauguration of the Service on September 7, 1910.

Domingos Sérgio de Carvalho, director of the anthropology section
of the Museu Nacional and author of the protest signed by its staff against
the von Lhôring extermination statement, was named technical consultant
to the Minister of Agriculture in late 1909. In that capacity he is believed,
by at least one writer, to have been the one who conceived the idea of a

---

1 Paulo Carneiro, "Conferencia sob o título 'A epopeia da missão
Rondon'," 19 de abril, o dia do índio: As comemorações realizadas em
1944 e 1945 (Rio de Janeiro, 1945), I, 151.
government-sponsored, nation-wide service of Indian instruction under the direction of Cândido Rondon. Early in 1910, according to Paulo Carneiro, he took that idea to his friend (Paulo's father), Mário Barbosa Carneiro, who was at that time Disbursing Agent (Diretor Geral da Contabilidade) in the Ministério da Agricultura.

Mário Carneiro had good reason to favor Carvalho's idea of an Indian Service under Rondon's direction. He, like the telegraphic chief, was a strong Positivist. He knew and respected Rondon, admired his humanitarian methods of pacifying hostile tribes, and was so devoted to him that he had requested him to serve as the godfather of his son, Paulo.² Carneiro persuaded Carvalho that the Service he contemplated should be primarily protective rather than instructive, and that it should avoid all forms of religious indoctrination. Together they presented the idea to their chief, Rodolfo Miranda. At his request, they worded a brief telegram addressed to Rondon concerning the projected Service, which Miranda signed and dispatched sometime prior to the telegraphic chief's visit to the Ministério da Agricultura on February 25. That first contact with Rondon, as well as all the later negotiations designed to free him from his army duties outside of Rio and entice him to accept the direction of the contemplated Indian Service, were closely watched and warmly supported by President Nilo Peçanha. As a close friend of the President,

² Information supplied by Paulo Carneiro in conversation with Professor Lewis Hanke of the University of Texas, contained in a letter to the author from the latter, September 7, 1954.
who was responsible for his appointment to the Ministério da Agricultura, Mário Carneiro worked unceasingly during the early months of 1910 to speed arrangements for the Indian Service. He acted largely in a liaison capacity between Pêcanha, Miranda, Rondon, and the many individuals and societies that were urging the government forward on its plan for a national Indian Service.

Throughout the month of May, the detailed regulations of the Indian Service were taking form under the supervision of the Minister of Agriculture and the watchful eye of Cândido Rondon. President Nilo Pêcanha's message to Congress of May 3, 1910, spoke of the future Service as one of several projects under study that would soon be the object of government action. A notice in the Jornal do Comércio ten days later divulged the further information that the Service would be composed of two distinct sections: one designed to aid and protect the Indians, and the other charged with the task of bettering the living conditions of the so-called "national workers" - Brazil's illiterate, impoverished, and widely dispersed Negro and mestizo farm laborers that had been wandering over the country since the days of emancipation.

The general outline of the draft regulation of the Indian Service was probably completed by the middle of May. A press release of May 16 informed the public that the Minister of Agriculture, in his next dispatch

---


4 Jornal do Comércio, May 13, 1910, p. 4, col. 5.
to the President, would submit for his consideration a "general plan of organization of the 'Serviço de Protecção aos Índigenas e Localização de Trabalhadores Nacionaes'. There is some doubt, however, as to whether that plan reached the President before May 28, when Miranda is known to have had a conference with Pecanha on the subject of the "creation of an agency within the Ministério da Agricultura whose purpose it would be to instruct the Indians."

Presidential approval. The last detailed measures of the proposed Indian Service were drawn up during the first two weeks of June. At the same time, a formal statement by Rodolfo Miranda of the reasons that had led him to request such an agency was prepared, and both the draft regulation and the "Statement of Motives" (Exposição de Motivos) were submitted to the President for his signature on June 16, 1910.

Miranda's "Statement of Motives" began with an explanation of how in Brazil, since early colonial times, selfish private interests, supported often by local government officials, had neutralized all humanitarian efforts of Church and Crown to protect the natives against an insatiable hunger for new land and slave labor. The cruel exploitation and massacre of the Indians was not just an historical phenomenon, Miranda continued. Injustices and cruel warfare against the natives were as remorseless in

6 Gazeta Oficial (Mato Grosso), May 31, 1910, p. 3, col. 2.
7 Jornal do Comércio, June 16, 1910, p. 4, col. 5.
the twentieth century under the Republic as during the most violent colonial days.

The "Statement of Motives" informed the President that the measures set forth in the draft regulation of the Indian Service were designed primarily to protect the Indian against all forms of aggression and injustice - a formidable task that had never been effectively handled in Brazil, either by government decree or by missionary supervision.

Miranda assured the President that the procedures of Indian treatment set forth in the draft regulation he was submitting for approval were not only supported by the writings of Brazil's most prominent jurists and scholars, but also sanctioned in large measure by the experience of other countries of the Western Hemisphere. He called Paçanha's attention to North America's time-honored practice of treating its native tribes as independent nations and as lawful owners of the territories they inhabited. He spoke of George Washington's message to Congress in 1795 in which he denounced the injustice done to the Indians by colonists - especially by those of Georgia and other southern states. Miranda laid before the President the action taken by the American Congress in that year (1795), which authorized the chief executive to provide certain Indian tribes with working utensils, domestic animals, and the instruction needed to use those gifts efficiently. He supplied statistics to show the cost to the United States government of purchasing Indian-inhabited lands - eighty-five million dollars prior to 1840 and almost two and a half million in the year 1850. He noted the current five million dollar annual budget of the United
States Bureau of Indian Affairs, and informed President Peçanha that the American program of aid to its Indians was a nation-wide operation requiring a staff of twenty-three hundred persons, including teachers for more than two hundred and fifty Indian schools.

Miranda closed his appeal for presidential approval of the draft regulation he was presenting with a brief reference to government legislation in behalf of the natives in Chile and Argentina. The Chilean Constitution, he informed Peçanha, specifically granted the Indians rights and responsibilities equal to those of the other citizens of the Republic. In addition, he said, efforts had been made there to gather the natives into villages or reservations. A similar project was in operation in Argentina, he continued, entrusted largely to religious organizations under government supervision.

Miranda's brief review of government action in behalf of the natives of North America, and his one-sentence allusion to a similar interest in the Indian on the part of the federal authorities of Chile and Argentina, were more inspirational than informative. The inference was clear: if other nations of the Western Hemisphere had successfully handled their Indian problems through government intervention, then Brazil, in its urgent need for peace between its hostile tribes and advance agents of the white man's westward expansion, should follow their example. Miranda closed his well-founded (and successful) appeal for presidential approval of the proposed Indian Service by stating, in words that harked back to September, 1908, and the beginnings of the Indian
debate, that

Such examples as those [of the United States, Chile, and Argentina] call for imitation by Brazil, [for indeed, our nation] cannot continue to exclude the aborigines from its consideration and thereby go on justifying the accusation made in the International Congress of Americanists in Vienna [by Alberto Frič] that Brazil permits the enslavement of its primitive peoples and even encourages their extermination. 8

The Indian Service now in effect in Brazil dates from June 20, 1910, when President Nilo Peçanha issued an executive decree, Decreto N.º 8,072, which approved the draft regulation submitted by the Minister of Agriculture and officially created the Serviço de Proteção aos Índios e Localização de Trabalhadores Nacionaes. 9

The "Regulation" of the Indian Service (it ceased to be a draft regulation when it became law on June 20, 1910) will be reviewed here in some detail. Methods for educating and protecting the Indians will receive special attention. Less significant aspects, such as the salary scale of its personnel and the division of responsibility among its several officers, will not be treated so fully. The procedures set forth in the Regulation for the settling of the trabalhadores nacionaes [hereafter referred to as the national workers] in agricultural centers with the aid of government loans, improved breeds of domestic

---

8 Jornal do Comércio, June 22, 1910, p. 3, cols. 3-4. Also, Homenagem a José Bonifácio no 88º aniversario da independência do Brazil: Inauguração do Serviço de Proteção aos Índios e Localização de Trabalhadores Nacionaes (Rio de Janeiro, 1910), pp. 79-100.

9 Decreto N.º 8,072 and the draft regulation which it authorized may be found in either of the following sources: Homenagem a José Bonifácio, pp. 79-100, or the Collecção das leis da República dos Estados Unidos do Brazil de 1910 (Rio de Janeiro, 1914), Vol. I, Part II, pp. 743-958.
animals, and educational projects, will be briefly mentioned because that program was supervised by the same overall directorate and implemented by many of the same personnel who were looking after the interests of the Indians.

Article one of the Regulation stated briefly that the dual purpose of the Indian Service was 1) to render assistance to Brazil's Indians, whether they dwelt in villages, were congregated in tribes, wandered in the nomadic state, or were settled amid civilized surroundings, and 2) to establish population centers for properly qualified national workers on fertile lands, located within easy reach of markets for their agricultural produce.

Article two is for us the most important section of the Regulation. It specified, in seventeen clauses, the procedures to be followed by the new agency in its Indian-aid program. The plan of action outlined in those seventeen clauses can be reduced to a four-point program designed to increase the white man's knowledge of the Indians, to protect the natives' rights to the land they inhabited and needed for their way of life, to provide them with basic educational and material benefits, and to safeguard them from exploitation and massacre.

The part of the program designed to increase Brazil's knowledge of its native inhabitants was, according to Clause seventeen, to be accomplished through a careful study of their living conditions and their culture, as well as by a methodical investigation and statistical report on their origins, languages, individual ages, and most common occupations.
Clauses two, twelve, and thirteen referred to the protection of Indian land rights. According to the first of these, the Indian Service would uphold the natives' claims of ownership to all territories they currently inhabited. That would be done with the cooperation of local authorities wherever possible. Clause twelve called for the return of lands recently taken from the Indians by unlawful means. Whenever that form of justice was impossible or unfeasible, and dispossessed Indians needed more or better land than what remained to them, Clause thirteen provided for their settlement at government expense on uninhabited and more desirable land, subject to the acquiescence of the tribal chiefs involved. It will be recalled that these three measures concerning Indian land ownership were strongly recommended by Cândido Rondon in his March 19 letter of acceptance of the directorship of the future Indian service.

The Indians' material needs became the direct concern of the Indian Service under Clauses ten and fourteen. By the wording of the former, the Service was charged with the task of supplying the natives with whatever they needed for the efficient performance of their various occupations. Clause fourteen was equally comprehensive. It stipulated that the Indians would be furnished with any musical instruments they desired, with working tools, farming utensils, and machinery that might add to the productiveness of their endeavors, with any domestic animals that would be useful to them, and, finally, with whatever other material aid they might require. These generous provisions were altered in
later years when it became apparent that too much gratuitous aid spoiled
the natives and made them overly dependent upon outside help.

The program of educational benefits outlined in Clauses eleven,
fifteen, and sixteen, like the provisions for material aid, offered the
Indians only what they desired and could use effectively. Under Clause
eleven the personnel of the Service were directed to encourage whole-
heartedly every effort made by the natives to improve their living con-
ditions. That included attempts to awaken the Indians' desire to con-
struct more livable habitation and to take an interest in learning more
advanced agricultural and industrial practices that would make less ar-
duous and more productive those activities in which they had already
demonstrated special aptitudes and interests. One practical form of in-
struction, treated under Clause fifteen, was that involved in the intro-
duction of the cattle-breeding industry into Indian territories where con-
ditions permitted. Clause sixteen covered the subject of formal educa-
tion. It did not specify who the teachers were to be or whether they would
be permitted to introduce religious instruction into their classrooms.
It stipulated simply that the Indian Service would provide voluntary "in-
strução primaria e profissional" to Indian children whose parents agreed
to such a program.

The remaining eight clauses of Article two were concerned with
the primary task confronting the Service; namely, the protection of the
Indians from exploitation and massacre. Clauses one, five, and nine re-
ferred to the legal aid that must be supplied by the Indian Service to protect
the natives' rights before the law. The first clause made it the Service's responsibility to safeguard those rights by bringing to bear on every form of injustice towards the Indians whatever present or future laws applied to the case. Clause five directed the Service to seek the punishment of crimes committed against the Indians. Clause nine designated the Service's field inspectors as legal consultants to the natives, and directed them, in that capacity, to obtain whatever legal aid their charges needed in appearances before local authorities and justices of the peace.

The protection offered under Clause four was of a different sort. It concerned the defense of the natives' culture - their tribal organization, their independence, their customs and institutions. These were not to be altered without great care and the most gentle coercion, and never without continual consultation with the Indian chiefs concerned.

The prevention of cruel or discriminatory treatment of the natives became the responsibility of the Indian Service under Clauses six and seven. According to the terms of the former clause, field representatives would observe and report on the manner in which the Indian was treated in private establishments, in immigrant settlements, and in villages under missionary or local government supervision. Clause seven directed the agents to guard against injustice in contracts made for native labor and to forestall any attempts to force an Indian to render services without just compensation.

The most difficult task assigned to the personnel of the Indian Service was that of bringing peace to regions where inter-tribal warfare or
conflict between the Indian and the white man had bred distrust and hatred and resulted in the decimation of large numbers of the native inhabitants. According to Clause three, the agents of the Service were authorized to adopt whatever means seemed practicable to put an end to the invasion of Indian territory and, at the same time, to prevent further Indian raids against the isolated homes and settlements of innocent colonists. Clause eight stipulated that the Service's thirteen inspectores (inspectors or overseers - one for each of twelve states and the territory of Acre) should maintain close relations between the Indian tribes of their regions and the central office in Rio. It was to be their personal responsibility to help the Indians to keep order and peace amongst themselves and neighboring tribes.

Under the terms of Articles three through nine, which constituted the next section (Chapter II) of the Regulation, the federal government became the acknowledged protector of Indian land rights. Article three provided that the national government, whenever necessary, would work through the Ministério da Agricultura with state and county governors to establish and uphold the natives' titles to territories currently inhabited by them or conceded to them in the past by lawfully recognized land grants. Furthermore, the same contact between national and local governments would be used to expedite state donations of uninhabited areas needed by the Service for Indian reservations, or for the settlement of the national workers.

Articles four and five stated that the federal government, through
the Ministério da Agricultura, would order a careful survey and demar-
cation of those lands ceded by the states, and would require that the ori-
ginal survey charts and notes be preserved in the archives of the Indian
Service. To avoid later misunderstandings, duplicates of those docu-
ments would be kept in both state and county archives. Articles six
through eight made it unlawful for the Indians to lease or transfer into
other hands any of the land provided for them by the federal government.
Contracts made by the natives that decreased the value of their newly
acquired property or jeopardized their title to it would, according to
Article eight, be unrecognized by law. Under Article nine, the national
government was committed to uphold the Indians' full ownership of the
land they currently inhabited in the federal territories of Brazil.

Chapter III, containing Articles ten through thirteen, provided
for the Indians who were settled in permanent villages and were desirous
of remaining there. Their lands, too, were to be carefully surveyed
and their titles to ownership fully protected. Under special circum-
stances, houses were to be built for them and roads were to be constructed
between their villages and the nearest marketing centers to enable them
to sell their produce more readily. Moreover, if their property were
situated in a populous area, they were to be provided with cultivable land
conveniently located beyond the residential clearing.

Chapter IV was concerned with the plight of Brazil's nomadic
Indians who, according to Article fourteen, were to be gently persuaded
to settle down, presumably on uninhabited land provided by the federal
government. Article fourteen further stipulated that the Indians who dwelt in close contact with civilized Brazilians would also receive the Service's full measure of care and assistance.

Chapter V deserves special attention. It described in Articles fifteen through twenty-one, the manner in which the former aldeia mentos (permanently-established Indian villages supervised in the past by local government authorities or by religious organizations) were to be renamed "Povoações Indígenas" and placed under the overall jurisdiction of the national government. Under Article fifteen, these Povoações Indígenas [referred to hereafter as "Indian Communities"] were entitled to the full benefits of the Service's educational program. Again it was emphasized that no coercion would be used, other than gentle reasoning, to entice the natives to take advantage of the primary school courses, the music lessons, the workshops, the farm tools and machinery, and the experimental agricultural projects available for their use and instruction. Article sixteen provided for special grounds and facilities devoted to bee-keeping, silkworm culture, domestic animal breeding, and other agricultural industries. Under the terms of Article seventeen, the inhabitants of each "Indian Community" were to receive the same material assistance granted by the federal government to the more widely scattered tribes. That aid was to include medical treatment and, if needed, food supplies during the first six months of residence in the community.

According to Article eighteen, the Ministério da Agricultura would offer prizes to the personnel of the Service who acquired a fluent command
of the Indian "lingua geral" (Tupi-Guarani language systematized by the Jesuit padres and spoken throughout Brazil in early colonial days) and of the dialects spoken in their appointed precincts.

Articles nineteen and twenty covered the controversial issue of the transfer to the federal government of control over the former aldeiamentos. They are translated here to show the reader how little was said and how much implied by the diplomatic but vague wording of this section of the Regulation.

Art. 19. The federal government is authorized to accept the transfer to its jurisdiction of the aldeiamentos or whatever institutions devoted to Indian education are maintained by state or municipal governments, or by associations [presumably religious or welfare], as soon as those installations and the land they occupy are ceded to it.

Art. 20. Such aldeiamentos or institutions will then become subject to the statutes of this Regulation that apply to similar [Indian communities] created by the federal government.

It should be noted that the Regulation did not specify here, or in its later tabulation of the personnel of the Service, whether the schools that were to become government property by the cession of the lands on which they were constructed would continue to use the same teachers, missionary or otherwise, or whether they would replace them with appointees of the Indian Service.

In practice during the following years, the Service did not deprive the former teachers of their positions unless they insisted on continuing a form of obligatory instruction or theological indoctrination, Catholic

---

10 Appendix, p. 311.
or Protestant, that brought complaints from their native charges. The primary-grade teachers and special instructors of industrial arts and agricultural techniques were appointed by the Minister of Agriculture on the recommendation of the Service's director. They were not considered part of the regular or permanent staff and their appointments were effective only as long as there existed a need for their special services. In most part, they supplemented, rather than displaced, the dedicated government, church, or independent workers who were active among the Indians as educators, caretakers, and even proselytizers.

Chapter V, with its regulations governing the "Indian Communities" closed with Article twenty-one's brief but important assurance that the Indians would not be forced to work and that whatever they produced would be their own to consume, barter, or sell as they pleased.

---

11 Luis Hildebrando de Barros Horta Barbosa wrote in 1944: "For thirty-four years in our country, this Service has been aiding and protecting the Indians without obstructing or embarrassing the catechizing efforts of the Protestants, Catholic priests, or missionaries of other religious faiths." Semário do Índio: 19 a 26 de abril de 1944 (Rio de Janeiro, 1944), p. 15. A similar statement of the Service's cooperation with missionaries working among the Indians came from the pen of a Catholic padre, Alfredo Pinto Damaso, in his study: O Serviço de Proteção aos Índios e a tribu dos Caríjós no sertão de Pernambuco (publisher and date unknown). A reference to this source in Agnol F. de Macedo and Eduardo P. C. de Vasconcellos, O índio brasileiro (Rio de Janeiro, 1935), pp. 188-192, attributes to Father Damaso the statement that the Indian Service was not in itself a proselytizing agent for Positivist teachings nor was it an obstruction to Catholic activities among the natives. Damaso was further said to believe that the Service was serving its purpose well, and that there was no reason why it and the Catholic missionaries could not work together in friendly relations in the cause of the Indians.
The second section of the Regulation, Articles twenty-two through forty-eight, regulated the organization of Centros Agrícolas [referred to hereafter as "Agricultural Centers"] intended to attract large numbers of Brazil’s impoverished mestiço and Negro farm laborers, many of whom had never settled on land of their own since their emancipation in 1888. Briefly stated, the "Agricultural Centers" offered to these so-called "national workers" most of the benefits granted to the natives in the "Indian Communities." The "Centers" differed from the "Indian Communities" mainly in the limitations imposed on the national workers. To qualify for admittance to an "Agricultural Center," the applicant had to be an able and willing farm-laborer between the ages of twenty-one and sixty (unmarried or, preferably, accompanied by a family), and free from any kind of criminal record. He could be expelled from the "Center" for misconduct or for failure to farm his land during a three-month period. Finally, unlike the occupant of the "Indian Community," he was expected to either buy his house and lot of sixty to one hundred and twenty acres outright or finance it before the close of six years of occupancy.

Although the Serviço de Proteção aos Índios was divorced after 1931 from the program of Localização de Trabalhadores Nacionais, it cannot be handled separately in this study, not only because of the overlapping of personnel between the two services, but also because of the repercussions that the development of the "Agricultural Centers" had on Indian relations. Many of the national workers who settled in those centers after 1910 had, prior to that time, been a source of irritation to the
Indians on whose hunting grounds they had built their temporary shacks and had briefly cultivated patches of burned-over woodlands that were not their own. The "Agricultural Centers" established by the Service (one or two in each of a majority of the states) drew many of these potential trouble-makers out of Indian territories onto uninhabited but fertile and well-located farm lands.

Primary-grade schools, offering day and evening classes, together with all forms of instruction in agricultural techniques and the mechanical arts, were, according to Article thirty-one, open to the children of workers outside the "Agricultural Centers." There was no stipulation in the Regulation that withheld those facilities from Indian children who dwelt in proximity to the "Centers." Furthermore, there was a financial connection between the dual programs of the Indian Service that prevented a completely separate treatment of either one of them. The terms of the Regulation made it clear that the government would derive no financial return on its costly program of Indian assistance. All the benefits of land survey, title recording, medical care, law counselling, and education plus the provision of new land, houses, schools, working tools and machinery, seeds and domestic animals were to be provided for the Indians at government expense. On the other hand, whatever the natives produced was their own to dispose of as they wished. That financial drain on the Service's treasury was partially offset by the income derived from the sale of land to the national workers. Though the cost of lots in the "Agricultural Centers" was slight, the funds received by
the federal government through this means were almost one hundred
percent profit because the lands utilized by the "Centers" were almost
all donated rather than sold to the national government.

The third and last section of the Regulation concerned the administra-
tion of the Indian Service. Here was to be seen the close relationship
between the two programs; the one designed to aid and protect the Indians,
the other devoted to the welfare of the national workers. Both were sub-
ordinate to a directoria geral (general directorate), operating as an agency
of the Ministério da Agricultura and located permanently in Rio de Janeiro.
This directorate was composed of three men - a director-in-chief (Cândido
Rondon in 1910), a secretary (Luís Bueno Horta Barbosa of the Centro de
Ciências), and one other administrative officer. The director-in-chief
was responsible solely and directly to the Minister of Agriculture.

Two sub-directorates were created by the Regulation. The first
was composed of a sub-director with two assistentes, an agronomist, an
engineering draftsman with one assistant, and a general secretary. This
first sub-directorate was responsible for the demarcation of Indian-
inhabited lands, the selection of localities for both the "Agricultural
Centers" and the new "Indian Communities," the survey and division of
rural lots for the national workers, the building of houses and the direction
of sanitation measures in the "Centers" and "Communities," and the con-
struction or repair of roads between these settlements and railroad stations,
ocean or river ports, and neighboring population centers. The labors of
the first sub-directorate were therefore technical in nature, required a
personnel of competently trained technicians, and involved similar duties and responsibilities among both the Indians and the national workers. These seven administrative officers, like those of the second sub-directorate, were permanently located in the central offices of the Indian Service in Rio de Janeiro.

The second sub-directorate, composed of a sub-director and six assistants, was charged with the administrative details of installing and operating the "Agricultural Centers," the "Indian Communities," and the many services of pacification and protection of Brazil's scattered Indian tribes. The sub-director of this second unit, like that of the first, was solely and directly responsible to the Service's director-in-chief.

The field personnel of the Indian Service were distributed by the Regulation among twelve states and the territory of Acre. Each of those districts: Acre, Amazonas, Pará, Maranhão, Baía, Espírito Santo, São Paulo, Paraná, Santa Catarina, Rio Grande do Sul, Minas Gerais, Goiás, and Mato Grosso was assigned a central office or control station known as an Inspeção. These regional stations were each to be directed by an Inspector (overseer or inspector) whose duties were to be allotted by the director-in-chief at a later date. Each inspector was to be provided with a secretary, and in Acre and the states that contained especially large Indian populations - Amazonas, Pará, Mato Grosso and Goiás - each was granted the further aid of two adjutants. The Regulation could not specify the number of "Indian Communities" and "Agricultural Centers" that would be installed in the coming years, but it provided for the assignment
of three staff members to each of them. The "Indian Communities" were each to be supervised by a director, an assistant director, and a secretary. Each "Agricultural Center" was to be administered by a director, a cultural officer, and a secretary.

In addition to the personnel of these settlements of Indians and national workers and the other fifty-seven members of the permanent operating staff who were divided among the regional stations and the central office in Rio, plans were made in the Regulation for the procurement of the temporary services of medical doctors, druggists, primary-grade teachers, workshop directors, land surveyors, carpenters and other skilled and non-skilled workers.

Inauguration of the Indian Service. Such were the regulations of the Servico de Proteção aos Indios e Localização dos Trabalhadores Nacionaes as submitted by Minister of Agriculture Rodolfo Miranda to President Nilo Peçanha on June 16, 1910, and approved four days later by Executive Decree N.º 8,072. The Service did not, however, begin operations immediately. Two and one half months were to pass before the formal inauguration ceremony. In the intervening period, both Miranda and Rondon were actively engaged in the task of selecting the Service's regular staff and in procuring final assurances of support from state governors and from institutions whose cooperation was deemed especially desirable.

The first notice that Many Brazilians had of the presidential approval of the Regulation of the Indian Service came on June 24 when the Jornal do Comércio printed a telegram in which Rodolfo Miranda informed
several state governors of the presidential decree. Briefly explaining the purpose of the new agency, the Minister of Agriculture added:

I am confident that your government will recognize its obligations and grant its valuable and necessary cooperation to the plans outlined in the above-mentioned regulation. . . . 12

The importance that the Minister of Agriculture attached to the active support of the newly-created Indian Service by the more powerful of Brazil's learned societies is apparent in his letter of July 4 to the Instituto Histórico e Geográfico de São Paulo. Although he had already thanked the Instituto indirectly, in letters to Ludgero de Castro and Dinamérico Rangel, for its approval of the controversial Oliveira motion of May 20 that had praised his efforts in behalf of the Indians, Miranda now, in July, thanked the Instituto personally in an official letter read before that body by its secretary in the session of July 20. 13 Referring to the President's approval of the Regulation of the Indian Service, he stated that the successful realization of the plans set forth in that document would require the cooperation of all institutions that took an active interest in the nation's current affairs.

The selection of the principal officers was left almost entirely in the hands of the director-in-chief. One of the conditions under which Rendez had originally agreed to direct the Service was that he might have


the freedom to choose the men who would work closely with him and, especially, the personnel who would represent him in the field in the hazardous and critical task of winning the friendship and cooperation of Brazil's remaining tribes. From among his trusted friends and the junior officers of his past telegraphic command, Rondon requested that Miranda obtain through President Pêcanha, if necessary, clearance from army duty and appointment to the Indian Service for Nicolau Horta Barbosa, Manoel Rabelo, Cândido de Oliveira Sobrinho, Antonio Estigarríbía, Pedro Trompowski Toulois, Francisco Escobar de Araujo, Melo Nunes, Alberto Portela, Pedro Ribeiro Dantas, and others.

Not until August 25 did Rondon himself receive his presidential appointment to the post of director-in-chief. With the receipt of that appointment and the completion of a form-letter announcing the activation of the Indian Service under Rondon's direction, all was in readiness for the inaugural ceremony. This announcement of the Service's inauguration, like Miranda's telegram of late June addressed to the state presidents, expressed the hope that the government could count upon the recipient for the active cooperation and support needed by the personnel of the Indian Service in their initial efforts to aid and protect the nation's less fortunate citizens.

---

14 One of those form-letters may be found in the archives of the Museu Nacional (Quinta da Boa Vista), Pasta 54, Documento no. 146. The letter was dated September 8, 1910. Only the addressee (in this case, Cidadão Director do Museu Nacional), and Rondon's signature were not printed in advance.
The day selected for the formal inauguration of the Serviço de Proteção aos Índios e Localização de Trabalhadores Nacionaes was the eighty-ninth anniversary of Brazil’s independence from Portuguese rule. The choice of September 7 was a means of paying homage to the Patriarch of Independence, José Bonifácio, who in 1823 had made it clear in his now famous “Apontamentos”¹⁵ that he could not envision an independent Brazil composed of free white men and enslaved Negroes and Indians.

The ceremony was not intended to be a public affair and was therefore not widely heralded. News reporters covered the event for five Rio dailies, but the attendance (more than sixty persons) was otherwise limited to administrative officers of the Ministério da Agricultura and persons who had either taken a special interest in the creation of the Service or who were assigned to future roles in its operation. Among them were two or three relatives of the Minister of Agriculture, including his father, Luís da Rocha Miranda, Barão do Bananal. Also present were Domingos Sergio de Carvalho and Mário Barbosa Carneiro, the two figures who were most influential behind the scenes in the earliest developments of the Service under the direction of Cândido Rondon.¹⁶

Rodolfo Miranda opened the ceremony with a recapitulation of

¹⁵ José Bonifácio, “Apontamentos para a civilização dos índios bravos do imperio do Brazil” and “Representação à Assembléa Geral Constituinte e Legislativa do imperio do Brazil sobre a escravatura,” Homenagem à José Bonifácio, pp. 13-68.

¹⁶ See footnote 3, this chapter, and the information to which it applies.
the reasons that had led the government to establish the Indian Service.
followed by the choice of September 7 as the date of the inaugural ceremony, and then turned the meeting over to Cândido Rondon who asked his secretary, Luís Bueno Horta Barbosa, to read the formal "Acta da Instalação do Serviço de Proteção aos Indígenas e Localização de Trabalhadores Nacionais."

The "Acta da Instalação" (the minutes of the installation ceremony) was a previously prepared, general summary of the proceedings of the inaugural program. It announced the "instalação solene" of the Indian Service as approved by Decreto N.º 8.072 of June 20, 1910, and reviewed the Minister of Agriculture's reasons for choosing the seventh day of September as the date of activation of the new agency. Also, it announced that José Bonifácio's "Apontamentos" and "Representações" would be published together with the Minister of Agriculture's "Exposição de Motivos," the presidential Decreto N.º 8.072, and the "Acta Inaugural," in a commemorative volume (Homenagem a José Bonifácio) which would be widely distributed among the public institutions of the nation. By that means, the "Acta" read, Brazilians would become familiar with the debt of gratitude they owed to that eminent statesman and grand protector of the Indians, José Bonifácio, who would henceforth be the patron of the Indian Service.

At the close of the presentation of the "Acta," Cândido Rondon read a speech that summarized his personal motives for accepting command of the Indian Service. From the days of his youth in Mato Grosso,
he declared, the unfortunate plight of many of the nation's Indians had been known to him at first-hand. For many years past, he continued, he had felt a deep appreciation for the consecrated labors of Catholic missionaries such as Fathers Anchista, Nobrega, and Vieira. For the dedicated efforts of men of all faiths to aid and protect the Indians since the days of independence, and especially for the example set by José Bonifácio, Rondon claimed a similar debt of gratitude.

However, it was not, he explained, until his introduction (about 1890) to the Positivist philosophy and his close study of the sociological concepts of Auguste Comte that he had fully appreciated the values of the fetishistic civilizations. Only then, he said, had he recognized the extent of his duty to his nation's aborigines. With the aid of this new insight, Rondon explained, and the generous assistance of R. Teixeira Mendes' wise counsel through the years, he had formulated a system to win the trust and friendship of hostile Indians. He assured his listeners that the methods he had used since 1890 to pacify the Indians of his own state of Mato Grosso - the gifts of clothing, knives, and ornaments, the playing of music, the open display of friendship, and the absolute refusal to wound or kill an Indian even in self defense - had always been crowned with results that were, in his words, "swift, sure, and lasting".  

Before closing his address, Rondon made it clear that the most difficult part of the task now incumbent on the Indian Service, namely

that of pacifying hostile tribes and ending the discord and misunderstanding between the white man and the Indian, should not be considered an experiment to be watched with hopes and fears. Rather it should be recognized for what it was, a nationwide application of policies and techniques that had already proved their worth by the pacification of some of Brazil's most primitive and intractable Indians. Moreover, Rondon explained, not only were the Service's policies proved in action but so was its personnel, who had used the same suggested techniques successfully for years in their contact with the tribes that had first opposed and later aided their efforts in telegraph-line construction in northwestern Mato Grosso.

The last speaker on the agenda of the inaugural ceremony was Congressman José Bonifácio, a descendant and namesake of the Patriarch of Independence. Bonifácio was to champion the interests of the Indian Service in later years. On this date, September 7, 1910, he expressed his gratitude to the Minister of Agriculture for the privilege of taking part in the founding exercises of a government service designed to fulfill the cherished dreams of his distinguished ancestor.

Attributing to George Washington the sowing of the first seeds of Indian aid and protection in the United States of America, the speaker declared that it was the "Washington of Brazil," José Bonifácio de Andrada e Silva, who had done a similar service for his own country. Unfortunately, the seeds had been long in germinating. Though attempts had been made by the governing authorities of the Empire to legislate effective aid for
the Indians, and although some native tribes had benefited from the constant labors of devoted missionaries working amongst them, especially the Salesians in Mato Grosso under the direction of Padre Malan, nevertheless the nation's Indian population had suffered, the speaker declared, from a long period of profound governmental indifference that had lasted well into the period of the Republic.

Only now, the speaker continued, after eighty-nine years of national independence and twenty years of a republican form of government, had the nation's leaders, under the initiative of Rodolfo Miranda, faced the responsibility of systematically protecting the Indians and caring for the national workers. If the present administration had not already performed other outstanding services, Bonifácio asserted, the decree of June 20 would have sufficed to recommend the names of the President of the Republic and the Minister of Agriculture to the grateful memory of their countrymen.

With the signing of the "Acta Inaugural" by those present, the ceremony was ended and the Serviço de Proteção aos Índios e Localização de Trabalhadores Nacionaes was officially established.
CHAPTER XI

CONCLUSION

The Indian Service established in Brazil in 1910 is still in effect today. The fact that it has weathered several transfers from the jurisdiction of one federal ministry to another, survived a brief stage of inactivity in the revolutionary period of 1930-1931, withstood several campaigns of adverse criticism, and kept stubbornly to the job of aiding and protecting the Indians despite long periods of inadequate financial support, attests to the genuine and lasting need for its services, as well as to the steadfast spirit of the men and women who have devoted themselves to its humanitarian labors. Though many reasons have been presented in this study for the creation of the Service in 1910, none are more valid than the same two factors that account for its existence today - the vital need for such an agency and the high quality of the men who labored in its behalf.

An effort has been made in the present study to acquaint the reader with the seriousness of the post-Empire clash between the generally unscrupulous agents of the white man's rapidly-expanding civilization and the Indian tribes that resisted that merciless expansion. Attention has been directed to several examples of deep penetration of the interior after 1889 and to some of the most violent forms of invasion and occupation of Indian territory. It has been shown that those who argued in 1908-1910
for a government Indian Service, or for increased financial support by the federal government of Catholic missionary work among the Indians, were well-aware of the pressing need for effective mediation between the opposing forces. Many of their accounts of Indian extermination, together with their less-frequent references to the massacre of colonists, rubber gatherers, railroad workers, and others have been presented in this study.

The shift of emphasis in the debate after mid-1909 from the problem of Indian extermination to the equally controversial issue of church versus government supervision of Indian instruction may have led the reader to the mistaken impression that only in the early stage of the debate were the arguments for government intervention in Indian affairs based on the desire to end the bitter feud between the natives and those who were attempting to overrun their lands. Such was not the case. Both Cândido Rondon and Rodolfo Miranda, latecomers to the debate but the two men most responsible for the creation of the Indian Service, clearly recognized the grave implications of the warfare that was blocking the nation's communication and transportation development, disrupting its military strategy, costing the lives of mounting numbers of its citizens, and threatening the hostile tribes with ultimate extinction.

The influence of this Indian-white conflict on the creation of the Indian Service in 1910 can be seen in the following quotations from men who have viewed the matter in retrospect. From the introductory pages of Miranda's November 8, 1910 ministerial report to the President comes
the following significant statement:

The recent penetration of the most distant forests by telegraph and railroad lines has once again brought the Indian face to face with civilization and its best interests.

The continuance of these communication services and the safety of those who construct and maintain them would, in itself, make imperative the discovery of a solution to the traditional dispute over the destiny of the scattered remnants of the primitive inhabitants of [our land].

A recent reminiscence of Miranda's brother-in-law, Jonas Pompeia, seems to substantiate the theory that Rodolfo Miranda's resolve to establish a government Indian Service was strongly motivated by the current crisis in Indian-white relations. In a letter dated September 24, 1954, addressed to his niece, Nair Miranda Pirajá, he described a conversation that had taken place between her father, Rodolfo Miranda, and her grandfather, the Baron of Bananal. In that conversation, which occurred shortly after Miranda took the post of Minister of Agriculture in late 1909, the Baron expressed deep concern over the waste of life among both the Indians and the white men, attendant upon the construction of railroads and the opening of new coffee lands. Pompeia's account of the conversation, as he remembers it today, continued in these words:

Faced by this inhumane and distressing situation, the Baron of Bananal, a tenderhearted man, felt that the government ought to organize a Service designed to halt [such] barbarous extermination. It was thus [through the influence of this talk] that my brother-in-law resolved to organize and submit to President

---

Nilo Peçanha, a plan that later became the present-day "Serviço de Proteção aos Indios e Localização dos Trabalhadores Nacionaes."²

Two years ago, when the Indian Service published an extensive description of its present administrative organization and of its current labors in behalf of the Indians, it inserted a five-page historical survey of the past forty-two years of its operation. The survey opened with a summary of the most bitter conflicts between Indians and white men in the year or two preceding the creation of the Indian Service. It then closed that account with these significant remarks:

This was the situation in which the forest Indian found himself, hunted like a beast throughout the country and even to the portals of the most civilized areas.

Even more unfortunate was the plight of the semi-civilized Indians, incapable of defending themselves from the oppression of those who enslaved them, who robbed them of their lands, made prostitutes of their wives and daughters, and scattered them as if they were Pariahs. Under these conditions, thousands of Indians throughout most of the states of the Union were slowly wasting away.

These were the conditions that motivated the creation of the Serviço de Proteção aos Indios, this was the problem that demanded a solution.³

Although there existed in 1910 an almost unprecedented need for a powerful voice of mediation between the desires and best interests of the native races, on the one hand, and of the white invaders, on the other, that need alone does not explain the birth of the Indian Service in the year 1910, rather than in an earlier or later decade. The conflict between

---

² Information in a letter to Nair Miranda Pirajá from Jonas Pompeia, September 24, 1954, now in the possession of the author.

Indian and white man had already reached alarming proportions by 1903, when railroad construction began to meet with determined opposition.

The fierce exploitation of Indian labor by rubber gatherers and the decimation of small Indian communities by the buxreiros of São Paulo and the southern states dated back to the early years of the Republic and beyond. The present study seems to indicate that certain timely events and a combination of forces worked together after September, 1908, to produce the Indian Service in 1910.

Among those causal forces was the concern on the part of many influential Brazilians over adverse publicity abroad regarding the government's indifference towards the rumored enslavement and extermination of its Indian population and, conversely, the massacre of Italian and German immigrants by the "savage tribes" of the southern states. Brazil's sensitivity to the opinions of European powers during the early years of this century needs no documentation. Through active participation in a series of international scientific congresses and peace agreements, and more specifically, through the brilliant statesmanship displayed abroad by Joaquim Nabuco, Baron Rio Branco, and Rui Barbosa, the young Republic built a reputation during the period of this study that she was loath to jeopardize through international criticism of anarchy and governmental indifference in her Indian affairs at home.

Alberto Fric's widely publicized accusations of Indian enslavement and massacre in southern Brazil, presented in September, 1908, at the Sixteenth Congress of Americanists, Vienna, Austria; Nelson.
Cuelho de Senna's sharp criticism of his government's criminal neglect of Indian affairs, submitted to the Fourth Latin American Scientific Congress, Santiago, Chile, in December, 1903; and the well-publicized recommendation by the First Brazilian Geographic Congress, September, 1909, that the government take effective action to protect the nation's remaining tribes from further injustice — each of these pronouncements prodded the nation's authorities to take the Indian problem more seriously, and prepared the country to accept Miranda's decision to place the Indians under the jurisdiction of a federal service of aid and protection. It will be recalled that Miranda, in his brief address at the formal inauguration of the Indian Service, referred to Alberto Frič's damaging testimony at the first of those congresses (the 1903 Americanist Congress in Vienna) and declared that the creation of the Indian Service had been imperative because only through positive action of that sort could Brazil take the sting out of the young scientist's accusations of government indifference towards Indian captivity and extermination.

On the basis of the present study, one cannot avoid the paradoxical conclusion that much credit for the development of the Indian Service in Brazil in 1910 belongs to Hermann von Ihering, whose aggressive championship of the welfare of the German colonists above that of the Indians provoked the long debate of 1906-1910. His apparent endorsement of Indian extermination, his repeated predictions of the Indians' irrevocable extinction, his cynical evaluations of the worthlessness of Indian labor, and his recommendations that the warring Indians be crushed and the
peaceful tribes be isolated from contact with the white man's civilization, so annoyed his adversaries that they labeled his opinions "foreign science," "German," and "non-Brazilian." In opposition to von lhering's statements, individuals and societies after September, 1908, began to refute ideas that many Brazilians, and some of their own number, had previously accepted with indifference or openly endorsed. Thus, by March or April of 1909, it was almost heresy in Brazil to talk of the survival of the fittest or speak of a unified Brazil that did not include the assimilated remnants of the native population. Throughout 1909 Brazilians argued in their leading newspapers and most influential learned societies for the measures that von lhering opposed; namely, the humane treatment of hostile Indians and the gradual assimilation of all Indians into the nation's economic and cultural pattern.

It has been seen how the growth of genuine sympathy for the Indian, encouraged by von lhering's unpopular scientific predictions and cynical arguments, almost buried his repeated requests for government protection of the colonists against Indian attack. It may be recalled that only once, in a minor clause of one of the sixty or more articles of the Regulation for the Indian Service, was there any mention of the need for preventing Indian raids outside the boundaries of their own territories.

It has been shown in this study how there developed in 1908-1910 among those debating the Indian problem, a willingness to admit that the Brazilians themselves, rather than the Indians, were to blame for the conflict between the native and white races. The idea that Brazil must
alone in some way for the manner in which it had stolen the Indians' lands and exploited their labor became a dominant theme of the Indian debate. When Campos Novaes ridiculed his fellow members of the Centro de Ciências for their sentimental idealism in thinking that the Indian could contribute substantially to the nation's labor force or culture, he was answered with the argument that the Indian deserved special care and protection regardless of whether he became a productive element in the national economy. It will be recalled that Miranda later voiced the same thought.

The sincerity of that humanitarian viewpoint is well demonstrated by the wording of the Regulation for the Indian Service. Nothing was to be sold to the Indians - everything given. All that the natives produced was to be entirely their own. There was to be no trade by the government of goods and know-how for services rendered. Although Brazil had much to gain from the pacification of hostile tribes that were blocking the expansion of rail and telegraph lines, and something to gain, indirectly, from the Indians' productive use of the soil, nevertheless, the emphasis was not on what the government would get out of an Indian-aid program, but rather what the Indian would gain from it. The aid and protection provided for the natives by the new Service were generally considered by its founders to be a small payment on the debt owed by Brazilians to the first and rightful owners of the land.

Attention has been given in the present study to the manner in which several of the most powerful learned societies of Rio de Janeiro
and the state of São Paulo took offense at von Thering's ideas on the subject of Indian extermination. The formal protests they drew up and publicized in answer to his provocative statements were influential in uniting these societies in the common bond of a renewed sympathy for the Indian and an active interest in his welfare. When these same societies, together with equally powerful organizations like the Igreja Positivista, the Museu Nacional, and the Grand Orient of Brazilian Masonry in São Paulo officially endorsed the Minister of Agriculture's plans to organize a government service of Indian aid and protection, it clearly indicated that the climate of opinion among the intellectual circles of the larger cultural centers of Brazil was favorable at last to a shift away from the traditional form of church, or church plus local government supervision of Indian affairs to a nation-wide, centrally directed, non-religious program under federal government responsibility.

The moralistic tone and humanitarian provisions of the Indian Service suggest the source from whence it came. The Service did not originate in the mind and will of the general public. To the author's knowledge, there were few public lectures on the subject, no significant participation in the Indian debate by the non-professional classes, and no public demonstrations in favor of, or in opposition to the idea of federal intervention in behalf of the Indians. Nor was the Service the product of parliamentary debate or political bargaining. It was not officially discussed in either legislative body (Senate or House of Deputies). Even without the active support of the learned societies, the national and state
museums, the Indian-welfare organizations, the Positivist movement, the Masonic orders, and the state presidents, it seems likely that the year 1910 would have seen the establishment of the Indian Service. The single, indispensable element in the overall contribution to the creation of the "Serviço de Proteção aos Índios" was the enthusiastic and untiring labors of a relatively small number of Brazilians who not only recognized the need for such an agency but who discovered, in the new plan for aiding the Indians, a cause that excited and challenged them - a humanitarian labor that inspired them to devote to it a generous measure of their time, their talents, and their lasting support.

The names of those individuals have appeared repeatedly in the course of this study. To review the contribution of almost any one of them to the movement that eventuated in the creation of the Indian Service would be to list a series of articles and pamphlets, a number of appearances in the debate of the Indian question in the sessions of their respective scientific and historical societies, active participation in the proceedings of national and international congresses where the Indian problem was discussed, and, finally, close contact, either personal or by correspondence, with the leaders of the movement for government intervention in Indian affairs. The reader of this study may recall the general contributions of R. Teixeira Mendes of the Igreja Positivista, Luis Bueno Horta Barbosa of the Centro de Ciências, Letras e Artes of Campinas, Leolinda Daltro of the Associação de Proteção e Auxílio aos Selvícolas do Brasil, Torres de Oliveira of the Instituto Histórico e Geográfico de São Paulo, Nelson
Cecilio de Senna, strong champion of the Indian in national and international congresses, and Domingos Sergio de Carvalho of the Museu Nacional and the Ministério da Agricultura.

It can be said with certainty that these leaders of the movement for government intervention in behalf of the Indians were almost religiously dedicated to the task of protecting the natives and gradually assimilating even the most primitive and hostile tribes into the nation's economic and cultural life. Their fight for Indian justice did not stop with the creation of the Indian Service. It was not a passing interest with them but a lifelong preoccupation.

The outstanding contribution of Rodolfo Miranda to the establishment of the Service needs no further comment. It is fitting, however, that this acknowledgement of the dedicated efforts of those who led the campaign of 1898-1910 for government intervention in Indian affairs be concluded with a statement by Cândido Rondon, still the Indians' best-known friend. In it is clearly revealed the unselfish and ardent spirit that motivated the creation of the Service in 1910 and still underlies the work of that agency today. These were Rondon's words on the occasion of the formal inauguration of the Indian Service on September 7, 1910:

As for me, Sir (addressing Rodolfo Miranda), be assured that I bring to the new service more than the resolve of a worthy functionary to perform the duties of his post with honor.

You know that, beyond that initial requisite, there exists in me a conviction, and an enthusiastic—one might even say a passionate—desire to see realized the glorious project envisioned by the noble minds of our most renowned forebears, condensed in the program of José Bonifacio, of restoring to the descendants
of the original inhabitants of Brazil the land from which they were driven by fire and sword. You know that, as a patriot, I long to see the reconciliation of the three races that constitute the ethnic base of the Brazilian people, in order that, once fused, they may form at last the united population of this great republic. 4

4Homenagem á José Bonifácio no 88.º anniversário da independência do Brazil (Rio de Janeiro, 1910), pp. 107-108.
APPENDIX

DECRETO N. 8. 072, DE 20 DE JUNHO DE 1910

Cria o Serviço de Protecção aos Índios e Localização de Trabalhadores Nacionaes e approva o respectivo regualmento

O Presidente da Republica dos Estados Unidos do Brazil:

Resolve, de acordo com a lei n. 1. 606, de 29 de Dezembro de 1906, criar o Serviço de Protecção aos Índios e Localização de Trabalhadores Nacionaes, sujeito ao regualmento, que com este baixa, assignado pelo Ministro de Estado dos Negocios da Agricultura, Industria e Commercio.


Regulamento a que se refere o decreto n. 8. 072, de 20 de Junho de 1910.

DO SERVIÇO DE PROTECÇÃO AOS ÍNDIOS E LOCALIZAÇÃO DE TRABALHADORES NACIONAÉS

Art. 1° O «Serviço de Protecção aos Índios e Localização de Trabalhadores Nacionaes» , creado no Ministerio da Agricultura, Industria e Commercio, tem por fim:

a) prestar assistencia aos indios do Brazil, quer vivam aldeados, reunidos em tribues, em estado nomade ou promiscuamente com civilizados;

b) estabelecer em zonas ferteis, dotadas de condições de salubridade, de mananciaes ou cursos de agua e meios faceis e regulares de comunicação Centros Agricolas, constituidos por trabalhadores nacionaes que satisfaçam as exigencias do presente regualmento.

---

1"Decreto N. 8. 072, de 20 de junho de 1910," Homenagem a José Bonifacio no 83.° anniversario da independencia do Brazil (Rio de Janeiro, 1910), pp. 79-100.
TITULO I
CAPITULO I

DA PROTECÇÃO AOS INDIOS

Art. 2º. A assistência de que trata o art. 1º, terá por objecto:

1º., velar pelos direitos que as leis vigentes conferem aos indígenas e por outros que lhes sejam outorgados;

2º., garantir a efectividade da posse dos territórios ocupados por indígenas e, conjuntamente, do que nelhes se coutiver, entrando em acordo com os governos locais, sempre que for necessário;

3º., por em prática os meios mais eficazes para evitar que os civilizados invadam terras dos indígenas e reciprocamente;

4º., fazer respeitar a organização interna das diversas tribus, sua independência, seus hábitos e instituições, não intervindo para alterá-los, senão com brandura e consultando sempre a vontade dos respectivos chefes;

5º., promover a punição dos crimes que se cometirem contra os indígenas;

6º., fiscalizar o modo como são tratados nos aldeamentos, nas colónias e nos estabelecimentos particulares;

7º., exercer vigilância para que não sejam coagidos a prestar serviços a particulares e velar pelos contratos que forem feitos com elas para qualquer gênero de trabalho;

8º., procurar manter relações com as tribus, por intermédio dos inspetores do serviço de protecção aos indígenas, velando pela segurança delas,
por sua tranquilidade, impedindo, quanto possível, as guerras que entre si mantêm e restabelecendo a paz;

9º., concorrer para que os inspectores se constituam procuradores dos índios, requerendo ou designando procuradores para representá-los perante as justiças do país e às auctoridades locais;

10º., ministrar-lhes os elementos ou noções que lhes sejam aplicáveis, em relação às suas ocupações ordinárias;

11º., envidar esforços por melhorar suas condições materiais de vida, despertando-lhes a atenção para os meios de modificar a construção de suas habitações e ensinando-lhes livamente as artes, ofícios e os generos de produção agrícola e industrial para os quais revelarem aptidões;

12º., promover, sempre que for possível, e pelos meios permitidos em direito, a restituição dos terrenos que lhes tenham sido usurpados;

13º., promover a mudança de certas tribus, quando for conveniente e de conformidade com os respectivos chefes;

14º., fornecer aos índios instrumentos de musica que lhes sejam apropriados, ferramentas, instrumentos de lavoura, máquinas para beneficiar os produtos de suas culturas, os animaes domesticos que lhes forem utéis e quaisquer recursos que lhes forem necessarios;

15º., introduzir em territorios indigenas a industria pecuaria, quando as condições locaes o permitirem;

16º., minister, sem caracter obrigatorio, instrução primaria e profissional aos filhos de índios, consultando sempre a vontade dos pais;

17º., proceder ao levantamento da estatistica geral dos índios, com declaração de suas origens, idades, linguas, profissões e estudar sua situação
actual, seus hábitos e tendências.

CAPITULO II

DAS TERRAS OCCUPADAS POR INDIOS

Art. 3º. O Governo Federal, por intermédio do Ministério da Agricultura, Indústria e Comércio, e sempre que for necessário, entrará em acordo com os governos dos Estados ou dos municípios;

a) para que se legalisem convenientemente as posses das terras actualmente ocupadas pelos indíios;

b) para que sejam confirmadas as concessões de terras, feitas de acordo com a lei de 27 de Setembro de 1860;

c) para que sejam cedidas ao Ministério da Agricultura as terras devolvidas que forem julgadas necessárias às Povoações Indígenas ou à instalação de Centros Agrícolas.

Art. 4º. Realizado o acordo, o Governo Federal mandará proceder à medição e demarcação dos terrenos, levantar a respectiva planta com todas as indicações necessárias, assinalando as divisas com marcos ou padrões de pedra.

Art. 5º. Da planta e do memorial respectivo, que deverá ser o mais detalhado possível, será dada cópia aos governos estadoes e municipaes, conservando-se o original no arquivo da diretoria.

Art. 6º. Satisfeito o disposto nos artigos anteriores, o Governo providenciará para que seja garantido aos índios o usufruto dos terrenos demarcados.

Art. 7º. Os índios não poderão arrendar, alienar ou gravar com onus
reasse as terras que lhes forem entregues pelo Governo Federal.

Art. 8º. Os contratos dessa natureza que forem realizados pelos mesmos, serão considerados nulos de pleno direito.

Art. 9º. O Governo providenciará para que nos territórios federais os índios sejam mantidos na plenitude da posse dos terrenos pelos mesmos actualmente ocupados.

CAPITULO III

DOS INDIOS ALDEIADOS

Art. 10. Se os índios, que estiverem actualmente aldeiados, quiserem fixar-se nas terras que ocupam, o Governo providenciará de modo a lhes ser mantida a efectividade da posse adquirida.

Art. 11. As terras de que trata o artigo anterior serão medidas e demarcadas na forma do art. 4º.

Parágrafo único. O Governo, sempre que julgar necessário, fará construir casas para residência dos índios e estradas de rodagem para ligação dos aldeamentos aos centros de consumo.

Art. 12. Na medição e demarcação dos terrenos e na concessão dos títulos, será observado o disposto no presente regulamento e nas instruções respectivas.

Art. 13. Quando os índios aldeiados, na forma do art. 10, ocuparem terrenos na visinhança de centros populosos, ser-lhes-ia concedida, além da área destinada à sua residência habitual, uma superfície de terreno, em lugar conveniente, para as culturas a que se dedicarem.
CAPÍTULO IV

DOS ÍNDIOS NOMADES E DOS QUE SE MANTIVEREM EM PROMISCUIDADE COM CIVILIZADOS

Art. 14. A directoria, por intermédio dos inspectores, procurará, por meios brandos, atrair os índios que viverem em estado nomade e prestará aos que se mantiverem em promiscuidade com civilizados a mesma assistência que lhe cabe dispensar aos mais índios.

Parágrafo único. Para o serviço relativo aos índios nomades, poderá ser admitido pelo Ministério, sob proposta da directoria, o pessoal extraordinário que fór preciso.

CAPÍTULO V

DAS POVOAÇÕES INDÍGENAS

Art. 15. Cada um dos antigos aldeamentos, reconstituidos de acordo com as prescrições do presente regulamento, passará a denominar-se «Povoação Indígenas» onde serão estabelecidas escolas para o ensino primário, aulas de música, oficinas, máquinas e utensílios agrícolas, destinados a beneficiar os produtos das culturas, e campos apropriados à aprendizagem agrícola.

Parágrafo único. Não será permitido, sob pretexto algum, coagir os índios e seus filhos a qualquer ensino ou aprendizagem, devendo limitar-se a acção do inspector e de seus auxiliares a procurar convencê-los, por meios brandos, dessa necessidade.

Art. 16. Annexas aos campos de que trata o artigo anterior, haverá secções especiais para apicultura, sericicultura, pequenas indústrias, criação de animais domésticos, etc.
Art. 17. São extensivos aos índios localizados em "Povoação Indígena" os auxílios conferidos no presente regulamento às tribus cujos terrenos foram medidos e demarcados pelo Governo Federal, além da alimentação, nos seis primeiros meses de estabelecimento na povoação, socorros medicos e outros recursos, sempre que forem necessários.

Art. 18. O Ministro da Agricultura, Indústria e Comércio estabelecerá premios para os funcionários da diretoria, nos Estados, que adquirirem perfeito conhecimento da língua geral dos índios e de seus dialectos.

Art. 19. O Governo Federal poderá aceitar a transferência para sua jurisdição dos alojamentos ou quaisquer instituições destinadas à educação dos índios, mantidas por governos estaduais, municipais ou por associações, desde que lhe sejam cedidos os terrenos em que forem estabelecidos e às respectivas instalações.

Art. 20. Tais alojamentos ou instituições passarão logo ao regime instituído no presente regulamento para os similares criados pelo Governo Federal.

Art. 21. Os índios trabalharão livremente e terão pleno direito ao produto integral do seu trabalho.

TITULO II

CAPITULO I

DA LOCALIZAÇÃO DE TRABALHADORES NACIONAES

Art. 22. O Governo Federal, por intermédio de Ministro da Agricultura, Indústria, e Comércio, e de conformidade com este regulamento, promoverá a instalação de Centros Agrícolas, onde serão localizados os trabalhadores nacionaes, que por sua capacidade de trabalho e absoluta moralidade, possam merecer os favores consignados para esse fim.
Art. 23. Os Centros Agrícolas serão estabelecidos em boas terras de cultura, apropriadas à lavra mecanica, dotadas de perfeitas condições de salubridade, de mananciais ou cursos de água potável, servidas de meios fáceis de comunicação e proximas dos mercados consumidores.

Art. 24. O Governo promoverá, desde já, a fundação de um ou dois Centros Agrícolas em cada um dos Estados, em que julgar conveniente, inclusivê o Distrito Federal, devendo sempre ser preferidas para esse fim zonas cortadas por estradas de ferro da União e que reúnam os requisitos exigidos pelo artigo anterior.

Art. 25. O número de Centros Agrícolas poderá ser aumentado anualmente, conforme permitirem as dotações orçamentárias.


Parágrafo único. Os Centros Agrícolas serão de preferência estabelecidos nos Estados ou municípios que fizerem à União doação de terrenos nas condições estabelecidas no art. 26.

Art. 27. Occorrendo o facto de pertencerem os ditos terrenos a particulares, será sempre preferida a aquisição por composição amigável e de conformidade com o valor locativo das terras, verificado pelo preço médio das vendas realizadas no último quinquênio e so em caso extremo empregar-se-ha o recurso da desapropriação.
CAPITULO II

DA INSTALCAO DOS CENTROS AGRICOLAS

Art. 26. A escolha de terras para a instalação de Centros Agricolas deve preceder exame circunstanciado, por parte da Directoria do Serviço de Protecção aos Índios e Localização de Trabalhadores Nacionaes, afim de serem verificadas as condições estabelecidas na alinea b, art. 1º., do presente regulamento.

Art. 29. Além das alludidas condições, devem os terrenos ter a superfície precisa para o futuro desenvolvimento dos Centros Agricolas e expansão de suas culturas, devendo possuir igualmente terrenos de mata.

Art. 30. Nas instruções do presente regulamento serão estabelecidas regras que devem ser adoptadas para os trabalhos preparatorios do Centro Agricola, relativos ao levantamento hydrographico e da linha de perimetro, medição e demarcação das terras, sua divisão em lotes e respectiva discriminação, abertura de estradas, construção de casas, e todos os trabalhos technicos indispensaveis, que ficarão a cargo da respectiva sub-directoria.

Art. 31. O Governo Federal estabelecerá nos Centros Agricolas escolas primarias com curso diurno e nocturno, officinas, campos de experiencia e de demonstração, com aprendizado agricola, depositos de instrumentos de lavoura e as installações necessarias para o beneficiamento dos produtos da lavoura local.

Parágrafo unico. As escolas, officinas, campos de experiencia e demonstração e aprendizado agricola poderão ser frequentados por filhos de lavradores estranhos aos Centros Agricolas, de conformidade com as instruções que regularem o assumpto.
CAPÍTULO III
DOS TRABALHADORES NACIONAIS

Art. 32. Os Centros Agrícolas serão constituídos com trabalhadores nacionais domiciliados no mesmo Estado e que satisfaçam as seguintes condições:

a) não ter sido condenado por crime de qualquer natureza, nem ter sofrido prisão correccional por embriaguez ou contravenções;

b) ser chefe de família ou solteiro com mais de 21 anos de idade e menos de 60;

c) ser trabalhador agrícola;

d) ter capacidade física e aptidão para o trabalho.

Parágrafo único. Os chefes de família serão sempre preferidos, desde que satisfaçam às condições das letras a, c, e d.

Art. 33. Aos trabalhadores nacionais que tiverem de estabelecer-se nos Centros Agrícolas serão concedidos os seguintes favores:

a) transporte para si e sua família, com direito à bagagem;

b) fornecimento gratuito de ferramentas, plantas e sementes para as primeiras culturas;

c) auxílio para a manutenção de sua família, dentro dos três primeiros mezes de estabelecimento no "Centro Agrícola";

d) recurso médico gratuito, pelo prazo de um ano.

Art. 34. A área destinada a cada "Centro Agrícola" será dividida em lotes de 25 a 50 hectares, nos quais serão construídas casas destinadas aos trabalhadores nacionais, de conformidade com o plano e às condições estabelecidas pela directoria do serviço.
Art. 35. Os trabalhadores nacionais poderão adquirir os lotes que lhes couberem, mediante pagamento imediato ou dentro do prazo de seis anos, a contar da data da sua instalação no núcleo, cabendo-lhes, conforme a hipótese, título definitivo ou provisório da propriedade.

§ 1.° O prazo fixado para o pagamento do lote poderá ser reduzido pelo adquirente, de modo a permitir-lhe mais prompta acquisição do título definitivo de propriedade, cabendo-lhe, no caso, o abatimento que for arbitrado pelo Ministro da Agricultura, até o máximo de 20 %, de acordo com os seus hábitos de trabalho e sua conduta.

§ 2.° O abatimento a que se refere o parágrafo anterior, poderá ser elevado a 30 %, se, dentro de quatro anos, da data de sua instalação, tiver o trabalhador cultivado com sucesso, a juízo do Governo, toda a área do seu lote, com reserva de 10 % do total das terras, que deverá ser conservada em matas, de preferência nas partes altas.

Art. 36. O preço dos lotes, compreendendo a casa, será estabelecido pelo Ministro da Agricultura, de acordo com a proposta do director do serviço, tendo em vista as condições que lhes forem peculiares.

Art. 37. A amortização do débito contrahido pelo trabalhador nacional começará logo que forem decorridos 24 meses de seu estabelecimento e será feita em prestações mensais ou trimensais, na razão anual de uma quarta parte (1/4) da importância devida.

Art. 38. As dívidas dos trabalhadores serão escrituradas em livros especiais, rubricados pelo director do serviço, entregando-se ao devedor uma caderneta em que serão feitos os assentamentos que lhe corresponderem.

Art. 39. O trabalhador nacional que tiver de incorporar-se a um «Centro Agrícola» obrigar-se-ha:
1°, a estabelecer-se, com a sua família, quando a tiver, no lote que lhe for designado pelo director do serviço e a cultivar-o pessoalmente;

2°, a não criar animais senão em terrenos fechados, de acordo com as instruções que lhe forem dadas pelo director do centro;

3°, a não arrendar, vender ou hypothecar o lote e as respectivas bensiofetrias, nem fazer sobre elles proposta de venda ou qualquer contrato que o prive de cultivar livremente, até que obtenha o título definitivo de propriedade; não podendo vendê-lo ou arrendá-lo, mesmo depois de obtido o título definitivo, senão a pessoas que reunam as condições do art. 32, a juizo do director do serviço e com aprovação do ministro;

4°, a submeter-se às regras e providencias que forem estabelecidas pelo representante da directoria a bem da ordem e da disciplina, quer em relação aos funcionários do «Centro Agrícola», quer para com os seus próprios compaesheiros.

Art. 40. Em caso de morte do trabalhador nacional a quem houver sido expedido título definitivo ou provisorio de propriedade, passará o lote, na forma commum do direito, aos seus herdeiros ou legatários.

Art. 41. Se o chefe de família fallecido houver adquirido o lote a prazo, tendo contribuido com três prestações, sera passado título definitivo de propriedade em favor da viuva e dos orfãos.

Art. 42. Se a família do chefe fallecido ficar em estado de miseria, poderá o ministro, ouvido o director do Serviço, expedir a favor da viuva e orfãos o título de propriedade, independente de qualquer amortização.

Art. 43. O Governo Federal procurará estimular os trabalhadores nacionaes, incorporados aos Centros Agrícolas, concedendo premios de animação para certas culturas, organizando exposições regionaes, etc.
Art. 44. A's famílias de trabalhadores que tiverem filhos maiores de 14 annos, aptos para o trabalho agrícola, poderá ser concedida, além do lote destinado ao respectivo chefe, a área de 12 hectares para cada um delles, com a aprovação do Ministro da Agricultura.

Art. 45. O trabalhador nacional que se distinguir por sua actividade, poderá adquirir mais de um lote, a juizo do director do Serviço; desde que tenha pago o primeiro, ou quando tenha feito mais da metade do pagamento.

Art. 46. O trabalhador que deixar de cultivar o seu lote por espaço de tres meses, a não ser por motivo justificado de força maior, a juizo do director do serviço, será excluido do «Centro Agrícola», sem direito a indemnização alguma, desde que não se ache de posse do título definitivo de propriedade.

Parágrafo único. No caso de já haver obtido o título definitivo, será, indemnizado de importância que tiver pago aos cofres públicos.

Art. 47. O trabalhador que, por sua má conducta, tornar-se um elemento de perturbação para o «Centro Agrícola», fica sujeito ao disposto no artigo anterior.

Art. 48. A exclusão, em qualquer dos casos previstos nos artigos antecedentes, será feita por acto do director do Serviço, com recurso voluntario para o ministro da Agricultura.

TITULO III

Da organização do serviço

CAPITULO I

DISTRIBUIÇÃO DOS TRABALHOS

Art. 49. Os trabalhos previstos neste regulamento ficarão a cargo de uma directoria geral com duas sub-directorías e dos inspectores e mais
Art. 50. A 1ª. sub-directoria incumbe especialmente:

a) projectar, organizar e dirigir a execução dos serviços de demarcação dos territórios ocupados por índios;

b) escolher as localidades em que deverão ser instaladas as Povoações Indígenas e os Centros Agrícolas;

c) proceder à divisão e demarcação dos lotes rurais, levantamentos topográficos, construção de casas nas povoações e Centros Agrícolas e nos predios necessários à administração;

d) projectar e dirigir a execução de obras de saneamento, construção de caminhos, reparação e melhoria das estradas de rodagem que intercem nas povoações e Centros Agrícolas;

e) estudar e construir, nos casos de necessidade, caminhos vicinais ou de ligação dos centros ou povoações às estações de estradas de ferro, portos marítimos ou fluviais, ou a centros comerciais;

f) preparar em cada lote rural a área destinada às primeiras culturas;

g) instituir e manter no escritório um arquivo dos projectos, plantas topográficas e outros papeis que se relacionem com as obras em andamento;

h) executar quaisquer outros trabalhos técnicos que lhe forem confiados pela directoria geral.

Art. 51. A 2ª. sub-directoria incumbe especialmente:

a) propor e zelar pela rigorosa execução das medidas adoptadas para tornar efectiva a protecção aos índios e evitar a invasão de seus territórios; as que forem conducentes a obstar os conflictos das tribus entre si e com os civilizados, envidando esforços para tornarem-se, primeiro, pacíficas, e depois amistosas as relações entre estes e aqueles;
b) instalar e dirigir, na parte exclusivamente administrativa, as Povoações Indígenas;

c) criar escolas, proteger o salário dos índios que se empregarem como jornaleiros e adoptar ou pedir às auctoridades competentes todas as medidas necessárias para a manutenção da boa ordem, segurança e desenvolvimento das povoações;

d) instalar e administrar os Centros Agrícolas, fornecendo-lhes gratuitamente ferramentas e sementes, como auxilio de primeiro estabelecimento, além de outras vantagens previstas neste regulamento ou posteriormente instituídas em instruções expeditas pelo director geral, por ordem do ministro, mediante proposta ou não do sub-director;

e) propor a criação de campos de experiência e demonstração junto aos Centros Agrícolas;

f) ter a seu cargo os trabalhos relativos a exposições regionaes, feiras e premias de que trata o presente regulamento, ou que forem posteriormente instituídos;

g) executar quaisquer outros trabalhos que lhe forem confiados pela directoria geral, além do expediente da repartição, registro de papeis, e toda escrituração que for necessaria para o bom andamento do serviço.

CAPITULO II

DO PESSIONAL

Art. 52. O pessoal do Serviço dividir-se-1... em efectivo e extraordinário.

§ 1º. O pessoal efectivo será o seguinte:

Na sede do Serviço:

Directoria geral:

1 director geral:
1 primeiro oficial (servindo de secretário);

1 segundo oficial.

Primeira sub-directoria:

1 sub-director (technico);

2 ajudantes (technicos);

1 agronomo (technico);

1 desenhista;

1 desenhista auxiliar;

1 terceiro official.

Segunda sub-directoria:

1 sub-director;

2 primeiros oficiaes;

2 segundos oficiaes;

2 terceiros oficiaes.

Portaria:

1 porteiro;

1 continuo;

2 serventes.

Nós Estados:

13 inspectores, sendo 1 para cada um dos Estados do Amazonas, Pará, Maranhão, Bahia, Espírito Santo, São Paulo, Paraná, Santa Catharina, Rio Grande do Sul, Minas, Goyaz, Matto Grosso e 1 para o territorio do Acre;

10 ajudantes, sendo 2 para cada um dos Estados do Amazonas, Pará, Matto Grosso, Goyaz e para o territorio do Acre;

13 escreventes, sendo 1 para cada inspectoria.
Nas Povoações Indígenas:

1 director, 1 ajudante e 1 escrevente.

Nos Centros Agrícolas:

1 director, 1 chefe de culturas e 1 escrevente.

Art. 53. Além do pessoal efectivo, haverá o pessoal extraordinário que for indispensável para a execução dos serviços de demarcação, construções, levantamentos topográficos, localização e outros que não puderem ser executados pelo pessoal efectivo.

Art. 54. O pessoal extraordinário, inclusive médicos, farmacêuticos, professores primários e mestres de oficinas, será nomeado pelo ministro, de acordo com as necessidades e sob proposta do director geral, receberá as gratificações que lhe forem arbitradas no acto da nomeação e será mantido somente enquanto bem servir e durar a necessidade do serviço.

CAPÍTULO III

ATTRIBUIÇÕES DO PESSOAL

Do director geral:

Art. 55. Ao director geral, imediatamente subordinado ao Ministro incumbe:

a) distribuir, dirigir e fiscalizar os serviços instituídos por este regulamento;

b) manter e fazer manter, pelos meios ao seu alcance, a observância das ordens em vigor;

c) propor ao ministro, verbalmente ou por escrito, as providências que julgar convenientes para o bom andamento e melhoria dos serviços;

d) preparar e fazer preparar as instruções que houverem de ser expedidas para a instalação, regularização e desenvolvimento dos serviços;
c) apresentar anualmente ao ministro um relatório dos trabalhos realizados;

d) prestar às auctoridades federaes e estaduais, espontaneamente ou mediante requisição, os esclarecimentos necessários à boa ordem e desenvolvimento dos serviços;

e) dar posse aos seus subordinados, fazendo lavrar e assinar os respectivos termos de promessa;

h) impor as penas disciplinares, de conformidade com o art. 68 deste regulamento;

i) assinar a folha de vencimentos dos funcionários sob sua direcção, concedendo ou não a justificação das faltas por elas cometidas dentro do mesmo, à vista do livro do ponto, e requisitar o respectivo pagamento;

j) rever o expediente e lançar o — visto — quando não tiver de dar parecer, nos papéis que tenham de ser apresentados ao ministro;

k) ordenar às despesas com o expediente e mais objectos necessários à direcção e mais dependências do serviço, dentro dos recursos orçamentários;

l) examinar as contas e requisitar ao ministro o pagamento das acquisições quaisquer que se tenham de efectuar para os serviços sob sua direcção;

m) requisitar às auctoridades federaes e estaduais as medidas necessárias para a manutenção da ordem nos diferentes pontos em que exercer a sua jurisdição;

n) exercer quaisquer outras atribuições que lhe couberem por este regulamento e mais disposições em vigor.

Art. 56. O director geral, em seus impedimentos ou ausências desta Capital, por motivo de serviço, terá por substituto o sub-director da 1ª. sub-
directoria, e, em falta deste, o da 2ª. sub-directoria.

Do secretario:

Art. 57. Ao secretario, subordinado e auxiliar immediato do director geral, incumbe:

a) receber e enviar às respectivas sub-directorias os papeis dirigidos ao director geral e que tenham de ser nelas processados;

b) receber das sub-directorias e fazer chegar ao conhecimento do director geral os papeis que por elle tiverem de ser despachados;

c) providenciar sobre a expedição dos actos do director geral, fazendo as devidas comunicações;

d) auxiliar o director geral nos trabalhos que este reservar para si;

e) providenciar sobre a correspondencia epistolar e telegraphica da directoria.

Dos sub-directores:

Art. 58. Os sub-directores, auxiliares immediatos do director geral, são os cheios das respectivas sub-directorias e, como tais, os unicos responsáveis perante o director geral pelos serviços que por elles correm.

A elles incumbe:

a) auxiliar a direcção dos trabalhos segundo as instrucções do director geral, distribuindo ao respectivo pessoal os serviços da competencia de cada um;

b) dirigir, examinar, fiscalizar e promover todos os trabalhos que competirem às respectivas sub-directorias;

c) cumprir e fazer cumprir as ordens do director geral;

d) apresentar ao director geral, até ao dia 20 de Fevereiro de cada anno, as notas e elementos que lhes forem requisitados e os que julgarem necessarios para a confeccão do relatorio annual da directoria, com os
documentos que lhes servirem de base, bem como os dados necessários para a confe
cção do orçamento;

e) apresentar semestralmente ao director geral uma synopse
dos trabalhos realizados pela respectiva sub-directoria;

f) encerrar o ponto dos funcionários subordinados, à hora regulamentar.

Art. 59. O sub-director da 1.ª sub-directoria terá sob suas ordens
imediata e deus ajudantes o um engenheiro-agronomo, cujas atribuições
e deveres serão discriminados pelo mesmo sub-director, em instruções
expedidas mediante aprovação prévia do director geral.

Art. 60. As sedes das inspectorias, os deveres e atribuições dos
inspectores e pessoal das Povoações Indígenas e Centros Agrícolas, serão
discriminados em instruções expedidas pelo ministro da Agricultura, sob
vista do director geral.

Art. 61. O director geral fará a distribuição dos demais funcionários
pelos diversas sub-directorias, incumbindo aos sub-directores prescrever-
los os seus respectivos deveres, guiando-se, para isto, pelos regula-
mentos das repartições do Ministerio da Agricultura.

CAPITULO IV

VENCIMENTOS, NOMEAÇÕES, DEMISSÕES, LICENÇAS,
APRESENTADORIAS, MONTE-PIO E OUTRAS VANTAGENS

Art. 62. Os vencimentos dos funcionários do serviço serão os con-
stantes da tabella annexa.

Art. 63. Serão nomeados, por decreto do Presidente da Republica, o
director geral e os sub-directores, e os demais funcionários pelo ministro da
Agricultura.
Art. 64. A nomeação do director geral, bem como a do pessoal técnico, inspectores, ajudantes e pessoal das Povoações Indígenas e Centros Agrícolas será da livre escolha do Governo.

Art. 65. A dos sub-directores, primeiros e segundos oficiais, será sempre por acesso dentro os funcionários de categoria imediatamente inferior, que tiverem dado melhores provas de competência, zelo e assiduidade ao serviço.

Art. 66. As nomeações dos terceiros oficiais serão feitas mediante concurso, de acordo com as instruções para esse fim expedidas pela direcção geral.

Art. 67. Ficam extensivas aos funcionários do Serviço as disposições contidas nos arts. 21 e 22 do regulamento da Secretaria de Estado da Agricultura, Indústria e Comércio.

Art. 68. No tocante às licenças, aposentadoria, montepio e penas disciplinares, serão extensivas aos funcionários do Serviço as disposições contidas nos artigos competentes dos capítulos VIII, IX e X do regulamento annexo ao decreto n. 7.727, de 9 de Janeiro de 1909.

CAPITULO V

TEMPO DE TRABALHO E EXPEDIENTE

Art. 69. O trabalho, na Capital Federal, começará às 10 horas da manhã e findará às 3 horas da tarde nos dias úteis, podendo, porém, ser prorrogado pelo director geral, por urgência de serviço.

Nos Estados, o trabalho começará nas horas indicadas nas instruções que forem expedidas pelo ministro, sob proposta do director geral.
CAPÍTULO VI

DISPOSIÇÕES GERAIS

Art. 70. O Governo Federal procurará aproveitar os indígenas em serviços industriais compatíveis com as suas aptidões, remunerando-os de acordo com a sua capacidade de trabalho e conforme o estabelecido para os mais trabalhadores.

Art. 71. Organizado definitivamente um «Centro Agrícola», o Governo Federal entrará em acordo com o governo local para o estabelecimento de uma feira semanal nas proximidades do mesmo centro, prestando o auxílio necessário para esse fim.

Art. 72. Haverá em cada «Centro Agrícola» máquinas e instrumentos agrícolas para serem vendidos pelo custo ou emprestados aos trabalhadores, assim como serão montadas as máquinas necessárias para beneficiamento dos seus produtos, mediante as condições que forem estabelecidas e a juízo do Governo.

Parágrafo único. As máquinas e instrumentos a que se refere o presente artigo poderão igualmente ser emprestados aos pequenos lavradores das proximidades, assim como as de beneficiamento poderão ser por elas utilizadas nas mesmas condições em que o forem pelos trabalhadores do «Centro Agrícola».

Art. 73. O Governo Federal mandará fornecer gratuitamente aos lavradores, residentes nas proximidades dos centros, sementes, mudas e publicações relativas à agricultura e indústrias rurais, e mediante indenização apraz de acordo com os recursos orçamentários, conforme as instruções que forem aprovadas pelo ministro da Agricultura, instrumentos
e pequenas máquinas de lavoura, veículos e animais para a condução dos
productos agrícolas e animais reprodutores de raça, especialmente
galinaceos, suínos e caprinos, adequados a cada região.

Art. 74. Em caso de seca ou qualquer calamidade que obrigue as
populações rurais a se afastarem das zonas em que se acharem fixadas, o
Governo Federal procurará localizar-as, de acordo com o Governo estadual,
em outras zonas não assoladas do mesmo Estado, constituindo nelas «Centros
Agrícolas».

Art. 75. Sempre que houverem de ser feitas derrubadas, aberturas
de estradas, aterros e outras obras em proveito de um «Centro Agrícola»,
serão, de preferência, utilizados trabalhadores nacionais localizados no
mesmo centro, percebendo as diarias que forem fixadas pelo director do
Serviço.

Art. 76. Os cargos do director geral, sub-director da 1.ª sub-directoria
e seus ajudantes, serão exercidos, de preferência, por profissionais de
reconhecida competência.

Parágrafo único. Terão preferência para os cargos de directores
dos «Centros Agrícolas» os agronomos diplomados e que tenham longa
prática e experiência de agricultura.

Art. 77. O Ministro da Agricultura, Indústria e Commercio expedirá
as instruções necessárias para execução do presente regulamento.

### TABELA DE VENCIMENTOS A QUE SE REFERE O ART. 62 DESTE REGULAMENTO

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CATEGORIAS</th>
<th>VENCIMENTOS ANUAIS</th>
<th>Gratificação</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ordenado</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Director geral</td>
<td>12:000$000</td>
<td>6:000$000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sub-director</td>
<td>8:000$000</td>
<td>4:000$000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ajudante</td>
<td>6:400$000</td>
<td>3:200$000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agronomo</td>
<td>6:400$000</td>
<td>3:200$000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Desenhista</td>
<td>4:800$000</td>
<td>2:400$000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Desenhista-auxiliar</td>
<td>3:600$000</td>
<td>1:800$000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secretario</td>
<td>6:400$000</td>
<td>3:200$000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1º Official</td>
<td>5:600$000</td>
<td>2:800$000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2º Official</td>
<td>4:000$000</td>
<td>2:000$000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3º Official</td>
<td>3:200$000</td>
<td>1:600$000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Porteiro</td>
<td>2:000$000</td>
<td>1:000$000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contínuo</td>
<td>1:600$000</td>
<td>800$000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Servente</td>
<td></td>
<td>1:800$000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### INSPECTORIAS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Ordenado</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Inspector</td>
<td>6:400$000</td>
<td>3:200$000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ajudante</td>
<td>4:800$000</td>
<td>2:400$000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Escrivento</td>
<td>2:000$000</td>
<td>1:000$000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### POVOAÇÃO INDÍGENA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Ordenado</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Director</td>
<td>5:600$000</td>
<td>2:800$000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ajudante</td>
<td>4:000$000</td>
<td>2:000$000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Escrivento</td>
<td>1:800$000</td>
<td>600$000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### CENTRO AGRÍCOLA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Ordenado</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Director</td>
<td>4:800$000</td>
<td>2:400$000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chefe de culturas</td>
<td>2:000$000</td>
<td>1:000$000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Escrivento</td>
<td>1:800$000</td>
<td>600$000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### OBSERVAÇÕES

1. O director geral, sub-directores, ajudantes e agronomo, inspectores e seus ajudantes, quando em serviço fora da sede de seus trabalhos, terão direito a diarias que serão fixadas pelo ministro, não excedendo, porém, as quantias de 20$ para o director, 15$ para os sub-directores e inspectores, e 10$ para os ajudantes e agronomo.
2ª. O logar de secretário será exercido por um primeiro ou segundo oficial, escolhido pelo director geral, cabendo-lhe, quando no exercício do cargo, a gratificação mensal de 100$, além dos respectivos vencimentos.

3ª. A sede de cada inspectoria será fixada nas instruções a que se refere o art. 60 deste regulamento.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

I. PRIMARY SOURCES

A. Manuscripts


"Registro das actas das sessões da congregação." M. S. in archives of Museu Nacional.


B. Printed


Almeida, Silvio de. "Divagações," Estado de S. Paulo, October 12 and 26, 1908.


Archivos do Museu Nacional. See Rio de Janeiro, Brazil (City).


"Representação..." See Magalhães, Basilio de.


Brazil. Laws and Statutes. Coleção das leis da República dos Estados Unidos de Brazil [Title varies slightly]. 1871 -. Rio de Janeiro: Imprensa Nacional, 1892 -. 


Catálogo geral das publicações da Comissão Rondon. See Brazil. Conselho Nacional de Proteção aos Indígenas.


Coletânea de leis . . . See Brazil. Conselho Nacional de Proteção aos Indígenas.

Coleção das leis da República . . . Brasil. See Brazil. Laws, Statutes, etc.


Comissão Geográfica e geológica do . . . S. Paulo. Exploração do rio de Peixe, 1737. See São Paulo, Brazil (State).


Damaso, Alfredo Pinto. O Servico de Proteção aos Indígenas e a tribo dos Carijós no sertão de Pernambuco. n. p., n. d.


Homemages à José Bonifacio. . . See Brazil. Ministerio da Agricultura.


"Exterminio dos indígenas ou dos sendacejos?" Jornal do Commercio, December 15, 1908, p. 2.

"O futuro dos indígenas do estado de S. Paulo," Estado de S. Paulo, October 20, 1908.


"A questão dos índios do Brazil," Revista do Museu Paulista, VIII (1914), pp. 112-140.

Instituto Histórico e Geographico Brasileiro. Revista do Instituto Histórico e Geographico Brasileiro. Rio de Janeiro, 1839-. Title varies: Vol. 1, Revista do Instituto Histórico e Geographico do Brazil; Vol. 2-13, Revista trimestral de historia e geografia; ou Jornal do Instituto Histórico e Geographico Brasileiro; Vol. 14, 22-43, Revista trimestral do Instituto Histórico, Geographico e Ethnographico do Brazil. Other slight variations followed until 1915 when present title was adopted.
International Congress of Americanists. 16th. Vienna, 1908. 


Mendes, Raymundo Telzera. "Ainda os indígenas do Brasil e a política moderna." Igreja e Apostolado Positivista do Brasil (Rio de Janeiro), September 6, 1907, pp. 3-14.

"Bases de uma constituição política ditatorial federativa para a República brasileira." Igreja e Apostolado Positivista do Brasil (Rio de Janeiro), 1890.


"Igreja e Apostolado Positivista do Brasil: Em defesa dos indígenas brasileiros," Jornal do Comércio, November 11, 1908, p. 12.

"O ceticismo e a defesa dos indígenas brasileiros," Igreja e Apostolado Positivista do Brasil (Rio de Janeiro), No. 276 (December 15, 1908).


Missão Rondon. See Brazil. Comissão de Linhas Telegraphicas.


"O selvagem perante o direito," Revista trimensal do Instituto Histórico e Geográfico Brasileiro, CI (1901), 19-38.


Rendon, José Aracne de Toledo. "Memoria sobre as aldeas de índios da provincia de S. Paulo, segundo as observações feitas no anno de 1793. Opinión do autor sobre a sua civilização" [Written in 1823]. Revista trimensal de historia e geografia ou Jornal do Instituto Histórico e Geográfico Brasileiro, IV (1842), 295-311.

Revista brasileira de geografia. Rio de Janeiro. January, 1939-

Revista do Centro de Ciências, Letras e Artes de Campinas. See Centro de Ciências, Letras e Artes de Campinas.

Revista do Instituto Histórico e Geográfico Brasileiro. See Instituto Histórico e Geográfico Brasileiro.

Revista de história. São Paulo. 1950-

Revista do Museu Nacional. See Rio de Janeiro, Brazil (City). Museu Nacional

Revista do Museu Paulista. See São Paulo, Brazil (City). Museu Paulista.


V.Silva, José Bonifacio de Andrada e. "Apontamentos para a civilização dos índios bravos do império do Brazil" and "Representação á Assemblea Geral Constituinte e Legislativa do império do Brazil sobre a escravatura." Homenagem a José Bonifacio (Rio de Janeiro, 1910). pp. 17-70.


Trabajos del Cuarto Congreso Científico. Santiago, Chile, 1908. See Pan American Scientific Congress.


II. NEWSPAPERS


Correio da Manhã. Rio de Janeiro. 1901-.

Correio Paulistano. São Paulo. 1854-.

Deutsche Zeitung; Diário Alemão. São Paulo.


Diário Popular. São Paulo. 1885-.

O Estado de S. Paulo. São Paulo. 1874-.

Folha da Manhã. São Paulo. 1931-.

Folha do Dia. Rio de Janeiro.

Gazeta Oficial. Cuiabá, Mato Grosso.


Jornal do Brasil. Rio de Janeiro. 1891-.

Jornal do Commercio. Rio de Janeiro. 1827-.


A Noticia. Rio de Janeiro. 1894-.

Novidades. Itajaí, Santa Catarina.


Der Urwaldsbote. Blumenau, Santa Catarina.
III. SECONDARY WORKS


Bandeira, Alípio. *A cruz indígena: Com a descrição de dolorosos episódios verdadeiros em que as nossas aborígenes têm sido vítimas de inomináveis barbaridades cometidas pelos civilizados.* Porto Alegre: Livraria do Globo, 1926.

"Discurso pronunciado por Alípio Bandeira na sessão solene de instalação da inspetoria do Serviço de Proteção aos Indios e Localização dos Trabalhadores Nacionais no Amazonas," Coletânea de leis, atos e memoriais referentes ao indígena brasileiro (Rio de Janeiro, 1947), pp. 29-54.


Schaden, Egon. "*Ultimo livro de Nimuendajú,*" *Anhembi* (São Paulo), XL (March, 1954), 90-95.


Verissimo, José. See Mattos, José Verissimo de.
